interlitteraria

interlitteraria

Tartu Ülikooli maailmakirjanduse õppetooli ja Eesti Võrdleva Kirjandusteaduse Assotsiatsiooni rahvusvaheline aastakiri.

Annual international refereed edition of the Chair of Comparative Literature of Tartu University and the Estonian Association of Comparative Literature.

Edition annuelle internationale de la Chaire de Littérature Comparée de l'Université de Tartu et de l'Association Estonienne de Littérature Comparée.

Internationales Jahrbuch des Lehrstuhls für Weltliteratur an der Universität Tartu und der Assoziation der Vergleichenden Literaturwissenschaft in Estland.

Edición anual international de la Cátedra de Literatura Comparada de la Universidad de Tartu y de la Asociación Estonia de Literatura Comparada.

Interlitteraria – 16

volume 2

Contents – Matières – Inhalt – Contenido

VOLUME 2

Contents – Matières – Inhalt – Contenido

Contents – Matières – Inhalt – Contenido

Latvian Drama and Theatre during World War II

Latvia was directly drawn into the events of World War II in 1941. The comparatively short period of the Nazi German occupation in Latvia (1941–1944) now attracts the increasing attention of Latvian scholars in different fields, which is only natural since during the period of the Soviet regime it could not be studied objectively due to ideological reasons. The present article will give an insight into some aspects of Latvian drama and the life of the Latvian theatre during the period of Nazi German occupation focusing on these issues within the context of the aesthetic phenomena and themes characteristic of that time.

In the summer of 1941 – on 1 July – the first Soviet occupation was succeeded by the Nazi German occupation in Latvia. After experiencing the Soviet repressions of 1940 and 1941 as well as the mass deportations of 14 June 1941, many Latvians first perceived the Nazis as the liberators from the Soviet occupation only gradually realizing that it was another repressive occupational regime.

Despite the occupational regime and the economic hardships of the war, the period of 1941–1944 was an active creative time in the Latvian theatre. Similar trends could be observed in other arts as well, in fine arts, for instance, exhibitions were organized very actively both in Riga and other places in Latvia. The number of people visiting the war-time exhibitions was large, and the works of art were intensively purchased both by individuals and organizations. Similarly, the creative processes in Latvian drama and the theatre life became much livelier again after the period of the Soviet occupation, and this resulted in several important artistic works. The Nazi regime interfered in the theatre life just along general lines – it was forbidden to include the plays by Russian authors and those created by playwrights from allied countries in the repertoire, as well as to voice Communist ideas. Nevertheless, there were some exceptions to

this rule, and a certain selection was made in this respect. Germans loved Pushkin, for instance. In 1940, the Soviet regime had banned the *Swan Lake* in the Opera, accusing it of reactionary romanticism, but during the Nazi regime, the 1941 Opera season was opened with *Eugene Onegin* and the renewed *Swan Lake*.

All in all, a period of flourishing could be observed in the Latvian theatres. The theatres got rid of the Soviet repertoire. The Nazi regime did not require open glorification; their ideological pressure was more refined than that experienced during the Soviet regime of 1940. As to the requirements set for arts, there could be noticed some features characteristic of the Nazi cultural policy: a trend towards monumentalism (neoclassical forms), huge space, high ceiling, etc. There could also be observed some elements of the baroque culture – rich ornamentation, sometimes conveying the idea of artificiality.

Before any kind of stage production – operas, plays, operettas, musical comedies, and ballet productions in particular – a written permission had to be received from Commissioner General. This was stipulated in the direction issued by Commissioner General on 19 December 1941 on requirements regarding the applications for prospective theatre productions in the Eastern Province (Ostland). It was stated in the direction that before commencing any production an application had to be submitted to the District Commissioner:

> The applications for the works which were intended to be produced in any other language than German had to be supplemented by a complete text and a prompt book. Any individual who produced or was allowed to produce the above mentioned stage works without the written permission of the Reichskommisar was liable to a fine and 3-month imprisonment or one of these kinds of punishment. (*Des Generalkomissars* 1941: 199)

Censorship was entrusted to academically educated people. As a result, there was weeded out not only the so-called non-Aryan art, but also trash, so the theatre repertoire was cleared of low quality plays. There was a period of revival in culture, including the theatre life. Theatre tickets were sold out. The daily life was hard, insecure and poor, and people were longing for the theatre, for light and

warmth, good drama, humanist ideas, high spirituality, and a broad scale of thought; it was an opportunity to escape from reality. According to the Latvian theatre expert Lilija Dzene, "the brisk and independent war-time theatre life during the German period in Latvia is admirable. It is like war-time love – ardent and desperate, filled with the power of resistance." (Dzene 1990: 34)

During the German period, there were eleven drama theatres in Latvia: The National Theatre, which had been renamed The Drama Theatre, The Daile (Art) Theatre, Jelgava Theatre, Liepaja City Opera and Drama, Daugavpils Theatre, Latgale Theatre in Rezekne, People's Theatre, North Latvia Theatre, Ventspils Drama Theatre, Cesis Drama Theatre, and two productions were staged by The Latvian Drama Company. The Theatre of Children and Youth and The Russian Drama Theatre, whose premises were used by People's Theatre which focused on entertainment and staged several operettas as well as some plays by Latvian authors, were closed. The theatres were supervised by The Theatre Division of the Department of Culture and Social Affairs, where the theatres had to submit regular reports about their repertoire, visiting artists, as well as the reports about their performances, audiences, earnings, etc. During the period of Nazi German occupation, the theatres produced the works of high artistic quality. Basically, the repertoire consisted of three kinds of plays: Latvian and foreign classics addressing topical issues, individual's position and role in the epoch dominated by brutal force and power, as well as Latvian contemporary dramaturgy. The share of entertainment was quite small in the repertoire.

Latvian drama also flourished during the period of Nazi German occupation. Both the theatre people and the public wanted to cultivate, preserve and see the manifestations of Latvian culture in the theatres; therefore, both the Latvian classics and the original works by the Latvian authors of that period were staged. The authors popular in the 1930s continued working in the theatre, including two of the most prominent Latvian playwrights: Mārtiņš Zīverts created some of his best works during that time, and Anšlavs Eglītis became a strong new voice in the Latvian drama. In order to motivate playwrights to write, The Department of Culture and Social Affairs announced a competition. The participation was quite active, and 66

works were submitted for the competition. Two plays by Mārtiņš Zīverts *Vara* (Power) and *Nauda* (Money), *Intermeco* (Intermezzo) by Elīna Zālīte, as well as the comedies *Kosma konfirmācija* (The Space Confirmation) and *Par purna tiesu* (Win by a Nose) by Anšlavs Eglītis can be mentioned among the assets of the competition. All these pieces of drama were promptly staged and became interesting theatre events. During the German period, nobody forced playwrights to write anything, and no subservient plays pandering to the governing regime were created. Apart from the plays mentioned above, there were created works like *Trauksme paradīzē* (Alarm in Paradise) by Jūlijs Pētersons, the musical comedy *Ezermaļu krokodils* (The Ezermali Crocodile) by Jānis Jaunsudrabiņš and Krišjānis Norvilis, *Dzejnieks un roze* (The Poet and the Rose) by Valdis Grēviņš, *Gudrā Marjana* (Smart Maryana) by Tija Banga, etc.

The themes of the plays and their composition reflected the spiritual climate of that time – social insecurity, the horrors of the war and the hardships made the striving for harmony, safety, peace, and encouragement more acute. There was no demand for the reflection of reality on the stage. The plays were set in the peace-time. The themes of the plays were far away from the harsh reality and focused on fundamental human values. The creation of illusion was a common feature, portraying a harmonious, idealized environment and relationships – the island of happiness, allowing just a few sounds from the outside to penetrate it. It could be regarded as a peculiar myth creation – a quiet resistance to the official myth, which is a common key element of any totalitarianism as far as its political, ideological, aesthetic, and psychological aspect is concerned, irrespective of the state where the particular totalitarian regime exists.

As to the genre, rather a lot of plays created at that time were comedies. There were also plays with the elements of melodrama and psychological analytical drama, and only one play written at the time could be considered as a tragedy – *Vara* by Mārtiņš Zīverts. Most of plays were set in pre-war Latvia; emphasis was put on details reflecting the splendour of life before the war. For instance, the play *Trauksme paradizē* by Jūlijs Pētersons focuses on traditional Latvian values and virtues; the characters are good, positive young people; it depicts idealized Latvian country life and a farmstead as

the micro-model of the happy, sunny and harmonious past, conveying the idea between the lines that now this life has been demolished and destroyed – it is a dream about former Latvia, which is no more.

Quiet, smarting pain, longing for happiness and harmony can also be felt in the play *Intermeco* by Elīna Zālīte, the structure of which is closer to a chamber play. The insecurity dominating the world has been transformed in the play into the fragility of human relationships. The love affair of a famous singer and a young district forester from Dundaga depicted in the play sounds like a slightly painful intermezzo, as they both part and continue their lives in separate directions. This play does not offer the depth and the scope of ideas characteristic of a classic; as the title implies – it is just a little intermezzo. Nevertheless, the lyrical sentimental atmosphere of the production with a mute longing for happiness, even an illusory one, enabled the audience to draw some parallels with the feelings vibrating in the actual reality; besides, they were happy to meet their favourite actors Lilija Štengele (the singer Liāna Langa) and Žanis Katlaps (Dainis Ilsters) on the stage. Moreover, the idea that a person could feel really good only in his homeland, at home, in his natural rhythm of life conveyed in the play was also close and understandable to the audience.

A key issue tackled by the drama of that time was the juxtaposition of the brutal, dogmatic, evil world and the subtle, fragile spiritual life; there appears the recurrent image of a dream which emphasizes the tragic incongruity between the dream and reality. The development of this line can be traced in the works by the prolific dramatist Mārtiņš Zīverts. One of his best plays – the drama *Nauda* written in 1942 – is set in Riga in the 1930s. The play is saturated with the crime scheme and character studies – the plot winds around the situation when money unexpectedly falls into the hands of a person who has never had any. It turns out to be not the fulfilment of a dream, but just a coincidence – the main character of the play, the dreamer Piķurgs, finds the money hidden by the criminals. The play treats the relations between man and money in an intriguing way from the angle unusual for Latvian drama: the man is worthless either without money or with it if he loses the sense of his

personality, the meaning of life. The production of *Nauda* in Riga Drama Theatre in 1943 directed by Alfreds Amtmanis–Briedītis became a significant event in the theatre life of that time. Like some other works of that period, the motive of a dream appears in this play – the refreshing dream providing the meaning of life is contrasted to money – the weapon of the powerful – which does not bring the expected happiness contrary to the initial hopes of the main character Piķurgs. Laying his hands on a large sum of money by a lucky chance, the ragman Piķurgs becomes one of the power elite but, having experienced the degenerating power of money, he is neither happy nor satisfied. As far as the direction is concerned, the restaurant scene where the newly rich Piķurgs, played by the actor Jānis Šāberts, orders the richest table to be laid, but allows the noble gentlemen to sit down at it only when they have jumped over a stick like dogs is particularly masterful. And they do jump over it.

The play *Minhauzena precības* (Munchausen's Marriage) by Mārtiņš Zīverts written in 1941 is a typical piece of that time having a dreamer and fantasizer in its centre with his dream about his dream land Ulubele. It should be noted that in the composition of the play Zīverts has imitated the form of the 18th century classical comedy – one of the models of harmony. Both the form of the play and its characters express the dream of peace and harmony. The plot of the play is based on the event when at a certain winter night both the entourage of the Russian tsarina headed by the nobleman Narishkin and the dreamer gentleman Munchausen seek shelter from the blizzard in the Dunte Manor run by the beautiful baroness Jakobine. Both noble gentlemen start the competition to win Jakobine's heart. This play, which is a typical character comedy, can be treated as a legend of the chivalric century; one of its key themes – saving face – is an essential feature of the chivalric century and the characteristic of a great personality. Munchausen and Narishkin are adversaries worthy of each other; there is pride, excitement, self-respect and independent character on both sides. Narishkin has no place either in the Dunte manor or in Jakobine's heart since he belongs to the mighty of this world controlling money and power. The premiere of *Minhauzena precības* directed by Eduards Smiļģis took place on 12 December 1941 in The Daile (Art) Theatre.

During the period of Nazi German occupation, The Daile Theatre was the leader among other Latvian theatres. The head of this theatre was one of the most distinquished Latvian directors Eduards Smiļģis. His creative style – artistic scope, monumental form, aestheticism, as well as the exquisite, graceful scenery of the performances and the characteristic ease of acting, which could be called a peculiar Smiļģis' "rococo", related unintentionally with some of the aesthetic requirements set by the Nazi regime. The theatre worked at a very high artistic level and experienced creative success. It had a strong and professional company of actors. Most of the actors working in the theatre were quite young, but they had already acquired the mastery of acting, were full of energy and ready to undertake complicated creative tasks.

Zīverts' comedy *Minhauzena precības*, permeated with the idea of humanism, was the first play directed by Smiļģis during the period of Nazi German occupation. *Minhauzena precības* is one of the most striking and significant productions of that time reflecting the juxta-position of the brutal dogmatic world and the subtle spiritual world, with the recurrent image of a dream, which conveys the idea of finding an escape in a dream. On the other hand, it can be inferred from the subtext that it is a dream about Latvia, which does not exist any more, and will possibly never exist again. The production of *Minhauzena precības* demonstrates very clearly theatre's role of harmonizing and spiritual enrichment. From the dark streets, the night-time curfew and the horrors of war, people came into the light, an exquisite, joyful world dominated by the atmosphere of the chivalric century, just like the tsar's courtiers in *Minhauzena precī-bas*, who found shelter from the winter cold and blizzard in the Dunte Manor by the fire-place. The atmosphere which completely overwhelmed the audience was one of the key trump cards of Smiļ-ģis' performances. Immersed in the atmosphere of the chivalric cen-tury and fantasizing together with Munchausen about his dream land Ulubele – the audience were given an opportunity to enjoy a specta-cular and witty comedy where wit sparkled like an old matured wine.

Edgars Zīle, one of the leading actors of The Daile Theatre at that time, played Munchausen as a sensitive dreamer rather than a swaggering braggart; he did not look for the image of the traditional

adventurer, liar and dreamer in the character of Munchausen, but for a man with romantic dreams who hates violence and humiliation. Due to his chivalrous spirit, Munchausen is a kindred soul to Don Quixote rather than to Gargantua with his grotesque fantasies, the features of which can also be traced in Munchausen's image. The dramatic conflict of the production results from Munchausen's spirituality and the subtlety of his soul, on the one hand, and the brutal force and spiritual robustness of Narishkin, played by Artūrs Filipsons, on the other hand.

The German press published in Riga at that time also paid considerable attention to *Minhauzena precības*, possibly due to the popularity of Munchausen's character; it described Zīverts as the author of a beautiful and valuable comedy. As the theatre observer of newspaper *Deutsche Zeitung im Ostland*, who signs with initials L. S., notes:

> The comedy abounds in sparkling humor and all kinds of jolly ideas. This comedy is above the average level as the author has managed to intertwine a piece of worldly wisdom into it. First and foremost, it is due to the character of gentleman Munchausen himself, which conveys deep humane content reaching above his adventurous personality, and the great liar and story-teller, appears in a different light. Surely, Munchausen is a well known character in the world; at the same time, his actual fate is unknown. Therefore, it would be important to show this successful, exquisite comedy on the German theatre stage in good translation. (*Deutsche Zeitung im Ostland* 1941: 5)

Minhauzena precības is a vivid example representing one group of productions characteristic of that time, which can be called the dream type performances and which emphasize escape in a dream, in the state of nirvana, thus finding refuge and dissociating oneself from the harsh, tragic reality. A similar trend could be observed in the theatres of other occupied countries. In the French theatre, for instance, several performances staged during the period of Nazi German occupation were based on fairytales and myths (*Renault and Armida* by Jean Cocteau etc.). The use of dream aesthetics, creating the imaginary space and thus alienating oneself from the reality, is also

characteristic of the Latvian literature of that time in general. Consequently, it can be concluded that repressive regimes generate these kinds of tendencies in art.

It is interesting that never before had such attention been paid to the theme of lies as in the war-time Latvian drama. Lies appear there in various gradations – from open hoaxing to romantic fantasies – there is a lot of talk about lies, and characters also lie in the plays. Lies have an important role in the plays like *Nauda*, *Intermeco*, *Čiko* (Chico), *Trauksme paradīzē*, *Kosma konfirmācija*, *Par purna tiesu* etc. This also reflects in a transformed way the disintegration of the stability and uniformity of the outlook of the world. The visible does not correspond to the essence any more; truth is hidden, or it is no longer possible to find one unequivocal answer, one truth.

During the period of World War II, Anšlavs Eglītis, one of the most prominent Latvian playwrights, started his creative career in the Latvian drama. His creative power of a dramatist manifests itself starting from the very first plays – it appears in the word play and in the witty dialogues full of paradoxes. Besides, his plays are very theatrical. Although Eglītis defines his own plays as character comedies, his first plays have to be attributed to situational comedies where action is guided by characters. One particular feature dominates in the characters, and they do not get deeper in the course of the action. In the plays *Kosma konfirmācija* and *Par purna tiesu* Anšlavs Eglītis portrays the artistic circles and race course public in a stereotypical, grotesque manner where peoples' relationships are subject to fame and win. The main characters of these plays, Ģirts Kaužēns and Leofrolds Brempelis, are ardent gamblers; at the same time, they are popular socialites and storytellers, lies being an integral part of their lives. They both live exclusively for themselves and their passion believing that the end justifies the means. The process of the game itself attracts Brempelis as much as the sum of money he might win, or even more – he bets on race horses. He plunges in the game actively and passionately with firm belief in his lucky star. Apart from these leading characters, there are also others that can be considered gamblers. In *Par purna tiesu*, for instance, it is Mrs. Bisher, the owner of a stable, whose desired trophy is

completely different – it is Brempelis himself, whom she manages to win being more successful in this game of life.

On 27 April 1944, Mārtiņš Zīverts offered his new play *Vara* to Smiļģis. The leading part – Mindaugs – was already tailored for The Daile Theatre premier Edgars Zīle. This play set in the 13th century, when the Lithuanian grand duke Mindaugs brought the lands belonging to other dukes under his rule, is the only tragedy created in the period of 1941–1945. It depicts the world of violence where human decency, faithfulness and love mean nothing. Everybody who enters Mindaugs' castle is pulled into the circle of violence. The play is a study of relations between power and an individual bringing forward one unsolvable contradiction – it is only violence that can protect an individual from violence. Mindaugs has been lying and killing for the sake of his state Lithuania. In the play, he lies for his own good for the first time when he wants to gain his love – Marte for himself. At this moment, he symbolically loses his invincibility and dies – as power does not need the individual who loves. When Mindaugs dies, the closed space – the inner courtyard of the castle where the action takes place – comes into contact with the outer world for the first time. Paradoxically, it turns out that by means of violence the state has been protected from the chaos reigning outside. The contact results in the victory of chaos. The play foresees the chaos endangering the nation in the future; it as if predicts the end of the German period. As literature and theatre researcher Viktors Hausmanis writes, "both in the drama *Nauda* and the tragedy *Vara* Zīverts tackle fundamental problems which, according to the writer, various epochs have posed and are still posing to mankind. There are spiritual values, altruism, and self-sacrifice on the one side and brutal, harsh, absurd power on the other. What should the mighty edifice of the world be based on? What should its foundation be? These are the issues Zīverts is preoccupied with; he is treating them without providing a ready-made answer, as no answer can be given." (Hausmanis 2004: 157)

During the period of Nazi German occupation, there was active search for new theatrical forms, and Mārtiņš Zīverts was the most active in this respect. A good example is the tragedy *Vara* where he develops the form of the so-called large one-act play based on the

principle of the continuous increase in the dramatic tension. Another innovation developed by Zīverts in this tragedy is the so-called grand scene. In *Vara*, it is Mindaugs' extensive monologue, during which the audience's attitude to this character changes dramatically.

Zīverts' *Vara* concludes a certain period in Latvian drama characterised by fundamental issues, high passions and strong characters. The future is going to be bleak; human relationships are the only value beyond the direct reach and influence of power – such are the future prospects Zīverts has encoded in the play *Vara* with the intuition of a talented artist, since it is war-time Latvia rather than the 13th century Lithuania the final words in the play: "Oh, Lithuanian men! Your state is burning there!" (Zīverts 1988: 376) refer to.

It can be seen that the tragedy *Vara* has been created under the influence of the themes of ancient and Renaissance tragedies, which have been subjectively transformed. There are also parallels with dramatic works created in other occupied countries during that time, the French drama of World War II, for instance – the plays by Jean Anouilh, The *Flies* by Jean-Paul Sartre etc., which emphasizes the contemporaneity and topicality of the issues raised in Zīverts' works.

There has to be noted one more trend in the Latvian theatre of that time – the increasing popularity of plays – parables. During the period of Nazi German occupation, the productions of Latvian contemporary drama as well as the Latvian and world classics were done purposefully (Zīverts' *Vara*, *Mīla stiprāka par nāvi* (Love is more Powerful than Death) by the classic of Latvian drama Rainis; *Mary Stuart* and *Fiesco* by Friedrich Schiller; Shakespeare's *Romeo and Juliet* and others). The events depicted in these plays based on historical situations and regularities gave an opportunity to draw parallels with the situation in Latvia and the public sentiments at that time. Theatre historian Māris Grēviņš notes: "It was mainly a classical repertoire dealing with the events of the distant past and treating seemingly local and intimate problems, the major and artistically most powerful works in the repertoire inevitably created associations with the actual reality." (Grēviņš 1971: 97) It has to be concluded that during the Nazi regime, the Latvian theatres openly used the so-called Aesopian language and some theatrical forms (performances-

parables, performances-dreams) which were further developed and became widespread in the subsequent Soviet times.

It is interesting that during the period of Nazi German occupation the Latvian theatres did not stage any plays that would be openly antagonistic to the recent Soviet regime experienced in 1940–1941. The play *Dienvidvējš* (Southern Wind) by Estonian writer August Mälk staged in The Daile Theatre in 1942 by the director Kārlis Veics is the only openly anti-Soviet work which was produced in the Latvian theatres in the period of German occupation. The play is set in Estonia in the first year of the Soviet regime in a fisherman's family. Kārlis Veics has kept to the principles of psychological realism focusing the performance on the inner emotional experience of the characters and highlighting the moments of dramatic conflicts – portraying strong characters tempered by hard work and caricaturing Soviet army men. This play appeared on the stages of several Latvian theatres during the period of German occupation: along with The Daile Theatre it was also produced by Jelgava Theatre, North Latvia Theatre, and Daugavpils Theatre.

When analysing what exactly caused such interest in Latvian original drama as well as national and world classics, it has to be concluded that, first and foremost, it is the humanistic values conveyed in these works, the high moral and ethical imperative, the message about the victory of good over evil, about individuals' ability to preserve their dignity and their moral core in spite of the adverse circumstances, and love for the native land. The strong, manly characters of the classics full of self-respect serve as an inspiration and role models in any historical epoch where an individual faces the problem of moral choice. These works portray people with a passionate heart and ardent, uncontrollable love for freedom who rise up against violence as well as moral and physical enslavement. Apart from that, both the national classics and Latvian original drama give a deep insight into the national character, which was particularly important for the preservation of the national identity at that time, also at the mental level. This is the reason why the producers of the performances paid such attention to the traditional virtues.

A good example is The Daile Theatre, which produced five performances of the Latvian classics, five Latvian contemporary plays and five performances of foreign classics from the end of 1941 to 1944. The German authorities had no objections to such a proportion in the repertoire. The position of the Reichskommisar for Ostland was essential for the Latvian theatre and the cultural life in general. According to him,

> National aspirations have to be channelled into the harmless area of culture, folk culture in particular (folk songs, national costumes, and traditional holidays); they have to be allowed to die out in a natural way. These activities of national culture must be air-tightly separated from the German cultural and social life. They have to reach a kind of a deadlock, from which an ambitious and industrious person is trying to get out as it prevents him from joining the German ruling class dominating in Europe. (Mēs apsūdzam 1965: 18)

It has to be concluded that this plan of the Nazi cultural policy to channel the Latvian national aspirations into the seemingly harmless area of culture and art by separating them from the German cultural society and environment, which was originally aimed at the natural gradual extinction of the Latvian culture, actually played into the hands of the Latvian theatre. By staging the classics and the works of Latvian contemporary drama and focusing on universal human values in the performances, the theatres managed to keep the Nazi politics and ideology out of their repertoire. There can be traced just a few separate elements characteristic of totalitarian art – monumentalism, amplitude, etc. However, they organically relate to the existing traditions of the Latvian theatre and fit in naturally in the common context. The theatres managed to preserve and develop the traditions established in the previous years (before the Soviet occupation). Aesthetic experiments, which could be found at the Polish theatre, for instance, working in very difficult conditions at that time, appeared rather seldom in the Latvian theatre.

There can be observed a paradoxical situation that to a certain extent the time of Nazi German occupation was the highest point in the previous twenty-year long period in the development of the

Latvian theatre. The theatres had strong companies of actors who were talented artistic personalities; they staged high quality repertoire, and there were created powerful artistic productions. Working in different conditions, but still trying to maintain the spirit of the national identity, being the theatre for spiritual survival, the Latvian theatre had much in common with the theatres in other occupied countries during World War II. At the end of the German occupation in the autumn of 1944 when the Soviet troops were approaching Riga and it was clear that another Soviet occupation was unavoidable, a large number of actors and other theatre artists emigrated to the West. Even though many artists who had left Latvia started making theatre productions in exile, their emigration was a tragic loss for the Latvian theatre, which was deeply impoverished. Actually, the year 1944 put a bold full stop at the end of the whole artistically bright period in the history of the Latvian theatre.

References

Amtsblatt Des Generalkomissars in Riga. 1941. Rīga: Deutche Verlage und Druckerei Gesellschaft im Ostland.
Deutsche Zeitung im Ostland. 1941. Münchhausens Wederkehr, December 14.
Dzene, L. 1990. Gabaliņi. – *Māksl*a, no. 8.
Grēviņš, M. 1971. *Dailes teātris*. Rīga: Liesma.
Hausmanis, V., Kalnačs, B. 2004. *Latviešu drāma 20. gadsimta pirmā puse*. Rīga: Zinātne.
Mēs apsūdzam. 1965. Rīga: Liesma.
Zīverts, M. 1988. *Lugas.* Rīga: Zinātne.

Anti/pastoral Landscapes and Places in Lithuanian Literature: Looking for Paradise Lost

> *Where are you now, my old friends,*
> *the people, whom I grown up with,*
> *like with shrubs, with fields, with hills' gravel pits*
> *where are you now, and where are those fields,*
> *where are retteries, where is that high summer's sky,*
> *where is December's snow?*

Jonas Mekas

Natural places, pure landscapes "untouched" by civilization have always had a special place in the Lithuanians' national conscious-ness. Indeed, for a hero of our prose nature is a space which he runs to from disasters of life, observes Violeta Kelertienė (Kelertienė 2006: 108). Moreover, in nature, especially in the forest the Lithua-nian finds a physical asylum. I n the national mythology the forest was a sacred place, to some extent even a live cemetery: there are gathered his dead ancestors turned into the trees. All partisans and rebels of Lithuania who hid in the forest, found there a shelter and could successfully fight the enemy (ib.). That is why for Lithuanians the forest is not just a mystical, pagan sacred space, but also a safe haven – a peculiar synonym for the Christian paradise. Under critical historical circumstances, which threatened the survival of the nation (wars, exile, Soviet occupation, censorship), the forest, the wood (later the village was included) were the places to which people were running, where they were looking for support and shelter, and which were perceived as the lost paradises (pastoral).

Talking in pastoral terms and looking at some particular places as natural areas where everything is possible as in paradise, defines the literature of post/colonial countries and nations, notes Lawrence Buell (Buell 2005: 144–145). Moreover, this "new worlds" pastoral, in time, helped to give rise to different forms of pastoral nationalism

on the part of the postcolonial intelligentsias, such as the wilderness cult in the USA and the Negritude movement in French-speaking Africa and the Caribbean. "Nations *do* generate distinctive forms of pastoral or outback nationalism (e.g. the myth of the Bush for Australia; the mystique of the far North for Canada; the iconicity of the Black Forest for German culture; the myth of the jungle for Creole cultures of Brazil, Venezuela, and other Latin American nations)" (ib. 16). The germs of unique – *Lithuanian pastoral* – can be found in Kristijonas Donelaitis and Antanas Baranauskas (the agro-mythical world view, the symbolism of the native soil, the idealization of work and nature) also at the beginning of 20th century in the Lithuanian poet Maironis' texts that motivated idealistic national thinking and gave rise to the peculiar Lithuanian culture, and specific–nature based nationalism. Thus the national (Lithuanian) pastoral was formed under the influence of both: the old pagan (mythical world-view that claimed an inherent unity of the Lithuanian and nature) and the Christian tradition fortified by Maironis' lyrics.

In this way the traditional pastoral narrative "invited" the reader to either the wild, primordial oasis, akin to ancient Arcadia, or the idealized harmonious natural environment having a meaning of the Christian paradise (lost). In any case, the mentioned pastoral toponyms – they are exclusively natural, "untouched" places and landscapes providing a hope of "unspoiled" and safe excitation for all Lithuanians. According to Rimvydas Šilbajoris, nature's symbolism frequently embodies the opposition between a free, pre-war Lithuania, envisioned as "Arcadia, an ancient mythological country, a kingdom of freshness and greenness", and Lithuania, suffering from the consequences of Soviet occupation:

> The Second World War shattered this pastoral scene and sent many of the best poets into exile. The Arcadian image of their previous poetry now became a paradise lost, and the poets could hardly bear to speak of anything else. Consequently, the same home landscape now left behind continued at the center of their creative effort, and the framework of nature remained as the dominant system of images. (Šilbajoris 1997: 5–6).

Such a vision of the home landscapes and native places as a lost Christian paradise, perhaps is best reflected in the Lithuanian émigré writer Jonas Mekas' poetry collection *Semeniškių idilės (Idylls of Semeniskes)*:

> We watched, how men, under the burning midsummer's sky,/ how woman, in colored and varied shawls, go along the swaying fields in the heat,/ breaking mowed hay swaths,- [...]/ whether, sitting in emptied, bare autumn's fields,/ under the open and torn by winds tree,/ crouched in a broad and wornout by elder brown coats,/ popped coals, watching, how with big and humorous, wide numbers,/ happened to come and making noise autumnally, in starlings air-blasts tear mellowed, the last rowan berries [...]/ in rye stubble and mow down meadows/ go cows' and sheep's flocks,/ only the shepherds' fireplaces burn in the wind. (Mekas 1997: 49).

The memories of a bright and carefree past, a return to the idealized world of childhood as a kind of paradise lost as a constant literary signifier, according to Raymond Williams, means nothing else than an intention "to beat the present" (Williams 1975: 12). Such a withdrawal to an idealized childhood world and/ or the traditional Lithuanian village, which perhaps no longer exists, but which is again revived in memories and dreams is basically typical of all the mid 20th century's emigrants' writing, e.g. Marius Katiliškis *Užuovėja (The Lee)*, Jonas Mekas *Semeniškių idilės (Idylls of Semeniskes)*, Pulgis Andriušis *Kitoj pusėj ežero (On the Other Side of the Lake)*. The discourse of retreat, a possibility to escape from "our manners", "our climate", "our age", into a literary construct is an essential/ fundamental pastoral movement, allowing us to define all pastoral narratives (Gifford 1999: 45). In this way a retreat to the world of childhood, an immersion into a state of dreams and memories in the analyzed Lithuanian emigrants' texts should be understood and regarded as a conscious literary narrative strategy, allowing the author and the reader at least for a while to forget, to escape from the historical/political/social reality that is experienced as intimidating and destructive.

MAČAITYTĖ-KASELIENĖ

The perception of the lost homeland in terms of the culture/nature opposition in Lithuanian émigré writing may be seen as a response to the Soviet occupation. Collectivization, as well as the industrialization and urbanization is understood as destroying our national – Lithuanian – culture. The village was not really a form of pastoral until the Second World War. At the end of the 19th and the beginning of the 20th century the village was a place for living and as a natural environment/landscape became an embodiment of harmonious stability and security. After the Second World War, when Lithuanian writers escaped to Germany, and later to America, it is not the forest, woods, wild landscape, but the village that is the place that is dreamed of as a lost paradise. In the middle of 20th century the native soil, husbandry scenes, the agrarian landscape, even the village community and connections with it become symbols of "Lithuanianness". Our national culture, the national pastoral and the specific Lithuanian national self-consciousness are probably best revealed in Jonas Mekas' book *Laiškai iš niekur (Letters from Nowhere)*:

> I called my column *Letters from Nowhere*. But while reading all these letters I felt, that those letters were also from Nowhere. If you don't have a land, so you are nowhere./ Earth, earth's, for earth, earth, with earth, on earth, oh, earth!/ That is how my teacher, Šernienė, taught./ Neglect the land – and all cities will collapse./ Neglect the peasants – and begin to dig your last hole. (Mekas 1997: 29).

And continuous:

> And farmers, tillers, peasants were, are and will be – and I will always be with you, wherever I would be: here, there, or Nowhere. There is nothing more precious and more sacred than earth, all of us mother earth, and all of you, who love her and work and eat bread in their sweat. (Ib. 145)

Thus to the land, the traditional Lithuanian village, the agrarian worldview, rural landscapes, even earthworks are ascribed not just the meaning of the nation's spiritual life, the viability of life, but also

one's physical survival in difficult historical circumstances, as well as resistance to foreign (Russian) rule and cultural imperialism.

Like Lithuanian literary and cultural anthropologist Vytautas Kubilius has perceptively noted,

> When a nation loses its state, the native land remains the last one basis of presence. The poetic mythology of the native soil, as manifestly declared the anthology "The Land" published in Chicago in 1951, is rooted in the occupied literature as a keynote of resistance, hope and sorrow (M. Martinaitis, J. Strielkūnas, J. Aputis creation). In many poetic and prose works land becomes the fundamental word, surrounded by the aureole of romantic idealization as the most important principle of Lithuanian national consciousness and culture. The emblematic homeland image legitimized by the nation's identity and agrarian overlap, not a bit affected by the country's industrialization, took on mythological depth and fundamentalism. (Kubilius 1995: 618–619).

That is the emphasis of the native land mythology, where the Lithuanian is perceived as a tiller or a farmer, having an agrarian mentality. Precisely this – the unique agricultural worldview is understood as the only hope for the nation's survival in historical cataclysms. The preserved, cherished values of the traditional – nature based – culture, the agrarian self-consciousness – these are the elements embodying the Lithuanians ideal, thereby becoming an opposition to the East (Russian) and the émigré writers' western culture. On the image of the native soil various national mythologies and/ or idealistic, utopian narratives, claiming tradition, national culture and Lithuanian national identity are based. Thus the *land* – consoling, providing the vital forces, spreading vitality – becomes the dominant pastoral image in 20th-century Lithuanian literature of emigration.

According to Stephen Daniels, national identities are coordinated, often largely defined, by "legends and landscapes", by stories of golden ages, enduring traditions, heroic deeds and dramatic destinies located in ancient or promised home-lands with hallowed sites and scenery. Landscapes "picture the nation" (Daniels 1993: 5). "As exemplars of moral order and aesthetic harmony, particular

landscapes achieve the status of national icons" (ib.). Lithuanian literature which reflects the forms of nature-based nationalisms, is not an exception. Following from what was mentioned above, the forest, fields, villages, the native land – are places, where Lithuanians could go and find shelter in destructive socio-historical circumstances. Moreover, these natural places and particular landscapes of Lithuania are actively emotionally experienced and realized as a part of individual as well as national identity:

> I think that it does not matter what nature or landscape people or nations live in. What is important is what he ascribes to that landscape.
> And, we ascribe a lot to our small, modest, simple landscape. We made it warm, delicate, sweet, and lyrical. We made it with our songs, with wooden ware we made it like that, with our poetry, our every move and every touch we made it like that.
> And I drove through America, and looked at things, trees, works, and everything was in one dimension. No smells evoked by those trees, they are alien to me, and there are no feelings, no memories (Mekas *Letters from Nowhere* 1997: 121– 122).

The creation of an emotional connection with the unique homeland landscape, the realization of some specific locations (places and landscapes) as pastoral – protecting, *own* – this is the result of various textual and cultural narratives. It is meaningful that these specific landscapes and places throughout "picturing" the nation became symbols capable of "speaking" the meanings of national and cultural values.

The importance of *national pastoral images* was confirmed during the second Soviet occupation when the Russification policies, viewed in retrospect, were directed at their suppression or complete elimination. According to Elena Baliutytė, in the "Soviet period" Lithuanian literature clashed with a very strong anti-nationalist campaign, primarily evidenced in the especially intensive harassments of the so-called rural prose (Baliutytė 2002). The native landscape seen as "the most important manifestation of nationalism and aestheticism" becomes highly supervised and controlled. Therefore literary censorship prescribed moving the plot into the city, writing about

working-class themes and, most importantly – "no love, no nature" (ib. 43). However, despite such a strict control of literary and cultural life, most 20th century literary narratives: 1) retain the images of pure, "untouched" nature (forest, woods, wild areas); 2) reiterate the symbolism of the native soil (including the land, village, rural – Christian – community); 3) continue the Lithuanian cultural tradition of the rural word-view and national agrarian self-consciousness; 4) reflect nature's scenery, invoking nature-based nationalism (magical realism, nature symbolism, the Aesopian language – the main techniques that are used in this period's Lithuanian literature).

The end of the 20th century and the beginning of the 21st century mark radical changes not only in the Lithuanian literature, but also in the national consciousness and self-awareness. The subject of contemporary literature is a rover, a nomad, a person without place, lost in space and in time, and lost in the seared virtues. However, this "unplacedness" differs from the texts of the exiled authors, because the person of the end of the 20th century and the beginning of the 21st century does not find support and stability neither in the nature of the motherland, the fields of the homeland, nor in the streets of the urbanized city:

> What kind of years can be, when this sort of time, then there are no years. Plague destroys years. Eats everything. And cities consumed. And port disappeared. Just Vilnius exists, says, it is still alive there and counts the years. And here are no years anymore. What years here will be, when nothing left, so from where could those years be. Villages gone into forest, trees watch through the chimneys, before burnt them as firewood, and now they grow in stove, look out through chimneys and do not see people [...] what times is this, if it's death. (Ivaškevičius 1998: 68).

The traditional agrarian-mythical worldview, the close connection/ identification with native soil, an ability to discover a shelter and support in nature (traditional national pastoral images: forest, woods, native fields, Lithuanian landscape) are drastically dismantled, deconstructed and/ or mocked by giving them totally opposite (the nation's death, moral failure and destruction) meanings.

MAČAITYTĖ-KASELIENĖ

The inability of the contemporary Lithuanian literary subject's to find some stable, safe, consolidating places becomes a dominant textual element on which narratives of the apocalypse are based. For today's subject neither traditional pastoral toponyms (native land, village, forest, parents homestead or his childhood home), nor the more artificial spaces constructed by contemporary culture: city, hospitals, museums, streets, etc. provide security. Furthermore, all spaces, like the city itself are experienced as mysterious, frightening, unsafe, aggressive, or even hostile to human beings:

> S. had to decide quickly whether to stay for the night in the desert, which frighten him, or to go to town, which did not seem safe either.
>
> However, he decided to go to town. Even though there are Vulture and Nobody, but these two creatures frightened him less than the Beast lurking somewhere. (Janušaitis, Lideikis 2005: 56–57).

It seems that at the turn of the 20th and the 21st centuries there is no place to which as into a Christian paradise lost or an ancient mythical country of dreams and illusions – an Arcadia – to run and which would provide a soothing refuge, harmony and shelter.

What causes such apocalyptic tendencies and the disruption of the pastoral vision? Like Indrė Žakevičienė notes, "the symbol of agrarian culture that marks the spirit of those living in Lithuania is still visible but hardly described" (Žakevičienė 2007: 168). Today we are experiencing a specific – "a new displaced persons" – situation. There is a paradox: we feel labelled, not only pulled away from land, but also displaced – of our own free will; the physical body obeying the laws of the age of globalization, but the spirit still vaguely longing for the still existing yet unfashionable Arcadia (ib.). "In our postmodern age we dismiss this Arcadian image as an idealized pastoral myth", claim western literature's and culture's researchers (Gifford 2006: 3). It could be anticipated that these changes, brought about by globalization and the western culture are especially deeply and painfully experienced in post-colonial Lithua-

nia, where the cultural tradition, as well as national values were cherished for several centuries up till now.

However, the analysis of contemporary Lithuanian literature reveals that talking in pastoral terms is impossible after materialism, alienation, the loss of contact with nature, with the surrounding environment in general. The loss of space, fluttering in various non-places, the inner emptiness, the existential "gap" is visualized through frightening dreams and nightmares:

> Decided to change us. Set this forest on us. We flop down from plague, from starvation and from death, but neither starvations kills, nor the forest fells lack of eating. Land feeds it, but not us anymore. There are no mysteries anymore. If the tree watches through the chimney – what can be mystery? Just Vilnius still holds, and where he is – I already don't know well. We are going to Vilnius too, just like you, but we lost our direction. Or to be more precise, we know the direction, in the East Vilnius was, when we started to walk towards it, but is it still there – I cannot tell, because everything has changed so drastically, that we could have passed through. Lawks some barefoot refugee soldier would tell us what kind of place this is. He knows even less, because until the war he hasn't seen it even in his dreams. (Ivaškevičius 1998: 69).

In contemporary Lithuanian literature the village is not the object of visualization or idealization and exists only peripherally. The land, the forest, the woods, the native fields, the village, the rural landscape used to be the basis for the Lithuanian national identity, in the 21st century become objects of utility or a source of profit. The struggle between the traditional forms of "Lithuanianness" (Lithuanian – nature's child, ploughman, tiller) and the western culture's innovations; the interface between the Lithuanian's closure, stability and openness brought about by globalization determine the state of uncertainty, fear and emptiness in contemporary Lithuanian literature.

It is meaningful, that this state of confusion, uncertainty, loss and obscurity is narrated not only in literature but also in the newest photo album *Unseen Lithuania* (2009) as well:

Landscapes drowned in fog become a reference to the obscure, unstable, vanishing (and maybe the already vanished?) traditional Lithuanian national identity. Efforts to reflect the national identity in the changed environment; torn between the traditional (national) culture's nationalist forms and the obligation to escape from it have resulted in a "picture" of Lithuania as a mystical, fantastic, an almost unreal place, a *non-place*, to be precise.

Contemporary Lithuanian literary narratives reflect similar, basically identical meanings. Changes in both the historical and political but also the cultural context (the restoration of Independence, the European Union bringing western culture, the processes of globalization, etc.) call into question the effectiveness of the traditional pastoral imagery:

> Does anybody know it? Lithuania? Not anymore.
>   Everyone, who knew, left.
>   Here nobody knows her anymore. (Ivaškevičius 1998: 72).
> I should look for a different – fragrant and not outworn Homeland's. I should have to tame it little by little, later – take care of it and cherish it. For that, new one, would not be enough just a doggy affection and loyalty. (Jakučiūnas, 2007: 81).

Lithuania, with traditional – "old-fashioned" – mythologies is unrecognizable, unknown, alien to today's modern person. Contemporary texts emphasize the "wastage", disability, inefficiency of traditional

pastoral images and places. Moreover, the predominant mock pastoral or anti-pastoral narratives in Lithuanian literature indicate the necessity of revision, transformation, and/or renewal:

> Lithuania is the shoes. It is important to well-worn it on time. (Ivaškevičius 1998: 75).
> Clapped with palm through the floor, solid floor, it was to walk. "I would only stroll after you, – said for home. – I would not go anywhere from you, but I need to leave just once, at least one cartel like this, when you don't know, whether you comeback [...] "I would stroll after you", but it is necessary to leave just once, - thought again. – You are good animals (livestock), but the most important true, you, old man, look after the home, maybe someday we will stoke, stoke, old man, stoke again if I return.
> (Ib. 76)

Traditional pastoral images (home, livestock, Lithuania itself) are realized as useful, precious, having "served" us for centuries (the significance of shoe's), but already threadbare elements ("It is important to well-worn it on time"). Their examination/testing and review is unavoidable ("it is necessary to leave just once") in newly changed – geopolitical, multicultural – circumstances. In contemporary texts alongside traditional pastoral images the emerging irony precludes the reader's empathic attitude to the text. Thus a non-emotional, distanced audience-text relation is promoted.

These peculiarities: 1) an invitation to think, a deeply critical attitude towards traditional pastoral images; 2) their examination/ testing in contemporary changed (social, geo-political, cultural, historical) settings. Thus traditional pastoral images in contemporary literary narratives are placed next to pop-culture, innovations brought by globalization, western cultural elements); 3) the desire not to deny drastically, destroy or "get rid of" (like in the typically postmodern anti-pastoral western literature and culture), but to reconsider traditional pastoral images and the national cultural elements, and maybe refresh them again, return to them ("you, old man, look after the home, maybe someday we will stoke, stoke, old man, again stoke, if I return") allow to state that contemporary Lithuanian

MAČAITYTĖ-KASELIENĖ

literature is not dominated by the destructive, negative, apocalyptic anti-pastoral but a version of the new – *complex pastoral[1]*.

The narrator of the contemporary Lithuanian writer Gintaras Beresnevičius' novel *Paruzija* (2005) speaks about significant changes not just in the external (in social, geo-political, cultural, historical) reality, but also in the national consciousness and Lithuanian self-awareness:

> – Today busy with nonsense we didn't notice that we exist in an island. We exist in politics, economics, Europe, moreover in the "Centre of the Europe", but we, thanks to God, are aside from terror. Of course, this may be just the matter of days – absurd strokes of terror hit in totally unexpected and in most innocent places. But today we are in an island [...] we got to the bay of the history and became an island after all. With the island's mentality. (Beresnevičius 2005: 123).

Today's texts are based on a desire to find some "fresh", pure, "clean", unspoiled places – natural areas that the 21st century's Lithuanian nation could identify with. Thus Lithuanians are represented like different *others*, having an island mentality. Such representations mark the writer's aspiration for the nation that has missed its own identity, is unable to find any stable values.

The island as pastoral image of Lithuania is also reflected in the 21st century's photo narratives (Jovaiša 2009):

---

[1] *Complex pastoral* – Leo Marx's "invented" term. Opposite to *sentimental pastoral/ pastoral of sentiments* (that is inherent in Lithuanian émigré texts, as well as the 20th-century traditional literary/cultural narratives) this kind of pastoral is often critical, affecting the reader's thoughts, but not feelings. These old and new pastoral images and the newest forms of the nation's self-consciousness have the purpose of revising/examining traditional national pastoral images and/or traditional narratives of the sentimental pastoral. Therefore, according to L. Marx, the complex pastoral acts as some particular "reaction power, cutting its idyll" (Marx 1964: 70).

Natural, "untouched" landscapes reveal the intention of restoring the lost pastoral. An island as a closed, protected space becomes a place of delight. "Pastoral, in fact, is that *other* place which the human mind ceaselessly constructs as a place apart from the everyday's pressing actualities", notes Stephen Watson (Watson 2005: 148). Thus in traditional pastoral narratives and in the contemporary literary narratives the basic objective remains the same – to provide consoling dreams about the nation's existential succession, its identity, oneness and individuality.

One of the best known and most popular Lithuanian writers Gintaras Beresnevičius has probably the best explained the "mission" of contemporary art:

> And still the responsibility remains – to name the current condition. It is not named, I emphasize that; what is more, "namings" may and should be done differently. Naming encourages, I would say, social acuity. Naming provokes discussion. Naming is important, that we could exist in time and space – without political constituents. Intellectual while provoking must name the present, from it's positions – past, that is history and future [...].

Fights take place not under the carpet, but deeper than whiles' paths; intellectuals' task, in fact, – to be anesthesiologists. To offer dreams because otherwise it is too horrible. (Beresnevičius 2003).

References

Baliutytė, E. 2002. *Laiko įkaitė ir partnerė: lietuvių literatūros kritika 1945–2000.* Vilnius: Lietuvos literatūros ir tautosakos institutas.

Beresnevičius, G. 2005. *Paruzija.* Vilnius: Tyto alba.

Beresnevičius, G. 2003. *Intelektualas: misija.* Metai. Vol. 3.

Buell, L. 2005. *The Future of Environmental Criticism: Environmental Crisis and Literary Imagination.* Blackwell Publishing.

Daniels, S. 1993. *Fields of Vision: Landscape Imagery and National Identity in England and United States.* Polity Press.

Gifford, T. 1999. *Pastoral.* London and New York: Routledge.

Gifford, T. 2006. *Essays in Post-pastoral Practice.* Athens and London: The University of Georgia Press.

Ivaškevičius, M. 1998. *Istorija nuo debesies.* Vilnius: Lietuvos rašytojų sąjungos leidykla.

Jakučiūnas, A. 2007. *Tėvynė.* Vilnius: Lietuvos rašytojų sąjungos leidykla.

Janušaitis, E., Lideikis, M. 2005. *Nuo Roko iki Abelio.* Kaunas: Naujasis lankas.

Jovaiša, M. 2009. *Neregėta Lietuva.* Vilnius.

Kubilius, V. 1995. *XX amžiaus literatūra.* Vilnius: Alma littera.

Marx, L. 1964. *The Machine in the Garden: Technology and the Pastoral Ideal in America.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Mekas, J. 1997. *Laiškai iš niekur.* Vilnius: Baltos lankos.

Mekas, J. 1997. *Semeniškių idilės. Reminiscensijos.* Vilnius: Baltos lankos.

Kelertienė, V. 2006. *Kita vertus.* Vilnius: Baltos lankos.

Šilbajoris, R. 1974. *An Intelectual's Encounter with Nature – Modern Trends in Lithuania Poetry.* Lituanus. 20(2): 5–14.

Watson, S. 2005. *Bitter Pastoral: The Meaning of the Cedarberg.* English Academy Review. Vol. 22: 146–159.

Williams, R. 1975. *The Country and The City.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Žakevičienė, I., Višomirskytė, V., Ragaišienė, I. 2007. *Ekokritikos akivarai.* Kaunas: Vytauto Didžiojo universiteto leidykla.

Symbols as Means of Creating Cultural Communication and Identity. The Estonian Case[*]

In the present article my main interest is to find out which kind of role symbols play in the self-description of Estonian culture and in the internal communication and how the "cultural formatting" of the society has occurred.[1]

Estonian culture can broadly be divided into two epochs. The first one comprises prehistoric (Raun 1987: 4–13) ancient Estonian culture during the period 1000 – 1200 (Talve 2004: 7–23) until the beginning of the 19th century. In the context of European culture it denotes the involvement of a geographical periphery into history, so to say "europisation of Europe" (Bartlett 1993: 388–419), because already the term "Ancient Estonia" sound paradoxical in comparison with the Early Middle Ages in Europe. The gap between Ancient Estonia and the cradle of the European culture – Ancient Greece is at least 1,400 years, and in regard to the oldest European epics *Iliad* and *Odyssey* recorded in 750 and 650 BC respectively.

[1] I have discussed the problems of the identity and self-description in Estonian culture from different aspects also in earlier articles, published in the author's collection *Tuikav tekst* (Throbbing texts; Veidemann 2006) and *Eksistentsiaalne Eesti* (Existential Estonia; Veidemann 2010). The articles published in English are: "About the Meaning of Estonian Literature" (Veidemann 2007: 63–72), "About the Boundary/Boundaries of Estonian Culture" (Veidemann 2009: 129–141) and "History of Estonian Literature as a Kernel Structure of Estonian Culture" (Veidemann 2010: 75–84) and in German "Fr.R. Kreutzwald's "Kalevipoeg" als ein Heiliger Text der estnischen literarischen Kultur" (Veidemann 2004: 263 - 268) and "Eine kurze Einführung zum Verständnis der estnischen Literatur" (Veidemann 2005: 19–49).

VEIDEMANN

The first epoch is characterised by a process which Juri Lotman describes in his cultural semiotics as the creation of space sphere in terms of "internal" and "external", "intrinsic" and "alien" (Lotman 1990: 309). The so-called traditional societies having the animistic approach to the world also characterising the culture of Ancient-Estonia, irreversibly influenced the emergence and spread of the monotheistic religion. Alongside the conquest of the Teutonic Order in the 13th century, the forcible invasion of Christianity commenced in Estonia and Livonia. Text connected with Christianity, hereby we also have to consider rituals as "texts" and their acceptance caused, according to Lotman "a powerful cultural explosion", which transferred the former cultural tradition into a "dynamic state" (Lotman 1990: 293).

In ancient times Estonians lived in villages and parishes and their **symbolic communication could be described as adjusting.** Estonian-Finnish ethnologist and cultural historian Ilmar Talve has called the oral tradition "practical poetry" because folk songs, fairy tales, proverbs and customs (rituals) served the purpose of explaining the world, transferring the traditional knowledge and elementary organisation of the society (Talve 2004: 21). Estonian folk faith is especially rich in symbols in regard to the adjusting-practical function (Paulson 1997: 158), including folk medicine. The etymology of diseases, diagnosis and treatment was surrounded by a dense network of symbols, due to which we can discuss the phenomenon of peculiar "clinical reality" (Kleinman 1980: 42, Honko 1983: 43). It comprises beliefs, expectations, norms, behavioural patterns connected with diseases, communication between the healer and the patient, thera-peutic procedures and the evaluation of the achieved results. (By the way, today natural and alternative treatment is also influenced by geo-cultural conditions and peculiarities).

Various magic activities (sacrifice and magic sayings e.g. incantation and exorcism, but also creating impact in literature by using palindromes and other magic formulas) helped to reaffirm the pact with nature. Hereby, the magic procedure did not lose its practical purpose to ensure necessary conditions, procure means (food), achieve economic benefits and establish reconciliation with natural forces. However, several anthropologists (see e.g. Kiev

(editor) 1964) and psychological approaches (Krippner 2004) indicate that shamanism could also have had a practical purpose – psychotherapy.

The places of action acquired sacral-symbolic value. In Estonian folk heritage communication with the forest has always been of special importance. The importance of the forest and the cult of trees have provided the basis for handling the earlier periods of folk culture as the tree culture (see Viires, A. 2000). Burial places in the woods acquired a sacral meaning in the word "his" (sacred grove). Forest fairies were the soul of the forest (rulers), which have proved to be the most viable among the anthropomorphic natural spirits (Loorits 1949, Paulson 1997: 58–59). Bigger trees growing by roads or near crossroads have been marked with a cross in honour of a deceased person. This reflects the mental picture rooted in people during thousands of years that after death the human spirit is transferred into a tree (Kõivupuu 2009: 28–29). Big rocks with holes or of meteoric origin were used as sacrificial stones.

This illustrates the process of how natural objects were transferred into objects of cultural importance and acquired a symbolic meaning. Today the tradition is retained in the custom of planting trees in the honour of people or events. For example, on the slope of the song festival ground in Tallinn oaks planted in the commemoration of the song festivals form a whole park already. The same trend is observed in placing boulders. The Estonian semiotician Anti Randviir who has studied the intercourse of nature and text has described a case, which involves both – trees and a commemoration stone (Randviir 2000).

The conversion of Estonians to Christianity in the 13th century denoted the transfer from the earlier magic system of relationships characterised by contractual and gradual withdrawal from the religious consciousness. "A religious act" as stated by Juri Lotman "is not based on exchange but on the unconditional dispossession of oneself to the dominion of the other party". (Lotman 1999: 240). In symbolic communication it denotes the replacement of a pragmatic (equally useful) relationship by a sacral relationship. No exchange of values occurs in religion as it was characteristic of magic consciousness. Communication here is linear (in one line): communication of a

man restricted by his/her lifetime against eternity (hereafter, para-
dise) representing the absoluteness. Absoluteness (God-eternity)
speaks to people through symbols. The volume and complexity of
the repertoire of symbols requires an intermediator and the position
is taken by the church.

Although "alien texts" (Catholic Christianity) entered into Esto-
nian peasants' *resp* folk culture, people got used to it due to adjusting
communication. E.g. sacrificing known in folk religion obtained a
new content, the church "synchronised" religious holidays with the
cyclic rituals (Midsummer's Day, Yule) of the traditional calendar.
According to Ilmar Talve the "cultural explosion" caused by the
acceptance of Christianity constitutes in the fact "that the doctrine
developed by the church was far ahead of the "folk faiths" as the
system had no blanks, and gave answers to all questions agonizing a
reasoning person" (Talve 2004: 49).

The human being was shown how to live in the world created by
God following Christian ethics, norms and symbols in order to
deserve bliss and eternal life after death. Death was much closer to
people in the Early Middle Ages than today because the average life
expectancy was much shorter, life was a constant fight of war,
famine and epidemics. Christianity denoted the entrance of the
existential dimension into Estonian culture, becoming later one of
recurrent features and the *primus motor* of Estonian literature
(Veidemann 2010: 179–191).

The above-mentioned "Swedish time" (which has acquired
mythological-symbolic colouring in the discourse of Estonian
history) (See Laidre 1994: 957–962) characterises the (written)
invasion of the elite culture versus the folk (oral) culture, which
considerably deformed people's treatment of the universe (Veispak
1990: 244). The training was "so to say enforced and meant a large
scale interference with the development of folk culture." (Vahtre
1992: 28). Learning based on religious texts moulded the conscious-
ness of new generations to the extent that people started to feel
themselves as members of the Christian congregation. At the end of
the 17th century, which is considered to be the highlight of Estonian
aculturisation (from the European point of view civilisation)
(Veispak 1990: 244), Estonian peasants donated church bells,

chandeliers and chalices etc. to the church. Stone crosses were put up in graveyards; fences were built to keep wild animals away from the graves (Paul 1999: 62). This is an explicit example of accepting Christian-symbolic communication, although it might have comprised a lot of formality and obligation. However, the church still represented foreign power to Estonians till the end of the 19th century.

Although the importance of Reformation in the emergence of the Estonian language is indisputable, an important phase of Estonians becoming a part of Europe (Europeization) is rather the religious awakening of the fraternity congregations in the 18th century. Fraternity congregations gathered in houses of prayer, taprooms or in some peasant's threshing barn. Unlike going to church, they went there of their free will and interest. The religious information exchanged in the fraternity congregation, praying and singing increased self-awareness (Paul 1999: 62). Namely, this is how the Estonian "awareness of congregation" ("congregation" as a symbol) was formed, which in the 19th century became the mental foundation of the nation (*resp* "Estonian speaking congregation") and the primary civil society (unions, organisations). The irony of the situations is reflected in the fact that as long as the church was fighting against Estonian paganism, animism remained viable, but the sacred groves and other holy places were chopped down by the Estonians who had joined the movement of fraternity congregations (Ilja 1994: 62). The fact may be treated as the withdrawal or even the end of the adaptable (adjusting) communication.

The second, or the modern epoch of Estonian culture has its beginnings in the 19th century. It includes the creation of the Baltic-German Estophilia influenced by Romanticism in Europe, the beginning of Estonian national journalism and literature, which formed the basis of the awareness of Estonians as a nation (the years between 1830–1870). It also witnesses the development of the national cultural institutions (general song festivals, theatre, literature and music associations) at the end of the 19th century, on which the many-sided Estonian professional high culture was based in the first decades of the 20th century.

The symbolic communication of this epoch is characterised as focusing. The focusing use of symbols may be of different intensity, and it may develop in different and even opposite directions, however, the creation of symbols serves certain purposes (the development and consolidation of a national or the state ideology, mobilisation of people and the society in critical situations).

At the beginning of the 19th century the Estonian language becomes a symbol of the developing Estonian intellectuals. For example, the first Estonian national poet Kristian Jaak Peterson (1801–1822) writes his ode "The Moon" (1818) and claims for the right of eternal existence for "the language of this country". Or paraphrasing: (the Estonian) language was elevated to the level of the ideal.

The Estonian language had not yet become a unified national language and Peterson could have referred to the language as a divine attribute as described by Wilhelm Friedrich Hezel (1754–1824) – his exegetics professor in Tartu University, and Rosenplänter – an authorityative language philosopher, who published the Estophilic magazine *Beiträge*. At that time Hezel already represented "the anachronistic tendency, according to which the language saved from the flood by Noah and his family became the original language of mankind." (Undusk 2001: 16). Peterson's message had to wait for the readers for an entire century.

The creation of symbols and communication within the next decades was definitely influenced by the doctor and the literary man, the lecturer of the Estonian language in Tartu University Friedrich Robert Faehlmann and his "Estonian legends" presented in the German language at the Learned Estonian Association on the second of February 1838 and numerous later publications in Estonian – the first one was published in the *Perno Postimees* in 1866. The composition of this Estonian pseudo-mythological work follows Kristfrid Ganander's *Mythologia Fennica* published in Turku in 1789, the adapted version of which was translated from Swedish into German by K. J. Peterson. The ancient archetypes and heroes performing symbolic acts included such characters as Vanemuine, Ilmarine, Lämmeküne, Vibuane, Kalev and Kalevipoeg living in Kaleva.

The turning point in the symbolic communication of the 19th century was the publication of Fr. R. Kreutzwald's epic *Kalevipoeg* (in 1853, 1857–1861, 1862). To prove that it was a "national project", a patriotic goal to create a symbolic text for Estonians is Kreutzwald's letter sent to the Learned Estonian Association (16.11.1853) after the initial version of *Kalevipoeg* was finished. He admits that *Kalevipoeg* is the main work of his life, which, like Homer today, will be found 1000 years later in libraries of people who do not understand a word of it. *Kalevipoeg* started functioning as a text creating a nation (Undusk 1994: 148, Talvet 2003: 888).

Like the Bible draws together Christians, Kreutzwald's epic attracted the nation to the story of Kalevipoeg and the system of values of the epic, inspiring the national feeling of togetherness and self-confidence. August Annist (1899–1972) – a major authority on *Kalevipoeg* – states that the centre of the 19th century was a preparation for the emergence of national leaders[2]. Kalevipoeg – a hero representing an ancient Estonian king was just one part of it. "Kalevipoeg as the first broader human character in Estonian literature may also be considered the first developed Estonian national character," writes Annist (Annist 2005: 748). Furthermore, Kalevipoeg symbolises the all countrymen, it is a "symbolic hero of masses" performing physical labour (ib. 749). The traces of Kalevipoeg and the whole epic in Estonian literature, art, theatre and music in the following years allow us to talk about Estonian culture before and after *Kalevipoeg* (Talvet 2003: 889).

Kalevipoeg not only becomes a means of communication of symbols, but also other pseudo-mythological characters participated in it. The Estonian ethnologist Ants Viires has referred to several similar cases in which ancient gods are engaged in the service of

---

[2] In relation to the circumstances it is appropriate to refer to the memoirs of the theologist Johann Kõpp from the period of Estonian awakening in the 19th century, when it was quite usual to turn almost in prayer to the symbolic leader of the nation Kalev, who was the father of the Estonian nation always thinking of his people, who was expected to come home and bring happiness to "his children", "to re-create the Estonian generations" – as it is said in the last verses of "Kalevipoeg". See Kõpp 1991: 130; Undusk 1994: 171).

VEIDEMANN

Estonian society in the 19th century. After the publication of the people's edition of *Kalevipoeg* in Tartu (1862), the singing association in Tartu was given the name of "Vanemuine" in 1865. When the German song festival took place in Tallinn, there was a gate erected through which the participants of the song festival marched and on which the God of Song Vanemuine was sitting and putting a wreath of flowers on every choir flag. Mythological characters Dawn and Dusk were standing on either side of the gate and throwing flowers under the singers' feet (Viires 2001: 220).

Kalevipoeg's mother Linda, father Kalev, Saarepiiga (Island Maid), the Finnish blacksmith, Tuuslar, Kalevipoeg's horses, dogs, the hedgehog and other animals, the storyline of the epic, landscapes (which symbolic marker is created by Kreutzwald's word "Kungla") become "decisive" in interpreting the *loci communes*[3] of Estonian culture, on which Estonians' narrative of identity is based.

Since 1896 the symbol of national identity has been the general song festival that takes place once every five years. The event is a manifestation of focusing (let us recall that we have to keep in mind its concentration and purposefulness) communication when we consider the birth of the initial idea and pre-story of the song festival tradition. The idea was borrowed from Switzerland and Germany in the first half of the 19th century. In the 1850s Baltic-German singing associations commenced their activities in Estonian towns, followed by the first outstanding achievement in the form of a song festival of German choirs in Tallinn in 1857. At the same time the newspaper *Perno*

---

[3] The term comes from work *Loci communes rerum theologicarum seu hypotyposes theologicae* (1521) by Philipp Melanchthon (1497–1560), who was Martin Luther's fellow fighter and supposedly the actual founder of Lutheranism, stating that *loci communes* are the key explanations of the interpreted holy texts. This statement gave basis to the opponents' attacks according to which this enabled discretional interpretation of the Bible. The reformers did not mean presuppositional understanding of the Bible, but proceeding from the sacral text itself – from its intrinsic idea naturally focussed on Christ (see Tool 1997: 257–258). I am attracted to the term because it allows comparison of *loci communes* and the symbols used in cultural communication. Both are based on instructive, pastoral and directive nature.

Postimees was published in Pärnu and the founder and editor Johann Voldemar Jannsen delivered the news of the German song festivals held in Zürich, Hannover, Tallinn and Riga. In 1861 Jannsen was present at the German song festival in Riga (Põldmäe 1969: 23–24).

When Jannsen moved to Tartu in 1863, he started planning a major national festival for Estonians dedicated (=focused!) to the 50th anniversary of the liberation of peasants from serfdom. In 1865 a singing association "Vanemuine" was founded for that purpose. In 1867, at the conference of parish clerks and teachers in Viljandi, Jannsen introduced his idea and invited "all Estonian /church /my comment R.V./ congregation choirs to take part in it." (Ib. 30). The stress is on the word "congregation" because the idea of the song festival was to show Estonians as a people of "congregation". It is this intimate form of togetherness that differentiates Estonian nationalism from other European nations that were formed in the 18th and 19th centuries.

It may be stated that the structure of the general song festival serves the purpose of symbolic communication starting with the repertoire, preparation for the song festival (rehearsals and competitions in singing, song festivals in counties) and ending with the rituals connected with the song festival (lighting the fire, procession, symbolic opening and closing songs, making speeches, putting wreaths around the conductors' necks).

The occurrence of the general song festival in every 5 years latently amplifies the cyclic nature of ancient Estonians' perception of life (seasons, day and night and work and rituals connected with them). The opening song of the general song festival and lighting the fire are explicitly related to the mythology of rebirth, like the final song – "Mu isamaa on minu arm" (My fatherland is my love) by Lydia Koidula/Gustav Ernesaks declaring faithfulness to one's country and nation (*resp* to the congregation) after death, became the traditional final song of song festivals after the war. The participants of the song festival leaving the song festival grounds, which becomes a sacral space during the song festival, is not sad or mournful, because the end of one song festival is the beginning of the next one. The cleansing effect of the song festival proceeds from its shamanistic nature. Tens of thousands of singers, their conductors and tens

of thousands of spectators literarily speaking form a circle of energy, which serves one goal – to perceive and confirm transcendental (divine, symbolic) unity (Veidemann 2006: 73–77).

In the last decades of the 19th century, in the communication of symbols real creators of culture stand next to pseudo-mythological and literary heroes (e.g. Bornhöhe's national romantic adventure stories "Tasuja" (The Avenger), "Villu võitlused" (The Struggles of Villu) and "Vürst Gabriel" (Duke Gabriel). It is illustrated by the fact that Lydia Jannsen – the poet and the founder of Estonian theatre, the daughter of Johann Voldemar Jannsen, is given a pen-name "Koidula" (The Homeland of the Rising Sun) by Carl Robert Jakobson, and Fr. R. Kreutzwald becomes known as "Lauluisa" (Father of Song). The portrait composition of Fr. R. Kreutzwad – "Kaugelt näen kodu kasvamas" (I see my home growing from afar) made by artist Ants Laikmaa in 1903, and Lydia Koidula's portrait painted in 1924 acquired the status of an icon. The legend of Koidula in Estonian literary history was "shaped" by the Finnish-Estonian writer Aino Kallas in her essayistic biography *Tähdenlento* (1915; in Estonian *Tähelend* (Shooting star) (1918).

On the 4th of July 1884, the Association of Estonian Students consecrated (*sic!* – a symbolic act) their flag with the colour combination of blue-black-white, which later becomes the basis of national and state symbols. The song "Mu isamaa" (My Fatherland) by Fr. Paciuse/J.V. Jannsen sung at the first general song festival becomes an anthem after the birth of the Republic of Estonia. It should be noted that the song was initially created by a German composer and conductor (based on Johan Ludvig Runeberg's poem "Vårt land" – "Maamme") living in Finland and was the most popular song among Finns in the middle of the 19th century. Including the song in the program of the song festival was a symbolic gesture of the Fennophile Jannsen to the closest neighbour.[4] So the unity of kindred nations is manifested in the same anthem of Finland and Estonia (although the words are different).

---

[4] At the festive dinner, organised on the second day of the general song festival in 1869, J.V. Jannsen greeted guests from Finland and expressed a

The myth of Noor-Eesti came into being during the years 1920 – 1930. The cultural movement of Noor-Eesti (1905–1915), motivated and enhanced by the European modernism (including French symbolism) at the end of the 19th century was clearly focused on the renewal of the expressiveness of the Estonian literature. Initially it was a project of the elite of the new generation of intellectuals. The manifesto by the poet Gustav Suits "Olgem eestlased, aga saagem eurooplasteks!" (Let us be Estonians but become Europeans) symbolises "Europe" as anything new and prophetic (new literary and art language, new authors, themes, motifs, etc). Linguist Johannes Aavik "worded it as the requirement of the new 'Estonian style', which would substitute the style of the village people and teacher by the style of educated people writing to each other" (Olesk, Laak 2008: 9). Symbolic communication had to serve Estonia by writing biographies of their own outstanding Estonian people (symbolic figures) (in addition to Kallas's biography of Koidula, also the monograph of Juhan Liiv by F. Tuglas and the monograph of Anna Haava by Villem Grünthal were published in 1914 and in 1929 respectively).

When one of the founders of the movement Friedebert Tuglas, whose short stories actually reached the level of world literature (Undusk 2009: 464–465), summarises the importance of Noor-Eesti thirty years after the beginning of the movement and the meaning of Noor-Eesti in Estonian (literary) culture, he sees it as a symbolic centre (source of emanation) surrounded by concentric circles of the developing Estonian literature and culture (Tuglas 1936: 177).

Anton H. Tammsaare's *Tõde ja õigus* (Truth and Justice) acquires the status of a symbol. For example, Estonians compare their memories and childhood experience with the fictional landscapes of Vargamäe from the first volume of *Tõde ja õigus* (Kõresaar 2005: 61).

Symbolic communication acquires a special place in the Republic of Estonia in the second half of the 1930s. By that time a strong middle class, the economic, political and cultural elite has developed in the Estonian society. The global economic crises, Nazism in Germany and the rise of totalitarianism in the Soviet Union, the

---

wish that Estonians should always be together with the Finnish people (Põldmäe 1969: 148).

increase of overall instability in Europe also had an impact on the political development in Estonia.

Estonia as a state was born in 1918 as the result of ethno-linguistic cultural nationalism. "If earlier nationalism created the state" write the historians Toomas Karjahärm and Väino Sirk, "now [in the 1930s – my remark R.V.] the reverse process is launched: the state starts to form the people and the nation." (Karjahärm, Sirk 2001: 255). New terms are introduced: "programmed nationalism", "new nationalism", "national solidarity", "national unity". Small nations and countries, including Estonians and Estonia, are seen as carrying on a unique mission "to retain the status of an intellectual oasis of culture among big countries with clashing interest of power" (Semper 1940: 33).

Culture (especially its visual and ritual expressions) becomes a means of propaganda for the state. Mass events are organised to confirm Estonian statehood (days of the Estonian flag, numerous parades, gymnastic festivals, erection of statuses for the War of Independence) and the national authenticity (Estonization of names, promoting national handicraft, decorating homes). It is the competition of building and designing "the most beautiful Estonian home that creates the connection between "the state narratives and more private family heritage." (Kõresaar 2005: 60) the Estonian state becomes the symbol of the Estonian home.

The development of Estonian culture is violently interrupted in 1940 followed by "the war of symbols". This is how the establishment of the Soviet-Stalinist system of symbols[5] and the discourse in Estonian social-political and cultural communication and the counter-reactions may be characterised. Ene Kõresaar has investigated biographies of Estonian people and describes the loss of the state in 1940 and the sufferings experienced after that as interruptions and "the fall of symbols" (ib. 86)[6].

---

[5] Jaan Undusk has made a thorough survey of the effect of the Stalinist system of symbols on Estonian literary culture "Mystical and magical signs of Stalinism. Juhan Smuul's "Poem to Stalin" in its rhetoric surroundings" (Undusk 1998: 137–164).

[6] Kõresaare's approach proceeds from the "interruption", when the central image of the historical picture of Estonians form "glasses" for those

The generation of the new Soviet symbols is also characterised by purposefulness and focus, as it was in the case of the formation of the national culture in the 19th century and the modernisation of culture at the beginning of the 20th century. But this time the goal is the subjection of Estonian culture to the totalitarian Soviet ideology. As it is the intrusion of foreign semiosis, the shaped communication of symbols is diverted into the conservation and opposition of the regime.

One example of such "diversion" (which has a typological resemblance to the adjustment of the Estonian animistic culture against the invasion of Christianity at the beginning of the 13th century) is the general song festival in 1947.

The new authorities expected it to be a promotional event. But the Estonian classical choir music and the pieces from the 1920–1930s dominated in the repertoire. "Mu isamaa on minu arm" (My Fatherland is My Love) by Gustav Ernesaks/Lydia Koidula was performed there for the very first time and became a national anthem for the coming decades. It is interesting to observe how Soviet symbolism mixes with the national. A pentagon is printed on the "Harp of Vanemuine" on the traditional emblem of the song festival, singers dressed in folk costumes with red flags in their hand dominate on the song festival posters. The authors of the new anthem of Estonia, incorporated into the Soviet Union, are Johannes Semper (text) and Gustav Ernesaks (melody). It is so typical that the first lines of the anthem ("Jää kestma Kalevite kange rahvas ja seisa kaljuna me kodumaa") refer to the mythical history of Estonians,

---

Estonians whose childhood and youth passed in the Republic of Estonian before the Second World War (Kõresaar 2005: 199). The fact that the later memories of the biographers from the later Soviet period (1970s – 1980s) remain superfluous, the author comes to the conclusion that the Soviet period itself is handled as a kind of "interruption", which forms "a kind of intermediate" period and separates the period of Estonian national independence from the period of the Post-Soviet recollection culture" (Kõresaar 2005: 201). The problem is that the keyword "interruption" in recollection culture should not be expanded to the description of those years representing "continuity".

which was used as the basis of the new national-mythological history in the middle of the 19th century.

The reversal of the symbolic communication in the literary culture of the Soviet Estonia is vividly expressed in the first part of the novel *Tuuline rand* (Windy Coast) by Aadu Hint, describing life in an Estonian fishing village at the beginning of the 20th century. It is written in the mode of Estonian critical realism and according to the literary scientist Sirje Olesk belongs to "the common texts" which have most evident connections for example with the "anti-German pathos" of /E. Vilde – my remark R.V./ *Mahtra sõda* (The War of Mahtra) (Olesk 2003: 478). When the book was published in 1951, the doctrinaire criticism demanded changing the novel in tune with the proletarian hegemony. In 1952 the second edition of the novel was published (the improved edition). The author of a history of the Estonian literature written in the German language Cornelius Hasselblatt classifies it as an independent novel and recommends the re-publication of *Tuuline rand* in its initial form (Hasselblatt 2005: 271–284).

During the decades after the war the communication of national symbols is transferred from the public sphere to the private sphere and forms the "second society" which functioned next to the official society (Ruutsoo 2002: 42–43). Although the Soviet authorities tried to keep a strict eye on it (e.g. celebrating Christmas is declared to be a "bourgeoisie vestige", church weddings are discouraged), people later recall proudly how national colours and patterns were knitted into hand-made cardigans, socks and mittens, how despite poor everyday life and lack of food the traditional menu for holidays and wakes was ensured or how enthusiastically pre-war magazines and books, hidden in the attics, were read. Such transfer is vividly described through the eyes of Viivi Luik – a writer, who was a child in the 1950s, in her novel *Seitsmes rahukevad* (The Seventh Spring of Peace) (1985). (See also Kannike 2001: 145–146). The father of Leelo Tungal, who also belongs to the same generation, says in the memoirs *Samet ja saepuru* (2009) (Velvet and Sawdust) that in the countryside "people from the first Estonian period" retained their customs and behaviour patterns also in the Soviet period. It may be stated that a whole era in history and Estonians representing it

acquire a symbolic and normative meaning "as a national opposite to the Soviet", as "the rearranged cultural space /---/ chaos causing unsociability" (ib. 143).

The symbolism of the Republic of Estonia is expressed more contrastively in the communication of Estonians, who fled from Estonia due to the Soviet regime in 1944 and created an emigrant society in the West (mainly in Sweden and Canada). It may be stated that the *primus motoris* of the emigrant culture was the Republic of Estonia itself as "the paradise lost". It is confirmed by the fact that "the subject matter comprising memories and numerous memoirs is one of the most distinguishing features of literature in exile." (Kruuspere 2008: 13). It is only in the 1960s (due to the change of generations) that next to the exile identity a new and more modern and open foreign-Estonian identity emerged (Hennoste 1994: 70–75). By implication it refers to the recognition of "Home Estonia" (Geographical Estonia) as the existential centre of Estonian culture in homeland.

At the same time, as the referred above "Home Estonia" was divided into two: the official (the Soviet) and the private, focused on Estonia as the "second society". The public expression of such a "second society" becomes folk culture. Ideological "battles" to retain national feelings are held in relation to the repertoire of local song and dance festivals, singing ensembles, drama groups (Aarelaid 2001: 101).

The opposite phenomenon to the above-described shift in Estonian literature and theatre that took place at the end on the 1950s (the beginning of the so-called Khrushchev's thaw) and lasted until the beginning of the 1990s was "reading between the lines". It is an intellectual phenomenon characterising the relationship between the author, the literary work and the reader (space for allusions) (Mihkelev 2005: 20) with the purpose of applying national identity and express political-cultural oppositions.

"Reading between the lines" is important due to multiple censorships that could be outsmarted only if the message from Estonian history or describing the Soviet reality was coded in a way that the top layer of the text structure retained the illusory compliance with the dominant ideological doctrine, but still made possible the

communication of symbols between the writer and the reader/readers in the deeper layers of the structure (in the theatre: spectators).

Several times authorities were involved in notorious cases, e.g. in the connection with Arvo Valton's collection of short stories *Kaheksa jaapanlannat* (The Eight Japanese Women) and Heino Kiik's novel *Tondiöömaja* (The Ghost's Nest) and the staging of Paul-Eerik Rummo's play *Tuhkatriinumäng* (The Cinderella Game) at the end of the 1960s. The public reception of Hando Runnel's collection of poems *Punaste õhtute purpur* (The Purple of Red Evenings) published in 1982 was blocked for years..

The cultural boom that started in the 1960s (the so-called spotlight period of the new generation in literature, theatre, music, fine arts in the 1960s; the restoration of continuity in literature; the arrival of world literature and philosophy in Estonia via intensive translation work; the beginning of television and the possibility to watch Finnish TV) together with the educational system operating in the Estonian language, has been described as cultural autonomy within an empire (Karjahärm, Sirk 2007: 254). This kind of autonomy reproduced a necessary network of symbols which was for Estonians the main resource in the political fight for independence at the end of the 1980s (Ruutsoo 2002: 175–176). Or in other words, the focus of the symbolic communication is the idea of the retention of independent Estonia and a readiness to restore it.

The 1990s mark the emergence of postmodernism in Estonia which began with the technological revolution and the re-structuring of the industrial society in the west during the 1950s–1960s. According to the most outstanding theoretician of postmodernism Fredrik Jameson, postmodernism is characterised by the globalisation of economy and the triumph of electronic technology in all areas of life, the cultural equivalents of which are fragmentation, randomness and heterogeneity, the disappearance of differences between the high and mass culture and their blurring borderlines (Jameson 1992: 410–412, see also Kraavi 2005: 96). According to Piret Viires, what sets Estonia apart here is that postmodernism's influence in Estonia remained only partial, as the era of postmodernism in the west was already drawing to a close. The symbolic sign to mark that closure was the terrorist attack against the World

Trade Centre in New York on Sept. 11, 2001. As a result, post-modernism was never to be the leading discourse in Estonian cultural theory (Viires 2006: 84).

From the point of view of **the symbolic communication it has definitely added diffusiveness and dispersion.** The explosion of new technology has brought along a "semiotic changeover" (Tart 2001: 119). The Internet environment and the spread of multimedia has led to the atomisation of the unified and divisible truth marked by symbols. The public and the private, the fact and the fantasy, the reality and the virtual have become an unlimited playground. It is clear that symbols, which are like gateways into major narratives, freeze in the Internet environment into clichés or empty markers. Indrek Tart vividly describes the situation as follows:

> The lack of mechanisms that ensure the continuity of culture or their deficient impact may lead to the loss of identity of social associations, which profoundly change their existence. New tribes, clans and gangs are formed, which function according to new and different principles. /---/ The entire time-space dimension is pressed together into a momentary icon, which disappears with a motion of a finger. Memory is not open to time and is not an unrolling process, in which events and meanings proceed from each other, but form a bit on the disk space, having a momentary (deleting, recording, and temporarily saved) value. (Tart 2001: 129).

However, the peculiarity of Estonia is constituted in the fact that it "is positioned in the field of tension between conservatism and postmodernism" (Viires 2006: 92), which leaves adjusting space for external ideologies and cultural practices.

At the beginning of the 21st century an increase in Neo-Conservatism may be observed in Estonia characterised e.g. by the privileges of the "state nation" dictating to other peoples living in Estonia (and especially the big majority of the Russian speaking community) how to live. This led to a dramatic conflict between Estonians and Russians in the spring of 2007, when the Estonia government decided to relocate a monument of the Second World War from the town centre to the military cemetery. It is a typical

situation from the "war of symbols". The centrepiece of the monument is a Soviet soldier, who symbolises for the Estonian Russians the victory of the Soviet Union (especially for the Russians) in the Second World War, whereas Estonians associate it with the continuation of the Soviet occupation in 1944. (See Vetik 2007: 34–50, 103–111 and the special edition of the magazine *Vikerkaar* 2008, 4/5). A glass monument with a cross on top was erected in the city of Tallinn to commemorate the victory in the War of Independence (1918–1920) in 2009. This confirms the fact that the focusing symbolic communication has been restored in the public space of Estonia.

Irrespective of the ways of expressing the symbolic communication it has to be admitted that from the point of view of Estonian culture the self-description of culture and the creation of identity has an important existential meaning.

References

Aarelaid, A. 2001. Rahvakultuuri piirid määrab dialoogisuutlikkus. – *Kultuuride dialoog.* Acta Universitatis Scientarum Socialum et Artis Educandi Tallinnensis. Tallinna Pedagoogikaülikooli Toimetised. Humaniora A20. Toimetanud A. Aarelaid. Tallinn: Tallinna Pedagoogikaülikool, 97–118.

Ahponen, P. 2001. *Kulttuurin pesäpaikka. Yhteiskunnallisia lähestymistapoja kulttuuriteoriaan.* Helsinki: Werner Södeström Osakeyhtiö.

Annist, A. 2005. *Friedrich Reinhold Kreutzwaldi "Kalevipoeg".* Tartu: Eesti Kirjandusmuuseum.

Arutjunova, N. D. 1990. Metafora i diskurs. – *Teorija metafory.* Moskva: Progress, 5–32.

Bartlett, R. 1993. *Euroopa sünd. Vallutused, koloniseerimine ja kultuurivahetus 950–1350.* Tlk. Tõnu Tammets. Tallinn: Kunst.

Blumer, H. 1986. *Symbolic interactionism. Perspective and Method.* Berkeley, Los Angeles and London: The University of California Press.

Cassirer, E. 1999. *Uurimus inimesest. Sissejuhatus inimkultuuri filosoofiasse.* Tlk. Toivo Pilli. Tartu: Ilmamaa.

Cassirer, E. 2007. *Keel ja müüt. Täienduseks jumalate nimede probleemile.* Tlk. Margit Rennebaum. Tartu: Eesti Keele Sihtasutus.

Hasselblatt, C. 2005. Stalini pikk vari üle tuulise ranna. Aadu Hindi "Tuulise ranna" kohandumine/kohandamine meie päevadeni. – *Kohanevad*

tekstid. Koostanud ja toimetanud V. Sarapik, M. Kalda. Tartu: Eesti Kirjandusmuuseum, Eesti kultuuriloo ja folkloristika keskus, Tartu Ülikooli eesti kirjanduse õppetool, 271–284.

Hennoste, T. 1994. Hüppeid modernismi poole: Eesti 20. sajandi kirjandusest Euroopa modernismi taustal. 11. loeng. Väliseesti modernism I. Eesti kirjandusest sõja järel. – *Vikerkaar* 11, 70–75.

Hennoste, T. 2003. *Eurooplaseks saamine. Kõrvalkäija altkulmupilk. Artikleid ja arvamusi 1986–2003.* Tartu: Tartu Ülikooli Kirjastus.

Hennoste, T. 2008. Noor-Eesti enesekoloniseerimisprojekt. Teine osa. Olulised kirjandusmõtteviisid ja nende suhted kolonialismiga 20. sajandi algupoole eesti kirjanduses. – *Methis* 1/2, 262–275.

Honko, L. 1983. Terveyskäyttäytymisen kokonaisuus. – *Kansa parantaa.* Toim. P. Laaksonen, U. Piela. Helsinki: Suomalaisen Kirjallisuuden Seura, 25–51.

Jameson, F. 1992. *Postmodernism or, the Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism.* London, New York: Verso.

Kannike, A. 2001. Kodukujundus kui kultuuriloome: moe ja traditsiooni dialoog. – *Kultuuride dialoog.* Acta Universitatis Scientarum Socialum et Artis Educandi Tallinnensis. Tallinna Pedagoogikaülikooli Toimetised. Humaniora A20. Toimetanud A. Aarelaid. Tallinn: Tallinna Pedagoogikaülikool, 134–158.

Karjahärm, T., Sirk, V. 2001. *Vaim ja võim. Eesti haritlaskond 1917–1940.* Tallinn: Argo.

Karjahärm, T., Sirk, V. 2007. *Kohanemine ja vastupanu. Eesti haritlaskond 1940 – 1987.* Tallinn: Argo.

Karjahärm, T., Luts, H.-M. 2005. *Kultuurigenotsiid Eestis. Kunstnikud ja muusikud 1940–1953.* Tallinn: Argo.

Kiev, A. (Ed.) 1974. *Magic, Faith, and Healing. Studies in Primitive Psychiatry Today.* London and new York: Collier Macmillan Publishers and The Free Press.

Kleinman, A. 1980. *Patients and Healers in the Context of Culture. An Explorationof the Borderland between Anthropology, Medicine and Psychiatry.* Berkely, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.

Kraavi, J. 2005. *Postmodernismi teooria ja postmodernistlik kultuur.* Viljandi: Viljandi Kultuuriakadeemia.

Kripper, S. 2004. Psychology of shamanism. – *M. N. Walter & E. J. N. Fridman (Eds.), Shamanism: An encyclopedia of world beliefs, practices, and culture.* Santa Barbara, CA: ABC- CLIO, lk 204–211.

Krull, H. 1996. *Katkestuse kultuur.* Tallinn: Vagabund.

Kruuspere, P. 2008. Sissejuhatus. – *Eesti kirjandus paguluses XX sajandil.* Toim. P.Kruuspere. Tallinn: Eesti TA Underi ja Tuglase Kirjanduskeskus, 9 – 26.

Kõivupuu, M. 2009. *Hinged puhkavad puudes.* Tallinn: Huma.

Kõpp, J. 1991. *Mälestuste radadel 2. Tartus 1896 – 1906.* Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Kõresaar, E. 2005. *Elu ideoloogiad. Kollektiivne mälu ja autobiograafiline minevikutõlgendus eestlaste elulugudes.* Eesti Rahva Muuseumi sari 6. Tartu: Eesti Rahva Muuseum.

Laidre, M. 1994. "Vana hea Rootsi aeg" – müüt või tegelikkus? – *Akadeemia,* 5, 957–962.

Loorits, O. 1949 /– 1960/. *Grundzüge des estnischen Volksglaubens I- III. Skrifter utg. Av Kungl. Gustav Adolfs Akademien för folklivsforskning 18: 1 – 3.* Lund.

Losev, A.F. 1997. *Imja. Izbrannyje raboty, perevody, besedy, issledovanija, arhivnyje materialy.* Sankt-Peterburg: Aleteija.

Lotman, J. 1990. *Kultuurisemiootika.* Tallinn: Olion.

Lotman, J. 1999. *Semiosfäärist.* Tallinn: Vagabund.

Mihkelev, A. 2005. *Vihjamise poeetika.* Collegium litterarum 19. Tallinn: Underi ja Tuglase Kirjanduskeskus.

Nöth, W. 1990. *Handbook of Semiotics.* Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.

Olesk, S. 2003. "Laine põhi". Kirjandusest ja selle kontekstist Eestis aastatel 1950–1953. – *Võim & kultuur.* Tartu: Eesti Kirjandusmuuseum, 465–479.

Olesk, S., Laak, M. 2008. Noor_Eesti rollist eesti kirjandus- ja kultuuriloos. – *Methis* 1/2 , 7–20.

Paul, T. 1999. *Eesti piiblitõlke ajalugu. Esimestest katsetest kuni 1999. aastani.* Eesti Teaduste Akadeemia Emakeele Seltsi Toimetised nr. 72. Tallinn: Emakeele Selts

Paulson, I. 1997. *Vana eesti rahvausk. Usundiloolisi esseid.* Tartu: Ilmamaa.

Põldmäe, R. 1969. *Esimene Eesti üldlaulupidu 1869.* Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Randviir, A. 2000. Loodus ja tekst: tähenduslikkuse tekitamine. – *Tekst ja loodus.* Koost. T. Maran, K. Tüür. Tartu: Eesti Kirjanduse Selts, 135–147.

Raun, T.U. 1987. *Estonia and the Estonians.* Stanford, California: Hoover Institution Press.

Ruutsoo, R. 2002. *Civil Society and Nation Building in Estonia and the Baltic States.* Acta Universitatis Lapponiensis 49. Rovaniemi: Lapin yliopisto.

Sebeok, Th. A. 1976. *Contributions to the Doctrine of Signs.* Lanham, Md: Universitity Press of America.

Sebeok, Th. A, Danesi, M. 2000. *The Forms of Meaning. Modeling Systems Yheory and Semiotic Analysis.* Berlin – New York. Mouton de Gruyter.

Semper, J. 1940. Kultuuri päevaküsimusi. – *Eesti Üliõpilaste Seltsi Album XI.* Tartu: Eesti Üliõpilaste Selts, 24–37.

Sossjur, F. de (Saussure, F. de) 1977. *Trudy po jazykoznaniju.* Moskva: Progress.

Talve, I. 2004. *Eesti kultuurilugu. Keskaja algusest Eesti iseseisvuseni.* Tartu: Ilmamaa.

Talvet, J. 2003. "Kalevipoeg" – suur Euroopa eepos. – *Keel ja Kirjandus,* 12, 886–896.

Tart, I. 2001. Interneti piiririik ja Eesti. – *Kultuuride dialoog.* Acta Universitatis Scientarum Socialum et Artis Educandi Tallinnensis. Tallinna Pedagoogikaülikooli Toimetised. Humaniora A 20. Toimetanud A. Aarelaid. Tallinn: tallinna Pedagoogikaülikool, 119–133.

Tool, A. 1997. Hermeneutika ja filosoofia. Saateks. – *Filosoofilise hermeneutika klassikat. F.D.E. Schleiermacher, Wilhelm Dilthey, Martin Heidegger, Hans- Georg Gadamer.* Tartu: Ilmamaa, 250–328.

Tuglas, F. 1936. *Kriitika VI.* Tartu: Noor-Eesti Kirjastus.

Undusk, J. 1994. Rahvaluuleteksti lõppematus. Felix Oinas, soome meetod ja intertekstuaalne "Kalevipoeg". – *F. Oinas. Surematu Kalevipoeg.* Tallinn: Keel ja Kirjandus, 147–174.

Undusk, J. 1998. *Maagiline müstiline keel.* Tallinn: Virgela.

Undusk, J. 2001. Kristian Jaak Peterson. Kommentaare eluloodaatumeile. – *IAAK. Kristian Jaak Peterson 200.* Eesti Keele Instituut, Underi ja Tuglase Kirjanduskeskus. Tallinn: Eesti Keele Sihtasutus, 13–20.

Vahtre, L. 1992. *Teekond läbi aja. Sugemeid eestlaste kultuuri ajaloost.* Tallinn: Sõltumatu Infokeskus.

Veidemann, R. 2006. *Tuikav tekst.* Tartu: Tartu Ülikooli Kirjastus.

Veidemann, R. 2007. About the Meaning of Estonian Literature. – *Interlitteraria* 12. Tartu: Tartu University Press, 63–72.

Veidemann, R. 2009. About the Boundary/Boundaries of Estoninan Culture. – *Interlitteraria* 14, Vol. I. Tartu: Tartu University Press, 129–141.

Veidemann, R. 2010A. Histroy of Estonian Literature as a Kernel Structure of Estonian Culture. – *Interlitteraria* 15, vol. I. Tartu: Tartu University Press.

Veidemann, R. 2010. *Eksistentsiaalne Eesti.* Tallinn: Tänapäev.

Veispak, T. 1990. Eestlased rootsi aja lõpul. – *Looming,* 2, 236–245.

Vetik, R. 2007. *Kahe vabaduse piiril.* Tallinn: Huma.

VEIDEMANN

Viik, T. 2009. Kolm teesi kultuurivormide loomuse kohta. – *Vikerkaar* 1/2, 127–137.

Viires, A. 2000. *Kultuur ja traditsioon.* Tartu: Ilmamaa.

Viires, P. 2006. *Postmodernism eesti kirjanduskultuuris.* Dissertationes Litterarum et Contemplationis Comparativae Universitatis Tartuensis 5. Tartu: Tartu Ülikooli Kirjastus.

The Conditions of Soviet Colonialism

This essay focuses on questions of colonialism through the historical reality of the Soviet Union in its relationship to the Baltic states[1]. I am interested in the question whether the vocabulary of postcolonialism can help us to investigate the mechanisms of oppression in the Soviet Union.

First some historical reminders about the Baltics: in the year 1940 Latvia, Lithuania and Estonia were each independent states, they were all economically flourishing, they each had a high national consciousness and a clearly formed national culture. In the summer of 1940, Russia invaded these countries; one year later, in 1941, the Germans took the Baltic States; three years later, in 1944, Russia re-occupied the countries and did not leave for almost fifty years. Finally, in 1991, the economic chaos and political instability of the Soviet Union was such that it could not defend itself from falling apart and the Baltic states broke away.

With few exceptions, the field of postcolonial studies has not seen Russian colonialism as part of its research agenda. Similarly, colonialism is not a common parlance in the Baltic states. Why not, one should ask. Maybe it is relevant to quote Ella Schohat's critique of the term postcolonial here: "The critical differences between Europe's genocidal oppression of Aborigines in Australia, indigeneous peoples of the Americas, and Afro-diasporic communities, *and* Europe's domination of European elites in the colonies are leveled with an easy stroke of the "post"." (Schohat 1992: 237) Add Soviet postcolonialism to the picture and you get an even diffuser set of different histories with relatively few common features. This is why

---

[1] For a good collection of writings on a similar topic, see Kelertas 2006. About the state of research in the filed of Soviet colonialism see Annus 2011a.

ANNUS

in my own project about nationalism in Estonia I actually attempted to show how postcolonialism is not a suitable framework for describing post-communist, post-totalitarian states in Eastern Europe. Incidentally, my project turned against itself.

My first question is thus: can we speak about the invasions of the Baltic states in 1941 and 1944 as colonisation? It is a historical fact recognized everywhere, save in Russia itself, that Russia invaded the Baltic states. Our question regards the precise nature of this invasion. Is one to describe it in terms of "occupation" or else rather as "colonization"– the two terms are not quite synonymous, are they? They seem to describe somewhat different projects, which may coincide, but which do not necessarily coincide. So then, what kinds of distinctions can we make between occupation and colonization?

Firstly we should note that in many articles about postcolonialism these words are used interchangeably. Authors who take the Baltic colonial situation for granted often use colonisation in one sentence and occupation in the next. But it strikes me that in many classic cases of colonization the word "occupation" does not seem to fit very well– even when the verb "to occupy", interestingly enough, does not disturb us in English. For example, we do not generally speak about British "occupation" of India or Portugese occupation of the territory of Brazil. Why not? Firstly, we think of occupation primarily as a violent, rude, bloody annexation of a territory belonging to somebody else, yet the story of Indian colonization, for example, is the story of the gradual imposing of a foreign rule, a process started by merchants that created small settlements which gained a political importance only later. Second, as the Latin root *colere* – to cultivate – suggests, important aspect of colonization is peaceful settling down in order to cultivate land. Robert Young reminds us: "Colonisation, as Europeans originally used the term, signified not the rule over indigenous peoples, or the extraction of their wealth, but primarily the transfer of communities who sought to maintain their allegiance to their own original culture, while seeking a better life in economic, religious or political terms – very similar to the situation of migrants today. Colonialism in this sense comprised people whose primary aim was to settle elsewhere rather than to rule others." (Young 20)

Early colonization was possible because of the lack of clearly defined and well developed political entities in the destination areas. Using our example of India, there were different smaller political units in conflict with one another – a typical premodern condition.

A big difference between the situation in the Baltic states in the 1940s and in early colonial invasions stems from the fact that the Baltic countries were already modern states, that is, modern legal entities with established national identities. These were nations and they identified themselves as such, they were proud of their national culture, and, what is more, they felt themselves to be culturally, economically, and technologically superior to their invaders. This created a very different dynamics of oppression and the invaders had to face a much stronger resistance on the ideological level. Can one colonize a nation-state? I do not think so. One can only ever *occupy* a nation-state. One can only colonize a prenational, premodern community. In the core of colonization we have a clash between a modern and a premodern society, or at least a very significant technological superiority of the colonizers. The modernity of colonists mesmerises the premoderns, and this happens first of all through technology. Recall, for example, the widespread myth of how natives considered the newcomers to be their returned gods. Remember how colonisation was supported by the work of missionaries. Yet the missionaries of Soviet Russia, the communist party ideologues, did not convert a noticeable number of people in the Baltic states.

Thus I claim that the Russians did not colonize the Baltic states. Instead, they occupied them, and this is not to be equated with colonisation. Yet the Baltic case seems to defy the archetypal story of occupation–that of the French *résistance,* a story based on binary thinking with occupation opposed by resistance. Thus, the oppressors are hated, their voice is not accepted in the occupied country as a voice of truth, and, under a thin veil of collaboration, the natives respond with proud denial. A wonderful story to tell. I would love to describe the almost 50 years of Russian dictatorship in the Baltics in these terms – only that it just is not possible. Between 1940 and 1945, more than a million people in the Baltics had died or been killed, had escaped, or been sent to Siberia. During the years 1940–

52 more than 203, 000 people were deported from Lithuania, Latvia and Estonia (Vahtre 2005: 274). The Baltic states had lost approximately one fifth of their population. Those who tried to offer resistance were ruthlessly silenced.[2]

Thus the new situation emerged. The simple opposition between oppressors and oppressed started to dissolve and become complicated – because it became clear that the resistance would not harm the enemy at all. The occupation-resistance scheme can work only when there is hope that the occupation can end soon – when there is no hope at all, resistance in its absolute denial of collaboration is left for very few selfless and dedicated nationalists. It can be a dominant model during a war (even though oppressors always find collaborators), it can be an important model for some years after the war. There were people hiding in the woods and fighting the regime until about ten years after the end of war (in Lithuania, from 1944 to 1952 approximately 100,000 Lithuanians participated in partisan fights against the Soviet system and the Red Army), but, one after another, they were caught or killed or simply gave up. What was left was a situation where the majority of the people took the new regime for granted.

By the 1980s, thirty or fourty years into the occupation, basically the whole population in the Baltic states had started to collaborate with a new regime. For example, almost all children were organized into communist youth organizations. It was possible to refuse to become a member, but it is rather remarkable that parents almost unanimously agreed with the teachers' demands. Why? Maybe partly because of the memory of Stalinist terror, they did not want their children to differ from others. But most of all it was just a silent concession that the Soviet regime had the brute power to mould the life of their children – that one must follow the rule of the game. Simple binary oppositions started to fall apart. Instead of a categorical "I will do anything I can to resist the regime," people started thinking: "How can I live in the best possible way, given the fact that the Russians won't leave this country? And how can my children live

---

[2] See Saueauk 2009 for mass repressions in Estonia.

in the best possible way inside the communist empire?" The oppressed started leading their lives within the framework of rules established by the oppressors. And so a situation emerged that has some significant affinities with typical colonial oppression: new forms of hybridity started to appear, the culture of the oppressed territories and the identity of oppressed people became infected by the new regime – and this influence had already some significant similarities with Western models of colonialism.

Thus I would propose that, even though Communist Russia did not colonize the Baltic states and instead "occupied" the Baltic states, nevertheless the period of occupation turned into a period of colonialism, as the modes of resistance turned into hybrid co-existence with the new power. Occupation has a short life-span; if an occupation does not end by expelling the occupiers from the country, then it acquires features of colonialism: the occupants settle in the occupied territory, their ideology starts to change the ways how the occupied relate to the world. The oppressed country can, of course, still be called an occupied country, yet the economical, social and cultural models at work are those of a colonial enterprise. Note here that I am making a distinction between colonization and colonialism. Generally these terms are used quite loosely, yet I reserve the term "colonization" only for the political and economical act of establishing settler colonies. Colonialism I use as a wider term, both temporally and ideologically: Colonialism is colonization plus what follows *after* the establishment of a colonial power. Thus colonialism is a set of political, economical, social and cultural issues. I claim that it is possible to separate colonization from colonialism and to have colonialism without a prior act of colonization.

Now we should ask more serious questions about colonialism, in order to prove our hypothesis about Soviet colonialism. What are the typical features of colonialism?

Firstly, foreign supremacy is established over a certain territory;

Secondly, the supremacy is guaranteed by the technological mastery lacking in the culture of the colonized;

Third, the economy of the territory is (re)constructed in order to serve the interests of the colonizers: whereas the know-how and

intelligentsia come from colonisers, the hard labour is, whenever possible, provided by locals;

Fourth, even though the establishing of power might have been bloody, after the system has been established, it generally works without constant and oppressive military supervision;

Fifth, the foreign power presents itself and is accepted by the majority of natives as an enlightenment project; (Said: "Both [imperialism and colonialism] are supported and perhaps even impelled by impressive ideological formations that include notions that certain territories and people *require* and beseech domination, as well as forms of knowledge affiliated with domination", Cl 9);

Sixth, the identity of the local population becomes based on the presence of others, who are perceived as superior, or more precisely, whose presence makes the natives feel themselves as secondary and unworthy. The experience of being oppressed becomes an important aspect of the local culture.

You see that my typology here is incomplete, I have left out, for example, the impact of the colonial situation over the colonizer which is not my interest here.

The first and third condition, foreign rule and economical exploitation describe well the situation in the Baltic states. As for economy, the Baltic economy was completely remodeled according to the needs of Moscow. The Baltic economy ceased to be oriented towards serving the needs of the local people, instead, it started to provide products for Russia. Economic power in the Soviet Union was, of course, concentrated in Moscow. The cornerstone of the economy of occupied Estonia, for example, became oil-shale industry and production of electricity, of which about 80 % was exported to Russia (Mettam and Williams 1989: 371). Even though Baltic farmers produced more meat than the local market could consume, still in the Baltics there was a shortage of meat, because most of the meat travelled to the Russian metropolis. However, communist Russia's employment policies were not typically colonial. The communist model relied on local intelligentsia, and imported *manual labour* to the oppressed countries. The Baltic states had a large, well-educated middle class. There was no need to import engineers, teachers or accountants. For its part, the impor-

tation of uneducated Russian labourers was a feature of population politics in the Soviet Union: to assimilate smaller nations, they would overwhelm them by flooding their territories with the larger Russian population. In the year 1934 there were roughly 93,000 Russians living in Estonia; by 1989 that number had grown five-fold to nearly half a million (475,000). If you keep in mind that the Estonian-speaking population has remained slightly under a million, you can see the vastness of that change in a population. This indicates a much more serious assimilation politics than the one used by Western colonialism, generally speaking.

As for the second point, the Russina supremacy was not guaranteed by the technological mastery, but instead by the military forces far outnumbering the military of the attacked countries. This sounds more like occupation than colonization.

Point four, the question of controlling the dominant power is, again, different in the Soviet occupation, as compared to Western colonizations. According to Edward Said, in colonised India were in 1930s 4000 British officials, 60,000 soldiers and 300 million Indians. Estonia had one million inhabitants, thus, keeping the same balance it would have meant about 15 Russian bureaucrats and about 200 soldiers. The fact was that for most Indians the power of the colonisers was not visible as an oppressive power supported by bare military force. The Baltic countries, however, were overcrowded with the Russian military personnel who did not speak the local languages, and who guarded the borders and major settlements with the utmost care, day and night. Typical of that situation was the tragedy of ethnic Livonians, a small Finno-Ugric ethnic community living in the territory of Latvia, whose main occupation had been fishing for centuries and who were now prohibited from coming closer to the sea than 50 metres.

Without the very visible fact that the oppressing regime was overwhelmingly stronger and more populous than the oppressed, the Russian regime would have not been possible.

The fifth point. Western colonialism was presented as an enlightenment poject and it was generally taken as such. The Russian occupation, however, was understood in the Baltics as a barbarian invasion. As we already mentioned, the Baltic states were nation-

states with an established national culture. Whereas the Russian invaders mythologized their invasion as an enlightenment project educating allegedly illiterate natives, in Estonia, to the contrary, one of the myths of the Russian invasion is, that the wives of the Russian officers, who had not seen fully equipped stores for twenty years, bought Estonian nightgowns and wore these as party dresses. This story, still often told, summarizes the position of the occupied countries: people felt the presence of barbarians, who were culturally ridiculous, but who unfortunately had a very large and ruthless army. The story of enlightenment, though told by Russians to Russians, was never accepted in the Baltic states.

Thus we have an interesting, multivoiced situation: the official story for the Russian state was to help the workers around the world and to liberate the Baltic states from their bourgeois governments. Behind this story we can easily discover the two-fold discourse of colonialism: the story of bringing enlightenment to the wilderness and behind it the typical imperialist desire to gain new territories and new commodities Sure enough, Russian oppressors made sure that in the public sphere only their discourse was present – yet their discourse was taken as a manifestation of power, not as a truth to be believed in.

We see already that the colonial regime established by communist Russia did have some very specific features. Apart from the above-mentioned lack of 'modern state versus premodern state' situation, two additional factors determined the situation; firstly, the communist ideology, secondly, the totalitarian regime. The totalitarian regime created the basic lack of freedom, closed the borders so that nobody could escape, and kept a very strict physical control over the oppressed. The communist ideology created a specific language, which was not openly colonial–and indeed described itself as anti-colonial. In all the Soviet empire, the official ideology was that of equality. In communism, all nations and all people were supposed to be equal. Thus, the communist ideology, together with totalitarian and colonial ideologies, created a complex fusion, where communist, colonial and totalitarian features merge into one another. Colonialism meant forced communism. It created a situation where communist vocabulary became the official language, yet very few speakers of

that language believed in the words they uttered. The totalitarian regime made sure that only acceptable language was spoken.

Maybe the most interesting feature of communist totalitarian colonialism in the Baltics was the failure of Russian oppressors to make natives feel unworthy and secondary in the cultural terms (look at point 6). Since the occupied people did not approve of the new culture, the oppressors did not become their objects of aspiration. Instead, the colonizer generated a movement away from itself and created another object of desire: the free world outside the oppressed regime. So, instead of a binary opposition between the colonizer and the colonized, the result was the deconstruction of that opposition by a third term, the free world outside the coerced union of the colonizer and the colonized. Everything Western, from hats and jeans and vinyl records to colourful plastic bags and chewing gum, became the object of desire in the youth culture of the oppressed country - the occupation led to a powerless resentment against the Soviet metropolis and an idealization of the west beyond the Soviet sphere.

In conclusion: Soviet colonialism shares many important features with classic Western colonialism: political and economical hegemony, attempts to shape the worldview of oppressed people. Yet in ideological terms Soviet colonialism functioned as colonialism in reverse: a colonialism that actually created an imaginary opposite for itself, a fantastic ideal of the Western world, full of happiness and free from Russian influence. Because of their forceful yet non-credible claims for enlightenment superiority, Soviet colonialism managed to make even language function in the reverse, so that "bad" (e.g. Western) started to stand for "good" and "happy" (e.g. Soviet) for "unhappy" – and that is quite an achievement, even though quite the opposite from the one intended by the Soviet colonial regime.

References

Annus, E. 2011a. Postkolonialismi pealetung post-sovjetoloogias: Kas paradigmamuutuse künnisel? – *Methis*, forthcoming.
Annus, E. 2011b. The Problem of Baltic Colonialism. – *Journal of Baltic Studies*, forthcoming.

ANNUS

Kelertas, V. (Ed) 2006. *Baltic Postcolonialism.* Amsterdam: Rodopi.

Mettam, C. W. and S. W. Williams. 1998. Internal Colonialism and Cultural Divisions of Labour in the Soviet Republic of Estonia. – *Nations and Nationalities*, 4, 3, 363–88.

Saueauk, M. 2009. Mass Repression in Estonia During the Late Stalinist Period. – *Estonian International Commission for the Investigation of Crimes Against Humanity.* Estonia since 1944. Reports of the Estonian International Commission for the Investigation of Crimes Against Humanity. Tallinn: Estonian Foundation for the Investigation of Crimes Against Humanity.

Soovik, E.-R. 2006. How Newness Enters a Country: Reception of the "Postcolonial" in Estonia. – *Interlitteraria*, 11, Vol. I, 161–173.

Vahtre, S. (Ed.) 2005. *Eesti ajalugu VI. Vabadussõjast iseseisvumiseni.* Tartu: Ilmamaa.

Young, R. 2001. *Post-Colonialism: An Historical Introduction.* Oxford: Blackwell.

Schohat, E. 2001. Notes on the 'Post-Colonial. – *Social Text*, 10.2–3 (31–32), 99–113.

End of Irony? Estonian Literature after Postmodernism[1]

In their work published in 2001, "After Postmodernism" (López, Potter 2001), the editors Garry Potter and José López claim that postmodernism was the most influential intellectual trend of the last third of the 20th century, and one of the central trends in the Western cultural-theoretical thinking since the 1960s. Postmodernism managed to grasp the spirit of the time and at the same time challenge self-confidence, presented by the mind, objectivity and knowledge (ib. 3). At the same time the authors have to admit that by the beginning of the 21st century the heyday of postmodernism had passed, postmodernism was in the "stage of decline" and "out of fashion" (ib. 4).

Today, in 2011, we have to admit that the early-decade prediction of Potter and López has come true; postmodern society is retreating and the postmodernist theory is on the decline and losing its central role.

Diffusion of postmodern era and postmodernist theory

The beginning of the disappearance of the postmodern era has been associated with the 11 September 2001 terrorist attacks against the twin towers of the World Trade Center in New York. Directly after the attack, on 24 September, Roger Rosenblatt, for example, wrote in the Times magazine that "the age of irony has come to an end" (see

---

Fish 2002: 27). Julia Keller in Chicago Tribune found that "the end of postmodernism" has arrived, as no postmodernist can keep his views and at the same time admit that the plane hitting the towers was indeed real (see Fish 2002: 28). The terrorist attack was thus seen as the invasion of clear and undisputedly objective reality into the vague world of postmodern relativity and pluralist truths.

The impact of the 11th September terrorist attack on the whole era is not denied by the theoreticians of postmodernism either. In his work "The Spirit of Terrorism and Requiem for the Twin Towers" (Baudrillard 2002), Jean Baudrillard said that after 11 September the world was totally different from what it was before. According to him, the catastrophe ended the previous age of pseudo-events, replacing them with new images and events. At the same time he saw the terrorist attack as an "absolute event", which combines Western technological achievements and sacrificial suicide. He describes the September events as a hyperreal spectacle, so extreme that it adds a special stage to the fictionality, whereas the process recreates "reality as the ultimate and most fearsome fiction" (see Spencer 2005).

We could thus summarise that the terrorist attack on 11 September 2001 displaced the dominating postmodern discourse in the world. The most direct manifestation of this change was probably the shift in evaluations that occurred in the USA; the emergence of one certain idea, the "great narrative"; the dominating role of the state and the usage of such words as "morality" and "ethics" in public vocabulary. Similar processes could also be seen in Europe: a definite rise in conservatism, the decrease of liberal permissiveness, plus sharpening tensions in the issues of nationalism.

Conservatism and postmodernist all-permissiveness have emerged in recent years in Estonian society as well, whereas irony and playfulness are retreating. Ethics and morality have been discussed, and a yearning for a uniform, all-embracing narrative (e.g. for a national narrative) and religious topics have arisen. All this could lead to a conclusion that the changes in postmodern world starting with the 2001 terrorist attack, have also reached Estonia.

We could thus generalise and say that the 11 September attack seriously questioned postmodern pluralism and relativity, and

emphasised such values as truth, morality, ethics, state and other great narratives.

Similarly with the end of postmodern era, an end has been declared for postmodernist theory as well. José López and Garry Potter, for instance, find that although postmodernism managed to most congenially capture the spirit of the times in the last third of the 20th century, it failed to describe the contemporary world adequately in the early 21st century. Postmodernism had become a cliché, postmodernist challenges were no longer radical, i.e. postmodernism had blended with the disciplines, which it opposed in the past (López, Potter 2001: 4).

Jean Baudrillard, the leading theorist of postmodernism, announced the end of postmodern age in 2002. Another author of postmodernist theory, Ihab Hassan, also seriously criticised post-modernism in his article "Beyond postmodernism: Toward Aesthetic of Trust" (Hassan 2003), published in 2003. He stressed that postmodernist relativity had exhausted itself and we should all start believing in truth again. According to him, people had to believe there is truth, because "if truth is dead, then everything is permitted" (ib. 204–207). The end of postmodernism has also been acknow-ledged by some founders of postmodernist theory, such as Linda Hutcheon and Charles Jencks (see Kirby 2010).

The suitability of postmodernist theory for describing today's cultural situation is therefore actually doubted even by the initial founders of the theory. This certainly proves the fact that post-modernist theory is no longer in the lead or topical.

Possibilities of a new theory after postmodernism

What, then, comes after postmodernism? This question has been actively debated on different forums (see e.g. Stierstorfer 2003; Rudaitytė 2008). It is paradoxical that when the term "post-modernism" contained pluralism and there was no single, clearly defined postmodernism, but instead "postmodernisms", whereas similar pluralism characterises the period following postmodernism and also theoretical approaches that attempt to analyse that period and cultural situation.

According to López and Potter, one theoretical possibility to interpret today's world is critical realism. They regard it as a new theoretical trend, which offers a better and more sensible framework to understand the philosophical, scientific and social reality of the new century. According to them, critical realism is a wide concept that enables to interpret literature, cultural theory, politics, sociology, psychology, anthropology etc. It once again appreciates logic, truth and science – all these terms rejected by postmodernism (López, Potter 2001: 5–9). In literature, critical realism would mean replacing postmodernist playfulness with realist literature. Scientific truth and knowledge oppose relativist scepticism. The authors find that cyberspace could be realist as well, because despite the world being virtual, computers and the internet are mostly used not anonymously, but as tools; after all, computers are palpable and real gadgets. At the same time López and Potter admit that realism is not a fixed concept, and today's world is rather characterised by the plurality of realisms.

The prominent literary theoretician Terry Eagleton, among other researchers, has found that postmodernism exerted great influence in its heyday, but was losing its topicality today. In his book "After Theory" (Eagleton 2004), Eagleton remarked that the era of theory was over and it was time to focus on significant truths, denied by postmodernism – for example love, evil, death, morality, meta-physics, revolution – because these were more important today than ever before. From theory back to literature – this seems to be the aim of quite a few researchers (see Kirby 2004).

In their treatment postmodernism, which is sceptical towards truth, unity and progress, denies any possibility of objective truth and values pluralism, disruption and heterogeneity (Eagleton 2004: 13), therefore constitutes the past and offers a theoretical approach that no longer suits the contemporary world.

A number of authors, however, associate the cultural situation after postmodernism with the concept of modernism. The umbrella term "post-postmodernism" is generally used, although there are more specific definitions deriving from modernism and modernity – e.g. neomodernism, remodernism, metamodernism (Timotheus Vermeulen and Robin van den Akker), altermodern (Nicolas Bour-

riaud), hypermodernity (Gilles Lipovetsky), automodernity (Rober Samuels), digimodernism (Alan Kirby).

Let us now take a closer look at some theoretical approaches.

Nicolas Bourriaud defines the "altermodern" as a culture shaped by the forces of economic globalisation. In a contemporary world buffeted by multiculturalism, travel and a condition of near-universal exile, Bourriaud sees the artist as a "cultural nomad" (cf. Kirby 2010).

Guilles Lipovetsky describes "hypermodernity" in more sociological terms as the successor to Lyotard's postmodernity. The epoch of postmodernity "is now ended". Hypermodernity, our contemporary state, begins when modernity's promises of limitless individualism and freedom from social obligations and structuring conventions are finally fulfilled. Lipovetsky believes that the maximisation of modernity is today being experienced across a society dominated by hyperconsumption (cf. Kirby 2010).

"Neomodernism" and "remodernism" emphasise opposition to postmodernist irony and cynicism, appreciate beauty, simplicity and closeness.

Raoul Eshelman introduced the new theory of "performatism". For him, performatist texts (e.g. Yann Martel's 2001 novel *Life of Pi*) frame their reader so that s/he accepts for their duration a set of values and practices that postmodernism treated with notorious suspicion, such as identity, transcendence, love, belief and sacrifice. They "bring back beauty, good, wholeness and a whole slew of other metaphysical propositions, but only under very special, singular conditions that a text forces us to accept on its own terms" (cf. Kirby 2010, Eshelman 2008).

Some authors, on the other hand, connect the interpretation of the post-postmodernism cultural situation with technology and especially with the development of computer technology. Robert Samuels thus talks about "automodernity", which sees a new world formed by the encounter between digital automation and personal autonomy. For him, the concept of automodernity unites automatism and autonomy, and technological and cultural automatisation creates individual autonomy (cf. Kirby 2010, Samuels 2009).

VIIRES

One of the main promoters of the role of technology is Alan Kirby, who launched the term "digimodernism" (see Kirby 2009; his earlier term for the same phenomenon was "pseudo-modernism"). Digimodernism marks a new relationship between text and computer, and according to Kirby, a new form of digital textuality has emerged. Digimodernism is especially linked with the spread of Web 2.0 in the early 21st century: blogosphere, Wikipedia, Twitter, Facebook, i.e. with everything where an active interaction between authors, readers and users in general takes place, and where the user actually creates a large part of the web content.

There are thus quite a number of terms replacing postmodernism and each of them focuses on different layers in cultural analysis. Two main trends however dominate: 1) aspiring towards simplicity, clarity and beauty; 2) considering changes brought about by the development of digital technology.

In sum, we could say that most of the new definitions are characterised by their attempt to oppose postmodernism, i.e. the postmodernist cynicism, playfulness, irony. Instead, they try to offer something new to replace the existing clichés, such as truth, simplicity, clarity and beauty – all values that postmodernism had abolished.

Similar theoretical treatments are supported by cultural pheno-mena, now determined by terms such as "new simplicity" and "new sincerity". Some views can be somewhat extreme; for example those expressed by the "new puritans" in a joint anthology published in 2000 (*All Hail the New Puritans*, editors Nicholas Blincoe and Matt Thorne). Their work primarily focuses on textual simplicity, temporal linearity, grammatical purity, truthful depiction of reality, and the conviction that the published works are also historical documents. They also stress morality and require the texts to be ethical (cf. Blincoe, Thorne 2000).

Estonia and postmodernism

Estonia's position in all these theoretical trends is ambivalent. On the theoretical level, postmodernism has never been the leading discourse in Estonian cultural theory. It would thus be possible to

claim that in Estonian cultural space postmodernism survived in its initial, pure form – as one "small narrative" amongst others. It is also paradoxical that the first overview treatments about postmodernism appeared in the Estonian language only in the mid-2000s, when postmodernism was already in the "stage of decline" and "out of fashion" (Janek Kraavi's *Postmodernismi teooria ja postmodernistlik kultuur* (Postmodernism and postmodernist culture, Kraavi 2005) and Piret Viires's *Eesti kirjandus ja postmodernism* (Estonian literature and postmodernism, Viires 2008). Postmodernism has probably been most prominent here in cultural practices. Nor has postmodernism ever been the dominant trend in Estonian literature, but merely one amongst the others, a "spot".

However, the number of postmodernist works certainly increased in the 1990s and at the turn of the millennium (e.g. Kivisildnik, Jan Kaus, Berk Vaher and others). This trend continued in the 2000s: for example Bartol Lo Mejor's *Popdada 2007–2008* (2008), Erkki Luuk's *Pideva and Silmnähtava Pöögelmann* (Constant and Visible Pöögelmann, 2008). In his series JI, Kivisildnik also continues publishing authors who are associated with postmodernism (e.g. Toomas F. Aru, Chaneldior). Some writers of the youngest generation, members of the group called Purpurmust.org, have also published postmodernist books, e.g. Robert Randma and Eia Uus. These young authors define themselves as a cosmopolitan generation and link their work with traditions of world literature (e.g. Douglas Coupland, Chuck Palahniuk), rather than Estonian literature. The earlier prediction that postmodernist textual play was probably going to continue in the work of some Estonian authors (see Viires 2008: 99), has come true. However, at the same time we can confidently claim that there has not been and never will be an all-embracing "postmodern turn" in Estonian literature, because postmodernist discourse is losing its vitality and significance.

Today's Estonian literature thus faces the question whether the trend towards simplicity, clarity and recovering old values in post-postmodernism theories is at all present in Estonian literature?

New sincerity in Estonian literature

"New sincerity" is not an altogether alien concept in Estonian literature. Writing an overview of prose in 2002, Jan Kaus for example
yearned for more lucid and simpler and simultaneously more hopeful
stories, without however using the term "new sincerity" (Kaus 2003:
415). Jan Kaus's call brings to mind Raoul Eshelman's analysis of
Life of Pi, where he said that the reader is carried along with the text
with the aim of "making us believe and experience beauty within its
own closed space" (Eshelman 2008: 56). From the point of textual
strategy, "Life of Pi" could at first glance be considered postmodernist, but Eshelman's analysis proves that the novel in fact
represented a new trend – performatism. The Estonian poet Jürgen
Rooste seems to be moving in the same rhythm with the currents of
world literature. He talks about the phenomenon of new honesty in
Estonian literature (Rooste 2010). Amongst others, he mentions the
poetry of Kristiina Ehin and fs as an example. Rooste fully believes
in the significance of new honesty: "... I am quite certain that as far
as readers, culture consumption and some sort of mainstream is
concerned, our time is characterised by an aspiration towards "new
honesty"" (ib. 108).

There are many examples of new simplicity in today's Estonian
literature. Mention should be made here of Tõnu Õnnepalu's books
of recent years: verse diary *Kevad ja suvi ja* (Spring and Summer
and, 2009) and *Paradiis* (Paradise, 2009). Both offer simple
descriptions, details of everyday life, photographing of reality. The
different nature of the poetry collection *Kevad ja suvi ja* is
immediately obvious when we compare it with Õnnepalu's other,
earlier verse diary – the baroque and exuberant *Mõõt* (The Measure,
1996). *Paradiis* is simultaneously very personal and honest,
describing real events and real people.

New simplicity is evident also in Hasso Krull's poetry collection
Talv (Winter, 2006). Compared with his postmodernist poetry of the
1990s, the poems here have become precise and brief pictures of
simple things, nature and the surroundings.

Regarding new simplicity, we should mention the young poet
Andrus Kasemaa, whose work might be called "poetry of loafing

around". His poems are characterised by simple things, pictures and just the pleasure of existing. Unlike Krull and Õnnepalu, Kasemaa did not go through a change towards the new and sincere, as he immediately and successfully started with appreciating simplicity (see also Tintso 2011). Reviewing Kasemaa's poetry, Tõnu Õnnepalu said: "However, Kasemaa's simplicity emerges not as a reaction against complicity, but straight from simplicity itself. It clearly relies on the previous generations' seeking for the simple" (Õnnepalu 2009).

On the other hand, realistic descriptions and aspirations towards simplicity and honesty can easily be found in the increasingly popular biographies and travelogues. Autobiographies in Estonian literature truly boomed in the 2000s, along with the growing confessional needs. These features are well illustrated in blogosphere, i.e. in blogs where people (including some writers) describe their thoughts and everyday life. Various professional writers are no longer bothered with inventing characters and instead reveal their own autobiographical "self" (e.g. the above-mentioned Õnnepalu's *Paradiis*, as well as his *Harjutused* (Exercises), Kalev Kesküla's *Elu sumedusest* (The Mellowness of Life), Viivi Luik's *Varjuteater* (Shadow Theatre). All this could be regarded as manifestations of "new sincerity".

The question arising here is the same as in postmodernist literature. Everything, after all, has occurred before. Simple, sincere and precisely worded poetry is quite common in Estonian literature (e.g. Juhan Liiv, Ernst Enno, Debora Vaarandi's *Lihtsad asjad* (Simple Things), Jaan Kaplinski's *Õhtu toob tagasi kõik* (Evening Brings Everything Back), Sass Suumann and others). Realism and faithful description of facts have indeed constituted the mainstream of Estonian literature for decades. There had been no lack of the autobiographical and sincere personal touch either – for example in Friedebert Tuglas's *Väike Illimar* (Little Illimar) Is everything happening in the first decades of the 21st century really something new, so we could call it "new sincerity"?

The answer probably lies in comparison with the preceding period. During the 1990s and at the turn of the millennium, postmodernist playfulness, irony and intertextuality in Estonian literature

increased considerably, further enhanced by the Estonian society moving towards postmodernity. Every literary trend is usually followed by a movement in the opposite direction like a pendulum. We can therefore confidently talk about new sincerity in comparison with the rise of postmodernism in Estonian literature in previous decades.

In the opinion of Fredric Jameson, the radical changes between periods do not actually result in a significant breakthrough, but instead in a certain restructuring of elements. The features that were secondary in the previous period or system, now become dominant, and the formerly dominant features in turn become secondary (Jameson 1983: 123).

We can thus conclude that new sincerity was a secondary phenomenon in the previous period, but became dominant in the 2000s.

There is, however, a counterargument to this claim – postmodernism has never been a dominant in Estonian literature, but a small "spot" amongst others. Equally, new sincerity is not a dominant at the moment either, but exists alongside all other trends.

What is new here is the fact that more attention is being paid to "new sincerity"; it is no longer "old-fashioned" literature, opposed to the postmodernist avant-garde. The tables have turned – "old-fashioned" now includes postmodernism, experimentation, playfulness, irony, scepticism, fragmentariness and abolishment of truths. Literature that values truth, clarity and beauty is innovative and certainly on the rise. This trend is also supported by tendencies in world literature and in new theoretical approaches, which have great respect for beauty and the sublime.

Transitional period

In sum – when we were wondering in 2008 what might happen to postmodernism in the future, it was not possible to offer one definite answer. However, the current author was convinced that as Estonia was no longer a closed society, and was actively participating in the world trends, fluctuations and changes, the future of our postmodernism was directly connected with whatever was happening with postmodernism in the world (see Viires 2008: 99).

This has now proved true. The importance of postmodernism has faded in theory and world literature, as well as in Estonian literature, but what exactly has emerged instead, is not yet quite clear.

Perhaps we are currently in a kind of transitional period. One era, the postmodern, has finished, and the other has not quite yet started. Besides, the other era has not been clearly defined either. The new era is mostly associated with modernism (remodernism, neo-modernism, metamodernism, digimodernism), and also with realism (critical realism).

Two principles are certainly valid. Firstly, cultural theoreticians appreciate technological achievements and analyse cultural situation from that basis. Secondly, postmodernist relativism has been abandoned and beauty, truth, realistic and honest descriptions rule once again.

The paradox is that although postmodernism abolished the truth, and the current era has supposedly restored faith in the truth, there is alas nothing certain and truthful about the transitional period.

However, today's theoreticians seem to confirm the existence of the current transitional period. Raoul Eshelman, for example who developed the performatism theory, wrote: "…we feel the presence of an epoch whose contours are just barely visible and in which we can perceive only simplicity or simple-mindedness. The main thing, though, is to already be in love with it" (Eshelman 2000/2001).

In any case, we are witnessing a change in eras and cultural paradigms. The age of irony is over, as is the era that could best be characterised by the keywords familiar from Hassan's table of oppositions: play, chance, anarchy, antiform, anti-narrative, schizophrenia (Hassan 1982: 267–268). After all, Ihab Hassan himself, the creator of postmodernist theory, is announcing the demise of the era, believing there is truth and we have to be committed to it (Hassan 2003: 204–207).

What era has actually arrived is not quite clear. We find ourselves at the beginning of a new cultural situation, and it does not yet have a name. Expectations of the new, however, do exist both in the world and in Estonia.

The feelings of expectation, changing of the two worlds and existing on the border, might best be characterised by the lines in the

poem "Lõpp ja algus" (The beginning and the End), written by Gustav Suits, one of the most prominent Estonian poets: *We are standing at the gates of two states:/ one is darkness and the other is light* (Suits 1905: 6).

We are therefore at the borderline of eras and cultural situations; what actually happened in our era will only be established afterwards, when we will be looking back at the current moment.

References

Baudrillard, J. 2002. *The Spirit of Terrorism and Requiem for the Twin Towers.* New York: Verso.

Blincoe, N.; Thorne, M. (eds.) 2000. *All Hail the New Puritans.* London: Fourth Estate.

Eagleton, T. 2004. *After Theory.* London: Penguin Books.

Eshelman, R. 2000/2001. Performatism, or the End of Postmodernism. – *Anthropoetics*, Vol. 6, nN. 2 –
http://www.anthropoetics.ucla.edu/archive.htm

Eshelman, R. 2008. *Performatism, or the End of Postmodernism.* Aurora, Colorado: The Davies Group Publishers.

Fish, S. 2002. Don't Blame Relativism. – *The Responsive Community: Rights and Responsibilities,* vol. 12, issue 3, Summer.
http://www.gwu.edu/~ccps/rcq/Fish.pdf

Hassan, I. 1982. *The Dismemberment of Orpheus. Toward a Postmodern Literature.* Second Edition. Madison, London: The University of Wisconsin Press.

Hassan, I. 2003. Beyond Postmodernism: Toward an Aesthetic of Trust. – Stierstorfer, K. (ed.). *Beyond Postmodernism. Reassessments in Literature, Theory, and Culture.* Berlin, New York: Walter de Gruyter, 199–212.

Jameson, F. 1983. Postmodernism and Consumer Society. – Foster, Hal (ed.). *The Anti-Aesthetic. Essays on Postmodern Culture.* Port Townsend, Washington: Bay Press, 111–124.

Kaus, J. 2003. Lennata või roomata? Teadvuses või reaalsuses? –*Looming*, No. 3, 415.

Kirby, A. 2009. *Digimodernism: How New Technologies Dismantle the Postmodern and Reconfigure our Culture.* New York, London: Continuum.

Kirby, A. 2010. Successor states to an empire in free fall. – *Times Higher Education* 27.05.

http://www.timeshighereducation.co.uk/story.asp?storycode=411731
(5. 3.2011)

Kirby, D. 2004. Theory in Chaos. – *The Christian Science Monitor*, 27.01. –
http://www.csmonitor.com/2004/0127/p11s01-legn.htm

Kraavi, J.2005. *Postmodernismi teooria ja postmodernistlik kultuur. Üle-vaade 20. sajandi teise poole kultuuri ja mõtlemise arengust.* Viljandi:
Viljandi Kultuuriakadeemia.

López, J.; Potter, G. 2001 (eds.). *After Postmodernism. An Introduction to Critical Realism.* London, New York: The Athlone Press.

Rudaitytė, R. (ed.) 2008. *Postmodernism and After: Visions and Revisions.*
Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Rooste, J. 2010. Uusususe taak: poeedi piinad. – *Vikerkaar*, No. 10–11,
100–108.

Samuels, R. 2009. *New Media, Cultural Studies, and Critical Theory after Postmodernism. Automodernity from Zizek to Laclau.* New York:
Palgrave Macmillian.

Spencer, N. 2005. Attacked from Within. – *International Journal of Baudrillard Studies*, Vol. 2, No. 2 (July). –
http://www.ubishops.ca/baudrillardstudies/vol2_2/ spencer.htm

Stierstorfer, K. (ed.) 2003. *Beyond Postmodernism. Reassessments in Literature, Theory, and Culture.* Berlin, New York: Walter de Gruyter.

Suits, G. 1905. *Elu tuli. Laulud 1900–1904.* Helsingi: Yrjö Weilini
Kirjastus.

Tintso, M. 2011. Maailmalõpu eest paremasse maailma. – *Sirp* 14.01, No. 2.

Viires, P. 2008. *Eesti kirjandus ja postmodernism.* Tartu: Tartu Ülikooli
Kirjastus.

Õnnepalu, T. 2009. Poeedi rahu ja armastus. – *Vikerkaar*, No. 3.
http://www.vikerkaar.ee/?page=Arhiiv&a_act=article&a_number=4904

The Beginning of Estonian City Writing –
a Bird's-Eye Overview

"The city is a state of mind," observed the American urban sociologist Robert Ezra Park (Bennett et al. 2008: 35). The mapper of several literary cities, the Nobel Prize winner Orhan Pamuk, concludes in his memoir about his home town Istanbul that, instead of the southern sun, it is the warmth of people that glows around this city.

Nowadays Estonia is mainly characterized as an urbanized country. Although the city was for some authors a happy space as early as in the 19th century, beginning with C. R. Jakobson, it was generally common practice to disapprove of the city and city life in 19th century Estonian poetry and this lasted for quite a long time, until the 1920s (Kepp 2003: 378). How was the city portrayed in prose? This article concentrates on the beginning of city writing in Estonian literature: the transition from village stories to early urban prose. The first known original Estonian literary work was a poem, a lamentation titled "Oh, ma vaene Tarto liin!" (Oh Me, the Poor Town of Tartu!), dedicated to the town of Tartu, which had been ravaged in the Nordic War. The sacristan from the Puhja parish church, named Käsu Hans, wrote it in 1708, probably also inspired by a Biblical parallel, the destruction of Jerusalem. However, it was almost two hundred years later that the first equivalent efforts in prose occurred, during the original flourishing of Estonian literature of the National Awakening, in the middle of the nineteenth century.

Introduction: the background

In treating the *topos* as the deep inner structure of a text (Ungern-Sternberg 2003: 614), the sources of inspiration were the Estonian towns with their long history, founded and mostly inhabited by

strangers. [1] During the Middle Ages, a town was an impressive complex of a stone castle and houses around it, defended by walls and towers, incorporating mundane institutions and ecclesiastical power together with economic activity (Talve 2004: 66), an urban system to crystallize the forms of church and feudal power, a closed, pure system rich in symbols (Choay 1986: 165). Its successor did not emphasize the totality of cultural behaviour, and the system was to break completely apart during the Industrial Revolution: the modern, industrial city lost its external and formal structure, gaining quite the opposite meaning of a menacing wasteland; it was also a time of changes in population. Clearly, systems and structures fell apart in the middle of the nineteenth century, including the city structure of the Middle Ages, its cyclical concept of time dependent on its hinterland, and the national composition of the population. Other things were to emerge instead: industrialized towns with mostly Estonian populations, original literature and, at the end of the era, the (urban) novel genre. [2] In this process, there was always "the Other" to oppose or to imitate.

The Estonian prose townscapes that emerged did not have real forerunners in this region in other local languages. In the Baltic-German novel, the town space was static, unchanging, provincial, and gave no reason for a close enquiry regarding the town milieu –

---

[1] The National Awakening of the Estonians began, in the middle of the 19th century, with ideology concentrating on the idea of the nation being tightly bound to the country, to found a rural society. Big metropolises, such as St. Petersburg, were not unknown, but quite often the newborn Estonian intelligentsia moving into the towns or far-away cities lost their connections with family, nation and language, and the lower ranks saw their health destroyed in factories. Yet, the town environment was attractive due to its opportunities and promised freedom, and in 1915 there were already more than 100,000 inhabitants in Tallinn.

[2] The first Estonian (historical) novel appeared in 1885. The word "novel" itself was first mentioned in 1879 in a newspaper; the first novels were Jaak Järv´s *Vallimäe neitsi* (The Virgin From Vallimäe) and Eduard Vilde´s *Teravad nooled* (Sharp Arrows), both in 1885 (Kangro 1940: 332–334).

no streets, no railway station, no market place (Lukas 2004: 541, 546).[3]

The literary process was closely connected with self-recognition as a nation. According to Franco Moretti, the nation-states found the novel, and the novel found the nation-states (Moretti 1999: 17). Towards the end of the eighteenth century, several processes, such as industrial development, improved communications, mass conscription etc., dragged human beings out of the local dimension, throwing them into a much larger one, and national loyalty clashed with the local and required a new symbolic form in order to be understood (ib.).[4] The novel functioned as the symbolic form of the nation-state, managing to turn it into a story (ib. 20).[5] Thie process occurring in most of Europe was delayed here, but then developed very quickly.

Transition in space: occasional visits

The beginning of describing the city in prose was marked by a fragmentary transition in space. The characters of village stories (by Koidula, for example) happened to visit or live for long periods in towns for several reasons. Occasionally, they came by train (to Narva) or by ship (to Tallinn), but mostly they arrived on foot or in horse-drawn wagons. They did not pay much attention to the

---

[3] Although, the Baltic-German tradition seemed to change in autobiographical pieces: for example, in the memoirs of the Tallinn (Reval) town archivist Gotthard von Hansen and those of the artist and journalist Leopold von Pezold, the city space is filled with tiny details, emotions connected with its buildings and atmosphere, creating the illusion of an old film with its vivacious rhythm (Sprengfeld 1877, Pezold 1901).

[4] And, it was the railway that defined the modern city and was instrumental in the nineteenth-century transformations of space and time (Gottlieb 1999: 235) – it made the space suddenly tactile instead of imagined.

[5] Nancy Burke has concluded, after Richard Lehan, that the rise of the city has been seen as inseparable from various kinds of literary movements – in particular the development of the novel and subsequent narrative modes: comic realism, romantic realism, naturalism, modernism and postmodernism (Burke 2002: 304).

environment. In a village story by one of the first Estonian female writers, Lilli Suburg, a country girl named Liina goes to town to study, and as a lover of nature feels distressed because of the stony environment (Suburg 2002: 31–32) and the lack of greenery, and yet yearns at the same time for the intellectual freedom possible perhaps in Saint Petersburg (ib. 26).[6] The education she receives from the town school makes it difficult for her to find her place – and somebody to share her interests – in village society.

A decade later, Elisabeth Aspe, an early realist from the outskirts of the town of Pärnu, knowing the environment of a little urban settlement rather well, described in her short epistolary novel *Kasuõde* (Stepsister, 1887) the obvious black-and-white opposition between the town and the country. The townspeople are bad, frivolous and in poor health; the country peasants are honest, good and strong, and finally win out with their morality, defending the idyllic country scene against the fascination of the city atmosphere. Soon the writer's attitude towards the city became more complex, not the simply negative environment originating from the possible vigorous ideology of her time: Aspe´s next, most well-known short novel, *Ennosaare Ain* (Ain From Ennosaare, 1888) is much more interesting, moving its focus from the village to the town. The characters live in Pärnu and Moscow and here the previous opposition becomes suddenly vague and enigmatic. The protagonist has a kind of double identity, as an educated Estonian in the German and Russian society might have had and, as the story supports the National Awakening ideals, he recognizes himself at last as an Estonian. The writer briefly depicts the familiar townscape of Pärnu and also of far-away Moscow: the latter is as picturesque as an old fresco, an ancient, holy city, more like a book illustration than a description.

The reader of Aspe's works probably perceives the importance of some themes in the story: one of them is connected with the haunting repetition of the word *city*. A quick language-based study[7] has shown

---

[6] Lilli Suburg, *Liina* (1877).

[7] The language-based study (Talivee 2010) was performed as a computer-assisted corpus-based analysis, in order to take a closer look at the language use of the author, using the software WordSmith Tools Version 5.0 (Scott,

that this word *city* (*linna*), in the illative case, is among the first one hundred words in the frequency list of this text, a lot more frequently used than in normal Estonian. It seems to be a keyword of this era, a word full of Bakhtinian polyphony, consisting of independent voices fully equal and dialogical, a communicative interaction between speaker and listener (Bakhtin 1987: 230), a leitmotif to accompany the whole story.

However, Aspe´s city is still a monolithic body of towers and walls, a remnant of a walled-in castle, often seen from afar. Eduard Bornhöhe, one of the founders of the Estonian historical novel, depicted Tallinn in his story *Tasuja* (*Avenger*, 1880) as a castle town that was burnt down by the peasants in the 14th century. Aspe´s characters sense the changing of the town structure: the disappearance of the walls and gates, like losing the borders of the previous world which divided the world in two: the (free) townspeople and the peasants, the wild and the civilised. And, in *Ennosaare Ain*, the contrasts defining the world of characters are no longer clear. According to Franco Moretti, the birth of the urban novel presupposed an overcoming of the binary narrative matrix, and then a new kind of more complicated story arose (a deep structure which is *just as clearly delimited* as the binary one – but different, triangular) (Moretti 1999: 108). A third element could here be the changing of society and the urge to come to the city, seemingly an almost subconscious connection.

The need to come to the city was real, but the city itself in literature was more like an idea – and not a negative one. For example, in Christian Kannike´s stories, the sought-after rich bride is several times found in the city, enabling debts to be paid off debts and ensuring a happy life in the country farmhouse. In Aspe's *Kasuõde,* one of the most beautiful descriptions, a kind of Bachelard-like poetic reverie (Bachelard 1999) arises together with the city girl's unhappiness in the country: she likes to sit by the dam of the watermill and listen to the roar of water, which seems to remind her of the loud voices and bustle of her home environment.

From a Picture to a Map: The Sound of the City

The Estonian geographer Edgar Kant once compared the field of influence a city has over its neighbourhood to the Doppler effect: a city has a voice, a sound whose frequency is higher in closer surroundings and lower as it recedes (Kant 1999: 493). Every city has a region surrounding it that is listening to that sound; the influence of a bigger city, a capital, may reach over the whole country. Every city has its own distinctive sound: Kant´s research object Tartu radiates a whole key of educational opportunities (the university, the Pallas Art School, the higher music school etc.), reaching even beyond the borders of the state (ib. 502). Of course, besides education there were other reasons to go to the city: to find work, to see the doctor, to buy and sell things, even to marry. With the transition from village narratives to those describing all kinds of city experiences, the focus moved from the idyllic village to the townscape, the latter becoming more and more visible.

It is possible to follow the process of the widening of the world with the help of a literary map, asking which cities had their sounds in Estonian literature in the second half of the nineteenth century. In Aspe's works, besides her home town of Pärnu, other toponyms occur: her map is actually wide and in the course of three stories her characters travel a lot, despite being female. The map (Fig. 1.) is based on Elisabeth Aspe's four short novels (*Ennosaare Ain, Kasu-õde, Anna Dorothea*, and *Aastate pärast*). While in *Stepsister* there are mostly initials signifying the towns, further on real toponyms replace them. Aspe´s map of Europe clarifies the influence fields of the cities of her time: the capital is Saint Petersburg, the university town is Tartu, and the capital of Livonia is Riga. Tallinn seemed pretty marginal to the writer from the southern part of Estonia. In comparison, for Eduard Vilde and Eduard Bornhöhe Tallinn was their central scene, but the capital was still Saint Petersburg. The journeys of the protagonists are interesting to interpret: for example, they all leave the country to live elsewhere, but in Aspe's last novel, *Aastate pärast* (After Many Years, 1911), the heroine finally returns home to find happiness. Here, clearly the changed attitude toward distance is sensed: it is no longer something fateful, but perceivable.

Figure 1. A map of three Estonian short novels from the eighteen-eighties. Aspe's map of Europe clarifies the influence fields of the cities of her time: the capital city is Saint Petersburg, the university town is Tartu, and the capital of Livonia is Riga. Important is also Moscow, where one of the protagonists lives for a long time.

Inside a town, individuals perceive and navigate through urban landscape, forming mental maps (Lynch 1960), like models of reality they mark with familiar elements. When the city lost its distance and found its sound, there was a need for closer mapping, sometimes even originating from the dark side of this environment. At the end of the nineteenth century, city descriptions, like fragmentary maps, appeared in Estonian detective stories. The bad characters were different from their counterparts in the country – not night robbers with a cudgel, but more cunning and sophisticated. It was, of course, easier to lose one's position in the city society – to lose a job or go bankrupt. The first literary attempt of Vilde, the detective story *Kurjal teel* (Going Wrong, 1882) about Saint Petersburg, gives a detailed description of a cash register robbery in a dark building in the middle of the night. One type of *flâneur* was someone observing the city like solving a puzzle, neutralizing its horrible secrets. In 19th century American literature, the literary metropolis brought with it the genre of detective fiction, with the first detective being created by Edgar Allan Poe, the rational observer of city life C. Auguste Dupin, who "read" the city and found answers for the darkest secrets – therefore minimizing the possible fears of the city jungle. And, to map and clarify the dark side in the considerably smaller Tallinn, the dramatist Aleksander Trilljärv wrote in his story *Keew weri* (Boiling-Hot Blood, 1893), within a quite detailed townscape, not only the detective's journey on the streets, but also through its social strata. His upper town is a German and Russian one, serving also, obviously quite realistically, as the goal to detach the two worlds in an alienating way, adding a stroke of mystery: the victim of the crime is the beautiful foreigner Josephine.

The street scene

What was the mapped townscape like? According to Lynch, landmarks, readily identifiable objects which serve as external reference points, are important. One of the landmarks of Tallinn in literature is definitely Kadriorg Park (Kadrintal), founded in the 18th century and situated next to the road to Tallinn (so the characters coming to the town see it, e.g. in Vilde's Tallinn novels). It can be a romantic place

(as for lovers), but also dark, lonely and dangerous (in Trilljärv's story, a murder takes place there), or desolate (mentioned as a place suitable for suicide (Trilljärv 1893). But, otherwise, hardly any detailed description of the town exists, except for some interiors and in Eduard Vilde's initial work.[8] In the novel *Jõulupuu* (Christmas Tree, 1903), the most critical Estonian realist, Ernst Peterson-Särgava, depicts a cold little room in a slum, a cab, a reeking tavern full of dockers, a vicarage, and a charity Christmas tree for poor children in a school hall (Särgava 1989: 243–280). Aspe writes about dismantled town walls and gates of a smaller town, and a park established to replace them, a market place, an ugly tavern, small and large shops, some new buildings, and the sound of church bells over the town (Aspe 1888). Eduard Bornhöhe is more specific: his old Tallinn in *Kollid* (Bugbears, 1902) is sleepy, quiet and lazy, with church bells ringing on Sunday: like "an old crow's nest" (Bornhöhe 1903: 4), from the sea looking like a northern Naples. There is also Kadriorg, mentioned for romantic reasons, and even the poetic beauty of the city, which is compared to a working class slum. As for the real sounds of the town, two should be mentioned: the uproar of a bustling crowd and church bells. The exception is Vilde, a bit scary in his depiction of reality: in the first working class novel of Estonia, *Raudsed käed* (Iron Hands, 1898), the town of Narva, with its cotton factories, contains the iron hands of machinery and earsplitting noise; each day starts with a factory whistle. The town of Narva is transformed here from its previous role as a war machine into a machine of work (Viitol 2009: 79), paradoxically fascinating, very visual and film-like.

Vilde was seemingly interested in "seeing and noticing things", and he had the experience of living in big cities – in Saint Petersburg, Berlin, Copenhagen etc. As early as 1891, in his story *Kuul pähe!* (A Bullet Right Into the Head), he described the city more precisely: as a ghastly place where you might fall ill, get injured while working and die, or work for a pittance. It is a place of low, dark moist rooms and meagre food, with factories devouring its

---

[8] Vilde's *Kui Anija mehed Tallinnas käisid* (When the Men From Anija Came To Tallinn, 1903) plunged into the essence of this period town.

workers mercilessly, although still filling them with hope; if only the children do not die, they can study and live a better life. The townscape of Vilde's slum is disconsolate: narrow muddy streets, rotten wood and low roofs within the city gates, little houses almost falling over. Vilde maps the town, naming toponyms, as most of his characters spend a lot of time walking around. It differs from the Berlin Vilde records, in the same year, quite merrily, poeticizing the local market women.

As Istanbul draws its strength from the Bosphorus (Pamuk 2006: 47), in the Estonian literature of the 20th century the River Emajõgi becomes immensely important; before it was seldom mentioned. Tallinn, however, has a connection with the sea as a seaport. Kannike mentions the end of the navigation season and the cargo boats (1904: 219). The inhabitants of Pärnu go on board more often while travelling to Riga, their almost only way to the outer world: "It was already twilight when the ship skimmed quietly past the foot of the town and the sleepy waves fled, terrified, to the beach, from where they at once ran back to watch how the town welcomed its visitors. The town is not now and was not then in regular connection with any place except the town of Riga and, as the townsfolk of Pärnu are of a grateful nature, they came, if at all possible, to welcome the ship, the only one to bring news a couple of times a week" (Aspe 1910: 8). [9] In this excerpt, the word *city* is repeated very often, as though an evocation of a city.

Generally, some repeated details from different authors are humorous: for example going into the wrong apartment in the wrong house after drinking.

Beginning with Koidula, one of the motifs in coming to town (Tallinn or Tartu) was the song festival, a great national choral event celebrated since 1869. In 1894, Vilde wrote the carnivalesque,

---

[9] '*Ämarik oli juba kätte jõudmas, kui laew tasamalt linna alt mööda libises, ja kohkudes põgenesiwad pool unised lained kaldale, kust nad aga sedamaid jälle tagasi jooksiwad waatama, kuis linn külalised wastu wõttis. Linn ei ole nüüd, ega olnud sel ajal, peale Riia linna kellegi muuga korralises ühenduses; ja et Pärnu linnalased tänulise loomuga, siis tulewad nad, kui iial wõimalik, ikka "laewa" wastu wõtma, kes ainu üksi neile paar korda nädalas uudist toob.*'

humorous *Muhulaste imelikud elamused Tartu juubeli-laulupeol* (*The Strange Adventures of Muhu Islanders during the Great Jubilee Song Festival in Tartu*) about the islanders of little Muhu going to the big song festival in the city of Tartu. It seemed to be an effort to subvert the fears and fixed ideas the people from the country had of the city environment through the liberating attitude of humour. On the journey, even before reaching Tartu, the smith Siim Sikusarv has told his two bride candidates absolutely different stories about this town: to the lovelier one he has depicted it as a spring of happiness, but to the other he has described it as almost the most dangerous place in the world. All three main characters experience town life differently after losing each other in the crowd in the railway station. It is most interesting to follow how their hazy ideas of this environment change and how they perceive different things. It is a humorous overview: their mishaps are mostly funny and end well.

And yet, the same topic was treated in the completely opposite manner six years later in Ernst Särgava's short story *Issanda kiituseks* (Praise the Lord), in the collection *Paised* (Ulcers, 1900), about a girl named Miina´s miserable journey to the next song festival in Tartu, where she is seduced and the city is again the "nest of all evil" (Tuglas 1959: 373). Miina stays in the town as a tavern singer. This could be a response to Vilde, or a parallel: they even share a very similar scene in the Tartu railway station, although it is absolutely different in tonality. Särgava's story was widely criticised because of its attitude towards the song festival.[10] The town of Tartu is here described weirdly with the help of citations from newspapers, promoting it metaphorically and unbelievably, even comparing the event to the ancient Olympics. Distinctive aspects of the Tartu townscape are the taverns named *Jerusalem* and *Bethelem*.

---

[10] Friedebert Tuglas once compared the two mentioned authors as follows: "Here are two outstanding Estonian writers: one a tourist and the other a schoolteacher, one by nature portraying the phenomena of life and the other being the critic of them" (Tuglas 1909: 117).

The colourful city dwellers: a gallery

Bornhöhe's beautiful foreigner Josephine dies in a murder of passion and is not analysed as a character; but other interesting types emerge in the newborn urban prose. The writer J. Liphart, probably of Estonian origin, in 1890 published the story *Narwa posatski* (A Tramp From Narva) about an idler living in the town of Narva. The protagonist is not malevolent; rather, he is a very lazy person with a very interesting attitude. The story is told in the first person by a young merchant, who becomes interested in this tramp´s way of seeing the world and tries to change the tramp's life-style through quite burlesque methods, to make him earn money instead of begging and stealing. The road to salvation is painful. In the background, the castle-town is depicted with few details, but very true to type, and the city catches the reader´s attention because of the errands of the tramp, probably a Germanized Estonian, like a *flâneur* sauntering on the banks of the river dividing the town into two parts. The tramp is a fraudulent artist using his acting talent to make a living, taking his roles from the human gallery of the town, always ready to change.

The townsfolk at that time were mostly not Estonian. In Eduard Bornhöhe's *Kollid* (Bugbears, 1902) characters from two social strata meet in a realistic detective story. The solver of the crime, the Estonian Paul Jostson, comes home from America, where he has lived for many years, and is therefore able to notice things the locals cannot see. He walks through the streets of the city, visits almost every part of the town, and meets different social classes. The slums he descends into are miserable because of the hard work its dwellers are engaged in, having no opportunity to educate their children. The crime itself is rooted in this condition. Dostojevsky´s *Crime and Punishment* is mentioned in the book. The protagonist almost sympathises with the criminal, who has no way out of his slum. Sherlock Holmes in London stayed in the West End (Moretti 1999: 134) instead of the really "vicious, semi-criminal" areas of the city, as in detective fiction crime must be precisely an *enigma* (ib. 136). While Trilljärv follows this principle, Bornhöhe's criminal character has his reasons as did Raskolnikov. This diminishes the enigma, but

probably it is more expressive and reasonable, and is seen from the point of view of the reader. Paul Jostson marries a daughter of a bourgeois family, and in the end the father of the bride confesses: "I am actually an Estonian by birth."

Soon the city slicker enters the scene, and he is often a nasty character. In 1909, in a short story by Vilde, his character Martinson describes his adventures to a rich and elegant friend, summarizing his city experiences: "He told us about the events of his wild life in every corner of the realm, anecdotes about the Warsaw Jews, Odessa Tartars, Tbilisi Armenians, Turkmens of Ashgabat, business stories and stock market jokes, heard and read jests about women, priests, nuns, monks, officers, stories about brothels, harems, theatres, the obscene places of pleasure in metropolises"[11] (Vilde 1983: 166). This description creates a sharp contrast with the scene of their meeting in a quiet park tavern in a smaller town, and the friend manages to make their meeting later on a lot more disgusting than were the stories told in the first place: good appearance and the newest vagaries of fashion do not hide the beast inside.

The woman in the city might be a worn-out wife of a docker (Vilde 1891), a prostitute (Särgava 1903), a maid (Aspe 1888), a factory girl (Vilde 1898) etc. But the most interesting characters are those who through their inner freedom and strength start to defy the conception that the city is the greatest danger to women, breaking "the opposition of the amoral city woman and the virtuous girl from the country" (Kepp 2008: 15). (Even the best of women may fall, as in Vilde's monumental novel *Kui Anija mehed Tallinnas käisid* (When the Men From Anija Came To Tallinn, 1903), where the baron seduces a girl who had cleverly managed to escape from him in the country.) But at least some brave girls are already present: for example, the half-Estonian, half-German girl Helene in Bornhöhe's detective story: she is intelligent, eager to learn and work, tolerant

---

[11] '*Ta jutustas juhtumisi oma ulaelust igas riiginurgas, ankdoote Varssavi juutidest, Odessa tatarlastest, Tiflisi armeenlastest, Ashabadi turkmeeni-dest. – ärilugusid ja börsinalju, kuuldud ja loetud naljatusi naistest, pappi-dest, nunnadest, munkadest, ohvitseridest, – jutukesi avalikest majadest, haaremeist, teatreist, suurlinnade nilbeist lõbukohtadest.*'

and compassionate, and with her internal warmth she is a prede-
cessor of Vilde's "sunny women". After the turn of the century,
Vilde introduced city women striving for education and self-reliance,
and becoming mature personalities (Lindsalu 2008: 31).

The City on Satan's Carousel

This was the beginning. In the first decades of the 20th century, the
Young Estonia movement is said to have founded the city culture of
Estonia, and the members were naturally inspired by it: factories and
modern technology (Sarapik 2008: 242), being the first generation to
live in towns and to urge the formation of the Estonian intellectual
class and desiring to experience the real city atmosphere in a foreign
metropolis (ib. 245). The Neo-Romantic authors mostly tried to see
the positive side of the city (ib. 248), and the result was rather
idyllic: with parks, theatres, museums and quiet apartments opening
to green gardens (ib. 257), suitable for an artist to create in. It was an
illusion destroyed by World War I.

One of the traits common in describing the city in Estonian
literature seems to have stemmed from the lament of Käsu Hans: the
cities are fragile. The pre-war idyllic city found an influential
response in a novel by August Gailit, where he no longer described a
familiar local townscape. Gailit, a writer with a vivid imagination
who constantly juxtaposed beauty and ugliness (Vaiksoo 2002), in
1924 wrote an anti-utopia titled *Purpurne surm* (Purple Death) about
the island town of Varria, belonging to a man named Toomas Moor.
The island town is destroyed by a terrible illness that has already hit
all the cities in the world and kills only men. Before the plague, the
city is like "the European granite and metal heart", "a spinning and
vicious merry-go-round of sin", "naked flesh", "an abortion of a
leprous woman" (Gailit 2001: 25, 62), a conglomerate of all images
of cities. The protagonist compares it to Sodom, Pompeii, and
Alexandria. It is like a piece of gloomy post-war literature with
shattered illusions, allegorical and symbolist, influenced by Oswald
Spengler and, in addition, for the writer, the possibility of acting as a
demiurge: the opportunity to create a city, assemble in it the reality
and the dream of the Young Estonians of a European city, let it

flourish and fall into decay, and then destroy it, full of the joy of creation, spinning the carousel of Satan. The powerful myth of lost cities, as though an answer to Käsu Hans, has since then emerged again and again in Estonian literature: literary cities are delicate. Bernard Kangro´s magically realistic Tartu in his novel cycle beginning with the book *Jäälätted* (Springs of Ice, 1958) is delicate, a town standing in the fire of World War II on the other side of the Styx, and Tiit Aleksejev´s Narva in the play *Leegionärid* (Legionaires, 2010) is very fragile: devastated in the same war, never to be rebuilt like it once was.

It was then the beginning of the era of writing about the cityscape and its essence as a familiar space and background, and for the city to become the main character of novels soon to be born – for example in Karl Ristikivi's "Tallinna-triloogia" (Tallinn Trilogy),[12] or in the descriptions of the outskirts of Leida Kibuvits' Tartu, which was characterized by literary critics as "breathing", in the harsh slum pictures in the late 1920s and early 1930s, describing the national variety of Oskar Luts' human kaleidoscope of the backyards of Tartu, the townsfolk of Russian, Estonian and Baltic German origin, or even as a city based on the grave in Baltic-German literature (Bergengruen 1939).

Conclusions

In this article, the works of several writers of the second half of the nineteenth century and the beginning of the twentieth were examined.

The period had several prominent features: there was the fight for Estonia's own town space as well as an attempt to make this space immanently familiar. It was a period of mapping, describing and

---

[12] Karl Ristikivi wrote three novels, which would come to be known as the Tallinna-triloogia, between 1938 and 1942: here the changes in the town structure and the comprehensive panorama of the country's urbanization are interesting to follow.

exploring with curiosity and eagerness; also it was a period of warning, a socially critical period. The idea of a city evoked a host of contradictory images and connotations, and it is sensed in the discourse of a hell for the poor, the dramatically exciting machinery of industrialization, something contradictory to nature and the natural state of being, a powerful magnet.

The contrast with nature, although it existed, is not a diagnostic feature. More distinguishing is the separation of two different worlds: the townspeople and those from the village, as well as the contrast between the solidity of the town centre and the condition of the poor slums depicted by Eduard Vilde and Eduard Bornhöhe. The city is occasionally a diseased body, although an efficient machine with its distinct noise, the cityscape with smoking chimneys. The protagonists are not yet young heroes or heroines of the *Bildungs-roman* coming to the big city and finding their way of living there, but the urge to come to town is notable. The picture is still static, but mapped with curiosity both geographically and socially. A *veduta* had not yet been born, but the literary townscape was largely visual: the landmarks mentioned in one book after another, and the beginning of detailed description that would appear later. And yet the cityscape and its essence remain enigmatic: it could no longer be a binary opposition of black and white, but had to be a lot more complicated because of the changing society and the urge to come to the city; a leitmotif and a keyword of the era.

The townscape of this period's literature is largely visual, and seems to have all the universal meanings. According to Yi-Fu Tuan, the ancient city was the symbol of the Cosmos, an image of the City of God (Tuan 1990: 150). The literature of nineteenth century Estonia seemed to be ready to experience the divinity of this phenomenon, as well as to understand its frailties, but it was still in a phase of feeling out, of finding and understanding the warm glow around their towns.

While the poetry of the period emphasized, at times, the need to leave the city (Kepp 2008: 15), in prose the city was an invitation, with distinctive sounds. But this was still largely an "extramural" attitude; the end of this period marks the beginning of the texts that would be born within, depictions of the city itself as a character, as a

living creature, or as the background of the reflection of modern man´s soul.

Symbolically, the era may have ended with August Gailit's novel *Purpurne surm*, with a utopia fallen in a cataclysm.

References

Aspe, E. 1911. *Aastate pärast*. Tartu: Postimees.

Aspe, E. 1910. *Ennosaare Ain*. Tartu: Hermanni kirjastus.

Aspe, E. 1913. *Kasuõde*. Tallinn: Maa.

Aspe, E. 1984. *Ennosaare Ain*. Anna Dorothea. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Bachelard, G. 1999. *Ruumipoeetika*. Tallinn: Vagabund.

Bakhtin 1987 = Bahtin, M. 1987. Teksti probleem lingvistikas, filoloogias ja humanitaarteadustes üldse. Filosoofilise analüüsi katse. – *Valitud töid*. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat, 212–234.

Bennett, T.; Grossberg, L.; Morris, M. (eds.) 2008. *New Keywords: A Revised Vocabulary of Culture and Society*. Malden (Mass.) [etc.]: Blackwell.

Bergengruen, W. 1939. *Der Tod von Reval. Kuriose Geschichten aus einer alten Stadt*. Hamburg: Hanseatische Verlagsanstalt.

Bornhöhe, E. 1903. Kollid. Tallinn: G. Pihlaka rmtkpl.

Burke, N. 2002. Cityscapes – Canadian Urban Space as Portrayed in Selected Fiction and Non-Fiction. – *Koht ja paik/Place and Location. Studies in Environmental Aesthetics and Semiotics III*. Virve Sarapik, Kadri Tüür (eds.). Proceedings of the Estonian Academy of Arts 14. Tallinn: Eesti Kunstiakadeemia, 303–312.

Choay, F. 1986. Urbanism and Semiology. – *The City and the Sign: An Introduction to Urban Semiotics*. Mark Gottdiener and Alexandros Ph. Lagopoulos (eds.). New York: Columbia University Press, 160–175.

Gailit, A. 2001. *Purpurne surm*. Tallinn: Tänapäev.

Gottlieb, J. 1999. Darwin´s City, or Life Underground. Evolution, Progress, and the Shapes of Things to Come. – *The Nature of Cities. Ecocriticism and Urban Environments*. Michael Bennett and David W. Teague (eds.). University of Arizona Press, Tucson, Arizona, 233–254.

Kalda, M. 2002. Estonian Literary Slum. – *Koht ja paik/Place and Location II*. Virve Sarapik, Kadri Tüür, Mari Laanemets (eds.). Proceedings of the Estonian Academy of Arts 10, Tallinn: Eesti Kunstiakadeemia, 389–406.

Kangro, B. 1940. "Romaani" tulek meie kirjandusse. – *Eesti Kirjandus* No 8, 331–339.

Kannike, C. 1904. *Ch. Kannikese teuste täieline kogu.* Tallinn: M. Neumann.

Kant, E. 1999. Tartu tagamaast ja mõjukonnast. – *Linnad ja maastikud.* Tartu: Ilmamaa, 493– 502.

Kepp, Õ. 2008. *Identiteedi suundumusi eesti luules.* Dissertations on humanities. Tallinn: Tallinna Ülikooli Kirjastus.

Kepp, Õ. 2003. A Chance of Estonian Urban Poetry? A Glance at Estonian Urban Poetry between 1860–1940. – *Koht ja paik/Place and Location. Studies in Environmental Aesthetics and Semiotics III.* Virve Sarapik, Kadri Tüür (eds.). Proceedings of the Estonian Academy of Arts 14. Tallinn: Eesti Kunstiakadeemia, 361–378.

Kibuvits, L. 1932. *Soomustüdruk.* Tartu: Loodus.

Lepasaar, K. (ed.) 2007. *Geograafia kontuurkaardid gümnaasiumile.* Tallinn: Avita.

Lindsalu, E. 2008. *Naisekuju modelleerimine XX sajandi alguskümnendite eesti kirjanduses: analüütiline ülevaade.* Dissertations on humanities. Tallinn: Tallinna Ülikool.

Liphart, J. 1890. *Narwa posatski.* Narva: J. Reinvald.

Lukas, L. 2004. Läbielatud ruum? Lisandus baltisaksa kirjandusloo uurimisse. – *Akadeemia* No 3, 531–561.

Luts, O. 1933. *Tagahoovis.* Tartu: Noor-Eesti.

Lynch, K. 1960. *The Image of the City.* Cambridge: MIT Press.

Moretti, F. 1999. *Atlas of the European novel, 1800–1900.* London; New York: Verso.

Pamuk, O. 2006. *Istanbul: memories of a city.* New York: Vintage Books.

Pezold, L. von 1901. *Schattenrisse aus Revals Vergangenheit.* Reval: Kluge, 1901.

Sarapik, V. 2008. Noor-Eesti antifuturismist. – Marin Laak and Sirje Olesk (eds.). *Noor-Eesti" kümme aastat: esteetika ja tähendus. Methis 1/2.* Tartu: Eesti Kirjandusmuuseum, 242–261.

Scott, M. 2008. *WordSmith Tools Manual Version 5.0.* Liverpool: Lexical Analysis Software.

Sprengfeld, G. (= Hansen, G. von) 1877. *Meine Vaterstadt Reval vor 50 Jahren.* Dorpat: Druck und Verlag Schnakenburg's litho- & typogr. Anstalt.

Suburg, L. 2002. *Kogutud kirjatööd.* Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Särgava, E. 1970. *Paised.* Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Talivee, E.-M. 2010. The inspiring townscape of the Estonian writer Elisabeth Aspe: urbanization,

482

TALIVEE

desire and the influence of context. – *Online Proceedings of the Annual Conference of the Poetics and Linguistics Association (PALA).* http://www.pala.ac.uk/resources/proceedings/2010/talivee2010.pdf]

Talve, I. 2004. Eesti kultuurilugu. Keskaja algusest Eesti iseseisvuseni. Tartu: Ilmamaa.

Trilljärv, A. 1893. *Keew weri. Kriminal-jutustus Tallinna elust.* Tallinn: Vahtrik.

Tuan, Y.-F. 1990. *Topophilia. A Study of Environmental Perception, Attitudes, and Values.* New York: Columbia University Press.

Tuglas, F. 1909. Eduard Wilde ja Ernst Peterson. – *Noor-Eesti III.* Tartu: Noor-Eesti, 113–194.

Tuglas, F. 1959. Ernst Särgava. – Teosed. Valik kriitilisi töid. Tallinn: Eesti Riiklik Kirjastus, 344–402.

Ungern-Sternberg, A. v. 2003. *"Erzählregionen": Überlegungen zu literarischen Räumen mit Blick auf die deutsche Literatur des Baltikums, das Baltikum und die deutsche Literatur.* Bielefeld: Aisthesis.

Vaiksoo, J. 2002. August Gailit. *Estonian Literary Magazine.* No 14. [http://elm.estinst.ee/issue/14/august-gailit/].

Viitol, L. 2009. Narva ja tema semisfäär romaanis "Raudsed käed". – *Igihaljas Vilde. Eduard Vilde 140. sünniaastapäeva puhul 4.–5. märtsil 2004 Tartu Kirjanduse Majas toimunud konverentsi laiendatud kogumik.* Livia Viitol (ed.). Tartu: Eesti Kirjanduse Selts, 68–82.

Vilde, E. 1891. Kuul pähe! Uudisjutt Tallinna elust. Tallinn: H. Mathiesen.

Vilde, E. 1882. *Kurjal teel.* Jurjew: Schnackenburg.

Vilde, E. 1983. Kuival. – Eduard Vilde. *Kolmkümmend aastat armastust.* Eesti novellivara. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat, 157–181.

On Decadent Europe and the Intellectual Identity of Young Estonia: J. Randvere's Ruth *and Friedebert Tuglas'* Felix Ormusson

"What is it that binds me to life?" asks Felix Ormusson. "Not my relatives, not my friends – no one! Werther had a mother, brothers, and friends, but is it possible for me to have any of these! It seems that I was even born into the world without parents! The perimeter of life is contracting. Everything is becoming more insubstantial. As my thought rubs against it, the glass wall dividing being from nonexistence keeps getting thinner. One of these days this merciless diamond will break the mirror of illusions. And what will happen then? The more conscious the human being becomes, the weaker he becomes when faced with life's tragedy, which is evident everywhere: in humans, nature, the starry sky. Every one of life's details comes to have a meaning, but taken together, existence loses its meaning altogether. What is left is a wordless, imageless despair, endless and pointless. Everything that is visible is for you only a symbol. You stand helpless before reality. You have no faith left in anything." (Tuglas 1988: 102–103)

This quotation[1] from Young Estonia's leading theorist and prose stylist Friedebert Tuglas' (1886–1971) novel *Felix Ormusson* (1914) is laden with references to literary decadence and the European *fin de siècle*. The novel and its protagonist, a would-be writer returned from Europe to spend the summer holidays at a friend's farm in rural Estonia, enact in diary form the conflicts and antinomies of a confrontation with the modern, experienced and recorded in the vocabulary of European decadence. For the reader even vaguely

---

[1] Here and in the following translation of quotations is mine. M. H.

familiar with the "key words" of decadence, Ormusson's diary entries and monologues will evoke connotations and specific intertexts, as can be seen from the first rhetorical question Ormusson poses above: "What binds me to life?". The same can be observed for his more philosophical exclamation, "Every one of life's details comes to have a meaning, but taken together, existence loses its meaning altogether." Both of these sentences seem to allude directly to Friedrich Nietzsche's formulation in *Der Fall Wagner* (1888), of one of the basic meanings of literary decadence, lack of coherence, the whole not holding together:

> "Womit kennzeichnet sich jede *literarische decadence*? Damit, dass das Leben nicht mehr im Ganzen wohnt. Das Word wird souverän und springt aus dem Satz hinaus, der Satz greift über und verdunkelt den Sinn der Seite, die Seite gewinnt Leben auf Unkosten des Ganzen – das Ganze ist kein Ganze mehr... Das Ganze lebt überhaupt nicht mehr: es ist zusammengesetzt, gerechnet, künstlich, ein Artefakt." (Nietzsche 1999: 27).

This totalizing approach to decadence is an important aspect of Nietzsche's later philosophy; the French word *décadence* is mentioned with increasing frequency in his writings after 1883–1884 (Silk 2005: 587–606). Yet for Nietzsche the style of literary decadence is but one of many examples of disintegration in culture. In addition to the use of decadence as an aesthetic term, the roots of which usage lead back to Gautier and Baudelaire, Nietzsche deploys decadence as a host of cultural meanings that range from psychology to physiology. Scholars of Nietzsche's philosophy emphasize three main lineages in Nietzsche's treatment of decadence. First, as has already been briefly discussed, decadence refers to disorganization, the disintegration or lack of wholeness (in both a positive and a negative sense), and the decline in physiological and psychological processes (organic decadence), as expressed in limited reaction to irritation, pathological instincts and the weakening of the will to life. A second meaning of decadence for Nietzsche is seemingly contradictory to the first one: decadence is a normal, even necessary life process, a phase of organic life, though the decadent side of

human life needs to find an appropriate expression and outlet. Thirdly, decadence in Nietzsche's view is a comprehensive manifestation in culture, making itself felt across all cultural fields (decadent morality, philosophy, religion, science, politics, art; Tongeren et al 2004: 540–563).

In light of these three meanings, decadence becomes an overarching synonym for modernity, and more specifically for "modern" psychology of perception and experience. At the end of the 19th century, decadence was a common denominator for a range of processes of modernization and modern approaches to art–along with terms such as naturalism, aestheticism, fin de siècle, impressionism, symbolism, and Jugend. As I will argue below, however, though in Felix Ormusson the term decadence is much more seldom explicitly named than its opposite term, Life, decadence becomes and remains a generative concept throughout the novel. I will also argue, using another Young Estonian – J. Randvere's short prose text *Ruth* (1909), that the arrival of decadence on the Estonian cultural scene was strongly – if not always apparently – gendered. Through the deployment of the gendered discourse of decadence Felix Ormusson and Ruth articulate the dilemmas of the sensibility, consciousness, and creativity of the transitional first-generation Estonian intellectuals.

Decadence and Life

In the European cultural discourse at the turn of the 19th/20th century decadence and life functioned as opposing philosophical concepts and as metaphors. The metaphor of life was often gendercoded as female, though sometimes in a veiled manner. Both Tuglas' and Nietzsche's texts focus on the experience of the disintegration of a whole. "Life", the opposite term to "decadence", signifies wholeness, health, and the unmediated perception of reality. The conceptualization of "life" was furthered by "life-philosophers" such as Simmel, Nietzsche and Bergson: at the beginning of the 20th century life came to be the symbol of authenticity, ineffability, dynamism, creativity, and totality, as well as a universal weapon in cultural discourse in the fight against social convention, the superficiality of

so-called "civilization", alienation from nature, and sober ratio-
nalism; at the very least it became a means for expressing mistrust
and protest against such conventionality (Sprengel 2004: 72). If
"life" was a feminized term, its opposite, decadence, was coded
masculine, but paradoxically it also functioned as a means of fighting
social and cultural conventions. By the 1880s decadence came to
signify the experience of a wholeness falling apart, of heightened
analytic consciousness, alienation from nature and the self, creative
impotence, and the splitting of the subject.

In Estonian literary decadence of the beginning of the 20th
century, and in the subsequent literary modernism, only the term
"life" carries a positive connotation. Usually the opposing term to
"life", "decadence", remains unnamed, or is mentioned only in
passing, and is then listed alongside other negatively coded terms,
such as decline, disintegration, decomposition. Why is it so that
decadence is so seldom overtly mentioned in the texts of Estonian
writers? Reasons for the avoidance of this term should be sought in
the mental ambience of the 1890s, when in Europe the term deca-
dence had became "anthropologized"[2], and consequently acquired a
pejorative meaning. This shift in usage can be attributed to
nationalistically minded, culturally conservative theoreticians such as
Max Nordau, Adolf Bartels, Lev Tolstoi. Decadence became a
negative signifier for a deviation from norms, for unhealthy and
pathological tendencies; thus it became a medium for conveying a
critique of modernity.

Decadence entered Estonian literary discourse already fraught
with this secondary field of negative meanings, both through
members of the Young Estonia movement, who in the first decade of
the 20th century sought to make Estonian "provincial" letters more
European, and their critics, who saw these foreign "imports" as the
carriers of the cultural disease of overcivilization. *Felix Ormusson*
can be situated alongside other texts that enact a critique of
modernity in the guise of literary decadence.

---

[2] That means the equating of decadence with modern perception and the
emphasis on components of cognitive psychology. Cf. Kafitz 2004.

Bourget's Concept of Decadence

The opening quotation from *Felix Ormusson* does not point only in the direction of Nietzsche, but implicitly toward the writings of Paul Bourget, familiar to the Young Estonia group through one of their members, Johannes Aavik, whose inclination toward contemporary French culture was epitomized by the choice of Bourget as a topic for his master's thesis, the manuscript of which has unfortunately vanished without a trace. In *Der Fall Wagner*, Nietzsche paraphrases Bourget, better known than Nietzsche himself as a writer and theoretician of decadence at the end of the 19th century. Indeed, it has been claimed that it was due to Bourget's influence that Nietzsche worked out his concept of decadence in its final form. In both Nietzsche's and Bourget's accounts, decadence is equated with modernity; both authors share a similar discomfort with their respective cultures and with the perception that both were exhibiting undeniable signs of decline.

In Bourget's view, decadent literature is characterized by the absence of stylistic uniformity: "Un style de décadence est celui où l'unité du livre se décompose pour laisser la place à l'indépendance de la page, où la page se décompose pour laisser la place à l'indépendance de la phrase, et la phrase pour laisser la place à l'indépendance du mot." (Bourget 1883: 25). Indeed, Nietzsche's above-quoted argument from *Der Fall Wagner* reads as an ironic gloss of Bourget's passage found in the opening essay on Baudelaire in Bourget's *Essais de psychologie contemporaine* (1883). In both this and the companion volume, *Nouveaux Essais de psychologie contemporaine*, (1885), Bourget uses examples from a range of French writers[3] to illustrate "symptoms of decadence."

Bourget situates himself among the first writers to reinstate a pessimistic view of life, an attitude rooted in certain intellectual predispositions such as melancholy, decadence, dilettantism, a spirit of analysis (*esprit d'analyse*), weakness of will (*maladie de la volonte*), cosmopolitanism (*cosmopolitisme*). As can be seen,

---

[3] Renan, Flaubert, Taine, Stendhal, Dumas the younger, Leconte de Lisle, the brothers Goncourt, Turgenev, and Amiel.

decadence is one term in the list of symptoms, as well as a general heading for the entire symptomatology, indicating Bourget's ambivalent stance with respect to decadence in his essays of 1883–1886. Seen in terms of psychological phenomenon such as sensitivity or "modern" perception, decadence becomes both attractive and repulsive. From the standpoint of a moralist and cultural conservative, Bourget judges these pessimistic attitudes as phenomena of disease.

In this way Bourget's argumentation makes way for a comprehensive critique of civilization, in which decadence signifies the decomposition of the social organism. In this view, society remains operational only to the extent that its component parts function "avec une énergie subordonnée", in other words if the majority of people stand against their own inclinations toward individualism. If too many members of society cease to fulfill their roles as elements of the whole, their drive to independence will result in the disintegration of family relationships and the general structure of society. In the "age of decadence", the experience of social wholeness becomes replaced by diversity, with a resultant collapse of social coherence and a condition producing too many individuals who are incapable of collective coexistence (ib. 24–25).

Thus it should not surprise us that upon closer comparison, Bourget pronounces a more severe negative judgment on decadent literature than does Nietzsche. Both Bourget and Nietzsche begin with the notion of the whole, but Nietzsche redefines this concept in Der *Fall Wagner*. For Nietzsche, the whole "is no longer the whole", that is, the whole is no longer taken as the norm against which "deviations" are to be measured. This shift of emphasis confers upon decadence a positive charge in the sense of "vitality". Bourget regards decadence in almost the same totalizing manner as Nietzsche, but his account remains ambivalent, and inclined away from the positive, vitalist valence of Nietzsche's reinterpretation. On the one hand decadence connotes for Bourget culture in an extraordinary state of refinement, whereas decadent individuals are "artistes de l'intérieur de leur âme" (Bourget 1983: 27). On the other hand, decadence signifies modern individualism and egoism. As a moralist, Bourget concludes that the increasing prevalence of individual life

over against common goals and efforts will result in the disintegration of the social fabric.

The Decadent Dilettante in *Ruth* and *Felix Ormusson*

If cultural decadence makes itself palpable in such contradictory tendencies as growth and aging, refinement and decomposition, the prototypical location of such culture is France, a country thought of at the *fin de siècle* as the epitome of modernization. Since a culture that has arrived at a zenith has nowhere left to move, intellectuals regarded the phenomena of progress paradoxically as signs of regression and decline. It is at this juncture, from a "finished" culture on the cusp of decline that the Young Estonia intellectuals adopted and absorbed European decadence in the construction of their own cultural modernity. As Aino Kallas has pointed out, the Estonian reader made his or her first acquaintance with the "modern person as a beautiful soul" through the pseudonymous J. Randvere's 1909 prose piece entitled *Ruth*, which exhibits all of the norms and symptomatic values of decadent discourse and its implicit critique of modernity (Kallas 1909). A definition of decadent culture in the spirit of Bourget is articulated quite near the beginning of *Ruth*:

> Woman seems to me to be capable of bringing to self-realization a more extensive work of art. In terms of her appearance, she is a more developed product of culture, a specimen of humankind as it has grown ever older and more refined. Her flesh is finer and more delicate; her physical force has diminished; her bones have become more refined, her hand and foot have lost volume. Overall she is a most ethereal, dematerialized, spiritual creature. (Randvere 1980: 10).

Though woman is set up as the allegorical equivalent of a highly developed, aged, and refined culture, the narrator of Ruth, himself a decadent intellectual, also makes direct use of the decadent ideal of beauty, the model of the *femme fragile*, to characterize Ruth as an ideal woman. Both of these ideal objects–culture and woman, meld together in a complex bundle of paradoxes: while culture is overripe,

overdeveloped, in the decline of age, the *femme fragile* expresses an immature, ethereal, and morbid beauty.

The portrait of Ruth as *femme fragile*, the projection and creature of male decadent imagination, is initially drawn through her external features: the delicacy and refinement of her flesh, the thinning of her bones, her physical weakness and pale demeanour. Ruth's psychic makeup is constructed according to concepts of the modern masculine subject: she is highly intellectual "in that special meaning given to this in France." She is a being "whose brain activity is extremely developed, who has gathered into the storehouses of her memory vast quantities of scientific and literary ideas and facts." (Ib. 28) These are the characteristics that define the male dilettante in literary decadence. It is not surprising to find the first lengthy consideration of the decadent dilettante in Estonian literature in *Felix Ormusson*. Ormusson, too, is highly analytical and highly sensitive, he has also stuffed his head with literary and scientific facts and he can be characterized as someone with an overdeveloped imagination and the perception of the relativity of different points of view. Together, these two characters seem to be textbook illustrations of Bourget's dilettante – a person with a huge appetite for knowledge and understanding, but whose attitude toward ideas, world views, and credos remains one of skeptical distancing. According to Bourget, the dilettante can make no claims without supplementing them with reservations and nuances, because he is highly cognizant of contradictoriness among different viewpoints (Bourget 59–75).

In the positive sense dilettantism is an expression of the intellectual freedom and "genius" of the decadent, a combination of sensuality and intellect that makes for an ultimate degree of refinement and nuance: life becomes art in the form of vast mosaic of fragments. As a moralist, however, Bourget is equally keen to point out the shadow side of this "superiority", this capacity for making art out of life. Dilettantism carries with it a weakness of will, which is a great disadvantage in a world of decisive action – an attribute that the narrator of Ruth is quick to point out. The *esprit d'analyse* appropriate to science may be accompanied by the pretension to objectivity and an ability to master all knowledge, but the modern human wins these at the expense of spontaneity and

decisiveness. He is unable to discard anything, to take a clear position, to make a decision for or against. In *Felix Ormusson*, the protagonist's genius (which the narrator never doubts) is expressed in the character's oscillation between heightened sensitivity and credence given to different modes of perception. Two of Ormusson's declarations sum up his skeptical, distanced attitude toward different perspectives: "There is no ugliness that is not beautified by distance. All art lies in the finding of the appropriate distance;" "world views are nothing but fine apparel for going visiting." (Tuglas 1988: 31).

Ormusson sets himself in opposition to different people (and their world views), while simultaneously seeking connection with them: he falls in love with Helene, then with her sister Marion; he feels pulled toward his friend and host Johannes, and repelled by him; by turns he idealizes and rejects rural society and its representatives. This oscillation between different positions sometimes paralyzes Ormusson's initiative and leads to an inability to make decisions, which in sum is the real reason for his decadence and melancholy.

Ormusson's cosmopolitanism and thirst for the exotic mix with his pose of dilettante, so that he can be equated with Nietzsche, whose warning to the expression of such attitudes toward life, sounding rather like Bourget:

> Ich beschreibe, was kommt: die Heraufkunft des Nihilismus. ... die Zeichen davon sind überall, die Augen nur für diese Zeichen fehlen noch. [---] der moderne Mensch glaubt versuchsweise bald an diesen, bald an jeden Werth und läßt ihn dann fallen: der Kreis der überlebten und fallengelassenen Werthe wird immer voller; die Leere und Armut an Werthen kommt immer mehr zum Gefühl... (Nietzsche 1999: 56–57).

Thus in the era of decadence it is no longer possible to cling to the rules of faith and reason as it had been in the age of Enlightenment. The modern human being (that is, the modern man) no longer holds on to a religion (*credo général*), nor to a force of negation (*force de négation*), both of which possibilities were available in the 18th century. Instead, he is receptive to everything, and his skepticism has

no analogy in previous intellectual history (Bourget 1983: 198–199).
Spiritually, the modern man has lost his bearings.

The Rhetoric of Health and Illness in *Ruth* and *Felix Ormusson*

In the oscillation between conflicting norms, *Ruth* as a text most
clearly demonstrates the *fin de siècle* as a time of transition, in which
new norms and values do not yet prevail, while the old ones have
lost their power. The narrator of Ruth deploys a number of markers
of "health" to neutralize the taint of decadent pathology in the
portrait of the ideal woman. Ruth's active agency, her state of health,
which carries a smattering of qualities from the romantic profile of
the male genius, outweighs the markings of the decadent dilettante.
Ruth's will is not totally paralyzed. Though she often suffers from
doubts and hesitations, her moments of inner struggle and indecisive-
ness are temporary. Ruth wakes up early in the morning and after her
hours of scholarly work, goes to bed early. In her activity Ruth
belongs to the productive geniuses of the Enlightenment.[4]

The contrast between Ruth and Felix Ormusson is dramatic: with
his mind saturated by scientific and literary facts, Ormusson is a
child of his era, and he has lost all capacity to act and to create. This
is not to say that efforts to surmount decadence in Felix Ormusson
are any less than in Ruth. However, unlike Ruth, Tuglas' novel
projects the states of health and wholeness outward from his
protagonist − into the setting of the agrarian world of the peasant,
into nature, into bourgeois lifestyles and mentalities, and into
children and women. For these reasons Ormusson, unlike Ruth, is a
thoroughgoing decadent. His dilettantism belongs unilaterally to the
phenomena of late civilization, signifying among other things the
enjoyment of material and intellectual privileges inherited from his
ancestors; he himself makes no contribution to the reproduction of
these values. This is the meaning of Ormusson's claim when,
aligning himself with Werther, he feels himself to have been born

---

[4] One of the intertexts informing the construction of Ruth as a character is
Weininger's model of the male genius.

into the world without parents. This feeling of rootlessnesss gives rise to the nostalgia for the past.

Diletantism as an attempt to define the identity of the decadent male artist is in dialogue with the prior accounts of problematics of the genius. In Bourget's words, those considered dilettantes in the "active centuries" were at the same time great geniuses, meaning skilled appliers of their universal knowledge (eg Alkibiades, Caesar, Leonardo da Vince, Montaigne). Ironically, dilettantism only reveals the plenitude of its possibilities in the "in the late period of the life of the races", when the extreme state of civilization has gradually destroyed the power to create, and compensated for the loss by the power of intellectual comprehension (Bourget 1883: 60–61). On the on hand, then, Bourget imitates the "genius" and richness of possibilities offered by dilettantism (just as the textual author of Felix Ormusson admires his character); on the other hand Bourget emphasizes the characteristic destruction of the powers of creativity that one sees in the genius-dilettante). The result is art that has lost all of its sacredness, the aura of genius that had been attributed to it in the Romantic era.

The decadent dilettante who merely desires to understand stands in opposition to those who know how to choose and act. In Tuglas' novel Ormusson's opposite is his childhood friend, the petit bourgeois doctor Johannes "who knows what he wants and wants what he knows, though he really does not know very much, nor want very much at all." (Tuglas 1988: 108). Ormusson knows too much and wants too much, and this is a mainspring for his decadence, his feeling that the whole has fallen apart. For Ormusson Johanes becomes the stimulus and object for his self-critique, and his longings for admiration and identification.

The City as Destroyer of the Perception of Wholeness

As we have seen above, the context for the construction of the decadent dilettante is scientific and technical progress with the concomitant expansion of human powers of intellectual comprehension, with the consequences of plurality and relativism of perspective and the paralysis of will. There is, however, another dimension to the

somewhat frenetic multiplicity and fragmentation of the dilettante's experience. Dilettantism can also result from the panoply of sensory impressions experienced in the large metropolis or in the modern salon, which gathers this multiplicity together into one space (Bourget 1883: 67, 70).

No references can be found in the text of *Ruth* concerning the protagonist's putative experiences in the metropolis. In Tuglas' words, Ruth is an excellent example of the "theoretical European": "Since we have no big cities here, we have come to know the cultural moods of the great world too theoretically, indirectly, through education, foreign literature and art. Heretofore we have not been able to participate actively in the creation of Europe's cultural values. Nothing connects us to the history of these treasures. We are but theoretical Europeans." (Tuglas 1996: 52). Ormusson, however, has clearly had the experience of living in Paris, the quintessential modern European metropolis. Thus the specific makeup of Ormusson's psyche (his hypertrophied imagination, his panic attacks and nervousness) can without scruple be associated with the influence of the city.

According to sociologist and life philosopher Georg Simmel,

> Die psychologische, auf der der Typus großstädtischer Indivi-
> dualitäten sich erhebt, ist die Steigerung des Nervenlebens, die
> aus dem raschen und ununterbrochenen Wechsel äußerer und
> innerer Eindrücke hervorgeht. [---] Indem die Großstadt gerade
> diese psychologischen Bedingungen schafft – mit jedem Gang
> über die Straße, mit dem Tempo und den Mannigfaltigkeiten des
> wirtschaftlichen, beruflichen, gesellschaftlichen Lebens -, stiftet
> sie schon in den sinnlichen Fundamenten des Seelenlebens, in
> dem Bewußtseinsquantum ... einen tiefen Gegensatz gegen die
> Kleinstadt und das Landleben, mit dem langsameren, ge-
> wohnteren, gleichmäßiger fließenden Rhythmus ihres sinnlich-
> geistigen Lebensbildes (Simmel 2002: 125).

Implicitly Simmel sets two temporalities in opposition to each other – the linear, subjective sense of time that belongs to the metropolis, and which gives rise to a sense of "things falling apart", and a cyclic sense of time attributed to the social spaces of small

town and countryside. In sum, these are reduced to the opposition of modern and premodern (agrarian) societies.

The opposition to the mentality of the small town and the countryside mentioned at the end of Simmel's passage can be found on several levels in the first half of the novel *Felix Ormusson*. The protagonist, who represents metropolitan consciousness, thinks that in the country nothing changes; everything repeats itself–the same voices, the same tasks performed at the same times, and from this Ormusson draws the seemingly logical conclusion that the thoughts of the rural person are similarly repetitive. Country people are always the same, always boring and unimaginative. By contrast, Ormusson thinks of himself as equipped with a superb quality of imagination, as well as an ultrasensitive nature. Interestingly, corresponding attributes can be seen both in the narrator and protagonist of Ruth.

Modernity as the signifier for sensitivity, imagination, and lack of repetition, as embodied by the character of Ormusson seems charged here with positive connotations. But over time Ormusson relates to modernity in a more and more negative spirit. The experience of multiplicity that accompanies scientific and technical progress, amplified by the accelerated pace of life in the modern metropolis, threatens to disintegrate the experiential unity necessary for life. "Nerve fever" is exacerbated by the uncontrolled thirst for acquiring sensations and new knowledge – a drive encoded in the positivist world view; instead of allowing the person to move without impediment from thought to action, "nerve fever" sets him back and forces him into the position of passive contemplator. Ormusson exclaims, "My nerves are so strained that every moment I could explode like a rocket." (Tuglas 1988: 70). This constant state of reactivity which Ormusson brings to his summer resort along with his sensitivity and nervousness is extremely fatiguing. The longer Ormusson stays in his summer "rest home", the more attractive country life seems to him:

> How simple and enjoyable life is here! That I did not expect. It paralyzes my thoughts, and all I want to do is rest – from people, art, and nervous fever. To eat at specified times and go to bed

early – that is the petit bourgeois way. The intellectual aristocrat stays awake at night and sleeps by day, often eating nothing at all. But it isn't such a bad thing to be a *petit bourgeois* some-times. At least the human organism votes in favour of it. The very thought of the poisonous air of the café and the powdered women in the flickering mirrors brings on my fever. And when the noise of the metro rumbles in my ears, I always get a sudden foreshadowing of hell. (Ib. 12–13).

Upon deeper analysis, one can see Ormusson's monologue arti-culating a dialectic between the biological decline ("nerve fever") that is the casualty of metropolitan life and the refinement of the spirit. The life of the "intellectual aristocrat" may mean an ultimate degree of spiritual refinement, but the artificial, unnatural environ-ment of the metropolis in which this life is lived augments physiological decline.

The Impossibility of Direct Experience and
the Thirst for Life

Like Bourget and Nietzsche, Tuglas uses the ambivalent presentation of his novel *Felix Ormusson* to settle accounts with the results of high civilization. On the one hand, for the textual author the figure of Ormusson as protagonist is a model of identification; on the other, he is a means of performing a critique of modernity and overcoming decadence. The zenith of cultural development should correspond to maximally productive activity, but this turns into its opposite, the impossibility of action: "The more conscious the human being becomes, the more powerless he is when faced with the tragedy of life." This highest degree of self-consciousness, due to which "Ormusson stands helpless before reality" (ib. 102–103) is an expression of solipsism and egoism, the cult of the self, and it inevitable consequence is the disintegration of the self.

Ormusson's overly cultured head is stuffed with quotations and interpretations of texts: he is "sick with thought." As a decadent, Ormusson constantly aestheticizes his life. Thus one of the context of his crisis of identity and sensibility is the powerlessness to

experience life naively, without the mediation of texts. Thus he becomes a modern (decadent) approach to art, which opposes itself to a mimetic interpretation of reality and instead emphasizes its constructedness. In himself and all of his objects of reflection Ormusson sees objects of aesthetic imagination. For example, he sees the women characters Helene and Marion refracted through works of art from different ages. He walks in nature as in a baudelaireian forest of symbols. Summer landscapes for him have associations with impressionist paintings.

In sum, Ormusson is incapable of experiencing life directly. The novel's textual author also warns readers against this kind of decadence. "Indeed we have always cared little about life... We have considered words in books as something more real and trustworthy than life itself." (ib. 9). This representation of alienation from life, along with the accompanying veiled critique, carried out by means of self-irony, continues to amplify over the course of the events of Ormusson. It becomes increasingly clear that Ormusson's only real contact with the outside world is his contemplation and self-analysis. All the more so, since Ormusson's consciousness is imprisoned inside him, any objective knowledge of the outside world becomes doubtful, just as it becomes increasingly difficult to make sense of the difference between the perception of reality and hallucination. In sum, even his existence is set in doubt. Sleep, dream, and imagination, life and reality all become mixed up. This is what Ormusson means (in the abovecited passage) by the thinning of the "glass wall" between being and nothingness. Here we see the experience of decadence in the direct sense of the word: an objective incapability to perceive oneself and reality logically and as a whole. The consequence of this state of consciousness is the multiplication of needs, the creation of demanding fantasies with little if any intersection with reality and existence becomes well-nigh intolerable: "All that is left is a huge, inarticulate despair, endless and purposeless. Everything that is visible is but a symbol to you. You stand helpless before reality. You have no faith left in anything." (Ib. 102–103).

This lack of faith, familiar to the reader of Baudelaire as *ennui* is summed up in Bourget's writings by the word melancholy, which he claims is exhibited in Slavic people as nihilism, the Germanic races

as pessimism, and the Romans as a certain type of nervous disease (Bourget 1883: 15). Bourget locates the causes of melancholy in three factors of modern sensibility: religiosity, albeit poisoned by superstition, which never ceases longing for something sacred, transcendent or ideal; second, sensuality, which has been set free from the shackles of traditional morality, but in its rapid pursuit of transgressive pleasure becomes saturated and inclined to boredom; the third factor is scientific thought, which analyzes everything and nullifies direct experience. The combination of these three results in melancholy: "et de ce triple travail est sorti ... le flot de spleen le plus acre et le plus corrosif ... " (Ib. 11).

Even Ruth has the tendency toward a certain melancholy. Her "self-confident stance has been driven to the utter extreme." However, besides being a deep thinker and scientific researcher, Ruth is also a poet and a dreamer and mere musical improvisations fill her with a "longing for something fuller and more permanent". The narrator postulates that "as a sensual and intellectual woman Ruth would arrive at the fatal point at which she would long to taste these refined feelings more directly, even to the point of finding delight in certain perversions." In Ormusson's identity the three factors of modern sensibility are interwoven more completely, and without moderation: the reader encounters him either in a state of highest exaltation or total resignation.

Ormusson's melancholy culminates in the sense of the limits of his sensibility, the realization that the Other remains inaccessible. For Ormusson the Other encompasses his own self as object of scrutiny, but also the rural society that surrounds him, with its representatives; beyond these the Other is nature and woman, and in sum, Life itself. As concerns woman as Other, Ormusson states. "That was how I had to see that girl and myself in the mirror! Some kind of impenetrable, cold, gleaming shell separated me from that woman, separated me even from myself." (Tuglas 1988: 126; 137)

Ormusson experiences and records many such unsuccessful bids to experience the Other. Even the textual author's opening address to his character, ("In actuality, You are nothing but a name") grows out of the same context: skepticism about language, consciousness of the split between signifier and signified are also among the connotations

of decadence. The impossibility of arriving at the *Ding an sich* is thus also a problem of language – the lack of overlap between the name and the object. This sharpened consciousness of language which is already visible in naturalism and impressionism leads in literary decadence to a farther-reaching understanding of the limits of expression.

Overconsciousness, constant reflection, and analysis combine to rule out any possibility of experiencing life as a coherent whole. Yet Ormusson feels a constant longing for real life and direct experience. His friend Johannes (and to some extent the women characters) help him soothe this longing: "He (Johannes) connects me to life through Marion. He is my bridge to that world I so seldom find my way to – into reality." (Ib. 107–108)

Despite these partial attempts at remediating connection, Ormusson believes that complete bliss and unmediated contact with reality is only possible for country people who have not been spoiled by urban culture. One example is the old peasant named Adam whom Ormusson believes does not think at all:

> Thinking is the enemy of happiness. And in the final sense, happiness is the mark of fullness. Old Adam never thinks while beating a fencepost into the ground: never thinks about what the fencepost is in itself, or what the Idea of the fencepost is. He is so simple-hearted that he has never asked himself: am I happy? And despite it all it is a sure thing that he is happy. Happy is he who gives no thought to anything! Happy is she who eats, sleeps, and gives birth to children. (Ib. 103)

Conclusion

The novels and criticism of Friedebert Tuglas is rich in the different philosophical connotations of *fin de siècle* decadence. The 1916 essay "Aja vaim" (Spirit of the Times) is an eloquent analysis of the life *versus* art problematics of decadence. The author identifies himself explicitly with the pole of art, and with the position of the decadent-dilettante, who, while incapable of experiencing life in a

direct and unmediated way, is envious of all those who have been able to maintain this ability.

Thus Tuglas could well apply to himself the words Thomas Mann wrote in 1918: "Spiritually I belong to that community of writers spread throughout Europe, who, having emerged from decadence speak as the chroniclers and analysts of decadence, while carrying in their hearts an equally strong will to dissociate themselves from decadence." (Mann 1974: 201). Nietzsche, Bourget, and Baudelaire had paved the way to this kind of ambivalent identity. In the Foreword of *Der Fall Wagner*, Nietzsche said: "Ich bin so gut wie Wagner das Kind dieser Zeit, will sagen ein *décadent*: nur dass ich das begriff, nur dass ich mich dagegen werte. Der Philosoph in mir wehrte sich dagegen." (Nietzsche 1999: 11). Bourget used almost the same words with respect to Baudelaire, and may as well have applied them to himself as well. "Il était un homme de décadence, et il s'est fait un théoricien de decadence" (Bourget 1883: 24).

One has only to browse through the Albums of the Young Estonia group to be convinced that skeptical attitudes toward Europe among Estonian intellectuals did not suddenly emerge at the threshold of the First World War, as has sometimes been claimed. While the first and second Albums, fraught with the after-effects of the 1905 revolution, were charged with optimistic, life-affirming attitudes. Album III, which contained J. Randvere's *Ruth*, already gave clear signals that a mental shift had occurred. On the basis of what I have argued above, there are ample grounds to claim that this change of mentality is connected with the emergence of the discourse of decadence on the Estonian intellectual scene. Though plenty of first-generation Estonian intellectuals continued to find it important to "become Europeans", the attitudes through which they regarded Europe become more and more ambivalent. Tuglas' novel *Felix Ormusson*, and J. Randvere's *Ruth* philosophical prose sketch of the ideal woman Ruth are telling examples of the ambivalent experience of modernity, and the attendant crisis of the disintegration of the subject and of communication. Both are case studies of decadence, as perceived by *fin de siècle* Europe in its cultural representations.

References

Bourget, P. 1883. *Essais de psychologie contemporaine*. Paris: Lemerre.

Kafitz, D. 2004. *Decadence in Deutschland. Studien zu einem versunkenen Diskurs der 90er Jahre des 19. Jahrhunderts*. Heidelberg: Universitäts-verlag Winter.

Kallas, A. 1909. Noor-Eesti III. – *Postimees* 31. XII.

Mann, T. 1974. Betrachtungen eines Unpolitischen. – T. Mann. *Reden und Aufsätze 4. Gesammelte Werke in 13 Bänden. B. 12*. Frankfurt-am-Main.

Nietzsche, F. 1999. Der Fall Wagner. Ein Musikanten-Problem. – F. Nietzsche. *Sämtliche Werke. Kritische Studienausgabe in 15 Bänden. B. 6*, München, Berlin/New York.

Nietzsche, F. 1999. Nachgelassenen Fragmente 1887–1889.– F. Nietzsche, *Sämtliche Werke. Kritische Studienausgabe in 15 Bänden. B. 13*. München, Berlin/New York. Randvere, J. 1980. *Ruth*. Tallinn: Loomingu Raamatukogu nr. 34–35.

Silk, M. 2004. Nietzsche, Decadence, and the Greeks. – *New Literary History. A Journal of Theory and Interpretation. Form and/of Decadence.* Nr 4, 587–606.

Simmel, G. 2002. Die Grossstädte und das Geistesleben. – J. Schutte, P. Sprengel (ed), *Die Berliner Moderne 1885–1914*. Stuttgart, 124–130.

Sprengel, P. 2004. *1900–1918. Von der Jahrhundertwende bis zum Ende der Ersten Weltkriegs. Geschichte der deutschen Literatur von den Anfängen bis zur Gegenwart*. München.

Tongeren, P. van, Schank, G., Siemens, H. 2004. *Nietzsche-Wörterbuch. Vol 1: Abbreviatur – einfach*. Berlin/New York.

Tuglas, F. 1988. Felix Ormusson. – F. Tuglas, *Kogutud teosed. III*. Tallinn.

Tuglas, F. 1996. *Kirjanduslikust stiilist*. – F. Tuglas, *Kogutud teosed. VII*. Tallinn.

Autumn in a New Residential Area

"And the window could be opened so that nothing remained between the world and the room." (*Autumn Ball*, p. 31)

This article compares one of the most translated Soviet-era Estonian novels, Mati Unt's *Autumn Ball* (1979), and the film of the same title (2007, director Veiko Õunpuu). According to a number of sources, Unt's novel contains the first manifestations of postmodernism in Estonian literature (e.g. Annus 2000: 778; Epner 2001: 497, Viires 2008: 61), and we can regard the film as a certain turning point in the development of Estonian cinema. It has received several awards abroad and is probably one of the internationally best-known Estonian feature films.

The focus of the current article moves from the film *Autumn Ball* back to the book *Autumn Ball*. One theme linking these focuses is the environment in which the plot of *Autumn Ball(s)* unravels: the space where the autumn ball takes place. The location of both the film and the novel is a new residential area in Tallinn. In the novel, this is the tower-block district called Mustamäe, which was started in the 1960s; the action of the film occurs in a similar satellite district, Lasnamäe, mainly built in the 1980s. During its construction, Mustamäe was characterised by an optimistic and positive attitude (cf. also Viires 2003), whereas the attitude towards the Lasnamäe residential district contained a negative undertone from the very beginning. This obvious emotional negativism is essentially there also in Veiko Õunpuu's film, where practically nothing good or beautiful is ever seen in the district. The aspects of visual enjoyment that Lasnamäe offers – expansive vistas, light etc. – have been totally abandoned, and thus the whole environment is characterised by a negative aesthetics.

The Mustamäe in Unt's *Autumn Ball* does not present such straightforward attitudes. *Autumn Ball* was influenced by architec-

tural discussions about a friendly and individualised urban environment and the novel, in turn, interfered in these discussions (Lapin 1980, cf. also Kurg 2010). The attitude to the residential district varies according to the character: there is aesthetic pleasure, discomfort and feelings of alienation, sharp interest and indifferent pragmatism. Most characters have an experience of a different living environment: a wooden slum, an area of private residences and a house in the country. Only the boy Peeter was born and grew up in Mustamäe.

The fact that Mustamäe in Unt's *Autumn Ball* is something much more meaningful than simply a place of action, maybe even more significant than all the protagonists put together, was acknowledged immediately after the novel was published (e.g. Jõgi 1982; Mutt 1986).[1] The focus on Mustamäe was later augmented in articles by Epp Annus and Piret Viires (Annus 2006; Viires 2003). In sum, the place, a real place, tends to overshadow the text of *Autumn Ball*.

*

The film *Autumn Ball* lasts slightly more than two hours. Its reception so far has mostly been descriptive rather than interpretive. The initial bewilderment of Unt's fans soon vanished as it turned out that, besides the identical title and the same number of main characters, whose names occasionally coincide or are at least similar, there is nothing much in common between the book and the film.

The Estonian-language homepage of the film offers a loose connection between the book and the film: "The movie is inspired by the book "Autumn Ball" by Mati Unt..."[2] The same text appears to the patient viewer also in the final credits, after the rest of the text has run past, and continues: "...and dedicated to all the men with gentle heart and weak liver who stand alone in the night in underwear. " The book might just as easily have inspired a painting

---

[1] Mustamäe has in fact been called the novel's collective protagonist in the annotation of the book (Unt 1979: 184).

[2] See http://www.sygisball.ee/et/film/about/ (accessed 11 January 2010). The note is missing in the English version.

or a piece of music, called *Autumn Ball*, and probably nobody would have bothered with finding any direct isomorphic connections.

Lasnamäe as the place of action of the film was clearly a conscious choice: it has a sharper meaning in the local socio-cultural context and stronger associations, offering views with more lucid emphasis in the visual (and international) plan and other environmental opportunities. That particular aspect of the film gathers all of the post-socialist new huge residential areas under Lasnamäe; Lasnamäe does not differ from other similar districts, but becomes their symbol.

Changes in characters that often depend on a kind of shift or even on mirror symmetry seem to try to break, rather than confirm, connections with Unt's text: the boy Peeter is replaced by the girl Lotta, the poet Eero by the writer Mati, and the hairdresser August Kask becomes Augusti Kaski of Finnish origin. The names of the other three main characters remain the same: Laura, the architect Maurer and the doorman Theo.

The book begins with expectation and a sense of danger. This is repeated in the last line of a Viivi Luik poem, which is also the epigram, as well as in the first sentence of the text – "Something was bound to happen" – immediately followed by mild comical bits that dispel expectations and anxiety: "Yet the autumn brought an extremely bounteous harvest of mushrooms /---/. There were too many apples, too; they kept falling into the grass all through the night, the canneries and juice presses could not cope with the enormous quantities of them /---/" (Unt 1985: 3). The beginning of the film, on the other hand, leaves no doubt about the mood: the figure of a man shivering on a balcony, a grim urban picture and a sky filled with black clouds and black birds.

In the book, the surroundings are observed only by the hairdresser August Kask through his telescope, whereas most views of the town in the film – from a balcony and a window – are presented through a telephoto lens. This method seems to bring the distant nearer, but by changing perspective also reduces the spatiality of whatever is far away, compressing the distance between the objects.

We could point out more similar comparisons, but that would not be quite correct or necessary. We have two *Autumn Balls*; the film

was allegedly inspired by the novel, although certainly not only by its text, but by much else as well.

In what sense then are they essentially different? At least a couple of significant differences emerge in reading and watching.

1.

The film *Autumn Ball* is perceptibly, visually real, corresponding to our experience, and this includes the events as well. The often described anxiety and sense of unease which keep haunting the viewer after seeing the film are caused by the extreme reality of the fictional world. The viewer is unable to escape this and is sucked into it for at least two hours. The sequence of events unravelling in the film reality is loosely connected, and does not seem causal or determined by the preceding events. Characters in a world like this are alone, on their own. They are not linked with any common activities, just the same environment. All of the characters have lives of their own before and after the events, but we are not familiar with those lives, and they don't necessarily have anything to do with Lasnamäe: Lasnamäe is a coincidence in the characters' lives.

The construction of the novel *Autumn Ball*, on the other hand, seems highly regulated. Six moments in time have been chosen, presented in a certain sequence through the eyes of the six characters. These characters could have easily been picked at random, but as the plot lines come together in the final part of the book, and separate encounters have an impact on the following events, there is not much room for chance.

At the same time, Unt's book also presents a number of sensory experiences. In the text Unt uses the largest number of words denoting colour of any of his works, and we would probably reach the same result if we listed all the words indicating the experience of smell, sound or touch. Sensory experiences are scattered as innumerable fragments throughout the novel, but they do not form a uniform and smooth text reality. The fictional world is persistently shattered by the insecurity of the characters and the reader regarding its reality, and the possibilities offered by the storyteller that everything is somehow different and that both the reader and characters could

easily vanish from it at any moment. The reader feels uncertain because he cannot be sure what the next bits of text are going to offer (how the story will proceed and who exactly is presenting it); from the first pages onwards, the characters' relationships to the fictional world are characterised by doubts about the existence of themselves and their surroundings.

The uncertainty of existence is made clear at the very beginning of the novel, when the former tenor Mortenson, known as Marino Marini, vanishes into thin air in the middle of the railway platform in the town of Valga. "What's gone is gone, his friends decided, their thoughts taking a fatalistic turn /---/" (Unt 1985: 5). In the afternoon, the former opera singer finds himself deep in Latvian territory, in a village cemetery 36 km from the place where he disappeared. The anxiety of expectation is simultaneously created and crushed. The influence of sentences that evoke alienation is dispelled by somewhat absurd fragments.

The reader therefore faces a world where nothing is quite certain. In this world, the characters must constantly secure and prove their existence. The new residential district Mustamäe, which has no constant history, needs the same kind of security. One method of confirming the environment and people are sets of facts in the text. Mustamäe is presented through a set of details about distances, ancient history and ground surface (by the architect Maurer). Closer objects are recreated by their recounting (by Arnold Kask) and by just naming them (by Peeter). It is exactly through naming that Peeter builds up a safe environment around himself, a room where he need not be afraid even of thunder.

The situation is made more complicated by words denoting things that do not seem to exist. Peeter thus reaches theologically almost competent proof that God and the devil do exist: "Of God, everyone knew that He didn't exist. Yet He was spoken about all the time. They wouldn't have talked so much about something that didn't exist" (p. 33). And: "But the Devil exists after all, Peeter suggested. He gets talked about even more often than God. He doesn't exist either, Mother explained, 'devil' is just a very bad and horrid word. /---/ Why is it a dirty word then, if it doesn't mean anything? It means a very bad thing. What kind of thing? The Devil, exclaimed

Mother, totally exasperated. I see, said Peeter, that means the Devil exists" (p. 34).

For Peeter, existence is confirmed by words and verbalisation, whereas for others, existence can be confirmed by an image: "Theo had got so used to looking at himself in the mirror that he sometimes felt insecure in a room with no mirror /---/. Sometimes he was afraid he might not exist at all because there was no proof of his existence" (p. 91). The existence of the architect Maurer, on the other hand, is proved to a benevolent militiaman by photographs found in his pocket: "The militiaman compared Maurer to the photographs. He did it very thoroughly, comparing him with each picture separately, although all the pictures were exactly alike." Satisfied by the similarity, the militiaman salutes Maurer and lets him go (p. 51).

The reader is therefore confronted with the possibility that all the characters could vanish at any time, because at first sight the only real thing seems to be Mustamäe itself. However, even this sense of certainty disappears quickly. The chance that there might be something else behind the door or window of an apartment besides what we think is there is constantly in the air. The constant recreation of a safe place, a home, does not however mean that everything outside it follows the efforts that produced existence. Thus the following picture could emerge at any moment: "Mustamäe had disappeared. The whole world had disappeared meanwhile. A grey nothingness stretched before them" (p. 71). The visible and seemingly existing world outside the apartment thus lives its own life: houses are breathing (p. 39), the building panels wilt in the evening (p. 9) and the huge boxes slumber in melancholy (p. 105).

This kind of non-existence, the possibility of non-places (and probably also non-time) is typical of Unt's *Autumn Ball*. We learn about the previous lives of all the characters, where they come from, although it is no longer possible to return there. The architect Maurer can never go back to the cosy slums of his childhood. Finding themselves in Mustamäe is not accidental; this seems to be predestined for all of them. However, people can easily disappear, go somewhere else, usually far away, to the other end of the world. An example: early in the morning after Eero and Laura meet, the piano player who is Eero's only chance to find Laura's house, leaves for

Sri Lanka. Equally, someone from a non-place and non-time, or from the other end of the world, can turn up in Mustamäe. One such person is from Tierra del Fuego, and that person annoys the others by endlessly singing like the vanished opera singer Marino Marini. And it is the initially vanished Marino Marini who reappears and causes a car crash in which August Kask gets killed.

Eero's wife leaves him in the evening when they have a party to celebrate their move to Mustamäe. After that, Eero manages to track her down only once, after which she disappears into the unknown, and we never hear of her again. This constitutes one of the essential differences between the film and the book: in the film, the writer Mati climbs on rubbish containers outside his wife's window and gets a look at her. The film can end with the wife returning, whereas the book only offers an encounter with another woman, Laura.

Let us here recall the words of Viivi Luik, who said that before Unt wrote his *Autumn Ball,* Mustamäe did not exist (Luik 2005: 779). Or to be precise, it did exist, but its inhabitants were invisible; they could not have been imagined. Perhaps we could say that Mustamäe was missing in the collective consciousness, but it arrived there through Unt's novel, or perhaps even more through the discussions that arose about the new residential districts. One of the foundations of identity – memories linked with a place – was precisely what the Mustamäe inhabitants, largely from outside Tallinn, did not have. Mustamäe's existence is thus not created by the contemporaries of *Autumn Ball* and not by its characters, but by writing about it, even mentioning Mustamäe in the papers, repeating the name over and over again. Mustamäe is not created by the daily experience of its inhabitants, because it is uncertain, or by daily life, because the environment is hostile. Mustamäe therefore needs to be constantly recreated and its name repeatedly mentioned. This is done in the novel by the architect Maurer, thus continuing his initial role as the creator of the residential district but, as was already noted, the boy Peeter does the same thing. Maurer achieves this by amassing facts on various levels, Peeter simply by putting his direct surroundings into words.

2.

The reception of Unt's *Autumn Ball* when the novel first appeared focused on its human relations: relationships and solitude, contacts with the environment (the big city and the new residential district), and on Unt's style of writing. The next stage was positioning *Autumn Ball* on the modernism-postmodernism scale. Problems connected with the place of action, e.g. Mustamäe as a separate and independent character, and how the protagonists experience their environment, have again emerged in recent years (see Viires 2003; Annus 2006).

An interesting nuance is the connection between windows and watching mentioned by Epp Annus. Windows indeed play a crucial role in *Autumn Ball*; in the novel, it is the hairdresser August Kask who mostly counts and observes them, although all of the characters have their own relationships with windows. Still, first of all, the function of the window itself is contradictory, as shown by Epp Annus: people look out of the windows and light comes in through them, and the windows themselves are also watched and counted. One possibility is to consider *Autumn Ball* as a journey from empty black windows towards lit ones (see also Annus 2006: 112). The windows thus constitute a sign that the buildings are alive, or even act to revive them, thus making them cosy and human. The rhetorical connection of windows and eyes is close and Unt makes use of this ("The giant boxes were having a melancholy nap /---/. Their hundreds of eyes reflected a listless question" – p. 106). In the novel *Autumn Ball*, the windows, especially lit windows, on the whole appear in a positive key, unlike for example the doors, which may be misleading. Transparent doors turn out to be the worst elements, as they have betrayed their protective function ("There was something ambiguous about doors. They were smooth but mysterious" – p. 52). There are no fears in the book associated with windows – that you can be seen, watched and caught. A different experience between living lower and higher up is also evident. In the higher apartments, the inhabitants are not really threatened by anything, as their relationship with the outside world is inevitably distanced.

In his treatise *On Painting* (in Latin in 1435, in Italian in 1436), the Renaissance humanist, architect and painter Leon Battista Alberti wrote that a picture should represent the world as if you were looking at it through a window: "First of all, on the surface on which I am going to paint, I draw a rectangle of whatever size I want, which I regard as an open window through which the subject to be painted is seen; and I decide how large I wish the human figures in the painting to be" (I.19, Alberti 1991: 54). Then, according to the size and proportions of the depicted people and space, the artist determines the horizon and a point of convergence.

Here, the passive and active double essence of the window is augmented further: the window lets through rays of light: it is transparent; on the other hand, a window is a medium that requires the glance to be active. Alberti emphasises the viewer's intention by adding a possibility of a choice: the painter chooses what is visible through the window (for the viewer).

Together with the disappearance of realistic depiction in painting, the metaphor of "Alberti's window" retreated, but reappeared via photography, film and television. These three have the function of a window into the world, bringing the unattainable closer, both spatially and temporally. Or they place viewers in the middle of other people's lives, and take them where they otherwise could not go.

The window as a means of connecting different rooms, depicting transitions and oppositions, is naturally a charmingly common motif in films, theatre and pictorial art, but also in literature. Splendid window games, for example, have been analysed on the basis of Gustave Flaubert's *Madame Bovary* (Frank 1991: 16–18). Unt's *Autumn Ball* clearly falls into the same category. The window's variety of functions in *Autumn Ball* is impressive: the book describes the views from the windows of all the characters; and the TV screen and traditional painting constitute the Alberti-like windows that compete with the real ones. For Peeter and Arnold Kask, the window is a means of seeing outside, into somebody else's space; for Peeter, it is also a wall that separates his home space from the rest of the suspicious world. Both observe, but at different distances (Kask has a telescope, while Peeter prefers to look at smaller and closer things). The architect Maurer and Eero represent the "aesthetic view", which,

however, does not emerge by itself, ready-made (it is not offered by the district itself); it requires an effort, casting something else aside or not noticing it. Eero's view is synaesthetic: he can perceive his surroundings also by means of smells and sounds coming in from the window. Maurer, on the other hand, links the view with knowledge. For Theo and Laura, looking out of the window constitutes a type of replacement activity, a passive way of existence; standing at the window, they seem to be looking, but at the same time they do not see what they are looking at, an activity that helps to collect their thoughts, focus on what they have seen on television, recall incidents in their lives (Laura) or analyse astrological predictions (Theo).

All these different views thus emphasise the difference between looking and seeing: looking is an intentional activity, consciously directing your glance towards something, but the result might not be actually seeing something, let alone seeing and understanding. Seeing does not occur simply via the glance, it must include learning, finding something out, which involves all of the senses. Looking presupposes an intentional glance, whereas seeing does not.

It should be clear from the above that the presentation strategies of the environment in Unt's *Autumn Ball* are rather unique. The significance of looking, watching from the window and from a distance, is often emphasised, and therefore we are left with the dominant impression of a distanced point of view, from where the viewer observes tiny human figures bustling about in the street or going about their business behind the windows of the house across the street. This is how Mustamäe is seen by Arnold Kask, Peeter and Maurer, and the reader gets an idea of what they see. The hairdresser Kask's desire to witness various depravities of life is his greatest desire: "He had feared, or hoped, to see Egyptian nights, pornographic delights, murder, rape, dances at least, birthday parties, or modest family love scenes. But he sustained a disappointment in this telescope. So plentifully provided with the potential for evil in the daytime, seemingly so minutely prepared for murder and incest, people had turned tame after the sun had gone down" (p. 73).

A few years before *Autumn Ball* was published, Finnish TV devoted one season to Alfred Hitchcock's films. I have no idea whether *Rear Window* (1954) was among them or whether Mati Unt

saw that film, but it is quite likely. For the protagonist, the photographer Jeff, life observed from his window replaces his own inactivity due to his broken leg, the lack of a television and of life itself. The neighbours' sins and virtues are revealed through the window, initially offering mere entertainment, but when events unravel, a murder is witnessed. Glances through the window, the double act of looking and watching (the viewer sees the photographer, then his glance through the lens, then the presumed murderer and the murderer's return glance), the meeting of the eyes of the observer and the murderer, mutual understanding and recognition, all make this film a classic of analysing looking and showing. Hitchcock's film is the archetypal text of window-watching and August Kask seems to be Jeff's possible reverse figure: he simultaneously desires and hates crime, depravity and filth, and cannot experience a single positive emotion. The lack of discovery and the lack of the hoped-for murder cause suffering. Besides, through watching, Kask has no power over the people he is looking at. As already noted, the *Autumn Ball* characters do not mind being watched through windows. For Laura, too, the fact that someone (i.e. Kask) is watching her from the opposite house is of little importance. (In the same watching scene, Kask on the other hand tries to focus all the possible power of persuasion into his glance.)

As the first peculiarity of the novel, we could point out doubts about the existence of the text reality, and also the possibility that whatever exists might disappear at any moment. Considering this, the window views of the characters indeed resemble the windows of Alberti. Although the characters do not choose what is shown through the rectangle, the narrator chooses for the reader.

The difference between watching television and watching from windows therefore disappears: Arnold Kask watches the windows across the road with just as much enthusiasm as Laura watches the TV series *Cunningham*. Thanks to the fact that the narrative of the series runs parallel to other activities, its characters become just as real or unreal as the text world.

*

In the film *Autumn Ball,* people also look out of windows a lot, and twice they look inside. This kind of looking is similar in the film and in the book in that the view from the window is always linked with a character, is always *somebody's* view. The views have a purpose; they are not separated from a specific person.

However, there are several significant differences between the film and novel. The variety of window views in the film is considerably smaller. The viewer can share what a character happens to see and generally this is Lasnamäe, either in grey daylight (not one scene has any sunshine) or in nocturnal dampness and rain. Some views are quite extensive and others more closed, but there is no watching or counting of the windows in the opposite house. A few times people also look in: Mati standing on a rubbish container and staring in through the window at his wife and another man; and in another scene we see the poster-beautiful family of the film director who has given Laura a lift. In both these cases, the window clearly separates two fictional spaces: the viewer cannot cross the border. The same relationship occurs in the film between Laura and television; we learn about the series she is watching, but the events develop separately.

In addition to the views from the windows, there are many other types of looking in the film. Just as the architect Maurer watches the moving cars in the main thoroughfare, Lotte stands on the balcony observing the surroundings, and Augusti Kaski stares at the children from behind a kindergarten fence. Two features thus emerge: looking as such is important; the manner of looking does not depend on who is looking at what and how (i.e. by means of what). The aim of such looking is primarily to show what a character might see. Secondly, different characters are linked and the spatiality of the surroundings are created by looking. Views from the window bring Lasnamäe inside and do not allow the viewer to forget its existence. Unlike Unt, there is no difference between windows and doors; the first do not become independent as a rhetorical figure. Therefore, what matters is not looking as such, but showing the looking.

*

As already noted, analyses of textual or written space usually differentiate between the distanced manner of presentation, which primarily uses the sense of sight, and the reliance on bodily experience, where the whole body participates in spatial perception through touching, the sensation of pain and inner functioning, and does so just like looking, or even more so. In the first case, the positions of the subject and object – the environment and its perceiver – are mostly distinguished; on the other hand, they can mix and blend. The other senses – hearing, smell and taste – can blend both with the distanced and the bodily spatial experience. There are few literary texts that persistently use either one or the other type of spatial experience. A point of view can alternate within one text depending on the events, characters or moods.

One of the most common ways to physically perceive a town is of course by walking. Epp Annus noted that *Autumn Ball* has a lot of looking and watching, but little walking. Mustamäe is not really suitable for walking and is thus quite a hostile environment (Annus 2006: 112–116). At the same time, she neglected to mention a fact that clearly supports this claim: the car crash following August Kask's walk. Kask prefers to walk outside town, but the approaching winter to some extent conciliates him with the city. This is the first time during the period set in the novel that Kask exchanges looking at Mustamäe for walking around there, because snow has just fallen and purified the town, "covering the city's trash and foul refuse" (p. 177–178). The freshly fallen snow creates a new distance from the previous habitual environment, and makes people perceive it differently. However, replacing watching from a distance with walking results in the death of the walker.

At the same time, it is crucial that looking is not the only way to experience Mustamäe for any of the characters. This is not the only way even for the most dedicated watcher, August Kask. He equally loves to eavesdrop on other people's lives, and other senses help as well: "Sometimes August Kask stood at the window, staring up at the sky and getting some air. His nostrils would move erotically. He smelled death: carbon dioxide, sulphurous gases, soot, dust, strontium, pesticides and lead. His nose was sensitive and he knew what he was looking for" (p. 43).

If we look more closely at the different ways the characters perceive the environment, we see an amazing variety and diversity. People look from a distance and from nearby, from inside out and from outside in, from above and from below. The distanced glance blends with the almost animal aliveness of the visible artificial objects. The houses are not just seen, measured, counted and touched, but are also perceived both psychically and somatically, they are heard and smelt, and they are alive themselves and constitute home for undetermined creatures. Microscopic sensations alternate with macroscopic, rational knowledge, with emotional bursts of feeling; Mustamäe is racked by time and the weather. It never quite emerges as a whole.

There is thus no clear opposition between the seen and the experienced environment. It would be more precise to say that the description of the environment in *Autumn Ball* is characterised by polyphony and polylogy, by a constant changing of different plans and points of view. Here, logical and bodily reception of space blend with looking, although they do not form any particular shape, but keep disintegrating, alternating, transforming into one another.

3.

As I mentioned before, the scenes in the film seemingly follow one another quite randomly, and there appears to be a possibility of realigning them differently, at least in the viewer's mind. The book, however, offers no such possibility. The six characters are united by a clearly established temporal framework (from September, the edge of summer, until December, the edge of winter) and common environment, where their stories unfold and intersect. The parallel aspect of the stories is confirmed by six shared moments in time, framed by either a season or weather: early autumn, thunder, fog, late autumn, the first snow and winter. The first two parts/times are presented in a certain sequence of characters; the first change of sequence appears in the third part, and a greater shift follows in the second part of the novel. There are, after all, 36 parts. It is difficult to believe that this is quite accidental: Eero lives on the sixth floor; August Kask and Laura on the ninth or sixth ("The sixth floor, let's

stick to the sixth floor, Eero thought, there must be a reason why that occurred to me. Six. 1+2+3, Eero kept thinking" – p. 172.) In a review after the publication, Andres Langemets recognised an allusion to Bulgakov, finding that "Unt stops narrating where Bulgakov starts", and that "no magic powers directly interfere in Mustamäe scenes or, rather, they never materialise" (Langemets 1980: 129). It's true, despite the connection between the events, the causal development and predictions offered ironically (plus promises of demons), that we do not perceive anything supernatural.

The Bulgakov-like ending mentioned above is of course the death of Arnold Kask in a car crash. The driver is the singer Marino Marini, who has vanished without a trace. This is the scene where almost all the characters, although they do not know one another, meet. Eero finds Laura, August Kask finds (a morally deserved) death, Maurer finds a new activity for himself for the future, and Theo finds a solution concerning his worries about the world of criminals. The time ends for all of them here; they have no future outside the text of the book, except perhaps for Maurer. There is no chance for their lives to change, and no chance for the Mustamäe autumn to be anything but a passing episode in life.

The similar text strategy is a good example of what Joseph Frank has called the spatiality of the text itself, and what should be kept apart from the representation of space or textual space. Frank considers spatial texts those that gather in one moment of time activities which can be perceived simultaneously but not in connection with one another. When temporal sequence and causality are missing, the reader must join these activities spatially. Making the text spatial occurs by the above-described means: parallel stories and the fragmentary nature of events, no clear beginning and a narrative with no ending. Events have to be constructed from fragments, which are scattered all over the novel and may be separated by hundreds of pages (see Frank 1991: 18ff).

*

The autumn in the film does not change; it is grey and overcast. There is no summer before it or winter afterwards, no definite

temporal borders. Unt selected six segments of time in sequence, whereas the film seems to have fixed on only one time. This seems to be the beginning of winter – traces of the first melted snow – rather than late autumn, probably one of the most unpleasant times of year, where everything is revoltingly muddy, dark and damp. The sodden environment as a place of action visually links the entire external space even better than Lasnamäe. The environment in the film, as mentioned above, is highly perceptible, synaesthetically emphasising the space that is perceived through different senses and the body. The experiences of the senses are enlivened by several methods, for example contrasting Maurer's purist-aesthetic surroundings with Mati's filthy room full of scraps of food and drink. The frequent repeating of the autumnal sodden dampness serves the same kind of synaesthesia. The physical experience is enhanced by walking at night, in the rain and through wastelands, and by varying the way of walking, staggering and stumbling. One method is the clothing of the characters: the half-naked Lotte on the balcony in the rain, and Mati falling asleep not quite undressed, adjusting an ill-fitting garment: scenes with words that inevitably associate with our daily experience. As a result of all this, an extremely compact, uniform and hopelessly unchanged environment emerges. This, in turn, is emphasised by distances shortened by the lens, or general views that have been united into a compact whole by means of a wide-angle lens. Grey days alternate with dark evenings full of circles of streetlights that dissolve in the damp. More clearly delineated is only the last day, which seemingly brings all lines of action to some sort of ending, without however gathering the six characters in one place and uniting them through one event, as does Unt. In the novel, the text is made spatial by parallel stories integrated with the moments of time shared by the six characters, whereas the element in the film that makes the narrative spatial is the environment Lasnamäe.

There is no chance that Lasnamäe will disappear or change; it is always there outside the windows of the inhabitants, inexorably accompanying the characters outside, compressed by the telephoto lens. Time, too, is compressed and halted, and there is thus no need to determine it more precisely. There is just one overcast unchanging

SARAPIK

season, and the entire depicted material environment – items and clothing – hopelessly mix the Soviet era with today.

<center>*</center>

In conclusion, we can agree with the often expressed thought that, both in the book and in the film, the residential districts – Mustamäe and Lasnamäe – become as crucial as characters. The same role could of course easily be taken by any other similar district in the world. The difference between the two texts reflects the time that passed between them, the different authors' positions, a different sense of reality and different ways of presenting the environment. What unites them besides the title? Maybe the fact that all that is left is the autumn and the residential district.

References

Alberti, L. B. 1991. *On Painting*. Trans. by Cecil Grayson, introduction and notes by Martin Kemp. Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Annus, E. 2000. Postmodernism kui hilissotsialismi kultuuriloogika. – *Keel ja Kirjandus*, No. 11, 769–780.

Annus, E. 2006. Jalajäljed ja pilgud. Mati Undi Mustamäe. – *Looming*, No. 1, 112–123.

Epner, L. 2001. Proosa uuenemine kodumaal. – Annus, Epp; Epner, Luule; Järv, Ants; Olesk, Sirje; Velsker, Mart. *Eesti kirjanduslugu*. Tallinn: Koolibri, 478–500.

Frank, J. 1991. *The Idea of Spatial Form*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.

Jõgi, M. 1982. Sügisballi retseptsiooni mõnest tahust. – *Kirjanduse jaosmaa '80*. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat, 101–106.

Kurg, A. 2010. Mustamäe "inimlikustamine". Mati Undi "Sügisball" 1970. aastate kriitiliste arhitektuuripraktikate taustal. – *Sügisball. Etüüde nüüdiskultuurist 2*. Ed. by V. Sarapik, P. Viires. Tartu Ülikooli Kirjastus, 28–38.

Langemets, A. 1980. Elu võimalikkusest. – *Looming*, No. 1, 129–132.

Lapin, L. 1980. Arhitektina Mati Undi Mustamäel. – *Looming*, No. 1, 132–134.

Luik, V. 2005. Sõna on rohkem kui sõna. – *Keel ja Kirjandus*, No. 10, 777–779.

Mutt, M. 1986. Proosaimpressioone 1979. – M. Mutt, *Kõik on üks ja see-sama. Kirjandusest ja teatrist 1975–1985*. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat, 268–311.

Unt, M. 1979. *Sügisball. Stseenid linnaelust*. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Unt, M. 1985. *The Autumn Ball: Scenes of City Life*. Tallinn: Perioodika, 1985.

Viires, P. 2003. Mustamäe Metamorphoses. – *Koht ja paik / Place and Location: Studies in Environmental Aesthetics and Semiotics III*. Ed. by V. Sarapik, K. Tüür. Proceedings of the Estonian Academy of Arts 14. Tallinn, 395–403.

Viires, P. 2008. *Eesti kirjandus ja postmodernism*. Tartu: Tartu Ülikooli Kirjastus.

Survival in the Stone City: Tallinn in the Literature of the 1970s and 1980s

"There is no black soil in Mustamäe"[1] (Kallas 1985: 57)[2] – such is the conclusion of Uku Peterson, a character in the short story *Muld* (Soil) of the Estonian writer Teet Kallas, after he has searched in vain for fertile soil to grow flowers in, amidst blocks of houses in the early 1980s city-space of Tallinn. The cry of the urbanized man who has had to leave his rural background behind and come to terms with the new way of life.

The city of Tallinn went through some major changes during the 1960s and 1970s. New mass housing residential areas were built. Mustamäe was the pioneer and Lasnamäe soon followed suit. In this article, I will discuss some of the cultural aspects of those residential areas and their depiction in Soviet Estonian urban fiction of the stagnation era.

Before going any further, I would like to explain the frequent use of the word *cityscape* in the article. The term has already been put to good use in the field of cultural geography and urban development. In literary studies, however, it is probably not something that goes without saying. Cityscape is an artistic representation of a certain district/neighbourhood in the city, the urban equivalent of landscape. (In Estonian language, there is no strict difference between the terms – the word *landscape* is commonly translated as *maastik* which brings to mind, first of all, rural allusions.). In urban design the term refers to the configuration of built forms and interstitial space.

The term was first used in visual arts where it stands for a painting, drawing, print or photograph depicting the physical aspects

---

[1] Mustamäel pole musta mulda. This simple statement is remarkable because of the use of alliteration and wordplay – when translated literally, the place name of Mustamäe means "Black Hill". Hence the colloquialism "mäed" ("hills") to describe the suburbs of Tallinn.

[2] Here and in the following the translation of quoted fragments is mine. I.H.

of a city or urban area. In the 17th century Netherlands it was an independent genre. Famous painters of cityscapes include Alfred Sisley, Camille Pissarro etc.

The many virtues of the term "cityscape" have been pointed out, among others, by Edward Soja. As Soja puts it, after the term has been coined, "seeing cityscapes as cityscapes [...] opens insightful new directions that explicitly embed the interpretation of cityscapes in the wider framework of critical spatial thinking and analysis" (Soja 2006: xv). The term is closely connected to the wider spatial turn of the 20th century (ib.).

Mustamäe as a cultural phenomenon

The start of building the first Estonian mass housing district Mustamäe dates back to 1957. According to the regulation of the Central Committee of the Estonian Communist Party and the Council of Ministers "Means of developing residential housing in the ESSR"[3], the problem of apartment shortage had to be eliminated within the next 12 years by means of producing 5.12 million square meters of living space. This policy was supported by the slogan of Nikita Khrushchev: "An apartment for every family!"
To improve the quality of housing Khrushchev emphasized the need to order the mass production of apartment buildings using standardized materials (Robinson 2009).

Extensive capacity for construction in Estonia became possible due to the establishment of the housing factory of Tallinn in 1961. The plant produced large panel elements for housing construction the Union-wide funding of which was part of the Soviet population policy (Laigu 2005: 52).[4]

---

[3] Abinõudest elamuehituse arendamiseks Eesti NSV-s.

[4] Among the goals of the Soviet population policy was the "Russification" of the Baltic areas and the rise of the new suburbs was directly associated with that. However, Mustamäe was nothing like Lasnamäe where later the number of locals probably exceeded that of the immigrants (Viires 2003: 396).

In its essence, Mustamäe is a modernist project. It was built to follow the free planning principle of Edouard Le Corbusier. Mustamäe was divided into *mikroraion*s. A *mikroraion* was the organizational logic of the Soviet city, internally linked by pedestrian walkways that, in theory, gave access to services such as libraries, sports facilities, nurseries, health services etc, with the intent that its residents could readily and conveniently access the majority of their daily needs (Robinson 2009). As it turned out, Mustamäe soon became regarded as a bedroom community connected to the center of Tallinn via a couple of highways enabling commuters to go about their daily business outside their living quarters.

As soon as Mustamäe was established, it initiated a wide-spread public discussion which resulted in a significant amount of newspaper articles ranging from laudatory to indignant. The pros and cons, the dangers and the virtues of urban sprawl were the talk of the town, not only in architectural circles but in other cultural spheres as well. Among many prominent figures, the writers Lennart Meri and Jaan Kaplinski presented their opinions on the subject (see Meri 1981, etc).

According to sociologist Mati Heidmets, in the 1980s the public opinion turned against the new housing areas the inhabitants of which had initially felt themselves fortunate and privileged. One of the main reasons why the "experiment" failed lies in the Soviet housing policy. A pre-designed comprehensive environmental package was presented to the people that excluded the participation of users in the design process (Heidmets 1993: 83).

It is clear that because of all the hubbub around the panel housing districts they ceased to be solely an architectural peculiarity and became a cultural phenomenon. It has been pointed out in recent studies that in the 1970s and early 1980s Mustamäe was a place where a significant number of the cultural elite resided (Viires 2010: 54). Teet Kallas has written in his memoirs about more than a dozen important Estonian literary figures who, at one point or another, have all lived in Mustamäe (Kallas 2008: 324). Since many artists had their ateliers in neighbourhoods like Mustamäe, these residential areas have left their mark in visual art as well. One of the most famous paintings is "Mustamäe" (1970) by Raivo Korstnik which

depicts the corner of a newly-built panel building with the neon-blue sky in the background Everybody knows the popular song "Mustamäe valss" (Mustamäe Waltz) which conveys the enthusiasm that went along with the rise of the new suburbs. Recent musical contributions to Mustamäe include the song "Kus on mu kodu?" (Where is my home?) by Agent M.

Last, but not least – Mustamäe has attracted a number of film directors. A thorough overview of the depiction of panel housing districts in Estonian film is given in the works of Eva Näripea (see, for instance, Näripea 2002). Latest in the list is the internationally acclaimed movie *Autumn Ball* (2007), based on the novel *Sügisball* (Autumn Ball) by Mati Unt.

From rural roots to an urbanized existence

Of all the art forms, one of the most influenced by the changes in the cityscape of Tallinn has probably been literature. Many texts written in the 1970s and 1980s depict the panel housing district scenery. They are categorized if not as a special genre then at least as a very distinctive way of Estonian urban writing. In my work, I have been striving to find the special characteristics of some of these texts.

The "flow" of urban fiction into Estonian literature which started in the 1960s is even more remarkable when we take into consideration that Estonian literature has been traditionally centered around rural themes. In fact, it is still not clear from which point in time we can talk about the start of urbanization in Estonia.

To give an idea of the depth of the abovementioned specific genre of urban fiction in Soviet Estonia, I will mention some of the most important works from the 1970s and 1980s.

Mati Unt's novel *Autumn Ball* (1978)[5] is the most acclaimed piece of prose written on the subject of new residential areas during the stagnation era. The novel received good press in Estonia as well as outside, living up to the critics' as well as the readers'

---

[5] *Autumn Ball* is the only text referred to in the present article that has been translated into English. *Autumn Ball: Scenes of City Life*. Mart Aru (trans.). Tallinn: Perioodika, 1985.

expectations. Six different characters in the novel hardly interact with each other as the author focuses on their everyday lives in the alienating urban space of Mustamäe. Among many groundbreaking qualities of Unt's book was the treatment of subjects such as alcoholism, sexual life of the characters etc in a relatively free-spirited manner which went against the grain of the strict communist moral. However, as the author effectively demonstrates, many of the problems that the characters confront, lead back to the environment that they are living in.

While *Autumn Ball* is regarded as an important piece of prose in Estonian literature, Teet Kallas' novel *Janu* (Thirst) (1983) lingers on the borderline of Estonian literary canon. Straight after its publication it received remarkably demolishing reviews. Aside from that, *Janu* deserves to be treated as a good example of Estonian urban prose of the 1980s which can be compared to *Autumn Ball* in more than a couple of ways. As an interview made with Teet Kallas in 2006 reveals, Kallas considered himself to be a good friend of the late Mati Unt. For a period in their life, both lived in the same neighbourhood, i.e. Mustamäe and, while standing by the windows of their working cabinets, could see each other from a few hundred meters' distance (Heinloo 2006).

The plot of the novel, in a nutshell: an unexpected occurrence, a disruption in water supply, forces the inhabitants of a typical panel building in a fictional town (however, with clear references to Mustamäe) to start communicating with each other. The author goes on to describe the quotidian life of urban-dwellers, mainly from the perspective of the main character Udo Munak.

Most of the characters in *Janu* are not the educated intellectuals that we meet in *Autumn Ball*. Plain, even rude language that dominates Kallas' novel is also something we do not come across often when reading *Autumn Ball*. However, both novels deal with the effects that a specific urban environment, a suburb like Mustamäe produces on its inhabitants. Among the negative effects are the feelings of anonymity, loneliness, inability to have healthy social relationships with the neighbours etc.

Arvo Valton is also a noteworthy author of urban fiction from this era. Some of his short stories written in the 1970s such as *Laternaad* and *Mustamäe armastus* (Love in Mustamäe) depict life in the suburbs of Tallinn in a unique, sometimes overridingly grotesque manner.

According to recent research, *Mustamäe armastus* has been regarded as an early sign of postmodernism in Estonian literature (Viires 2006: 53). The characters of the short story are inhabitants of the district Mustamäe who fall in love as a result of looking each other from their apartment windows. Without any physical contact they somehow manage to conceive a child together. *Laternaad* is a story about the life of two street lamps in a panel housing district.

Another author that we can add to this group of writers is Jaak Jõerüüt who has contributed to the scene of "panel housing literature" with a couple of short stories and the two-part novel *Raisakullid* (Vultures) (1982, 1985). *Raisakullid* deals with many philosophical, social and moral issues but at the centre lie the aspirations of a man in search of an apartment in the panel housing district. The new residential areas are shown as prestigious neighbourhoods and indeed, as Piret Viires has written: "For many, getting a flat in Mustamäe was a chance to escape their cramped quarters in the slums or large shared apartments, and have a place of their own with all modern conveniences" (Viires 2003: 396).

The list is far from complete even if we include Astrid Reinla and her short story *Muuseum* (Museum) (1982) where the main character lives in an apartment in Mustamäe but decides to move out eventually.

The blossoming of urban fiction started at a time when the authorities expressed a desperate need for urban topics to be handled in literature. In fact, as the Ideological Secretary of the Estonian Communist Party Rein Ristlaan has written with obvious concern in the early 1970s: "It is beyond doubt that the future of the Estonian nation lies in urbanization. The future will be determined by the "city people", the working class which has always been the leading power in the society. [...] We do not have urban novels in our literature [...] that would demonstrate the urban life of today and the characteristics of its poetry! There seems to be no will to depict the

relations between human and artificial nature. However, that would be highly necessary. […]" (Ristlaan 1973). [6]

It is hard to say if Ristlaan's article had any direct influence on the writers. Presumably not. However, the guidelines could not have been formulated more clearly. By the way, Ristlaan's essay has an allegorical title: "Juurtest ja võrsetest" (From roots to sprouts). As he explaines in the text, the roots of the Estonian writer are in the countryside whereas the sprouts should lie in the city.

Most of the Estonian writers of the 1970s were indeed not born and bred on urban asphalt. However, that does not hold true for all the writers that I have introduced here. For instance, Teet Kallas has always considered himself a native of Tallinn (Kalda 2003). Mati Unt, on the other hand, was a country boy who moved to the city in 1958. He describes the importance of the event, to some extent, in an autobiographical essay (Unt 1999), stating among other things that even in the urban environment he managed to maintain what he called "the common sense of a peasant" (*terve talupojamõistus*).

De Bijlmer – a Dutch version of Mustamäe?

The building of new suburbs was a result of the growth of urban population and other significant changes taking place in the post-World War II cityscapes which was not characteristic only of this side of the Iron Curtain. Similar developments can be detected in Western Europe as well.

It is well known that during the 1960s and 1970s there were megalomaniac plans to build new cities everywhere in the world. Take for instance Brasilia, one of the most complete examples of the

---

[6] On vaieldamatu, et nagu kogu inimkonna, on ka eesti rahva tulevik linnastumises ja et järjest rohkem määrab tulevikku "linnarahvas", töölis-klass, kes on olnud ja jääb ühiskonna juhtivaks, kujundavaks jõuks. […] Linnas eluneb meie kirjanike enamik. Linnaromaani meil ometi ei ole, ei ole isegi Tallinna "pilte ja pildikesi", mis näitaksid tänast linnaelu ja selle omanäolist poeesiat! Ei ole nagu püüetki inimese ja tehislooduse vahekorra kujutamiseks. See oleks aga hädatarvilik.

urban planning of utopian cities, the construction of which took just three years. The later urban development of these areas has always proven the initial idealistic thinking wrong.

For instance, in the south-eastern part of Amsterdam lies the borough Bijlmermeer (commonly known as De Bijlmer) which was designed in the 1960s as a new kind of functionalist city, a so-called residential utopia. Like Mustamäe, Bijlmer was inspired by the ideas of Le Corbusier. Many of its ideological cornerstones – apartment blocks separated by plenty of green public space; separation of living, working and recreational spaces etc – are remarkably similar to those of Mustamäe. (By the way, similar developments can be detected at the end of 1960s in the Rahlstedt district in Hamburg, Germany.)

Through the decades Bijlmer became known as a neighbourhood with little social control and a high crime rate. Most of its inhabitants have been immigrants who could afford low-cost social housing. By now, the status of Bijlmer has changed somewhat and it has taken the form of a vibrant multicultural district. But the ambitious housing project which was meant to become Western Europe's most completely functional satellite community has been dismissed as a planning and social failure.

Because of its social problems, Bijlmer has traditionally had a bad reputation. But that is not the only reason. One of the most outstanding among the many weaknesses of Bijlmer is the puritanical landscape of its materials as the Dutch renowned architect Rem Koolhaas calls it:[...] "a spartan symphony of poured concrete, concrete block, gravel, tarred piles used as decoration, concrete tiles, galvanized metal: the Bijlmer displays more gray matter than any other place in the world" (Koolhaas 1995: 874).

However, Koolhaas finds that the Bijlmer offers boredom on a heroic scale. "In its monotony, harshness, and even brutality, it is, ironically, refreshing. [...] It even communicates [...] the secret thrill of modernization" (ib. 871).

The way Koolhaas has brought up the positive aspects of the Bijlmer neighbourhood is reminiscent of the way Mustamäe's reputation has changed in time. Eight years ago, Piret Viires wrote: "Today, forty years later, the position of Mustamäe has changed

beyond recognition. With its decaying houses – the result primarily of the poor Soviet construction quality and materials – with its shattered doors and corridors stinking of cat piss, overgrown and abandoned grassy areas, beggars and loafers wandering around, Mustamäe has become a parody of its original idea" (Viires 2003: 400). Carrying on with the same subject a few years later: "I still live in Mustamäe, I breath along with its rhythms, yet I feel that what I wrote back then isn't true anymore. Mustamäe has changed. […] Mustamäe has been given a new life […] it is not threatened by the dangers of ghettoisation and it is moving purposefully into the future." (Viires 2010: 52–53).[7]

It is worth adding that after Estonia's re-independence in 1991, examples of fiction written on the subject of mass housing areas of Tallinn have been few and far between. The theme seems to be more popular in poetry, while prose rarely offers anything worth analysing in that particular context. According to some scholars, writers have forgotten Mustamäe (Viires 2003: 400).[8]

City and ideology

I started the article with a quote from a character of one of Teet Kallas' short stories. Uku Peterson observes what is happening in his neighbourhood with mixed feelings. He stands confused on the street on a busy Saturday, looking at housewives cleaning their apartment windows and listening to music coming from the radios which not surprisingly includes the optimistic schlager *Mustamäe valss* (Kallas 1985: 55). Soil is "hidden" under the strips of grass and signs prohibit entering these areas. Peterson concludes: "A city is a city, a city has no soil, a city has no bears or wolves either, you have to go

---

[7] Ma elan ikka Mustamäel, hingan koos tema rütmidega, kuid tunnen, et see, mida ma tookord kirjutasin, pole enam tõde. Mustamäel on midagi muutunud. […] Mustamäe ongi uuele elule ärkamas […], raputades end lahti getostumisohust ning liikudes sihikindlalt tulevikku.

[8] The same does not seem to apply to Bijlmer, however. In 2002 a novel *Vluchtwegen* (Escape routes), written by the Dutch writer Michiel van Kempen was published. *Vluchtwegen* depicts the life of the immigrants in the Bijlmer district where van Kempen himself lived for a while.

to the zoo to see them, only asphalt, neon and bars live in the city."
(Kallas 1983: 58). [9]

A deeper look at the Soviet Estonian urban prose reveals that the
likes of Uku Peterson are typical characters rather than exceptions,
i.e. they are all in some ways concerned with how urban environment
enforces itself upon nature. They try to find out if there is a
possibility for nature to survive in urban surroundings.

In Teet Kallas' novel *Janu*, the main character Udo Munak is
troubled when he sees inland seagulls in his neighbourhood: "At a
distance, some inland seagulls were flying. They had discovered our
district a couple of years ago, acknowlecged and conquered it. I had
never come across those seagulls in the heart of the city or in the old
slums. They liked it here, for some reason. What could these birds think
of our district, when looking at it from up high? Maybe the grey rows of
houses reminded them of a bay filled with large rocks?" (ib. 165). [10]

Udo bears witness to the beauty of nature seen from a distance.
However, he feels trapped in his apartment with the faraway lakes
and forests reminiscent of times gone by.

In the novel *Autumn Ball* by Mati Unt, one of the characters, a
juvenile Peeter is surprised to find that sparrows are able to live in
this kind of environment: "He noticed with astonishment sparrows
walking on the surface of the panel blocks. They were hooked in the
cracks of the wall. [...] Why did birds act this way? They probably
ate the maggots they could find in the cracks. Peeter didn't believe
that sparrows could eat stones.[...]" (Unt 1985: 326). [11]

---

[9] Linn on linn, linnas mulda ei ole, linnas pole ka karusid ja hunte, neid
näed loomaaias, linnas elavad asfalt, neoon ja baarid.

[10] Ja eemal tiirutasid sisemaakajakad. Paari aasta eest olid nad meie linnaosa
avastanud, selle omaks tunnistanud ja vallutanud. Veel kordagi polnud ma
neid sisemaakajakaid kohanud südalinnas või vanades agulites. Neile
meeldis millegipärast just siin. Mida võisid need linnud sealt ülalt alla
vaadates meie linnaosast arvata? Võib-olla meenutas helehall majadelaam
neile mingit ammukaotatud merelahte, mis oli täis pikitud suuri kandilisi
kivisid?

[11] Hämmastusega märkas ta, et varblased kõndisid mööda majade välisseinu.
Nad haakusid seinakatte mügaratesse. [...] Mis sundis linde nii tegema?

HEINLOO

Those paragraphs help us a little closer to understanding what was going on in the psyche of urban-dwellers. All of the mentioned characters are overcome, in one way or another, by some sort of nostalgy, a longing for the "lost world".

It has been pointed out that the juxtapositiion of urban and rural culture is one of the means of stressing the distinctive urban identity. (Tüür 2002: 685). While in colloquial use the city is as a rule opposed to nature and wilderness, in reality artificial and natural environments often intertwine. Some eco-critics have suggested that the term "environment" also includes cultivated and built landscapes (Wallace, Armbruster 2001: 4), i.e. cities.

The characters of *Autumn Ball*, *Janu* and *Muld* discover urban nature in the most unusual places. The opposition of city vs. nature / city vs. countryside has, in this case, an additional ideological context. We have to keep in mind that because of the censorship and the difficult working conditions of the writers of the stagnation era, a secret message was often conveyed to the reader who was used to reading between the lines. We can assume that the way the topic was handled in literature was part of a kind of a protest against the demands of the official ideology regarding Soviet urban planning which, in turn, was part of the Soviet progress myth (Sooväli 2008). "Writing about nature (outside as well as inside the city – I. H.) became another concealed possibility to express one's quest for freedom in the framework of the official culture and literature" (Maran, Tüür 2001).

During the Soviet era, nature protection (*loodushoid*) had a meaning attached to it that goes deeper than the word itself implies. Preserving nature (natural resources) was a way of preserving culture. For instance, Estonia was the first republic in the USSR to create national parks (for more information on that, see Smurr 2008).

The environmental/ecological aspects of urban fiction from the 1970s and 1980s have been emphasized by other scholars as well. For instance, Maie Kalda has pointed out that Teet Kallas brings a shade of green into the grey scenery of Tallinn which can be directly

---

Küllap nad sõid paneelipragudest vastseid. Peeter ei uskunud, et varblased söövad kive. [...]

associated with the international green movement that was popular at the time. Kalda refers to the green (*sic*!) cover picture of Kallas' short story collection *Öö neljandas mikrorajoonis* (Night in the fourth microrayon) (which includes the abovementioned piece *Muld*) depicting a huge apple-tree growing out of a multi-storey building in Mustamäe. According to Maie Kalda, the general tendency in the prose and poetry of the seventies was to regard the urban dweller as somebody who brutally desecrates nature (Kalda 2003: 601).

Another bundle of topics that cannot be overlooked while analyzing the Soviet Estonian urban fiction and which I will only briefly touch upon, is the distinction between private and public space. Panel housing districts as a living space stressed the importance of collective rather than individual identity. In other words – officially, private space did not exist. Technically, all citizens had legitimate claims to all spaces because they were considered public space. What happened was that the "unofficial" private space became the real centre of social life (Robinson 2009). Let me give a couple of examples on how this duality was presented in literature.

Among the many urban-themed short stories of Jaak Jõerüüt is a significant, though less-known piece called *Räägivad ja vaikivad* (They talk and remain silent). In this short story a couple moves into a brand new apartment in a multi-storey building which they describe, at first, as "untouched from lives, sterile" (Jõerüüt 1980: 35). It soon becomes a place of get-together for a circle of friends, a place to hide themselves from the outside world. Because of the fact that the outside world does not really belong to anybody, the urban-dwellers often feel complete indifference towards it.

It has been written in a recent study of Soviet city: "But people needed real places. They needed places that they themselves would imbue with meaning and over which they could exercise some control, places where they could breathe more easily and relate to one another. The foremost place of this sort was the home, especially its kitchen. Only there did people feel most comfortable" (Argenbright 1999: 7). And indeed, this is exactly the conclusion of Udo Munak in Teet Kallas' novel *Janu* when he remembers the way his forefathers used to sit in the kitchen, stare into the twilight outside and have a nice, old-fashioned conversation (Kallas 1983: 25).

Conclusion

There are multiple ways to approach the many-faced cultural phenomena of panel housing districts which, despite being part of the global urbanization process, gains an additional dimension when placed in the Soviet Estonian context. Nevertheless, it is possible to compare Mustamäe, from an ideological and planological point of view, with, for instance, the Bijlmer district in Amsterdam, Holland.

Back in the 1970s and 1980s, literature was a major output for sociocritical analysis of architectural developments. The switch from rural to urban mentality did not happen painlessly – in the urban fiction of the stagnation era we see how rural past is often nostalgically looked back at.

The Soviet city was an ideologized space. As many scholars have pointed out, by favouring public over private space and collective over individual identity, the urban planners did not succeed in making the new suburbs a pleasant environment for citizens. This is also one of the issues that the fiction written in the 1970s and 1980s is dealing with.

In the last decades, there has been a significant decrease in the popularity of the theme of mass housing residential areas in literature. Suburbs like Mustamäe no more attract the attention that they were granted so profusely during the era of stagnation.

References

Argenbright, R. 1999. Remaking Moscow: New places, new selves. – *Geographical Review* 89(1), 1–22.

Heidmets, M. 1993. Mass housing areas and their young inhabitants: Situation in former Soviet territories. – Ekberg, K., Mjaavatn, P.E. (eds.) *Children at risk: selected papers*. Trondheim: The Norwegian centre for Child Research, 111–114.

Heinloo, I. 2006. *Tallinna paneellinnaosade temaatika Eesti kirjanduses*. Bachelor's thesis.

Kalda, M. 2003. Teet Kallase Tallinn. – *Looming* 4, 594–601.

Kallas, T. 1983. *Janu.* Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Kallas, T. 1985. *Öö neljandas mikrorajoonis*. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Kallas, T. 2008. Kakskümmend seitse hetke Mati Undiga. – Kesküla, K. (ed.) *Undi-jutud. Mälestusi Mati Undist.* Tartu: Hermes, 306 – 347.

Koolhaas, R., Mau, B. 1995. *Small, Medium, Large, Extra-Large Office for Metropolitan Architecture.* Rotterdam: 010 Publishers.

Laigu, T. 2005. Estonian Megastructure Reuse. – Briseno, A. (ed.) *30609008: Autonomous Urbanism.* Princeton Architectural Press, 51–53.

Maran, T., Tüür, K. 2001. On Estonian nature writing. – *Estonian Literary Magazine* 13, 4–10.
    http://elm.estinst.ee/issue/13/estonian-nature-writing/

Meri, L. 1981. Aiaäärne majadetagune. – *Looming* 2, 261–269.

Näripea, E. 2002. Kaadreid modernistlikust ideaallinnast: "Viini Postmark" ja Mustamäe. – Sarapik, K., Kalda, M., Veidemann, V. (ed.-s) *Kohandumise märgid. Collegium litterarum 16.* Tallinn: Underi ja Tuglase Kirjanduskeskus, 142–160.

Reinla, A. 1982. *Inimestega.* Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Ristlaan, R. 1973. Juurtest ja võrsetest. – *Looming* 5, 867–868.

Robinson, J. 2009. The Post-Soviet City: Identity and Community Development. – *City Futures in a Globalising World (an international conference on globalism and urban change).*
    http://www.cityfutures2009.com/PDF/89_Robinson_Jill.pdf

Smurr, R.W. 2008. Lahemaa: the paradox of the USSR's first national park. – *Nationalities Papers* 36, 399–423.

Soja, E.W. 2006. Foreword. – Lindner, C. (ed.) *Urban Space and City-scapes: Perspectives from Modern and Contemporary Culture.* Routledge, xvi–xviii.

Sooväli, H. 2008. Maastiku kirurgia. – *Vikerkaar* 7, 8, 130–137.

Tüür, K. 2002. Aiad ja jõed: linnaloodusest Tõnu Õnnepalu romaanides. – *Keel ja Kirjandus* 10, 681 – 691.

Unt, M. 1985. Sügisball. – *Valitud teosed 2,* 306 – 430.

Unt, M. 1999. Maapoisi tee linnakirjandusse. – *Looming* 8, 1246–1252.

Van Kempen, M. 2006. *Vluchtwegen.* Breda: De Geus.

Viires, P. 2003. Mustamäe Metamorphoses. – Sarapik, V., Tüür, K. (ed.-s) *Koht ja paik. Place and Location.* Tallinn: Eesti Kunstiakadeemia, 395–403.

Viires, P. 2006. *Postmodernism Eesti kirjanduskultuuris. Dissertationes litterarum et contemplationis comparativae Universitas Tartuensis 5.* Tartu: Tartu Ülikooli Kirjastus.

Viires, P. 2010. Mustamäe – kolmkümmend aastat hiljem. – Sarapik, V., Viires, P. (eds.) *Etüüde nüüdiskultuurist 2. Sügisball.* Tallinn-Tartu: Eesti Kirjandusmuuseum.

Wallace, K., Armbruster, K. 2001. Introduction. Why go beyond nature writing and where to? – Armbruster, K., Wallace, K. (eds.) *Beyond Nature Writing: Expanding the Boundaries of Ecocriticism*. Charlottesville, London: University Press of Virginia, 1 – 25.

Throwing Mud in the Face or Gentle Journeys into Frames of Time? Some Notes on Post-Soviet Life-Writing in Estonia[1]

Life-writing texts of various genres (e.g., autobiographies, memoirs, autobiographical novels, diaries, correspondences), frequently by well-known men and women of letters have been part of Estonian literary and cultural scene since its emergence in the second half of the 19th century. With a few exceptions, until recently, however, life-writing was considered to be of marginal (if any) importance in Estonian literary and cultural history. At the same time, life-writing has enjoyed an increasing popularity and visibility on the contemporary Estonian literary landscapes to the extent that a few years ago, a discussion of 'a life-writing boom' was initiated. Gradually, discussions of life-writing are becoming, albeit without a certain reluctance, an integral part of both academic and popular debates on Estonian literary culture.

In the current article, I wish to discuss some implications of this boom as it is reflected in critical reception to life writing that makes a visible effort to keep such genres or textual practices outside the realm of literature. In addition to taking a strongly critical stance toward life writing as such, a postulation of its development of as a 'boom' phenomenon also creates a distinctive temporal frame. Rather than looking at the development of Estonian Post-Soviet life writing as a continuity that emerges during the period of regaining independence and proceeds through the two decades undergoing gradual shifts and transformations, the use of the notion of the boom

---

suggests rapid unprecedented and incontrollable growth that happens at the expense of marginalization of properly imaginative writing, i.e., fiction.

As an alternative to the 'boom' model, I would like to argue for the possibility to view Estonian Post-Soviet life writing as a continuous process that develops via various textual practices and modes of public engagement through the two decades – the 1990s and the 2000s – through interrelated and partially overlapping routes. The processes of the construction of subjectivity and identity in a number of autobiographical writings published in the first half of the 2000s by can be traced back to the emergence of Estonian "memorial culture" in the late 1980s and 1990s, characterized by a sudden and intense public visibility of memory. A central role in the development of such culture can be attributed to both oral and written testimonial accounts of personal experience focusing on the period of the Soviet occupation that played an important role in the process of dismantling the official Soviet discourses of history and contributed to the process of regaining independence.

Oral history research of totalitarian regimes has highlighted the central importance of tracing "the survival of the agentic" within the framework of state politics measuring its power through the degree of "the erosion of individual agency" (Crownshaw and Leyersdorff 2005: xiii). In the late 1980s and early 1990s life story became in Estonia a central vehicle of "the agency of the witness" (ib.), establishing "a memorial framework" as a central "mode of interpreting the past" (Hamilton 2005: 136). During this period numerous nation-wide public calls for submitting life stories were issued in Estonia; memoirs focusing on the experience of the Soviet regime were published in different journals, magazines and even serialized in daily newspapers.[2] One of the primary objectives of life narratives

---

[2] Among the many volumes of published life-stories, of highest importance is the monumental three-volume *Eesti rahva elulood. Sajandi sada elulugu kahes osas* (Tallinn: Tänapäev, 2000, 2003), the title of which in English is *Life-Stories of Estonians. One Hundred Life Stories of the Century in Two Volumes* and *Eesti rahva elulood III. Elu Eesti NSV-s* (Tallinn: Tänapäev, 2003), in translation *Life-Stories of Estonians. Life in the Estonian Soviet Socialist Republic*. Other volumes focus, e.g., on the life stories of the

at that period was to testify to the totalitarian nature of the Soviet regime that established its domination in Estonia (as well as in the other Baltic States) via an intricate penal system including deportations, persecutions, uncontrolled violence, social stigmatization and various other measures aimed at the destruction of national communities and its material basis in Estonia. Apart from confronting official discourses of history and power, the reconciliatory capacities of life narrative and its role as a vehicle of remembrance have also played an important role in Estonia during the period.

The constantly growing corpus of life narratives but even more importantly, the ways in which it has shaped an understanding of both public and private modes of engagement with memory and history, allows to talk about a specific memory culture in Estonia as a "historical sensibility where temporal continuities are strengthened and sustained through communication with others" (Hamilton 2005: 137). Bringing together an extremely diverse body of narratives from various time periods and socio-cultural backgrounds, such memory culture can be viewed as a unique phenomenon enriching and diversifying the modes of the perception of culture, history, individuality and collectivity in Estonia.

A number of life writing texts by well-known Estonian literary figures published in the mid-2000s employ modes of collective and individual self-conception and -reflection similar to those prevalent in the textual corpus of life stories. No longer employed for the purposes of implementing socio-political change these works confirm and consolidate such modes of identification and self-representation within the framework of (literary) culture. Examples of such life writing texts include, for example *Kallid kaasteelised* (Dear Fellow Travelers, Volume I 2003, Volume II 2008) by Jaan Kross (1920–2007), one of Estonia's most prominent contemporary novelists whose autobiography is structured as a web of interrelated

---

deportees, those of women, Russian-speaking minorities, and the period of the German occupation 1941–1944. Several volumes of life-stories have also been published in English: two of them focus on women's life-stories (e.g., *She Who Remembers Survives* and *Carrying Linda's Stones*), one on the life-stories of Estonians in general (*Estonian Life-Stories*).

stories featuring encounters of varied duration and degree of intensity with different people. *Isale* (To My Father, 2003) a life writing work by a well-known Estonian poet Jaan Kaplinski, is written in the format of an imaginary dialogue with the Polish father who perished in Soviet forced-labor camp and whom the author barely knew. Another work in this category, *Seltsimees laps ja suured inimesed* (Comrade Child and the Grown-ups, 2008) and its sequel *Samet ja saepuru* (Velvet and Sawdust, 2009) by an acclaimed children's writer and poet Leelo Tungal is a childhood story focusing on the period of Stalinism, narrated through the eyes of a child attempting to make sense of her mother's arrest and deportation when the author/narrator is only 4 years old.[3]

Next, I will take a brief look at the narrative structuring and thematic foci of *Kallid kaasteelised* by Jaan Kross, highlighting representations of subjectivity that reveal textual engagement with received modes of remembrance and processes of construction of identity in Post-Soviet Estonia but also go beyond them toward explorations of what Luisa Passerini has called the European identification (2007: 96–114).

Kallid kaasteelised (Dear Fellow Travelers) that has won Jaan Kross the title of "the nation's grandfather" and is considered an exemplary Estonian life-writing author, whose story is the story of all of us" is a prime example of the construction of a framework of memory that embodies and exemplifies the central importance of the "survival of the agentic" (Crownshaw and Leyersdorff xiii) under a totalitarian regime. In a two-volume work of nearly 1000 pages

---

[3] The tradition of Post-Soviet Estonian life-writing is also marked by the Estonian publication of various life-writings of exile Estonians that can be, albeit from a different perspective, considered a part of that memory culture. These works have certainly also made a noteworthy contribution to the high visibility of life-writing on contemporary Estonian literary scene. However, as exile Estonian life-writing has a long tradition dating back to 1950s and would require a different conceptual frame, I will not address issue of exile life-writing in the current article. An overview of exile life-writing can be found in *Eesti kirjandus paguluses XX sajandil* (Tonts 255–292). I have discussed issues of exile, subjectivity, cultural identity and translation in an article focusing on the life-writings of Käbi Laretei (Kurvet-Käosaar 2009).

Kross, starting with his childhood in the 1920s, proceeds with a detailed account of the turbulent times of the outbreak of the Second World War, the first Soviet occupation (1940–41), the German occupation (1941–1944) and his first arrest, the return of the Soviets in 1944 and his second arrest in 1946 and imprisonment and years of forced labor camp in Siberia following it, return to Estonia and attempts to find his place in the society despite his unfavorable political status, pervasive and often absurd limitations concerning educational and employment possibilities and everyday matters, building up his career as a writer and a few instances of opening up of the world behind the Iron Curtain for occasional possibilities to travel.

Kross makes visible the central concern of his work already with the title – *Dear Fellow Travelers* – that foregrounds the role of human encounters in the representation his life experience. Even more importantly, however, it points to a shared dimension of that experience that has been shaped by violent and overwhelming historical forces. This is further enhanced by the use of the adjective "dear" (*kallis*) in the title, commonly a rather private term of endearment in Estonian, used in public contexts only on rare occasions. Kross unravels his life experience not via a trajectory of his own individuality but presents it instead as a series of often anecdotal[4] episodes from his life, interwoven with those of the lives of other people, even the most cursory of which firmly belong to the spatio-temporal frame that forms the over-arching structure of the work. Such textual strategy, in my opinion, ties Kross' work implicitly to the life-story tradition and its central role in Estonian memorial culture; this aspect of *Kallid kaasteelised* that has been described as "an anthology that joins together the life(story) of Kross and his many fellow Travelers" (Kesküla A7) has also been underlined in the reception of the work.

---

[4] In her interpretation of Kross' *Treading Air*, Eneken Laanes views the anecdotalization of memory in the novel as a way of reprocessing memory that "renders painful experiences bearable" and "restores the subject to dignity and agency" (148–149).

The narrative structuring of *Kallid kaasteelised* that leaves the impression of an attempt to embrace as many episodes of different life stories as possible allows to argue that Kross may have put his outstanding position in Estonian culture to yet another use. Having the authority to be heard, he uses it not for foregrounding his own life experience or personality but for giving a presence to a multitude of lives and voices, in particular to those who can no longer speak for themselves. In her work on trauma and testimony, Leigh Gilmore has addressed the important issue of "the limit of representativeness, with its compulsory inflation of the self to stand for others, the peculiar way it operates both to expand and to constrict testimonial speech, the way it makes it hard to clarify without falsifying what is strictly and unambiguously "my" experience when "our" experience is also at stake" (Kross 2003: 5). Although it would be impossible to establish a definitive borderline between the "I" and "we" in Kross' text, his narrative strategy reveals and underlines an awareness of the inevitable conflation of voices and selves in search of a collective, yet also markedly subjective mode of dealing with the past.

The memorial frame of *Kallid kaasteelised* is, however, not only limited to an elaboration of national destiny but places the events of the Second World War and its aftermath into larger contexts of the reconfiguration of whole Europe. Kross highlights the rupture that was caused the Second World War and the occupations and the severing off not only of Estonia but many other countries from Europe that were previously considered as part of it at and the ambivalence of identification that is pervading this issue even today. "As I saw it," Kross comments on his silent response to a command by a German Army official at an office where he worked during the Nazi occupation, "the Republic of Estonia had been liquidated as the result of a particularly evil stunt by Stalin, Molotov and Ždanov and now fallen into the hands of an equally horrible maniac. As had half of Europe" (ib. 98). Such awareness is not unique to Estonian authors but is, for example, also echoed in various formats in the discussions about different conceptualization possibilities of Eastern and Central Europe. In a detailed overview of various cultural and geo-political definitions of the region, Marcel Cornis-Pope and John Neubauer refer to Czesław Miłosz's definition of Central Europe as

"all the countries [including the Baltic states] that in August 1939 were the real or hypothetical object of a trade between the Soviet Union and Germany," a definition that, as they point out, was, in turn, heatedly debated by other participants of the Budapest round-table in June 1989 where it was voiced (2004: 1).

The articulation of such position in *Dear Fellow Travelers* was underlined in the Estonian reception of the work that was viewed as describing the author's life "as a member of a betrayed nation going through the excruciating ordeal of the experience of the Stalinist regime" (Haug 2006: B9), a sense of betrayal that is here evoked in particular with respect to the decisions taken by political powers of Europe and the USA at the end of the Second World War that resulted in a paradigmatic change in the configuration of Europe. Kross returns to this theme several times in his work, framing it in different experiential contexts.

An awareness of the shift and the prevalence of borders permeate Kross' work, yet this is rarely manifested as a passive acceptance of the operation of political powers but rather as an attempt to make visible the continuity of the mental and cultural frame of Europe via multiple intersubjective processes. Kross makes a consistent and self-conscious effort to envision a wider space of existence, most importantly, that of a European space of human agency and inter-action. As he wishes to underline with the inclusion of many often quite unusual events and encounters, despite the establishment of the Iron Wall as a political entity with very real material implications, the capacity for imagining the possibility of such interactions can contribute to finding ways of its redefinition and even erosion. A perception of European cultural identity that covers "geopolitical, ideological, and symbolic dimensions that are not completely coin-cident, but instead ... converge and diverge in confusing and sometimes paradoxical ways" (Spiridon 2006: 377) is certainly not new but lies perhaps at the very heart of the idea of European identity.

Shifting the emphasis from identity (as a fixed position) to that of identification (as a process), in her *Memory and Utopia* (2007), Luisa Passerini uses a range of interrelated conceptualizations of intersubjectivity on which she grounds her discussion of memory

focusing on questions of Europe. Building her argument on defini-
tions of intersubjectivity ranging from a consideration of genera-
tional relationships between historians (Passerini 2007: 3) and
intersubjective nature of "interpretational exchanges" in her work as
an oral historian (ib. 4) to an awareness, supported by the work of
Melanie Klein of the "relationship between persons rather than
within the individual as a site for the negotiation of meanings" (ib.),
Passerini proposes a "new investment in Europeanness [that] … from
exchange with others awaits recognition of that which is specific and
that which is shared" (ib. 114).

Dear Fellow Travelers by Jaan Kross, "the nation's grandfather"
is, on the one hand considered by its critics to be an exemplary work
of Estonian life-writing, "whose story is the story of all of us"
(Kesküla 2003: A7) that offers a clear-cut conceptualisation of the
Estonian identity vis-à-vis the Soviet occupation and Estonia's
exclusion, together with many other countries at the end of the
Second World War, from Europe. One the other, the work also offers
a more ambivalent and dynamic view of the life of the author and his
many 'fellow travelers' where political and ideological borders
cannot contain the many intersubjective processes that make up the
core of the work. *Dear Fellow Travelers* proposes a (textual) con-
figuration of Europeanness where the narrating subject is self-
conscious both of its authoritative identity-forming position and the
limits of that authority that inevitably erode that identity and
metaphorically leave open a space of narration for the other.

***

Although the autobiography of Kross and several other works in the
'memorial culture' category have been received well by critics, in
particular with regard to the 'boom', the advent of life-writing in
Estonia has frequently been referred to in negative terms. Most
commonly, it is viewed as impoverishment of 'literature proper' at
the expense of the flourishing of non-fictional literature (e.g. Mutt
2009). Immediate reception of different works of life-writing makes
visible the strategies that have been adopted in order to ensure that

the realm of "literature proper" would remain untainted by the invasion of life-writing.

Such stance can be illustrated by the reception history of two life-writing works published in 2008 – *Ajapildi sees* (Inside the Time Frame) by Mari Tarand and *Musta pori näkku* (Throwing Mud in the Face) by Mihkel Raud that, due to different reasons, received extensive public attention, one as an achievement that won high recognition by the institution of literature and the other as a work that questions the very borders of that institution, breaching the popular and the elite, the high and low culture, popular press and sophisticated aesthetic judgment.

Ajapildi sees, authored by a well-known radio journalist Mari Tarand, is a subtle and finely tuned reminiscence focusing on the author's brother, an iconic Estonian poet Juhan Viiding that won two major Estonian literary awards in 2008.[5] Even though it was not viewed as a work of literature per se, *Ajapildi sees* received praise for rich and subtle treatment of the 1950s and 60s and an empathetic and non-intrusive rendering of the life of the author's brother (see, e.g., Kesküla 2008: 184, Kaus 2008: 42). Such reception seems to suggest that life-writing could tentatively be allowed to the very outskirts of the realm of literature proper if it stayed firmly within the boundaries of good taste, both in terms of the style of writing and the manner of representing life experience. In this particular case, it should not be overlooked that the subject of *Ajapildi sees*, the legendary Estonian poet himself already belonged firmly and unquestionably to the realm of literature, an affiliation that was in this case also extended to a poetic biography of him. By opening her work with a claim that apart from his brother, family members and friends, "this book also has [two] other protagonist[s] – literature and POETRY" (10), the author also underlines such affiliation herself.[6]

---

[5] Prize for Literature of the Cultural Endowment of Estonia and the National Culture Award.

[6] Parallel to such line of argument, the reception of the work also highlighted the relevance of auto/biographical knowledge about Juhan Viiding with regard to his legacy that Tarand's work provides. Also, while characterizing *Ajapildi sees* as "a poetic narrative composed with reticence and dignity", Jan Kaus nonetheless does not exclude the possibility that its

If *Ajapildi sees* established its' status from within the institution of literature, another work, an autobiography of an Estonian punk rock guitarist and popular TV-host Mihkel Raud titled *Musta pori näkku* gained attention due to its scandalous subject matter which, in turn, was reflected in sales numbers considerably exceeding those of the best-selling novels of the past few years. Self-conscious of the niche in the literary market that his book belongs to, the author offers the following rationale for his work: "For full-fledged existence, each proper nation needs /.../ at least five different brands of cheese at the local supermarket /.../ and myths and legends about alcohol addicted pop stars bouncing on the borderline of life and death, one day holding a football stadium size crowd spellbound the next getting busted by the militia." (Raud 2008: 5). Placing his auto-biography squarely into a common and internationally popular sub-genre of life-writing – that of celebrity autobiography – the author here identifies himself as in a way a pioneer of this genre. Critical reception of *Musta pori näkku* has, however, not looked at it within the framework of that specific genre but rather in relation to more general issues of (discourses of) truth(-telling) and literary value.

Highlighting author's journalistic affiliations and characterizing the work in terms of satisfying the demand of the yellow press for the thirst for juicy personal details that undermines the artistic oeuvre, a well-known Estonian literary critic and novelist finds *Musta pori näkku* lacking in artistic quality due to its formal features (poor description skills, polluting influence of the English on the language of the work, etc.,). Even more important than artistic shortcomings is for him the world-view advanced in *Musta pori näkku*; in his opinion, this work fulfils perfectly the new demand on the literary market for offensive and obnoxious stance in the guise of art (Kaus 2009b: 149). I have problematized the position of Jan Kaus by highlighting a possible pun in the title of Raud's autobiography.[7]

---

success can be explained by the fact that it is a biography of a person with celebrity status in Estonian culture, hence keen interest into the details of his life (Kaus 2008: 42).

[7] The paper on the position of life-writing in contemporary Estonian literature delivered at the annual meeting of the Society of Estonian literature in 2008, unpublished.

In Estonian there is an idiomatic expression 'to throw mud at someone', meaning 'to slander'. As the title itself already contains a hint to such treatment of the persons that appear on the pages of *Musta pori näkku*, in my opinion, it also automatically calls into doubt the seriousness of the offensive and disrespectful stance that the work supposedly flaunts. Furthermore, I have argued that the title can be read as a clue for reading the work in yet another way. In a sense the exaggerated flow of deliberately impolite language, including a multitude of four-letter words makes both the protagonist and other characters in *Musta pori näkku* as if constantly having 'mud in their face' which, rather that exposing in unpleasant and offensive manner, hides or camouflages their personalities and their habitat and functions like a code that only those belonging to the same subculture (in the given case, that of punk culture) can adequately interpret. Applying, from this point of view, the notion autobiographical truth as "an intersubjective exchange between narrator and reader aimed at producing a shared understanding of the meaning of a life" (Smith and Watson 2001: 13), the reaction of Kaus becomes not merely understandable but to a certain extent even predictable.

Taking an entirely contrasting stand, yet another critic praises *Musta pori näkku* as an impressive literary achievement exactly because of its exaggerated and nontraditional style of rendering life experience. As he puts it, "the novel oozes such belletristic energy and artistic freedom that I had no hesitations whatsoever in placing it squarely into the category of fiction. This is a ritualistic text that turns documental material into fiction, a quasi-autobiography that calls into being a new reality" (Vaher 2008: 420). Although viewing the work as a remarkable contribution to novelistic production of the year 2008, such position itself seems to be quite firmly anchored in an understanding of life experience that can be unproblematically reproduced in life-writing with an employment of certain array of textual tools that guarantee the reading of the text as possessing (non-literary) truth-value.

The reception of these two works of life-writing makes visible apparently deeply grounded and relatively fixed assumptions about the relationship between life and art, truth and representation, fiction

and reality, experience and imagination in Estonian literary culture. Life-writing proper remains outside (or on the very margins) of the realm of literature while life-writing that stands out for its experimental style and imagery becomes suspect as a convincing non-fictional text. Thus, on the one hand, modestly imaginative, more matter-of-fact and non-hyperbolic language that seems to function as a proof of a truthful rending of someone's life by the same token elevates those texts only in very limited cases into the category of 'literature proper'. On the other, life-writing works that have more imaginative narrative and tropic structure can be lifted from the category of non-fiction but by entering the realm of literature (i.e., that of fiction), they no longer can be read as offering a truthful and convincing representation of life experience.

Such conceptualizations of life-writing seem to a very little extent involve an understanding of any work of life-writing as a complex structure, a production of new textual reality that assumes an existence at the moment of writing and is influenced by a number of different factors, such as, e.g., the meaning-making and contextual quality and intertextual nature of memory, social and cultural production of experience and its interpretational nature, (Smith and Watson 2001: 16, 18, 24–26) and that "the stuff of autobiographical storytelling /.../ is drawn from multiple, disparate, and discontinuous experiences and the multiple identities constructed from and constituting those experiences" (ib. 35). One reason for the relative lack of sufficiently multifaceted considerations of different life-writing forms and practices can be perhaps attributed to its relative newness as an accountable phenomenon on the contemporary literary scene. As I argue in the current article, life writing necessarily does not need to be viewed as a completely new phenomenon, but as something that has not only been a part of Estonian post-Soviet cultural scene but a visible part of Estonian literary culture from its beginnings.[8] There also seems to be the need, as I already have

---

[8] For a more detailed discussion of the role and implications of life writing in Estonian cultural history, see the contributions of the special issue of life-writing of *Methis. Studia humaniora Estonica.* (5–6, 2010, ed. Leena Kurvet-Käosaar).

pointed out, to guard the borders of literature, a concern that is certainly heightened by an increasing output of life-writing works with an appeal for the mass market, such as, for example the many often co-authored celebrity autobiographies. One the other, as memory in general is a highly valued socio-cultural concept in Estonia, addressing memory's complex entanglement in issues of textual production may also, to a certain extent, be viewed as possible risk to its iconic status.[9]

Such position can to a certain extent be observed in the recent debate on Estonian literature of the 2000s in the literary journal *Looming*, where questions of memory and, to a certain extent, also those of life-writing are raised by almost all contributors. One aspect that emerges in these considerations is an emphasis on memory's monumental dimension in autobiographical representations, emblematic of the history and destiny of the nation as a whole. Including life-writings that focus on the period of independence from 1918 to 1939, the experience of WWII and the Stalinist regime and/or the Soviet period in general, works that are viewed as representing that dimension of memory and history are also considered to be noteworthy achievements of the literature of the 2000s. One example of such type of life-writing is Kross' *Kallid kaasteelised* (2003, 2008) that has been characterized as "a socio-cultural giant, reflecting, through the self, on the destiny of the whole nation" (Kesküla 2010: 117). Kross has also written a thorough theoretical consideration on life-writing, *Omaeluloolisus ja alltekst* (2003) that focuses on the interrelationship of his life experience and the process of writing historical novels. Providing an itinerary of the uses of autobiographical and historical elements in his work, Kross, who is first and foremost known as the author of historical fiction, emphasizes that as much as such thematic choices (time-wise limited

---

[9] An excellent point against such speculation, however, is a recent monograph by Eneken Laanes, titled *Lepitamatud dialoogid: subjekt ja mälu nõukogudejärgses eesti romaanis* (Tallinn: Underi ja Tuglase kirjanduskeskus, 2009), in translation *Unresolvable Dialogues: subjectivity and memory in Post-Soviet Estonian novel* that offers an excellent discussion of memory's complex interrelationship with representation, history, subjectivity and collectivity.

to the 16th to the 19th century) were inspired by his genuine interest in history they were motivated by the Soviet censorship apparatus that extended beyond mere literary production to cover extensively everyone's representation possibilities of their lives, including, for example the CV or as it was then called, the questionnaire (Kross 2003: 10–11). The flourishing of different genres of life-writing in contemporary Estonia has been related to the impact of a longer period (20 years) devoid of censorship also by others (see, e.g., Velsker 2009: 1422) and the very small number of life-writings from the Soviet period also supports this view.

In addition, there is also an emphasis on the "new outspokenness" with regard to life-writing works dominated by patterns of inner development of the authors' subjectivity where also intimate details of the authors' lives, in particular those pertaining to the body (Hennoste 2009: 1277) play an important role (Kesküla 2010: 116–117, see also Velsker 2009: 1422, Olesk 2008: 441). Another aspect of life-writing that, although not novel as such on the Estonian literary landscapes, has again been viewed as surfacing as an important literary and/or life-writing genre is that of travel writing. As Tiit Hennoste formulates it: "Memoirs are something that can tentatively be titled "My X" where X would stand either for time or for a person" but now works where X is "an arbitrary place in the world" are quietly (re)entering the literary scene (2009: 1277). Although different manifestations of life-writing are included among literary achievements, the conclusions pertaining to the decade as a whole nevertheless often accentuate the lack of new aesthetic achievements (Keskküla 2010: 121).

**

Wider agreement on the advent of the so-called life-writing boom in Estonia has spurned heated debates where a reluctance of recognizing life-writing as part of a nation's literary heritage is currently gradually giving way to interrogations that have started envisioning new literary and cultural spaces that exhibit a more diverse and multifaceted understanding of life-writing with regard to representation, memory, truth, and aesthetic merit. The focus of the

current discussions of Estonian life-writing dominantly on issues of literary value isolates the 2000s from the previous decade where life-writing enjoyed massive popularity and public recognition in the format of the life-story. The exclusion of the life-story tradition from discussions of life-writing can be justified from the point of view of mapping the development of literature (proper). Yet, the inclusion of 1990s as one that witnessed the emergence of one specific popular forms or genre of life-writing in the tentative mapping of Post-Soviet Estonian life-writing contributes to making visible both the continuities and changes in the perception of memory and history and the dynamics of the representation of individual and collective subjectivities.

References

Cornis-Pope, M. and J. Neubauer 2004. General Introduction. – *History of the Literary Cultures of East-Central Europe. Junctures and Disjunctures in the 19th and 20th centuries*. Volume I. Ed. M. Cornis-Pope and J. Neubauer. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 1–18.

Cronshaw, R. and S. Leydesdorff 2005. On Silence and Revision: The Language and Words of the Victims. – *Memory and Totalitarianism*. Ed. L. Passerini. New Brunswick and London: Transaction Publishers, viii–xviii.

Gilmore, L. 2001. *The Limits of Autobiography. Trauma and Testimony*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Hamilton, P. 2003. Sale of the Century? Memory and historical consciousness in Australia. – *Contested Pasts. The Politics of Memory*. Ed. K. Hodgkin and S. Radstone. London and New York: Routledge, 136–152.

Haug, T. 18 Dec 2003. Reedetute eepos. – *Eesti Ekspress, Areen* B9.

Hennoste, T. 2009. Mälu ja elu. Grillajastu kirjandus. – *Looming* 12, 1271–1280.

Hinrikus, R. (ed.) 2000. *Eesti rahva elulood*. I osa. Tallinn: Tänapäev.

Hinrikus, R. (ed.) 2000. *Eesti rahva elulood*. II osa. Tallinn: Tänapäev.

Hinrikus, R. (ed.) 2003. *Eesti rahva elulood. Elu Eesti NSV-s*. Tallinn: Tänapäev.

Kaplinski, J. 2003. *Isale*. Tallinn: Varrak.

Kaus, J. 2008. Ilukirjandus ja elukirjandus: eesti proosast 2008. – *Vikerkaar* 6, 41–57.

Kaus, J. 2009a. Liiga palju paljusust. – *Looming* 12, 1687–1695.

Kaus, J. 2009b. Mihkel-kuradi-Raud ja tema mäles-kuradi-tused. – *Looming* 1, 147–151.

Kesküla, K. Dec 04 2003. Rahvuse vanaisa. – *Eesti Ekspress*, A7.

Kesküla, K. 2008. Ja kelle pihtimus teid põletab. – *Vikerkaar* 11–12, 182–184.

Kesküla, K 2010. Mälu impeerium, ajaloo eri. – *Looming* 1, 116–121.

Kirss, T, E. Kõresaar, M. Lauristin (eds). 2004. *She Who Remembers, Survives. Interpreting Estonian Women's Post-Soviet Life-Stories.* Tartu: Tartu University Press.

Kross, J. *Omaeluloolisus ja alltekst.* Tallinn: Eesti Keele Sihtasutus, 2003.

Kross, J. 2003. *Kallid kaasteelised.* Tallinn: Eesti Keele Sihtasutus.

Kross, J. 2008. *Kallid kaasteelised.* II osa. Tallinn: Eesti Keele Sihtasutus.

Kurvet-Käosaar, L. 2009. The Situation of Translation/Translation Situation in Käbi Laretei's Life-Writing. – *Biography: An Interdisciplinary Quarterly* 32.1, 137–147.

Kurvet-Käosaar, Leena (ed) 2010. *Methis. Studia humaniora Estonica. Omaeluloolisus eesti kultuuriloos.* Tartu: Tartu Univeristy Press.

Laanes, E. 2009. *Lepitamatud dialoogid: subjekt ja mälu nõukogudejärgses eesti romaanis.* Tallinn: Underi ja Tuglase kirjanduskeskus.

Lie, S. S., and L. Malik, I. Jõe-Cannon, R. Hinrikus 2006. *Carrying Linda's stones: an anthology of Estonian women's life stories.* Tallinn: Tallinn University Press.

Mutt, M. April 02, 2009. Raamat nagu reality show. – *Postimees*, 12.

Kirss, T. and R. Hinrikus (eds.) 2009. *Estonian Life-Stories.* Budapest, New York: Central European University Press.

Olesk, Sirje 2008. Mastimännid ja muu mets. Mitmekülgsuse võlu. Eesti proosast aastal 2007. – *Looming* 3, 424–441.

Passerini, L. 2007. *Memory and Utopia. The Primacy of Interasubjectivity.* London: Equinox.

Raud, Mihkel 2008. *Musta pori näkku.* Tallinn: Tammerraamat.

Smith, S. and J. Watson 2001. *Reading Autobiography. A Guide for Interpreting Life Narratives.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Spiridon, M. 2006. Identity Discourses on Borders in Eastern Europe. – *Comparative Literature* 58.4, 376–386.

Tonts, Ü. 2008. Memuaristika. – *Eesti kirjandus paguluses XX sajandil.* (Collegium litterarum 9). Ed. P. Kruuspere. Tallinn: Eesti TA Underi ja Tuglase Kirjanduskeskus, pp 257–312.

Tarand, M. 2008. *Ajapildi sees. Lapsepõlv Juhaniga.* Tartu: Ilmamaa.

Tungal, L. 2008. *Seltsimees laps ja suured inimesed: veel üks jutustus õnnelikust lapsepõlvest.* Tallinn: Tänapäev.

Velsker, M. 2009. Uus kirjandus ja uued lugejad. – *Looming* 10, 1410–1425.

Vaher, V. 2009a. Etapp küll, kuid mitte epohh. – *Looming* 11, 1564–1573.

Vaher, V. 2009b. Lasteaia ja lõbumaja vahel. Eesti proosa. 2008. – *Looming* 3, 409–428.

Maria Konopnicka's Fairy Tale On Dwarves and a Little Orphan Girl Mary *as an Example of Polish Orphan Literature. Looking for Polish Identity?*

1. On specificity of Polish orphanage

Orphanage is one of the most important and most explored themes in the nineteenth-century Polish literature for children. In world literature we can find e.g. Cinderella, the girl with the matchbox, all the orphans from the songbooks for kindergartens, protagonists from the books of Charles Dickens, Ann of the Green Gables, the child from the secret garden, children from patriotic Finnish fairy tales of Zacharias Topelius – they all belong to the collective imagination.

A number of texts in Polish literature concerning the issue of orphanage are closely connected with the history of Poland, and with the motif of soldiers-insurgents who emigrated from Poland after the failures of the nineteenth-century uprisings, inspired by folklore. Polish children's literature of that time created the image of an uprooted Pole, a "man without a fatherland", often compared to the image of a motherless orphan (poems of Teofil Lenartowicz). The myth of orphanage is superimposed on the Romantic myth of childhood. Polish Romanticism treated this motif idealistically, Positivism (Realism) – sociologically and Modernism – symbolically. The best patriotic and symbolic-mythical fairy tale in Polish children's literature, *O krasnoludkach i sierotce Marysi* (*On Dwarves and the Little Orphan Girl Mary*), 1896, written by Maria Konopnicka, is representative of the above-mentioned issues and presents three models of orphanage: Romantic, Positivist and Modernist. A link that combines three levels of realising this motif is rurality. Mary is a country girl, the story is set against a rural background, and when the tale reaches its happy end, the orphan-

heroine – finds herself not in a royal palace, but under a thatched roof of a peasant who works on the 'orphan land' (a Romantic symbol of subjugated Poland). In her book *Sierota w polskiej literaturze dla dzieci w XIX wieku (Orphans in Polish Nineteenth-Century Literature for Children)*, Magdalena Jonca claims that Konopnicka's fairy tale "synthesises ... models of orphans' life known from nineteenth-century literary texts" (Jonca 1994: 271) while Ewa Paczoska in her article *Marysia i osieroceni (Mary and Orphans)* observes that "myths of orphanage centred round the following images: a Pole, orphaned by mother – land, an abandoned child as a model for the reader to learn moral virtues, an orphan as the most wretched creature but in God's special care, and hence anything can happen to him, a victim and at the same time a chosen one, an orphan as an object of care and educational activities ... the status of an orphan opened [the road] to another world ... [and] the orphan protagonist found himself in community with God." (Paczoska 1995: 8). Polish Romantic literature often used that motif, which it is particularly visible in poems by Teofil Lenartowicz, the author of texts immensely popular with readers and educators entitled *Złoty kubek (The Golden Mug)* and *Duch sieroty (The Orphan's Spirit)*. They present the particular charisma of orphanage. For the poet the reconstruction of "the orphan idyll" constituted "an aesthetic, moral and patriotic statement" (Jonca 1994: 266) Konopnicka, drawing from Lenartowicz's works, introduced the theme of orphans to many of her works but the fairy tale *O krasnoludkach i sierotce Marysi* is the most excellent example. The title protagonist Mary is orphaned, just like peasant Skrobek and his two sons; marked with orphanage is Skrobek's abandoned and fallow land; also secondary characters, e.g. the old woman – herbalist, or the animals appearing in the fairy tale, such as the rat that loses its children, relate to the theme of orphanage. Dwarf Podziomek, "a changeling" in the human world, and the whole society of dwarves, whose history is closely connected with Polish history (as stated by famous chronicler Koszałek-Opałek while recounting known legends), are also orphans. When Poland loses independence and the dwarves cannot help the country, they can only remember the glorious past of the Polish Republic 'of milk and honey' and they

feel orphaned in the new world. Though their existence is closely connected with the human fate, they sleep through the winter underground and wake back to life, according to the rhythm of nature, in spring. The very great chronicler of the dwarves Koszałek-Opałek is "a character [who] is often interpreted as an embodiment of a grotesque sage with a volume full of false wisdom, who learns the truth about the world only as an orphan" (Baluch 1993: 58; Leszczyński 1990: 30): "the old, abandoned orphan in a lunar ray quietly treads on snow and warms his hands, trembling, at silver light ... Humble he has become, good, quiet, he associates with the little ones and shares his heart with every living creature." (Konopnicka 1954)

Importantly for our analysis, it must also be observed that

> the syncretic fairy tale about orphan girl Mary has, like numerous masterpieces of literature for children, a double addressee: children and adults. As a Modernist text it already conveys a double, childlike and adult, vision of the world: fantasy and naiveté are intertwined with the rational order, and at the same time both the child and the adult recalling his own childhood become implicit co-authors of the text. (Ichnatowicz 1997: 85)

and

> magic thinking, a tendency to mythologise and the inclination to combine the real world with the imaginary context of fantasy have determined ... the composition [of the work] (Leszczyński 1990: 29)

Therefore, we shall also concentrate on the structure of narration, the three models of rurality corresponding to the three narratorial types, and on the syncretic character of the fairy tale (the text combines elements of the Positivist novel, the fairy tale, poetry with Modernist polyphonic narration). The dwarves and their excellent world, organised after the human fashion and ruled by adored King Błystek, constitute a magic but at the same time discreet power of the unreal. In conformity with their role in culture, the dwarves (like "nannies", who are the only authority for a child) help people, constituting the

unifying motif for the three above-mentioned models (levels) of realisation of the tale – bringing the whole story to a happy end.

The fable is illustrative in character, it contains a lot of references to Polish cultural myths and at the same time it is lyrical and amusing.

2. The Romantic aspect – idealisation (character types, rurality, the role of the people, patriotic and national issues, the religious context, elements of extraordinariness and mystery)

The title protagonist is orphan girl Mary, whose origin can be traced to Romantic poems by Polish poet Teofil Lenartowicz. Lenartowicz's poems, drawing from folklore and religion, highlighted the theme of compensating for orphanage with the gift of

> noticing things invisible to others, in accordance with ... the poetic belief that God is merciful towards orphans' while the world inhabited by the orphan is reminiscent of the interior of Złoty Kubek. (Ługowska 1999: 330–344)

Orphanage befalls every Pole while

> for Lenartowicz the child's charisma, deriving from the myth of the "divine child," has become evidently indisputable, and in particular the charisma of the child orphan, God's chosen, due to being doubly marked (with childhood and with orphanage), a child particularly blessed, blessed with goodness, beauty and truth. (Janion 1972: 95)

The tale's characters are children, country orphans, shepherds and gooseherds, whose daily activities include tending (grazing) animals, singing songs, playing the pipe. Only seemingly does their life seem idyllic. A distinctive feature of such characters is their otherness, loneliness and alienation, and sadness (asked by a housewife why she does not sing or enjoy herself like others do, Mary replies that

"birches weep in groves and the earth is flooded with tears" (Cieślikowski 1975), but – thanks to this – also openness towards another, irrational world: the world of the fairy tale. Rurality played a significant role here and because of the closeness to the land each activity of the character became authentic and touched on the *sacrum*. Also rural simplicity (Romanticism) is sanctified. For this reason character types (country children, peasant Skrobek, the dwarves, Queen Tatra) with their internal transformations are idealised at the first, Romantic level of reception: country children do not work – instead, their tending of animals is a game; orphan Mary, though hungry and poorly clad, sings lyrical songs and does not complain; peasant Skrobek, who raises two little sons on his own, is not very concerned about their future and in a sense awaits a better tomorrow; in their fairy dimension, the dwarves indeed live a life resembling human existence but e.g. sleep through severe winter and wake up in spring, full of hope and optimism; while queen Tatra (Lady of the Polish Tatra mountains, though living far away from Mary's native village and potentially even resembling Andersen's Snow Queen, as she seems severe, sitting on her high throne) after all understands Mary's trouble and soon agrees to return the geese stolen by the fox.

Romantic is the portrayal of queen Tatra's castle – a great, admired and ideal queen – full of elements of extraordinariness and mystery and it corresponds to the poetic image of animated fairy nature (entry 'nature'– *Dictionary of the Polish Language of the 19th century*): "corns parted before her [Mary]" (Konopnicka 1954: 145), "wild pear trees leaned towards the little wanderer," "she was surrounded by ... spreading oaks ... black pines" (ib. 146). Interesting is the commentary concerning the above-mentioned phenomenon written by Grzegorz Leszczyński and his interpretation of the following excerpt: "two spruce forests led to the gates of the castle, two stone giants held guard at the gates ... two streams poured silver in the gateway out of malachite pitchers day and night ... two eagles hovered over the turrets of the castle, two winds howled on the threshold like two savages, two pale stars shone through the turret windows: the morning and evening star." (Ib. 108) Leszczyński stresses the Romantic atmosphere of terror and poetry, which

"was constructed through interweavement of pairs of elements which inspire the sense of fear (both in the protagonist and the virtual reader) and fascination with the splendour and subtle beauty," i.e. the feelings of terror and wonder are shown parallelly here (Leszczyński 1990: 30) (e.g. phrases "two spruce forests" and "two stone giants" intimate coldness and darkness, whereas "two groves", "two streams" and "two stars" imply peace and warmth and brightness). (Ib.)

These images form a landscape resembling the atmosphere of Andersen's fairy tales, where the parallel fates of people and nature constitute a solid background to the world presented: "Queen Tatra's castle stood on a high mountain; a mountain so high that clouds lay at its feet like herds of grey sheep, while the summit shone in the sun against the clear azure" (Konopnicka 1954: 148).

The characters' fates interlace, as the main protagonist, orphan girl Mary, is helped by both the dwarves and Queen Tatra and some animals, and finally even Skrobek takes her into his cottage. Mary "brings into the work both childlike and adult modes of existence in the world ... as abandonment, suffering and forced independence befall her ... while otherness, loneliness, homelessness, abandonment, enslavement, uprootedness, helplessness, poor condition and lack of prospects" (Ichnatowicz 1997: 85) constitute the image of Polish Romantic orphanage of the nation, in which a society without a fatherland is regarded in terms of social orphanage (a nation without a fatherland is like children without a mother). Such view of orphanage becomes a national myth.

Romantic in origin is also the Gypsy character, as he has the right to transgress the border of the real and unreal world. He is a free man, so he lives closer to nature; he is also a brigand type, who raids, captures and enslaves (e.g. dwarves Koszałek-Opałek and Podziomek). (Cieślikowski 1975: 62). Romantic seems also the religious dimension of the piece – children pray to God, believe in his mercy and assistance.

3. The Positivist aspect – sociologisation (work, history, a synthesis of Polish national myths, ethnography, characters: peasant Skrobek, the Gypsy, the wise old woman)

The Positivist model of the tale is manifest in the emphasis on the theme of work and the broad sociological context of the text and social issues of the Polish countryside at the turn of the 20th century. The Positivist dimension is also characterised by the epic character of narration, especially clearly manifest at the beginning: "The winter was so severe and long that His Majesty Błystek, the king of the dwarves, froze to his throne." (Konopnicka 1990: 11) The beginning of the tale is realistic and the narrator can be categorised as omniscient (auctorial). The village where the tale is set – Głodowa Wólka – is presented like real villages within the temporal and spatial framework of Polish Mazowsze, the life of the country children in the fairy tale corresponds to the life of real children, and adult Skrobek is a true reflection of the character of a tough, stubborn Polish peasant who, though attached to his plot of land, cannot cope with farming and raising sons whose mother has died (cf. Bolesław Prus's *Placówka [The Centre]*, Positivist novellas *Janko Muzykant [Johnny Music-Maker]* and *Antek [Tony]*). In just such an ethnographical and sociological model of the world there is also the country herbalist – not a witch, but a wise old woman who knows forest secrets and can treat with the herbs she collects, knowing their medicinal components and "magic power". (Cieśli-kowski 1975: 72–73) At the Positivist level of the text it is not magic and wizardry that lead to success but science and knowledge. Partly Positivist is also the model of the Gypsy character – a real 'wanderer' of the second half of the 19th century – who "roves from fair to fair and plays the jew's harp ..., earning his living by tinkering and robbing people." (Ib. 62) The fairy tale also contains a clearly visible and elaborated theme of the mountains – the Polish Tatras (as queen Tatra lives there), whose symbolism has already been thoroughly analysed by Polish folklorists, ethnographers and literary

specialists (numerous works related to mountains appeared at the turn of the 20th century and the great fascination with the motif of mountains appeared in Polish literature at the beginning of the 20th century), (Kolbuszewski 1995: 21) in the context of Rousseau's Romantic "return to nature". Also in connection with the mountains – as in Konopnicka's fairy tale – there are clear references to the *topos* of treasure seeking, treasure being buried deep underground (often in rocky mountains), and the *topos* of the brigand:

> The night was warm, quiet, long before twilight, when Piotr Skrobek, returning home from a fair, saw a sudden brightness ahead. Well, simply, as if something was burning by the rock. "What is it?" thinks Skrobek. "Fire, not fire? Or maybe treasure is being cleaned? After all, old people say that here, in these rocks, brigands lived of old, robbing gold and silver and hiding it underground. It is nothing else but this holy fire that purifies the money of human grievance ... It has to burn so for a hundred years. Or two hundred if it is the orphan's mite ... Not sooner than this grievance has burnt out can such treasure go to a man. Only that the poor and orphans must partake of it, otherwise it would go to waste. Oh, would it be my share!..." (Konopnicka 1988: 189).

Clearly Skrobek's interpretation of the story of treasure allegedly buried underground contains the motif of orphans, privileged because of their afflictions. Orphans should be given part of the treasure found in order to redeem the guilt of the brigands who have stolen that treasure.

Positivist literature presented and verified Polish national myths. What is very clearly visible here is the dispute with the Romantic tradition: although it is Romantic feelings and respect for imagination that actually determine the choice of the proper way of living and the perception of the world in Konopnicka's tale, yet Positivist honesty, firmness and family values determine the presentation of the world in the text. The story of orphan girl Mary highlights also the theme of respect for work, unpopular in Romanticism but promoted in Positivism (e.g. the myth of the peasant – ploughman). Following the Positivist tradition, Konopnicka's fairy tale contains a juxtaposition of

tale and truth while the dwarves, though deriving from the fairy tale tradition, do not tell "tales": "fairy elements [their tales] constitute inner realism treated in the same way as the real world." (Cieślikowski 1975: 29). A characteristic of the Polish dwarves (similarly to the image of the Scandinavian gnomes) is their attachment to land and home, and so in the tale the dwarves "live a human life" and help the girl find a surrogate family. The tale's ending – and the image of Skrobek's family, where Mary in a sense plays the role of a housekeeper – is again realistic and matter-of-fact ("perhaps some hemp ... and maybe two patches of cabbages! Black, fertile soil, cabbage heads would be as big as pumpkins" (Konopnicka 1957: 72) and brings to mind the realist novels of the second half of the 19th century. There is also a poetic accent there, which for Polish readers once again constitutes a reference to patriotism and national issues – namely "the song about Earth."

4. The Modernist aspect – symbolism (polyphonic narration – fantasy and naiveté are intertwined with the rational order, verification of myths – the internal transformation of the peasant, the mythical role of the journey, magic)

Yet the fairy tale about dwarves and orphan girl Mary quite clearly breaks the Positivist sociological order. In the opinion of Jerzy Cieślikowski, who compared Konopnicka's fairy tale with *The Wonderful Adventures of Nils* by Selma Lagerlöf, the introduction to the rational world of only slightly irrational elements constitutes "a structural dissonance" for both authors, after all representing the Positivist spirit. Another Polish scholar, Grzegorz Leszczyński, writing e.g. about the tale's distinctive features (polyphonic structure or syncretism) in the context of world literature (e.g. *Gulliver's Travels*, *Alice in Wonderland* or Andersen's fairy tales), emphasises a major impact of Andersen on the shape of Konopnicka's fairy tale. (Leszczyński 1990). Magic and wonder gradually enter the tale, and the story changes into a fairy tale. Characters, who at the beginning

of the tale inhabit a real world and cannot cope with life in it (fox steals Mary's geese and Skrobek in not able to handle his fallow land and feeding children), receive help from the unreal world.

At this level of realisation of the text a significant role is played by Queen Tatra, who "no longer inhabits the temporal and spatial framework of the Mazowsze fairy tale, but lives behind the seven mountains." Orphan Mary goes to the Queen for rescue (she wants to recover the geese stolen by the fox) – an expedition "as if for the water of life". Help can be given only to a good and honest but at the same time poor and humble person. Polish folklorist Jolanta Ługowska, basing on Wladimir Propp's definition of the fairy tale, observes:

> Mary, similarly to folk-tale characters wandering in search of the water of life or another magic agent necessary for remedying a grievance, reverses a bad fortune, and thus they cover a vast distance, as the end of their quest lies 'behind the mountains, behind the forests ... behind the three-ninth river.' (Ługowska 1997: 63)

The girl's journey is not dangerous and encompasses three dimensions. Meaningful become (1) descriptions of Polish landscapes, the beautiful, lyrical region of Mazowsze – full of lowlands and fields, (2) "mysterious and solemn forests", finally (3) menacing, rocky and uninhabited mountains. Stratification of space, that is the girl's journey from region to region, called by Cieślikowski "circles of various fairy tales, landscapes of another fairy tale", which we could even call "circles of initiation". Characteristically for child readers, the circles are set along the line: from the circle of "near home" towards "the wide world" up to the circle ruled entirely by fantasy and imagination, that is to a place where "mountains reach up to heaven (God)".

Moreover, Mary's strength and endurance naturally derive from her orphanage, while God and nature often show "signs of their special care or tokens of hope". (Paczowska 1995: 10) Cieślikowski claims that this wandering through various lands "is a journey throughout Poland (fields, forests and mountains constitute a

complete allegory of Poland), whose substitute is the Earth."
(Cieślikowski 1975: 63).

Mary's journey to visit Queen Tatra is presented in categories
of a fairy tale and a myth:

> Queen Tatra lives in a castle, she is mighty, beautiful, but above
> all – good ... her very name, her palace in the mountains, her
> descriptive and characterological interchangeability with perso-
> nified Spring presented in the first chapters of the fairy tale place
> her in the same semantic field as the Queen of the Polish Crown
> [Saint Mary]. And events from the moment Mary starts her
> journey to visit the Queen until the girl wakes up are recounted
> by a poet-narrator, who at the same time is the creator of the
> myth. (Ib. 63–64).

The intermediate link between the real world and the world of the
fairy tale is the motif of dream. The transportation of a character to
'a higher floor' – the fairy tale – through dream becomes one of
credible devices used in the tale of the Positivist writer, as dream
may account for supernatural phenomena in a realistic way (see
Nielsen – Paluszek from *The Wonderful Adventures of Nils*: 'turned
into a Dwarf, he is automatically transported to another dimension –
dream') (Cieślikowski 1963: 112).

In the opinion of Ewa Paczoska "In the world of widespread
orphanage in which the story of Mary, her geese, Skrobek and the
dwarves takes place, there can be seen various consequences and
aspects of abandonment." (Paczowska 1995: 10) Not all characters
realise that "a lesson on orphanage" is taking place (is being taught)
(ib.), e.g. peasant Skrobek, whose impoverished, abandoned farm is
situated in a forest, cannot come into contact with nature or
understand it and does not understand his long neglected, fallow
land, which can give him an identity and free his creative powers.
Skrobek is helpless and admits that even dwarves, "a symbol of
continuity of tradition" (ib. 11), leave his cottage. Mary takes a
"more constructive" and paradoxical view of her orphanage: despite
abandonment and loneliness, remembering her childhood, mother
and family home, she still endeavours to regain what she has lost,

she anticipates the miracle of returning or meeting ... and dreams about returning to a paradise lost, living the myth in her daily life, being in touch with her dead mother, who comes to her in dream ... she believes that she is in God's special care ... she reads the rhythms of nature as the person best suited to participate in the rituals of life and open for the miracle of resurrection or rebirth. (Ib. 10)

And the miracle happens: Queen Tatra, who lives as if in a pastoral world: "clouds graze like flocks of sheep", creates (reconstructs) Mary's flock of geese. Her pastoral, good world is saved. (Ib. 11) The *topos* of a good shepherd and guardian constitutes a clear reference to the Bible. At the end of the tale King Błystek himself invokes this theme once again in the Biblical style, calling the orphan "a helpless lamb" or "a nestless dove". (Ib.) The thread of Skrobek also refers the reader to the Bible; it constitutes a clear reference to the image of Biblical Job, as through suffering and ordeals the man ultimately discovers the sense of life: farming and family.

Finally, Mary has a true home, becoming Skrobek's adopted daughter, and tidies up his cottage. The tidying up of the cottage has a symbolic meaning here: the girl brings harmony into the peasant's life, "restores all things to order, domesticates them". (Ib. 12) Home acquires here an obvious meaning: that of a happy childhood, family, security and continuity, a centre of a new life. We are referring here to research done by Mircea Eliade and his concept of home as the space of *sacrum* where orphans take shelter (Eliade 1993). Dwarves wandering through the world also dream of a real home – once it is a magnate's manor, then again a nobleman's mansion. Both images refer to the Sarmatian (noble) concept of Polish home, which in this context may be associated with emigrants' Romantic dreams of returning to their native country (Kopaliński 1990: 69).

The above-mentioned themes (e.g. the particular contact of man with nature, the motif of the shepherd, the *topos* of home, God's special care, the symbolism of journey and space recognised in that journey) strongly sustain the level of interpretation of both Romantic and Modernist traditions.

The Modernist dimension also involves a type of mythological fairy tale: the rhythm of the seasons of the year (in autumn dwarves terminate their earthly activity to re-appear in spring), the ritual of farming (Skrobek ploughs, sows and harvests crops in accordance with the rhythm of nature), the rituals and gestures connected with behaviour, e.g. children at work (the song and poetry level), blessing of sleeping children, homestead, human labour, even – interestingly – the national myth of dwarves and their role in Polish history.

While interpreting Konopnicka's fairy tale in *Młodopolska lekcja fantazji (The Modernist Lesson of Fancy)*, G. Leszczyński also makes a valid remark about the Modernist style of construction of a literary work – syncretism of genres and conventions and Bakhtin's narrative polyphony (Konopnicka's narrator is an epic realist, a poet and a country spinner of yarns). (Bachtin 1970) In Konopnicka's tale there are different levels of narration (and different literary genres), e.g. lyrical (the children's songs and the poetic portrayal of protagonist Mary), epic – from the Positivist novel (the social issues in the countryside of the second half of the 19th century, social stratification, the ethical dimension of work), the fairy tale and the folk tale (passages about Queen Tatra and the world of the dwarves), the fable (the episode with the rat family, the story of frog – singer Półpanek), or the tendentious novel. This generic syncretism corresponds to the syncretism of conventions: realism, fantasy and poetry (at the Positivist, Romantic and Modernist levels) and narrative polyphony. The narrator responsible for epic layers is an omniscient narrator – auctorial – Positivist realist (recounting the story of Mary Kukulanka and peasant Skrobek, he is well oriented in the countryside issues), whereas fantasy passages are narrated by a Modernist storyteller and a folk storyteller. Both (Modernist and folk) narrators are omniscient but passages belonging to the level of fantasy are narrated with a particular emotional involvement, with emphasis on changes in the mood, with the use of symbols, with myth creation (e.g. passages about Queen Tatra or the world of the dwarves), with some poeticised passages, which thus transforms them or unifies them into the character of a Modernist poet.

Undoubtedly, modernist is also the motif of the peasant, his great transformation, "his mission and heroism of farming [which] is

treated in a symbolic way". (Cieślikowski 1963:110) And the Modernist dimension of orphanage acquires here the status of a symbol – transformation. With the intervention of supernatural powers (queen Tatra "creates" a new flock of geese for Mary while the dwarves discreetly "impart" strength to the peasant, who willingly starts working and grubs out the fallow land), the tale gradually changes from an epic narration into a fairy tale, the presentation of the world becomes lyrical, the narrator – the folk storyteller changes into a Modernist poet and begins to dominate the omniscient narrator. The Modernist narrator poeticises the final, conclusive passages of the tale, endowing them with a special atmosphere, deep feelings and sentiment. Skrobek's cottage is filled with joy and optimism, orphan Mary finds a truer, real home and family, and the dwarves – having fulfilled their mission on earth – can return underground again.

5. Conclusion – epilogue. About the dwarves that gave sense to orphanage

Already the title of the work clearly introduces two motifs: those of dwarves and the orphan. The motif unifying the three levels of the tale – Romantic, Positivist and Modernist – is that of dwarves, deriving from the Germanic prototype. They constitute the distinctive motif in the tale, they are 'the driving force behind all that happened here.' The motif of the orphan appears at the song and poetry level whereas the theme of dwarves is presented in the tale in the fantastic – demonic dimension.

Jerzy Cieślikowski, a renowned expert in Polish literature for children and folklore, writes that the first illustration of the dwarves – the German *Bergmännchen* (little miners with long hooded aprons, lanterns and pickaxes) – reached Poland through publisher Arct. While trying to "polonise" some books for children, he became interested in Konopnicka's works and gave her the drawings of the dwarves, suggesting that she should write the text. The scholar distinguishes two "sub-groups" of dwarves: pygmies (i.e. creatures who live independently of people) and the household

gods: Roman Lares and Penates (that is creatures closely connected with people's lives, their families and homes). (Cieślikowski 1975: 115) The household gods in Poland were called *ubożęta* (meaning God's servants and poor people) or *lutki* (meaning little people or in Czech – puppets) (Brükner 1924: 114) and offered discreet help in the homestead (cf. the Danish Dwarf *spiritus familiaris* in the Scandinavian mythology). In Poland the 19th century and its interest in folklore produces quite a few "documents" concerning dwarves, e.g. in 1861 Klepaczewski writes that the name "dwarves" is associated with the red colour, since dwarves wore red: "they usually inhabit bread ovens, stove-corners and inglenooks. They are creatures with huge heads, very little in size, stocky in built and ugly, with flat faces, with coarse and dishevelled hair". (Kolberg, 22)

Quoting research done by Swiss folklorist Anhorn in his work *Magiologia*, Cieślikowski claims that one could already talk of some "systematisation of the genre" in German demonology:

> household spirits, which can be heard on dark nights, move furniture, run up and down the stairs, slam doors, light a fire, but also bring water and wood, prepare meals in the kitchen, yet on the next day not a trace of their nocturnal frolics can be found. (Anhorn 1674)

or "Polish gnomes are guests with an enormous appetite. They must be scrupulously served the same meals that are eaten by people." (Tharsander 1735: 408)

In Konopnicka's fairy tale the dwarf characters are similar. Undoubtedly, they belong to the category of household gods but in fact are a combination of several types. The most obvious characteristic of the dwarf is his little size and domestication (the Scandinavian type). Podziomek rides a cat (in Anglo-Saxon demonology elves ride horses) and flies a stork, which justifies the comparison to birds' behaviour. Cieślikowski claims that their "vegetative lifestyle [dwarves sleep through the winter underground] incorporates birds' joy and birds' anxiety". (Cieślikowski 1975: 119) Peasant Skrobek remembers them from his childhood and talks about them in positive terms, as when they made their presence felt: "all good thrived and

the farm prospered". (Ib. 120) A significant place in the tale is occupied by the thread of Koszałek-Opałek writing his chronicle. The character of a dwarf historian, a great scientist, who recounts Poland's past and its subjugation (national orphanage) and gathers information about the contemporary world, is innovative and original. This character reinforces the Positivist level of reception of the work. By reconstructing the tale from the chronicle, Koszałek-Opałek creates a "scientific" (pseudo-scientific) Romantic vision of history (taking into account the role of the people) and by teaching children he thus highlights the didactic aspect of the stories told. The world of the dwarves is colourful and interesting, the dynamic presentation of the adventures of the gnomes resembles the thriller convention (abduction, exchange, wandering), the dwarf portraits are profound and psychologically interesting, the emphasis is clearly put on the thread of Koszałek-Opałek – dwarf – historian – educator – teacher and passages in which the dwarves help people (mainly lonely orphans). With all these elements of "the dwarf world pre-sented" the poet creates "a national myth about Dwarves". (Ib.) Cieślikowski proposes the following interpretation:

> Christianity brought about degradation and degeneration of Dwarves. ... in order to reconcile pagan and Christian myths in her fairy tale for children, Konopnicka had to endow her dwarves with the qualities of good, though miserable demons. Due to this, the reader's sympathy is divided between *Bożęta* and angels. (Ib. 120)

Two among the dwarves are personified (Koszałek-Opałek and Podziomek) and, similarly to people, undergo psychological meta-morphoses. Chronicler Koszałek-Opałek realises that writing a real chronicle is a difficult, complex undertaking and requires thorough preparation (please take note that his volume burns and he himself stays with people on earth), whereas glutton Podziomek, the "changeling" from the cottage, when he really feels hungry – like country children – grows more sensitive to the afflictions and orphanage of others.

MICHUŁKA

To sum up, Konopnicka's fairy tale is an excellent illustration of the history of Polish culture and has a broad cultural context for Polish readers. The author of the tale about orphanage "synthesises Polish myths of condition and space" (also the space of identity), which become meaningful in "the orphaned world" of Poles only "thanks to the recognition of the boundaries of abandonment and care", and in this context it is the orphan who understands it best. As a particularly popular theme in Polish literature for children, orphanage survived three ages (Romanticism, Positivism and Modernism) and thanks to the fairy tale about dwarves and orphan girl Mary it has also acquired a patriotic character and has developed into a national myth.

References

Anhorn 1674. *Magiologia. Christliche warnung für den Aberglauben und Zauberei.* Basel.

Bachtin, M. 1970. *Problemy poetyki Dostojewskiego.* Trans. N. Modzelewska. Warsaw: PIW.

Brückner, A. 1924. *Mitologia polska.* Warsaw.

Baluch, A. 1993. *Archetypy literatury dziecięcej.* Wrocław: Bagiński i synowie.

Cirlot, J. E. 2000. *Słownik symboli*, Cracow: Uniwersytet Jagielloński.

Cieślikowski, J. 1963. *Baśń Konopnickiej 'O krasnoludkach i sierotce Marysi'* in 'Pamiętnik Literacki'. Vol.1

Cieślikowski, J. 1975. *Baśń synkretyczna* in   *Literatura i podkultura dziecięca.* Wrocław: Uniwersytet Wrocławski.

Cieślikowski, J. 1979. *Topos dziecka i dzieciństwa,* Zakrzewski B. (ed.). 'Prace literackie' 20. Wrocław: Uniwersytet Wrocławski.

Eliade, M. 1993. *Sacrum, mit, historia. Wybór esejów.* M. Czerwiński (ed.). A. Tatarkiewicz (tł.). Warszawa: PIW.

Ichnatowicz, E. 1997. *Zabawki Marysi* in *O krasnoludkach i   sierotce Marysi Marii Konopnickiej.* Suwałki.

Janion, M. 1972. *Wiersze sieroce Lenartowicza.* 'Pamiętnik Literacki'. Vol. 4.

Jonca, M. 1994. *Sierota w literaturze polskiej dla dzieci w XIX wieku.* Wrocław: Uniwersytet Wrocławski.

Kolberg, O. *Lud* , Series XV: *W. Ks. Poznańskie.* Vol. 2. Cracow.

Kolbuszewski, J. 1995. *Tatry. Literacka tradycja motywu Tatr*. Cracow: Uniwersytet Jagielloński.

Konopnicka, M. 1954. *O krasnoludkach i sierotce Marysi*, Warsaw: Agencja Wydawnicza.

Konopnicka, M. 1990. *O krasnoludkach i sierotce Marysi*, Bydgoszcz: Nasza Księgarnia.

Konopnicka, M. 1988. *O krasnoludkach i sierotce Marysi*, in M. Konopnicka, *Pisma wybrane (Selected Works)* Vol.3.,
Utwory dla dzieci (Works for children). J.Nowakowski (ed.). J.Z. Białek (introduction). Warsaw: PIW.

Konopnicka, M. 1957. *O krasnoludkach i sierotce Marysi*, Warsaw: Nasza Księgarnia.

Kopaliński, W. 1990. *Słownik symboli*, Warsaw: PIW.

Leszczyński, G. 1990. *Młodopolska lekcja fantazji*. Warsaw: Uniwersytet Warszawski.

Ługowska, J. 1999. The literary explication of T. Lenartowicz's poem *Złoty kubek* in *Lekcje czytania. Eksplikacje literackie.* Vol. 2. A. Wit – Labuda and W. Dynak (ed.). Wrocław: Uniwersytet Wrocławski.

Ługowska, J. 1997. Ludowe formy narracyjne w baśni Marii Konopnickiej 'O krasnoludkach i sierotce Marysi'. – *O krasnoludkach i sierotce Marysi Marii Konopnickiej*. Suwałki.

Paczowska, E. 1995. *Marysia i osieroceni. M. Konopnicka. 'O krasnoludkach i sierotce Marysi. – Sto lat baśni polskiej*. G. Leszczyński (ed.) Warsaw: Uniwersytet Warszawski.

Tharsander, L. 1735. *Schauplatz vieler ungereimten Meinungen und Erzählungen*. Berlin.

Modern Tales of Knight Errantry: John Buchan and Chivalry

The present article proposes to address the problematic of genre of John Buchan's adventure stories which are usually classed as spy fiction, historical romances and an occasional Bildungsroman. I would argue that there is a broad generic term to encompass them all, as to a smaller or greater degree they all can be classed as romances of modern knight errantry. Deeply rooted in the Victorian cult of chivalry, chivalric elements and motifs abound in Buchan's novels and short stories. Traditionally masked by other concerns which have attracted researchers who have tended to label the Buchan oeuvre rather narrowly as spy fiction, with some half-hearted attempts at realism and a rather unfortunate entanglement in Ruritania, plus a handful of old-fashioned historical romances, a consistent reading of all his books, I would argue, would locate them, for all their modern concerns, firmly in the tradition of Victorian chivalry which appropriated and reworked the ideas of medieval chivalry to answer contemporary needs. Buchan's generation, as the two preceding ones, had been raised in the spirit of chivalry to which many Victorian thinkers had contributed. Thus we can find in Buchan's works beside the Ruskinian close observation of nature a strong doze of Carlylean chivalry of work, Tennyson's *Idylls* reinterpreted, chivalry in the guise of imperial paternalism and Victorian courtly love. For reasons of space, I have chosen to concentrate mostly on Tennysonian echoes at the expense of other, equally interesting themes related to chivalry in Buchan's works.

The broad generic term for Buchan's books could be modern romance. They are more than adventure stories, containing elements of chivalric romance, boys' adventure story, colonial romance, spy fiction, invasion scare story, Bildungsroman, a touch of Ruritanian romance, visionary romance, mystical romance, meditative romance, the novel of ideas and the Condition of England novel. There is also

a large dose of romantic escapism in the otherwise closely observed realism of his books which allows the classification romances of truancy suggested by C. Baldick (2005: 213), for they are mostly narratives of holiday escapade or exotic truancy when for a brief period of time the hero escapes from the routine of everyday reality into a world of romantic adventure. Differently from the purely fabulous visionary or mystical romances, these are modest romances of the semi-realistic kind where the action verges on the probable and the world the protagonist inhabits is recognizably our own.

The immediate predecessor of romances of this kind in the English canon would be the picaresque novel in its eighteenth and nineteenth-century guises. The ultimate source, however, from which all other modifications spring would be the medieval romance of knight errantry. This is nowhere more evident than in their structure. Similarly to the medieval tale of a knight's adventuring, their essential formal medium is adventure. The medieval romance itself follows a clear pattern and addresses concerns already familiar from the folk tale. As W. R. J. Barron has shown (1987: 3–5), the central concerns of both are maturation through struggle, manifestation of one's independence from parental influence, self-realization, the establishment of a wider network of personal relationships than was available at home and closer integration with society through marriage and assumption of roles of public responsibility. The traditional form of such journeys of self-discovery has been the quest. Buchan's romances, both the historical and modern ones, have been seen as latter-day tales of George and the Dragon (Kemp et al 1997: 48) and indeed, one of the ways to approach them would be to treat them as modern romances of knight errantry. Below are delineated some aspects of such an analysis, selected to give an inkling of what can be found when looking at Buchan's novels with chivalry in mind.

Predictably, the then hugely popular *Idylls of the King* by Tennyson would have impacted Buchan's senses when growing up in a household which was steeped in poetry and song. Tennyson had defined for the mid-Victorian years the ethos of the modern gentleman as a moral crusader in his struggle against worldliness and contributed to updating courtly love as Victorian woman worship.

His presence can be strongly felt in Buchan's first novel *Sir Quixote of the Moors* (1895), the love triangle of which and the hero's predicament bringing strongly to mind Tennyson's *Idylls* and especially the quandary of Lancelot. Jean, Sieur de Rohaine's symbolic quest into the moral waste land of worldliness to find regeneration through love and self-denial which closely mirrors the Tennysonian battle between Sense and Soul is projected onto the landscape which sublimely mirrors the mental and emotional states of the hero. Jean, a man of honour who has lost his bearings in the untrammelled riot of the senses, embarks on a journey to regain his lost virtue and in his directionless wanderings in the Scottish Borders stumbles upon a household of Covenanters. This seemingly virtuous household, like King Arthur's in the *Idylls*, is seen to harbour a temptress and Jean makes his soul in battling his senses in a love triangle where his host Master Henry can be seen as bearing a close resemblance to King Arthur in his moral high-mindedness and his betrothed Anne being ascribed the role of Guinevere. Jean's predicament closely mirrors Lancelot's when Anne's future husband takes to the hills to avoid capture and entrusts Anne to Jean's care. Bound by a pledge to protect his lover, Jean is put in a difficult position by a word of honour which he finds increasingly difficult to keep when he falls in love with Anne who under his guidance has awakened to sensual pleasure. Anne's innocent awakening to the joys of worldliness also brings to mind Tennyson's Elaine whose awakening desire for Lancelot made her want to break out of the bounds of her domestic sphere. The desecration of the domestic sphere by lust was the great crime of Guinevere and Jean fears a similar fate as Anne's growing sensuality undermines his resolve to stay chaste. Adultery, if only in the mind, being a mortal sin, would harm Jean's prospects of salvation and as a true Victorian soldier of Christ he fights heroically to withstand Anne/Guinevere's lure very much like Lancelot in his lonely struggle to control his lust, Soul finally winning over Sense. Honour having been preserved, he leaves the 'fallen' Anne to her fate and rides off into the wilderness in great mental anguish.

Buchan returns to Arthurian echoes repeatedly in later books, notably in *Mr Standfast* (1919) where the pacifist Lancelot Wake is

made to enact his quest for meaning in the context of the First World War. Pitched into a contest with the famous Richard Hannay of *The Thirty-Nine Steps* fame for the hand of the latter's future wife, the love triangle highlights the legendary Lancelot's famous quandary of trying to reconcile the service of the state/Arthur/Hannay to his desire for Mary Lamington/Guinevere. Wake overcomes his momentary sensual weakness by attaining the 'rarefied', transcendental state reached by Sir Galahad in his quest for the Grail, his being the selfless service of his country. Galahad, so loved by the Victorians for his single-minded, virginal pursuit of the abstract ideal delineated by Tennyson in 'Sir Galahad', can be glimpsed also in other characters. Vernon Milburne in *The Dancing Floor* (1926), in his single-minded dedication to his quest and singular chastity amidst the hedonism of London in the 1920s is a ready example, as, incidentally, is his fiancé, the Anglo-Greek maiden Koré, who is on a quest to wash off the ancestral stigma of sexual depravity, bringing to mind Galahad's similar predicament vis-à-vis Lancelot. We can glimpse Galahad's shining presence even in the make-up of Buchan's more elevated, Luciferan villains, i.e. Medina in *The Three Hostages* (1924). In his fallen aspect Miltonian, in his elevated aspect he is Galahad-like in his ascetic, single-minded pursuit of a superhuman goal which is not of this world. Galahad readily gave up the world once he had attained his quest. Medina, who is described in the end as sustained by heavenly radiance alone, dreams of a similar fate.

After the blast of desire and anguish in his first novel, Buchan gradually shied away from experimenting with the treatment of naked lust, donning the cloak of modern courtly love, at first rather hesitantly, feeling his ground, and later with powerful conviction.

In *A Lost Lady of Old Years* (1899) which traces the moral regeneration of a born aristocrat whose ancestral nobility has been compromised by middle-class domesticity, the protagonist is awakened to the meaning of chivalry and virtue when he enters the service of the controversial Lady Murray whom Buchan has cast as a true lady of romance whose function is to guide the hero on his path of true self-knowledge. Francis Birkenshaw passes through all the stages of a questing knight in love and attains its highest and purest

form. The crucial element in courtly love would be the period of prolonged emotional turmoil which helps to suppress vice and enhance virtue. In this early book there are passages of startling sensuality which would be muted in later books. However, lust is firmly suppressed and sublimated into the refined *fin' amors* of the troubadour kind, the hero choosing self-imposed restraint and the non-consummation of the relationship not to taint his love and hold on to his recovered nobility of the soul.

The progress of the lover from the sensual to the spiritual appreciation of his loved one in the courtly love tradition is peaked by transcending earthly love to embrace an altogether more refined spirituality in dedicating oneself to the service of the Virgin Mary, the Queen of Heaven. This entails the realization that earthly love is a feeble substitute for a higher calling but a necessary stage in the recognition of the presence in one's life of such a mission neverthe-less. This is demonstrated eloquently in *Midwinter* (1922) where sensual love is a delusion which detracts the protagonist on his mission of state and brings utter ruin to his cause, his prince and himself in the context of the Jacobite uprising of 1745 in Scotland. The disillusion with the spirit of chivalry which had set in with the Great War is very noticeable here, especially in contrast with *A Lost Lady of Old Years* which deals with the events of the same year. Alastair Maclean's quest into England to enlist support for Bonnie Prince Charlie's planned invasion in *Midwinter* is full of paradoxes and irony. He comes from a culture which is more archaic and chivalrous than England which has grown placid and pragmatic with commerce and refuses to stir to his calls to heroic action. Indivi-dualistic and calculating, the upper classes have exchanged the heroic spirit for fatted ease, while the labouring classes only desire peace, being indifferent to the claims of princes. Maclean has come to seduce England into rebellion but is seduced by England in turn, his mission aborted by the lure of England in the guise of love. This ephemeral lure of England is embodied by a Lady Norreys whose feeble misguided innocence could be read as a critique of the whole Victorian woman worship idea were she not treated with such a solemn authorial reverence. A pawn in the hands of an equally enfeebled yet evil husband, together they stand for the distortion of

the spirit of chivalry which has accompanied the rise of middle-class mercantilism. Ironically, while the upper classes have sold out to trade and financial speculation, the only truly chivalrous person Maclean can find in all England is a middle-class clerk whose gauche friendship has to serve as a substitute for the kind of intense sublimated passion which in the earlier book sustained the hero to his lonely end and despite the tragedy gave the book a moral uplift which is completely missing in *Midwinter*. Maclean regains his confidence and moral perspective the moment he rejoins his prince's forces in retreat to be present at the final defeat, having opted for service of the state over courtly love, the siren song of Lady Norreys quite forgotten.

The futility of the whole human ambition is the central topic of the *The Blanket of the Dark* (1931) where the high-born protagonist is lifted by a whim of fate out of complete obscurity and given a chance to attain aristocratic perfection and win great power, only to turn his back on it, seeking a nobler existence in the world of the spirit. The book traces Peter Pentecost's evolution as a soldier of Christ by pitching his moral struggles against the greater struggle between old and new faith in reformation England. He is made to stand for the commonalty of England and the religious and moral choices he makes establish him as the carrier of the true spirit of the land. His rite of passage also entails complete mastery of the code of chivalry which, fully attained, prevents him from participating in the self-seeking power games of the aristocracy with whom he becomes completely disillusioned. Raised by the people and having found true chivalry only among the lowest of the low, the beggars who are the real masters of the land, he chooses to make his life among them, having chosen soul's salvation above power and rank. *The Blanket of the Dark* offers also the most thorough treatment of courtly love in Buchan's oeuvre, the hero's progress being traced through all the stages of the sublimation of erotic desire into the love of the Blessed Virgin, the Queen of Heaven.

Peter, though a scholar, is a child of the woods. He is noble-born but unaware of his ancestry, having been raised in a cottage in the forest by his stepmother. He is the fictional younger son of the executed Duke of Buckingham, Henry VIII's rival, and has been

hidden in the depth of the woods by the servants of the family to conceal his identity. He is the last of the once mighty Bohuns, has royal blood in him and is thus a true contestant for the throne of England. This is the prize with which he is tempted out of anonymity. However, the ironies of his position are present from the start, for he is already king of all he surveys, only he does not realize it and has to make a bid for the crown to recognize the ephemerality of temporal power. The England over which he presides, which he actually *is*, is the elder England indifferent to kings and pretenders, governed by the endless cycle of the seasons. Natura Maligna and Natura Benigna which rule men's destiny are rendered in the book through the complex symbolism of the Painted Floor, a Roman mosaic depicting the four seasons and presided over by Nature herself. She can manifest herself in a number of ways and is the beginning and end of all journeys. Above all, she is a tender mother whose lap of a sanctuary Peter leaves to test his manly prowess in the world of men, to return, chastened, to her green embrace.

His struggle is for us an already familiar one. It is the Tenny-sonian battle of Sense with Soul and its chief concern is the refutation of the spirit of worldliness in all its beguiling forms. In this context Peter's relationship with Sabine is played out according to the canons of courtly love, both Tudor and Victorian.

Sabine's first manifestation on the Painted Floor, which marks Peter's sexual awakening, is a very Victorian temptress – the elf – her traditional power to bewitch and delude signalling the ephemerality of Peter's quest for love and power and his misguided notions of love. Her next, very Tudor considering the later period context of the worship of Elizabeth I the Virgin Queen as Cynthia/Diana, manifestation as Diana/Artemis highlights the dangers inherent in sexual pursuit, for the chaste temptress was known to wilfully destroy men. But in her Moon Goddess aspect, she is also Nature personified, youthful love with the potential of bearing fruit. Her white, virginal robes bring to mind the Virgin Mary and her symbolic abode, the chaste enclosed garden, the pure spirituality of which would be the fitting end of a journey of refinement of one's moral nature through courtly love.

Sabine's next manifestation as a voluptuous worldly Aphrodite, pure sexual allure without the spiritual dimension, is one of a series of tests on Peter's way to the renunciation of power and wealth and the sordid, mercantile aspect of this sex for a title deal alerts Peter to the dangers posed by such an alliance to the salvation of his soul. Besides, if he is to stand for the commonalty of England, the very spirit of the land, his sensual love for Sabine should be transformed into a love that would encompass the whole of God's creation. When he turns away resolutely from all forms of worldly temptation, including sensual, he is rewarded with a supremely poetic vision of the Mother of God, the Queen of Heaven. She appears to him in a howling snowstorm, reminiscent of Victorian canvases showing Sir Galahad battling the elements in the wilderness in search of the Grail. All through Peter's progress also another Grail knight has been hovering in the background – Percival/Parzival. His journey was that of humility, very similar to Peter's – from humble beginnings to a brief delusion of worldly glory and back again to humility, tempered by understanding and compassion.

The beatific vision and the understanding of divine purpose mark the end of the quest for self-knowledge for Edward Leithen in Buchan's last book *Sick Heart River* (1941). Like the pilgrim Dante at the end of *The Divine Comedy*, Leithen merges with his Creator and the creation in the supreme realisation of what completely selfless love means. Having cut his ties with his former, highly successful, life in England, he goes to the Canadian Arctic to die, but instead of fading fatalistically away, he, the former soldier, is metaphorically called to arms to strike a blow for life in saving the lowest of the low – a miserable little tribe of Indians on the point of extinction. Gladly giving up his life in exchange for theirs, he attains the high plateau of completely selfless love which is in essence divine. His Galahad-like quest into the wilderness comes to an end in a gaudy ramshackle chapel on an Indian reservation where he attains his Grail, his journey, crowned by the ultimate reward of coming face to face with God, in so many different ways bringing together all the different quests of Buchan's heroes in a fitting conclusion to a long literary career.

References

Baldick, C. (2004) 2005. *The Modern Movement. The Oxford English Literary History*. Vol. X/1910–1940. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Barron, W. R. J. 1987. *English Medieval Romance*. London: Longman.

Buchan, J. (1931) 1994. *The Blanket of the Dark*. Edinburgh: B & W Publishing.

– (1926) 1997. *The Dancing Floor*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

– (1899) 1995. *A Lost Lady of Old Years*. Edinburgh: B & W Publishing.

– (1927) 1999. *Midwinter. Edinburgh: B & W Publishing.*

– (1941) 1994. *Sick Heart River*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

– (1919) 1994. *Mr Standfast*. Ware: Wordsworth.

– (1895) n. d. *Sir Quixote of the Moors*. London: Robert Hayes, Ltd.

– (1924) 1995. *The Three Hostages*. Ware: Wordsworth.

Kemp, S.; Mitchell, C.; Trotter, D. 1997. *Edwardian Fiction. An Oxford Companion*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Tennyson, A. 1987. (2nd edition incorporating the Trinity College Manuscripts). *The Poems of Tennyson in Three Volumes*. Harlow: Longman.

The Victorian Gentleman Dandified: Aspects of Dandyism in Charles Dickens' Bleak House *and* A Tale of Two Cities

The concept of masculinity as a cultural historical construction cannot be seen as monolithic but rather as a synthesis of various, often contradictory, aspects. Victorian masculinity is often identified with certain formations of the masculine, for example, muscular Christianity or bourgeois paternalism, which have contributed to the understanding of the concept of the Victorian gentleman. Such stereotypes dominated by Thomas Carlyle's ascetic heroism as the epitome of Victorian manhood are associated with a rather limited set of images. Yet the discussion of Victorian manhood only in terms of rigorous self-discipline, self-restraint and simple dignity might lead us to sweeping generalizations about the notion itself. The complexity of the "Condition of Manliness question" in the nine-teenth century suggests a multiform entity of Victorian masculinity, which is particularly noticeable when analysed in the context of its Regency legacy. At the beginning of the Victorian age the Regency dandy, the prevailing standard of manhood in the first decades of the century, was not just replaced by its antithesis, the earnest Victorian gentleman, but continued to shape the new ideal throughout the century. How Victorians perceived their masculinity reflects the influence of the Regency in many ways and what dandyism bestowed upon the concept of Victorian manhood should thus in no way be overlooked. The present article attempts to elucidate this issue in the light of the novels *Bleak House* and *A Tale of Two Cities* by Charles Dickens, who, as a disciple of Carlyle, addressed the most compelling concerns of the time, including the condition of manliness question.

By the beginning of the 19th century, the idea of the gentleman began to open up in contradictory ways. The old aristocratic values were subjected to a new interpretation and the notion of gentleman-

liness was expanding in different directions: money, fashion and manners were added to the initial tests of birth and land (Castronovo 1987: 45). The Regency era had given birth to a new type of gentleman known as a dandy. They were modern trend-setters who used their personae to exert influence on high society. Just as clearly as their clothes, the sang-froid, acerbic wit, and nonchalance of such highly admired dandies became signifiers of the gentleman. In the light of turbulent political events on the continent and ideas of romanticism, for many, "dandyism marked the death of kings, and the dawn of modern concepts of self" (Kelly 2005: 469). The dandy is very much responsible for the image of the Regency period and the influence of the phenomenon extended over the whole century. The manner, rhetoric, well-cut suit, and stoicism have remained recognisable gentlemanly characteristics in English fiction, life and masculine aspiration (ib.). As the century progressed, the dandies' pose and elements of their "sartorial style became signifiers of complex, intriguing and heroic modern masculinity" (ib. 470) and the legacy of dandyism can thus be seen as a major contributor to the formation of Victorian manliness.

The 1830s can be seen as a turning point in British history in many ways. The decade saw the close of the dissolute Regency era and the beginning of a new age that in addition to high hopes brought along a plethora of uncertainties and doubts. The rapidly changing industrial society required a re-evaluation of old conventions and reconfiguration of the idea of self. Thus in a world transformed by industrialization and the growing influence of the middle classes, Victorian writers and intellectuals also felt the need to redefine the notion of manliness. From the 1830s onward, the middle-class professional men, as their position gained more ground in society, felt the need to adjust themselves to the altered situation. Such men attempted to legitimize modern masculinity by creating a new concept of the gentleman, the epitome of manhood, which is largely based on Carlyle's ruminations on the subject, but not yet entirely devoid of the influences of the Regency.

Carlyle was very much a man of his times who was haunted by the uncertainties of the age and questions about the necessity of changes that his contemporaries had to undergo. Owing to the

influence of Evangelicalism, industrialism and pervasive market economy, the stereotype of the Regency dandy-gentleman seemed anachronistic, a grotesque and self-absorbed icon. Therefore the foundations of the new concept of the gentleman were designed to contrast with the out-of-date ideal. Carlyle's works *Sartor Resartus* (1833–34), *On Heroes and Hero Worship* (1841), and *Past and Present* (1843) became central texts in the debate on manliness and exerted a considerable influence on the intellectual climate of the whole nineteenth century. The effect of these works lies partly in their power to mythologize the ideal of manhood, contributing thus to the foundation myth of the Victorian gentleman. For example, in *Past and Present* Carlyle is intent on using the metaphors of the Middle Ages and monasticism, which seem to serve as a stabilizing force in the disrupted industrial modern age. According to Carlyle, superhuman efforts should be made to apply the innate male energy to hard work, self-composure, dignity, and ensuring order in the community just as Abbot Samson does, proceeding "with cautious energy to set about reforming their [his new subjects] disjointed distracted way of life" (1965: 93). Like the monk in *Past and Present*, the gentleman, or the ideal man of the era was also to be subjected to self-discipline in order to maintain order, which in Carlyle's writings almost parallels with religious asceticism. It was complete self-mastering that was to help a man control himself and his innate energy and which was to help channel this energy into productive labour. To yield to idleness and ease was incompatible with the ideal. In addition, a man had to be earnest in his deeds. The fabled Victorian earnestness, the concept in which the Evangelical influence is best seen, had to accompany every true gentleman's honest speech and action. A man was known for his bearing and manners, and to be passed for a gentleman one had to display qualities characteristic of the ideal.

To be regarded as a gentleman depended on people's judgement. The Carlylean hero, though, had to be totally indifferent to the public gaze. The Carlylean ideal is self-forgetful, oblivious to the outer world, thoroughly devoted to his labour and maintaining self-control. According to Carlyle (1831: para. 10), extinction of self-consciousness was to help a man control his energies, without which there

would be no integrity. Therefore, according to this ideal, the identity of such a man is not socially mediated, but is established solely by the man's heroic autonomy. Nevertheless, in his essay "Characteristics" Carlyle concedes that an ideal is an impossible state of being, "yet ever the goal towards which our actual state of being strives; which it is the more perfect the nearer it can approach" (ib. para. 11) and comments that "it is in Society that man first feels what he is; first becomes what he can be" (ib. para. 14). Thus identity is always related to socially mediated self-fashioning since there is always an audience to whom a man must present himself, and therefore a man cannot be freed from conscious self-modelling. Such anxiety of self-presentation among middle-class men at the time of social ascendancy was particularly evident.

Adams (1995: 11) emphasises that the element of theatricality is part of all masculine self-fashioning, which inevitably makes an appeal to an audience. A conscious and showy self-presentation was also inseparable from dandyism, and as such it was seen by Victorians as ostentatious and grotesque, and therefore unacceptable. Carlyle, while expressing utter contempt for such an extravagant, consciously created public image of dandies, is acutely aware of the importance of self-display. The modern type of gentleman, often originating from the middle-classes, had to make himself visible by showing his worthiness with the right behaviour and deportment in order to be regarded as a gentleman. Of course, such self-conscious presentation of one's persona could not betray any sign of effort, because a perfect gentleman is never aware that he is one. Composure and nonchalance had to come naturally; a man could not be a gentleman if he strove too hard. The same applied to dandies whose ultimate aim was to be at the centre of attention and for whom the most trivial social actions had to be performed with ease even if took ages to achieve perfection (Sirkel 2010: 66). To be regarded as a dandy took both money and effort, but one had to convey the impression that everything was done nonchalantly.

Carlyle seems to support the principle that without public acknowledgement and respect the ascetic containment of innate energy and dedication to work have no power to improve society. However, what Carlyle disdained most was the theatricality which

accompanied dandies' appearance in public. In *Sartor Resartus* Carlyle states that all that a dandy asks is "simply the glance of your eyes" (1999: 208). The dandy needs attention for his existence since his whole nature is subjugated to the desire of being noticed, admired and envied. A dandy makes a spectacle of his life, a theatrical that bears little resemblance to reality. For Carlyle, the dandy is a fake, a preposterous but an enduring legacy of the aristocratic age. Yet the dandyism that Carlyle so savagely attacks is not just the symbolic antithesis of the new ideal, but a reflection of reality that Carlyle seems to be disturbed by. Adams (1995: 22) suggests that the dandy "haunts the Carlylean hero less as an emblem of moral indolence or economic parasitism than as an image of the hero as spectacle, which arrestingly embodies a problematic of audience and authority – and hence masculinity." Carlyle is aware of the influence of dandyism on a man's self-modelling, even if all the excesses that are characteristic of dandyism are removed.

Charles Dickens, like many of his contemporary intellectuals, also felt the necessity to draw attention to the condition of manliness question. He had avidly read the writings penned by Carlyle and his great admiration for the Victorian sage is mirrored in the ideas that permeate his novels. The reason for such a great influence is considered to be mainly Carlyle's ability to disturb and stir the early Victorians, and, as Sanders (2003: 95) has said, it was "Carlyle who seemed to have identified the nature of their restlessness and who had put his finger on the racing pulse of the age". Like Carlyle, Dickens developed an aversion to Utilitarianism, Radicalism and the do-nothing aristocracy (ib. 96). Dickens responded to many of the problems addressed by Carlyle and believed vehemently in the importance of work and earnestness, which would help a man manage unpropitious circumstances.

The paradoxical aspects of Victorian masculinity arising from the problematic of self-presentation and the public image also come to the fore in Dickens' novels. Like Carlyle, Dickens perceived the novelty and special nature of the new era; the gap between the past and the Victorian present required a redefinition of several concepts, including the notion of masculinity. In his youth, Dickens had been desperate to be recognized as a gentleman. He was known to have

been an admirer of eminent dandies of the time and obviously took example of their clothing and manners alike. The young Dickens sought approval and recognition from the high society men-about-town and was well aware of the importance of being treated by them as an equal. Careful self-fashioning according to the standards of the elitist circles dominated by dandies was a *sine qua non* for public success. To be passed for a gentleman, one had to meet certain requirements. The fact that Dickens admired the ability to make an impression by one's reserved, elegantly condescending attitude and impeccable style and taste could be explained by the mesmeric effect Count d'Orsay had on the aspiring young man (Foulkes 2004: 279). Dickens seems to have consciously imitated d'Orsay, a naturalized French aristocrat in England and the successor of the foremost dandy Beau Brummell. Even Carlyle once described young Dickens as "dressed à la d'Orsay rather than well" in one of his letters to his brother (ib.), which suggests that the greatest of Victorian scribes inclined to be a more dandylike figure in his youth than might be expected from a future promoter of Carlyle's ideas. Although clothing was not a sure mark of gentility in the nineteenth century, it was definitely one of the factors that tended to set gentlemen apart from non-gentlemen (Castronovo 1987: 95). The gentleman was the man in a well-cut suit made from broadcloth, and not the man wearing a tasteless brocade coat of the previous century. This aspect also proves that the term "gentleman" was not restricted to aristo-crats in showy outfits, but had a broader sense which was reflected in men's clothing. To be regarded as a gentleman, a man, whether an aristocrat or not, had to dress accordingly. The new style at the beginning of the nineteenth century was best represented by the quintessential dandy George Beau Brummell, who became a self-styled arbiter of taste whose opinion counted more than anybody else's. The legacy of Brummell is well expressed by the popular Victorian writer Bulwer-Lytton: "Dress so that it may never be said of you, "What a well-dressed man!" – but "What a gentlemanlylike man!"" (ib. 96). For Brummell, to be no longer a dandy was to cease to be a gentleman; to cease to be a gentleman was to cease to be a man (ib. 94).

Despite Dickens' admiration for d'Orsay and his dandiacal appearance, he later distanced himself from the idleness and excessive aestheticism of the Regency beaus and the term "dandyism" acquired a pejorative connotation in his writings. For Dickens, the biggest divide between the past and present consisted in different conceptions of the importance of work. The aristocratic idleness was incompatible with the suggested new male ideal and Dickens became a vociferous critic of the "insolent Donothingism" (Carlyle 1965: 156), the concept which was not in accordance with the Carlylean work ethic. The construction of the new ideal in the Victorian period was still threatened by the legacy of Regency dandyism, which for many presented a standardised mental picture of what a gentleman should be like. The idea of dissolute, idle dandyism was still prevalent, preventing the new concept of gentlemanliness from taking hold of people's minds. This aspect of dandyism is especially explicit in Charles Dickens's novel *Bleak House*, where it is embodied, first of all, by Harold Skimpole and Old Mr Turveydrop. This kind of dandyism reflects according to Dickens the contemptible relic of the past, the antithesis of the true Victorian gentleman still holding sway of the new, redefined concept of manhood. But in addition to that, Dickens makes a bitter attack on all sorts of dandyisms in different walks of life. For Dickens, dandyism in the first place came to stand for all the ludicrous peculiarities and vices that famous dandies were notorious for and the word "dandyism" acquires a much wider meaning: for Dickens there was dandyism in politics and social issues in general, which manifested itself in a country divided exclusively between "do-nothing" dandies and drudges who did all the work; there was religious dandyism, the term Dickens used to ridicule the people who had fallen under the spell of Tractarianism (Roberts 2001: xxv-vi), and obviously enough, there was Regency dandyism, a relic from the past with its deleterious effect on the new masculinity. Dandyism, according to Dickens is thus present in all walks of life and it cannot be ignored.

The caricature of the dandy as presented by Mr Turveydrop serves as a cliché of the days of the Prince Regent, who, by combining the eighteenth century aristocratic pompousness with Brummell-like haughty elegance, had taken the concept of dandyism

to the extremes of ridiculousness, solipsism, and idleness. Such a stereotype poses a stark contrast to Carlyle's preaching of what a true gentleman should be like and reflects Dickens' own view of the excesses of the Regency dandy. Mr Turveydrop, the master of Mr Turveydrop dancing school, is the most grotesque figure of all the male characters in *Bleak House*. He is Regency dandyism incarnate, and as such he is entirely anachronistic in the Victorian context. The superannuated dandy lives to be admired as a paragon of excellence, a status which legitimises his gallant bullying of other people, particularly his son and his daughter-in-law. In the chapter titled "Deportment" Old Mr Turveydrop is first introduced to the reader by Caddy as "a very gentlemanly man indeed – very gentlemanly" (Dickens 2001: 161), a description which has been made intentionally misleading by the emphatic repetition. Caddy continues to characterize the gentleman in question by focussing on his bearing, which should set him apart from the rest of men: "He is celebrated, almost everywhere, by his Deportment. /.../ But his Deportment is beautiful." (ib. 162). As it turns out, Old Mr Turveydrop emerges as a preposterous icon from the past rather than a "very gentlemanly man" in Victorian terms:

> He was a fat old gentleman with a false complexion, false teeth, false whiskers, and a wig. He had a fur collar, and he had a padded breast to his coat, which only wanted a star or a broad blue ribbon to be complete. He was pinched in, and swelled out, and got up, and strapped down, as much as he could possibly bear. He had such a neckcloth on (puffing his very eyes out of their natural shape), and his chin and even his ears so sunk into it, that it seemed as though he must inevitably double up, if it were cast loose /.../ He had a cane, he had an eye-glass, he had a snuff-box, he had rings, he had wristbands, he had everything but any touch of nature; he was not like youth, he was not like age, he was not like anything in the world but a model of Deportment. (Ib. 164)

In Dickens' portrayal the similarity between Old Mr Turveydrop and the Prince Regent, later King George IV, is unambiguous. The George IV's counterpart in the book refers to the dubious notion of

the gentleman which was sustained by the monarch himself. The Prince Regent was very much responsible for extending the meaning of the concept of the gentleman both in terms of the man's social background and the standards of conduct. Before he became the Regent, he had made himself notorious for countless scandals, gaining a reputation of a gambler, spendthrift, a promiscuous and idle rake. But Murray (1999: 2) claims that he was also a man of enormous charm, taste, intelligence, and impeccable manners who deservedly earned the title "The First Gentleman of Europe". The Regent's influence on the notion of gentlemanliness was obvious and he had set an example to be followed by many, including the likes of Mr Turveydrop.

Old Mr Turveydrop appears on the pages of *Bleak House* as a reincarnation of the royal dandy, only wanting "a star or a broad blue ribbon to be complete". Mr Turveydrop pushes the dandiacal appearance to the extreme, which is also reminiscent of George IV. He does not belong to the ranks of aristocracy and has no legitimate reason for remaining idle. While his son Prince, named after none other than his great idol, was toiling away as a dancing master, "his distinguished father did nothing whatever, but stand before the fire, a model of Deportment." (Dickens 2001: 164). Old Mr Turveydrop has

> worked his wife to death /.../ to maintain him in those expenses which were indispensable for his position. At once to exhibit his Deportment to the best models, and to keep the best models constantly before himself, he had found it necessary to frequent all public places of fashionable and lounging resort; to be seen at Brighton and elsewhere at fashionable times; and to lead an idle life in the very best clothes /.../ The son, inheriting his mother's belief, and having the Deportment always before him, had lived and grown in the same faith, and now, at thirty years of age, worked for his father twelve hours a day, and looked up to him with veneration on the old imaginary pinnacle. (Ib. 166)

It is not just the idleness of the Carlylean unworkers that Dickens despises most, but the fact that dandyism is responsible for making gentlemanliness synonymous with Donothingism, a theatrical pose and self-admiration. Old Mr Turveydrop's idea of what it takes to be

a gentleman is exactly opposite to that of Dickens. He mourns for the past, firmly believing that the race of gentlemen is becoming extinct:

> England – alas, my country! – has degenerated very much, and is degenerating every day. She has not many gentlemen left. We are few. I see nothing to succeed us, but a race of weavers /.../ we are not what we used to be in point of Deportment /.../ A levelling age is not favourable to Deportment. It develops vulgarity. (Ib. 167)

Mr Harold Skimpole in *Bleak House* can also be seen as an example of premeditated theatrical self-presentation, but without the grotesque excesses demonstrated by Mr Turveydrop. Readers are given a portrait of Skimpole as a "perfect child", completely innocent of the ways of the world, a stance that he seems to be proud of. Carlyle had praised earnestness and straightforwardness as the basis of the integrity of the self and any hidden agenda would tear down the meticulously constructed edifice of the ideal. Skimpole turns out to be a sheer hypocrite in constructing an image of an unworldliwise man who needs to be sustained by others. Like Turveydrop, Skimpole never condescends to care about the ones to be cared for, his neglect of his family is spectacular and does not proceed from his naïveté in financial matters, but from his egotistic ambition to get through life with as little effort and as comfortably as possible: "Here am I, content to receive things childishly, as they fall out: and I never take trouble!" (ib. 218).

Skimpole also represents the so-called intellectual dandyism – the reluctance to take seriously the issues that shocked society at large. He is the kind of gentleman who has "agreed to put a smooth glaze on the world, and to keep down all its realities. From whom everything must be languid and pretty /.../ Who are to rejoice at nothing, and be sorry for nothing." (Dickens 2001: 137). His solipsistic unconcern about the world is conveyed with his offhand remarks about such serious issues as slavery and poverty. Skimpole lacks any principles except for the one that is carefully hidden: hypocrisy about his intentions. To Mr Boythorn's question whether there is such a thing as principle, Skimpole says he has no idea:

"Upon my life I have not the least idea! I don't know what it is you call by that name, or where it is, or who possesses it /.../ I know nothing about it, I assure you; for I am a mere child" (ibid.: 219).

The gap between the deeply ingrained image of an idle, self-obsessed dandy and that of the earnest and reserved Victorian gentleman is vividly portrayed by Harold Skimpole and Mr Turveydrop. Although these two colourful characters embody different sides of do-nothing dandyism, they both pose a threat to society with their irresponsible insouciance about the people around them. The Donothingism those gentlemen represent seems to be Dickens' main concern, but it is also their premeditated self-fashioning for malignant purposes that the author draws attention to. As Adams (1995: 14) says, "Dickens' portraits suggest how powerfully programs of masculine self-fashioning may arouse the pervasive suspicion of hidden designs". Dickens seems to see in such men as Skimpole and Mr Turveydrop a danger to the new definition of the gentleman, since the idea of idleness that had accompanied the notion was reluctant to disappear and survived in dandified figures like them. In addition, such characters may also testify to the viable, continuing existence of dandyism as it was known in the Regency period. But Skimpole and Mr Turveydrop may also have been introduced only to reinforce the new Victorian male ideal through its opposite since negative stereotypes also played an important role in the construction of Victorian masculinity. A true Victorian gentleman cannot centre the meaning of his existence around his personal comfort, doing nothing to achieve an honourable status in society.

Despite Dickens's explicit aversion to those dandylike characters, the depiction of such men also seems to refer to his concern about the influence that they may exert on the middle-class men aspiring to the status of gentleman.

This viewpoint can be illustrated by Richard Carstone in the novel, who is a representative of the younger generation looking for his place in society. Richard has the makings of becoming an exemplary gentleman, but his Carlylean lack of integrity makes him a victim of dandyism à la Harold Skimpole. Richard's pursuits come to nothing. His plans to make a career in different professions do not materialise since he lacks discipline and is not inclined to work hard.

He is only interested in the social status that accompanied these gentlemanly professions, for middle-class professionals "legitimated their masculinity by identifying it with that of the gentleman" (Adams 1995: 6). Before managing to make any success in becoming a doctor, military officer or lawyer, he already imagines himself as one by fashioning himself accordingly. Finally, however, he would rather prefer to be an idle gentleman in the manner of dandies and stakes his future on the victory in the Jarndyce case, for which he is forced to seek advice and borrow money. By taking Skimpole and the lawyer Vholes as his counsellors he falls dangerously into debt. Richard falls prey to the illusions of the dandiacal donothingism since, unlike Skimpole, he is in fact completely innocent of the ways of the world.

In addition to the spectacular self-presentation of true Regency dandies and the wannabes, there are male characters who represent a different aspect of conscious self-modelling: the ideal Mr Jarndyce in *Bleak House* and Charles Darnay and Sydney Carton in *A Tale of Two Cities*. In terms of self-fashioning the most curious male character is probably Mr John Jarndyce, who seems to have been unanimously regarded as utterly positive. John Jarndyce is obviously a rich man, for how could he otherwise support financially so many people dependent on him? What is more, he is at the same time involved in a time- and money-consuming court case. The source of his income has remained a mystery; it feels as though he himself was embarrassed to reveal it, for John Jarndyce is in fact another example of Carlylean Donothingism. Being a benefactor to orphans and helpless friends alike, Mr Jarndyce redeems himself by being chari-table and demonstrating his concern for the people around him. However, by presenting himself as a philanthropist may refer to his carefully designed public image which corresponds better to the gentlemanly ideal of the age than being just a man of means. The necessity to adjust himself to the modern age echoes Carlyle's un-easiness about the importance of conscious self-presentation akin to dandyism: to be an ideal gentleman he has to model himself as one.

Redemption is also a key to understanding Sydney Carton and Charles Darnay. The self-indulgent dandy and the former French aristocrat both redeem their inglorious past by displaying great virtue

in adhering to the acclaimed values of the Victorian age. Although the novel is set in the final decades of the 18th century, which is more than half a century before it was published, it bears the stamp of the mid-Victorian notions of the gentlemanly ideal. Both men have self-consciously modelled their image on the popular ideal of the Victorian male. Darney as a former aristocrat has disavowed his aristocratic connections and past in France and modelled himself into a respectable and honest English commoner. As such he embodies the new kind of ideal aristocracy for which Carlyle spoke in *Chartism* and *Past and Present*. It is his merits and talents that are to make him a true gentleman, not his noble background. To make his new role more convincing, Darnay presents himself as a commoner. By doing this, he gets close to the ideal only by carefully constructing his new image.

Sydney Carton, a rather careless man-about-down, has enjoyed life to the full and therefore at first sight corresponds to Dickens's dandylike characters in *Bleak House*. He is the "idlest and most unpromising of men" (Dickens 1999: 73); he is "seesaw Sidney" (ib. 75), both morally and temperamentally. However, at the end of the novel Dickens makes him palatable to the Victorian reader by turning him into a martyr who sacrifices his life for Lucy and Charles. His self-denial, courage and devotion transform him into an ideal gentleman who lacks self-interest. It seems that Sydney Carton is one of the cases in Dickens's works where the Carlylean uneasiness about the paradox of theatrical self-presentation comes best to the fore. Being a former dandy, Sydney Carton's act of sacrifice can be taken as a spectacular self-presentation, which immortalises his persona – the ultimate aim of every dandy. His prophetic visions in the final chapter of the book reveal the underlying reasons of such an act: "I see that I hold a sanctuary in their hearts, and in the hearts of their descendants, generations hence." (Ib. 320). Having redeemed his wasted life as a dandy, Carton emerges as an epitome of the Victorian masculine ideal, but he is only able to become one through theatrical self-presentation detested by Carlyle and Dickens alike. As Adams (1995: 56) has aptly described, Carton's deed is something that "confirms the reign of Carlylean dandyism in the novel, underscoring the efficacy of a wholly mediated selfhood, which betrays no

hint of a discordant identity that resides in some imagined, essential depth of being."

As demonstrated by Dickens, the influence of dandyism on the concept of the Victorian gentleman is not to be overlooked since it exerts a considerable influence on the new ideal. Dickens' presentation of some of his male characters in *Bleak House* and *A Tale of Two Cities* can be seen both as a reminder of the fundamental difference between the true gentleman and the dandy, the "inauthentic simulacrum" (ib. 54), and as a sign of uneasiness that pervades the condition of manliness question when the legacy of the Regency comes under scrutiny.

References

Adams, J. E. 1995. *Dandies and Desert Saints. Styles of Victorian Manhood*. Cornell University Press: Ithaca and London.

Carlyle, T. 1999. *Sartor Resartus*. Oxford University Press: Oxford.

Carlyle, T. 1965. *Past and Present*. Oxford University Press: London.

Carlyle, T. 1831. Characteristics. – *The Edinburgh Review* Vol. LIV. December, 1831. Edinburgh.

http://www.efm.bris.ac.uk/het/carlyle/charact.htm, accessed 16.06.2009.

Castronovo, D. 1987. *The English Gentleman: Images and Ideals in Literature and Society*. New York: Ungar.

Dickens, C. 2001. *Bleak House*. Ware: Wordsworth Editions Ltd.

Dickens, C. 1999. *A Tale of Two Cities.* Ware: Wordsworth Editions Ltd.

Foulkes, N. 2004. *Scandalous Society. Passion and Celebrity in the Nineteenth Century*. Abacus: Croydon.

Kelly, I. 2005. *Beau Brummell. The Ultimate Dandy*. London: Hodder and Stoughton Ltd.

Murray, V. 1999. *High Society in the Regency Period 1788–1830*. London: Penguin Books.

Roberts, D. 2001. The Historical context and setting of *Bleak House*. – Charles Dickens, *Bleak House*. Ware: Wordsworth Editions Ltd, pp. xxiii–xxxi.

Sanders, A. 2003. *Charles Dickens*. Oxford University Press: Oxford.

Sirkel, K. 2010. England's own fad – dandyism through a Frenchman's eyes. – *Humaniora Anglistica Tartuensia*, Vol. 1 No.1 "Britain between Europe and America", issue eds. Pilvi Rajamäe, Krista Vogelberg. Tartu: Tartu University Press, 61–71.

The Death of the American Dream: H. Thompson's Fear and Loathing: On the Campaign Trail'72

> A presidential campaign would be a good place ... to look for the Death of the American Dream (Thompson 1990: 122)

The presidential elections of 1972 are considered to be one of the most significant in American history, since they were "generally regarded as heralding a fundamental political realignment" (Schofield, Miller, Martin 2003: 217). They meant the ultimate victory of the Republican Party and its return to power on the political stage of the USA. The elections attracted the attention of many political observers, journalists and writers. Among them was Hunter S. Thomson (1937–2005), one of the representatives of New Journalism movement and the creator of gonzo journalism[1]. H. Thompson was interested in politics both as a journalist, since he practiced political reportage, and personally – he participated in political campaigns in his home town Aspen. H. Thompson founded the "Freak Power Party", basing its political platform on several points: prohibition of automobiles, legalization of drugs and renaming Aspen as "Fat City". Thompson's serious efforts in political reportage began in 1968, when he covered the Democratic Party conventions that resulted in the article "Chicago–1968", that was later published in nonfiction collection *Songs of the Doomed* (1990). According to Thompson, being on the edge of financial crisis, he decided to write the book titled "The Death of the American Dream", and felt that the best way to do it was to write the book about politics. The book was not written, but since then H. Thompson started covering political events regularly. Later the journalist estimated the effect of his political reportage as devastating, writing that

---

[1] Gonzo journalism is highly subjective writing which resembles journalistic sketches joined together by the image of the narrator who participates in all the described activities

> Everything that is wrong-headed, cynical and vicious in me today
> traces straight back to that evil hour in September of '69 when I
> decided to get heavily involved in the political process ... (214).

The American dream has long been a central topic to many of H. Thompson's works. The author was preoccupied by the American mythology, national character, American "glorious" past and "dark" future. It can be illustrated even by the titles he gave to his books: *Fear and Loathing in Las Vegas. A Savage Journey to the Heart of the American Dream* (1971), *Generation of Swine: Tales of Shame and Degradation in the 80s* (1989), *Songs of the Doomed: More Notes on the Death of the American Dream* (1990), *The Great Shark Hunt: Strange Tales from a Strange Time* (1991), *The Proud Highway: Saga of a Desperate Southern Gentleman* (1998), *Fear and Loathing in America. The Brutal Odyssey of an Outlaw Journalist* (2001), *Kingdom of Fear: Loathsome Secrets of a Star-Crossed Child in the Final Days of the American Century* (2003), *Hey Rube: Blood Sport, the Bush Doctrine and the Downward Spiral of Dumbness* (2004).

By 1972 H. Thompson was already recognized for his efforts "to find the American Dream". The book that made him famous was *Hell's Angels* where he approached closely to the subject of counterculture and its impact on the American Dream. The writer studied the activities of "Hell's Angels", a well-known Californian motorcycle gang, simultaneously studying the modern state of the "Dream". The factual account of H. S. Thompson's travels and parties with "Hell's Angels" turned into the book tracing the process of myth-making and its further debunking. The journalist, who first treated his characters as the embodiment of the genuine American dream of upward mobility, in the process of his work came to the disruptive conclusion that Hell's Angels are the integral part of American establishment, guilty of diluting the American dream and turning it into the dream of improving the material and social status. Although the book made him widely popular, H. Thompson did not stop in his search for the American dream and this quest resulted in publication of *Fear and Loathing in Las Vegas: A Savage Journey to the Heart of the American Dream*. The book represents the journey

of the protagonist and his companion around Las-Vegas that symbolically starts on the edge of the desert (American wilderness). The characters, thus, personify new American Adams ready to pursue their American dream. The author's irony becomes clear, when it turns out that the heroes are suffering from drug hallucinations, and reaches its climax when the characters find the American dream in the casino named Circus-Circus. The protagonist comes to the conclusion that the "dream" in modern America is freedom to gain material wealth by all means, even through fraud and cheat. These two books can be viewed as a platform on which H. Thompson's eventual concept of the "death" of the American Dream was formed.

Fear and Loathing: on the Campaign Trail '72: Some Notes on the Author's Style

In 1972 Thompson was engaged in coverage of primaries of the Democratic Party, and his work resulted in the issue of the nonfiction book *Fear and Loathing: On the Campaign Trail'72* (1972). Since the moment of its issue, the book aroused controversial reviews both from Thompson's fellow journalists and participants of the primaries. Thus, Frank Mankiewicz, George McGovern's[2] press secretary, would state that *Fear and Loathing: on the Campaign Trial '72* was "the most accurate and least factual" account of the election (495), implying that H. Thomson in his book presented, on the one hand, the most precise, but, on the other hand, immensely subjective account of the primaries. R. Winterowd in his analysis of the book highlighted its excessive subjectivity and "singular uninformativeness":

> ... one learns a good deal about the author, very little about his subject. *Fear and Loathing on the Campaign Trail*, for instance, is an intense account of Thompson's prejudices, neuroses, and devotion to alcohol and drugs... (Winterowd 1990: 91)

[2] One of the candidates from the Democratic Party who eventually lost to Richard Nixon in 1972 elections

KONOVALOVA

Notwithstanding the fact that both critics agree upon subjectivity being the main feature of the book, their attitudes to it vary considerably. Thus, for Mankiewicz such subjectivity is an unquestionable advantage, as far as for R. Winterowd it is seemingly a drawback. The first opinion seems to be more relevant, since stressed subjectivity is one of Thompson's literary devices that the author uses to create grotesque picture of American reality. Besides, the book is a specimen of hybrid genre and can be identified as literary nonfiction, thus it cannot be entirely objective and factual.

Thompson's efforts to create subjective account of Democratic primaries were highly appreciated by George McGovern who described the book as "the most valuable book on the campaign" (490). The writer himself claims the book to be "the bloody product of fifty-five consecutive hours of sleepless, foodless, high-speed editing" (11), referring to his usual way of working on the books. H. Thompson seldom worked on his books for a long time that was typical for all New Journalists. The only exception is his novel *The Rum Diary* that was written during almost thirty years. H. Thompson is also known for not editing his works that is why both his fiction and nonfiction books remind narrator's stream of consciousness that might also be explained by the impact of New Journalism. It's worth mentioning here that the starting impulse of the appearance of New Journalism movement on the literary stage is connected by many critics with the issue of the article titled *The Kandy-Kolored Tangerine-Flake Streamline Baby* (1965) by Tom Wolfe. The article was dedicated to automobile show that Tom Wolfe was to cover for *Esquire*. According to Wolfe, after visiting the show, he confessed to the editor Byron Dobell that he was unable to write anything appropriate and they agreed that T. Wolfe would send all the material without editing and someone else would finish the article. Tom Wolfe typed his memorandum, starting with "Dear Byron", for the whole night and eventually it took approximately 40 pages. When the editor got it, he decided to print it in full, omitting only the address. That article became the example of New journalists' work on their texts. H. Thompson would refuse the label "New journalist", preferring "gonzo journalist", but the way of writing "gonzo" he describes in one of his nonfiction collections bears strong re-

semblance to one T. Wolfe used in his New journalism experiments: "buy a fat notebook and record the whole thing, as it happened, then send in the notebook for publication – without editing" (Thompson 1979: 106).

Commenting on the genre of his book, the author states: 'So this is more a jangled campaign diary than a record or reasoned analysis of the '72 presidential campaign" (16). What immediately arouses the reader's attention is the epithet "jangled" that the writer applies to his book. H. Thompson seems to be aware of the impression the book creates among his readers and critics and intentionally attempts to arouse negative emotions. Thus, T.R. Whissen states that:

> "Doctor" Hunter S. Thompson is the self-styled journalist who invented, labeled, and defined "gonzo" journalism, the hallmark of which is its ability to see how far one can exceed what we shall call the Puke Factor (or PF). The Puke Factor is the degree to which a book can nauseate the reader (Whissen 1992: 89)

On the one hand, such peculiarity can be explained by the author's desire to provoke his readers and to attract attention to his creativity. On the other, contemporary reality, according to H. Thompson, is so monstrous and nauseating that there is no other possible way to reflect it in the books.

Fear and Loathing: On the Campaign Trail '72 imitates the diary; the book is divided into eighteen parts, most of which are called after the months when the described events took place: "December 1971", "January", "February", "March"… "December 1972". Moreover, each chapter has subtitles that serve as certain "guides" helping the reader to follow H. Thompson's trips throughout the USA in his attempts to document the primaries. Thus, the book (in common with other works by H. Thompson) besides the diary imitates romance and novel-quest, creating the peculiar synthesis of documentary (diary) and fictional (romance and quest) genres.

But the romance in H. Thompsons creative work turns into self-parody. Knight-errant Thompson (the narrator of *Fear and Loathing: On the Campaign Trail '72)* turns out to be "stone-drunk from dawn till dusk" (177) and his quest turns into the search for the death of the

"American dream". Burlesque character of the book is emphasized by the illustrations, representing the caricatures on politicians and electoral delegates, created by Ralph Steadman. It is not the first time H. Thompson cooperates with R. Steadman, the artist illustrated almost all Thompson's books, including his cult novel *Fear and Loathing in Las Vegas: A Savage Journey to the Heart of the American Dream*. The combination of text and illustrations is bound to highlight the effect the author produces on his readers.

In the foreword the author following the practice of many New journalists explains several aims at writing *Fear and Loathing: On the Campaign Trail '72*. One of them is his aversion to taking drugs:

> When a man gives up drugs he wants big fires in his life – all night long, every night, huge flames in the fireplace and the volume turned all the way up (19).

H. Thompson seemingly exaggerates his drug addiction. Thus, according to the author his previous book *Fear and Loathing in Las Vegas: A Savage Journey to the Heart of the American Dream* was written entirely under drug effect, although the critics agree that the novel is just an imitation of drug delusion. Thompson might be playing with his readers, adopting postmodernist technique.

One more reason for following the pre-election campaign, according to the author, was "to check out the people and find out if they are all swine" (28). Such perception of his contemporaries as "swine" was typical for H. Thompson who would even write the nonfiction book *Generation of Swine: Tales of Shame and Degradation in the 80s*. Besides, the author sets upon writing the book

> to learn as much as possible about the mechanics and realities of a presidential campaign, and to write about it in the same way I'd write about anything else – as close to the bone as I could get, and to hell with the consequences (14)

The book's hallmark is its extreme sincerity, which is emphasized by the fact that the author following the example of Norman Mailer and other New journalists introduces the special protagonist – narrator

Hunter Thompson, who is certainly the direct reflection of the writer's personality. That device was common for Thompson who often presented the events in his fiction and nonfiction books through the eyes of Raoul Duke (the pseudonym of the writer under which his *Fear and Loathing in Las Vegas: A Savage Journey to the Heart of the American Dream* first appeared) and Dr. Gonzo. It might be explained, on the one hand, by New Journalism principle of the writer's obligatory participation in the described events, and on the other – by H. Thompson's everlasting aim to create a kind of mythological figure out of himself. It is worth noting that he eventually managed to implement his ambition, since for many of his contemporaries H. Thompson represents cult figure and an embodiment of counterculture and non conformism. In 2008 the documentary film "Gonzo: The Life and Work of Dr. Hunter S. Thompson" appeared, in which many established writers, journalists, actors, representatives of various subcultures and members of H. Thompson's family aired their views on H. Thompson's life, ideals and his role in American reality since 1960-s. It turns out that all too often it is impossible to draw the line between H. Thompson – the writer – and his grotesque, fighting, nonconformist protagonist, because there is almost no distance between them.

Fear and Loathing: On the Campaign Trail'72 presents Thompson's attitude towards main political figures and politics in general that is utterly critical. Sometimes Thompson's characteristics lack arguments, but they never fail to be sarcastic. For instance, analyzing the chances of the main candidates, the writer creates a kind of gradation of the most inappropriate persona:

> Muslie is a bonehead who steals his best lines from old Nixon speeches. McGovern is doomed because everybody who knows him has so much respect for the man that they can't bring themselves to degrade the poor bastard by making him run for President ... John Lindsay is a dunce, Gene McCarthy is crazy, Humphrey is doomed and useless, Jackson should have stayed in bed... (53)

The journalist compares the Campaign of 1972 with "the second day of a Hell's Angels Labor Day picnic", describing the primaries as something vicious and chaotic.

The Results of "Roaring Sixties" and the Modern State of the American Dream

Developing the constant topics of his creative work, the journalist in his new book tries not only to reflect upon political life of the USA, but to summarize "roaring sixties" and present his own attitude towards American national character and the concept of the American dream. The genuine American Dream for H. Thompson is closely connected with democracy and freedom. The journalist as one of the main representatives of American counterculture supports the ideas and ideals of "roaring sixties" and is eager to fight for them: "I'm the one who got smacked in the stomach by a billy club at the corner of Michigan and Balboa on the evil Wednesday night four years ago in Chicago" (179). But in the early seventies the writer comes to the realization that eventful and vivid decade will result in "hangover: a whole subculture of frightened illiterates with no faith in anything" (59). The second victory of the Republican Party (the first being Nixon's victory in 1968) for Thompson means the failure of American Democracy. The journalist foresees this victory and attempts to analyze the grounds for it. According to Thompson the main reason is the "fatigue" of the majority of Americans:

> After a decade of left-bent chaos, the Silent Majority was so deep in a behavioral sink that their only feeling for politics was a powerful sense of revulsion. All they wanted in the White House was a man who would leave them alone and do anything necessary to bring calmness back into their lives - even if it meant turning the whole state of Nevada into a concentration camp for hippies, niggers, dope fiends, do-gooders, and anyone else who might threaten the status quo (440).

Another reason is the weakness and vice of the Democratic Party, that after the deaths of John and Robert Kennedy turned into "crippled and bankrupt in all its fronts" (133). The Democratic Party in its modern state arouses writer's loathing:

> That same gang of corrupt and genocidal bastards who not only burned me for six white sharkskin suits eight years ago in South Dakota and chased me through the streets of Chicago with clubs and tear gas in August of '68, but also forced me to choose for five years between going to prison or chipping in 20 percent of my income to pay for napalm bombs to be dropped on people who never threatened me with anything; and who put my friends in jail for refusing to fight an undeclared war in Asia (216).

Robert Kennedy for H. Thompson represented the ideal and hope for the possible glorious future for the USA. His protagonist, while following the primaries in Washington, New Hampshire, Wisconsin, Ohio, Nebraska, California, etc. is haunted by the feeling of R. Kennedy's presence during the conventions. That makes him return back in his memories to the hopes the whole nation connected with the politician in late sixties:

> There is a strange psychic connection between Bobby Kennedy's voice and the sound of the Rolling Stones. They were part of the same trip, that wild sense of breakthrough the late sixties when almost anything seemed possible. The whole era peaked on March 31, 1968, when LBJ went on national TV to announce that he wouldn't run for re-election – that everything he stood for was fucked, and by quitting he made himself the symbolic ex-champ of the Old Order. It was like driving an evil King off the throne. Nobody knew exactly what would come next, but we all understood that whatever happened would somehow be a product of the "New Consciousness" (134).

Observing the modern state of the Democratic Party, the protagonist could not but physically sense the feeling of shame Robert Kennedy might have, since the 1972 Democratic campaign mocks his

memory. The protagonist's reflections are by all means the direct expression of the author's position, who thinks that the murders of its best representatives turned the Democratic Party into the "atavistic endeavor – more an Obstacle than a Vehicle" (119) and that the only way to change the situation in America is to destroy the party completely.

Moreover H. Thompson in seventies is so pessimistic about his former ideals and hopes that even Democracy for him loses its attraction:

> The main problem in any democracy is that crowd-pleasers are generally brainless swine who can go out on a stage and whup their supporters into an orgiastic frenzy – then go back to the office and sell every one of the poor bastards down the tube for a nickel apiece (121).

The writer feels negative both towards the "Silent Majority" and contemporary state of Democracy in America, but does not propose any meaningful program to change the situation. According to him, contemporary Americans are bound to feel "fear and loathing". This word combination becomes Thompson's manifesto; the writer includes it in all the subtitles. Thus Thompson – the narrator – in December 1971 feels "Fear and Loathing in Washington", in February – "Fear and Loathing in New Hampshire", in March – "Fear and Loathing on the Democratic Left", etc. The very word combination is an allusion to the American dream. For the first time it was used by the author in the title of his cult book *Fear and Loathing in Las Vegas: A Savage Journey to the Heart of the American Dream,* one of the main themes of which (as it was stated above) was the search for the American dream. The novel has become immensely popular, turning the word combination into nominal; "fear and loathing" for many Americans have become an integral part of the American dream, in the same way as "American tragedy" has entered American national mythology after the issue of the novel of the same name by T. Dreiser.

According to J. Hellman, *Fear and Loathing: On the Campaign Trail'72* "structurally is a parodic quest book centered around a

symbolic city" (Hellman 1981: 96). The critic means Washington –
the city that personifies American political system in general and
such concepts as American Democracy and Declaration of Inde-
pendence. Already in the first chapter, the reader gets acquainted
with the hero named Hunter Thompson who starts his eastward
journey from his house in Woody Creek, Colorado towards
Washington. The hero, according to J. Hellman, reverses "the
historical – mythical – literary direction, in order to discover the
contemporary reality of a nation that has always moved west in
search of a dream" (ib.). Thus the book alongside with the
observation of primaries attempts to explain the contemporary state
of the country.

H. Thompson comes to the conclusion that the historical develop-
ment of the USA has always represented negative consequences of
the development of the American dream, among which he sees "the
White Man's rape of the American continent" (371) and foreign
policy of the USA. The "dream" in its modern condition, according
to the author, is an integral part of American establishment, and the
establishment is one of the most negative notions in American
society. Thompson feels that the American dream is so diluted that
one can only witness its "death":

> The ugly fallout from the American Dream has been coming
> down on us at a pretty consistent rate since Sitting Bull's time –
> and the only real difference now, with Election Day '72 only a
> few weeks away, is that we seem to be on the verge of ratifying
> the fallout and forgetting the Dream itself (371).

To justify his idea the writer traces the development of politics in
the USA, focusing on the images of political leaders of the country.
The Presidents in America used to serve as the personifications of
the national ideal, but the situation changed by the 1960s:

> Back in 1960 most Americans still believed that whoever lived in
> the White House was naturally a righteous and upstanding man.
> Otherwise he wouldn't be there... This was after 28 years of
> Roosevelt and Eisenhower who were very close to God. Harry
> Truman, who had lived a little closer to the Devil, was viewed

> more as an accident than a Real President. The shittrain began on
> November 22nd, 1963, in Dallas – when some twisted little geek
> blew the President's head off ... and then a year later, LBJ was re-
> elected as the "Peace Candidate" (80–81).

According to H. Thompson, since 1963 the nation has been gradually
losing respect for fundamentals of American society, namely the
Presidency, the White House, the Army, the Government, and as a
consequence, it has lead to the "death" of the American dream. The
journalist sees the culminating point of this process in the political
activities of Richard Nixon. Arguing with those who considered
Nixon to be the person who can revive the American dream,
Thompson states:

> It is Nixon himself who represents that dark, venal, and incurably
> violent side of the American character almost every other country
> in the world has learned to fear and despise (391).

The writer compares Richard Nixon with Barbie doll, emphasizing
his artificiality, on the one hand, but typical character of this person,
on the other, since Barbie doll for the whole world is personification
of "glamorous cover" of the American dream.

The concept of "the death" of the American dream is represented
also through the composition of the book. Beside fifteen chapters,
narrating about the trips of his protagonist around the country, the
author includes three more parts. One of the parts represents the
poem *Be Angry at the Sun* (1941) by Robinson Jeffers. The creativity
of the poet appealed to H. Thompson that might be explained by the
poet's social and political position: he consciously maintained an
attitude of an "outlaw" and claimed the decline of Western values. In
his poem R. Jeffers analyzes the contemporary to him state of the
USA, encouraging his readers to admit inevitable:

> That public men publish falsehoods
> Is nothing new. That America must accept
> Like the historical republics corruption and empire
> Has been known for years... (432).

The lyrical hero sees the way out in being faithful to his own ideas and preserving integrity of his own soul and independence from the laws of the society:

> Let boys want pleasure, and men
> Struggle for power, and women perhaps for fame,
> And the servile to serve a Leader and the Dupes
>   to be duped.
> Yours is not theirs (432).

Such position of rejecting the official ideals and support of the individual freedom was very close to H. Thompson, who encouraged his readers to rebel against "American idols". "Be angry at the sun for setting" (432) is the author's revolt against American establishment and conformism.

H. Thompson supports R. Jeffer's idea consisting of the decline of the American dream. It is not by chance that the author includes two more chapters into his book: "Dark Interlude" and "Epitaph". "Dark Interlude" refers to the scandal around McGovern[3]. In this chapter H. Thompson gives his political forecast, claiming that McGovern would not be able to win. Taking into the account the fact that the writer considers the politician "the only living honest man in American politics", his forecast sounds as prediction of bad future for the country. The last chapter "Epitaph", where Thompson announces the victory of Richard Nixon, reads as obituary notice, stating the death of H. Thompson's hopes for the better future of the country. The book ends with the episode when the narrator puts on his special nightshirt and walks to the "Losers' Club" (480).

Concluding Remarks

According to H. Thompson, the American dream in its contemporary state has very little in common with its genuine meaning. Modern

---

[3] Just over two weeks after the 1972 Democratic Convention, it was revealed that McGovern's running mate, Thomas Eagleton, had received electroshock therapy for clinical depression during the 1960s.

KONOVALOVA

American reality seems to the author so monstrous and grotesque that the only possibility for the writer is to state the death of the ideals introduced by national rhetoric. The writer traces the death of the "dream" in all the spheres of American life, but politics for him represents the very quintessence of corruption of national idea. Belonging to the world of politics mars the personalities, since "there is no room in American politics for an honest man" (77). H. Thompson finds only several exceptions among American politicians, who oppose to general viciousness. The author sees his ideal in the figures of John and Robert Kennedy, but states that their deaths deprive the USA of the hope for the better future. The author creates gloomy and mysterious atmosphere, announcing that "the ghost of Kennedys past hangs so heavy on this dreary presidential campaign" (91). The effect is highlighted by the peculiar structure of the book, including such parts as "Dark Interlude" and "Epitaph", and by perpetual repetition of "fear and loathing" metaphor both in the subtitles and the text itself. Notwithstanding the fact that Hunter Thompson admitted in his personal letters that he failed to write the book about the "death of the dream", *Fear and Loathing: On the Campaign Trail'72* is read as the book introducing the idea that would become crucial for his later creative work.

References

Hellman J. 1981. *Fables of fact: The New Journalism as New Fiction.* Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

Schofield N., Miller G., and Martin A. 2003. *Critical Elections and Political Realignments in the USA: 1860–2000.* Political Studies. Vol. 3

Thompson H. 1979. The *Great Shark Hunt: Strange Tales from a Strange Time.* New York: Ballantine.

Thompson H. 1990. *Songs of the Doomed: More Notes on the Death of the American Dream.* New York: Simon and Schuster.

Thompson H. 2005. *Fear and Loathing: On the Campaign Trail'72.* London, New York, Toronto and Sydney: Harper Perennial.

Whissen T.R. 1992. *Classic Cult Fiction: A Companion to Popular Cult Literature.* Westport, Connecticut, London: Greenwood Press.

Winterowd R. 1990. *The Rhetoric of the "Other" Literature \ Ross Winterowd.* Southern Illinois University Press, Carbondale and Edwardsville.

The Reception of Portuguese-language Literatures in Estonia. The Historical Context[1]

Introduction

This article provides an overview of how Portuguese-language litera-tures from Portugal, Brazil, Angola and Mozambique that have found their way into Estonian. Because of the small number of books that have been translated, it is possible to look separately at each translation and its historical-cultural context.

The reception of Portuguese-language literatures in Estonia has been fairly limited. The relative youth of Estonian culture could explain why the scope of our interests had not even encompassed all of Europe by the beginning of the 20th century, let alone cultures beyond it. A young culture tends to look for support from its immediate surroundings and only when it becomes more firmly established, its perspectives broaden.

Interest in Spanish studies has increased in Estonia since the country's new independence at the start of the 1990s: Tartu Uni-versity opened a Spanish Department that rapidly became immensely popular, and the other Estonian universities soon followed suit by offering courses in the Spanish language and culture(s). However, the presence of Portuguese studies is still fairly modest in the academic programs at the beginning of the 21st century.

The data in this article is based upon research from various chronicles in the Estonian National Library and Estonian newspapers and literary journals. In the Estonian reception of Portuguese-language literature, I have distinguished three periods. The first, 1890–1939, begins with the publication of the first translation from

Portuguese into Estonian. The second is the Soviet period, with its unique rules and systems that shaped translation policy. The third period, 1991–2010, covers the first twenty years of the Estonia's regained independence. Since then, the laws of a free market economy were adopted, which also had a strong influence on translation history.

In addition to the overview of translated works and their respective context, I will study the work of two major translators from Portuguese to Estonian, without whom this article would not have been possible.

1. The Reception of Portuguese-language literatures in Estonia, 1890–1939

The knowledge of the Romance languages was quite limited in Estonia during the first half of the 20th century. French and Spanish were not widely spoken, and Portuguese was even less known. In the 1920s, Estonians perceived Brazil as a marvellous country where newcomers had good opportunities to start a new life. According to official Brazilian statistics, 2593 Estonians emigrated to that country between 1923 and 1930 (earlier data does not differentiate Estonians).

In 1890–1939, there were no direct translations from Portuguese: a few translations into Estonian were made from German or other languages, and the editors made their selections without knowing the background of the author. Stories published in journals often lacked any mention of the language from which the text had been translated, and shorter texts did not even mention the name of the translator. It is usually possible to detect that German or Russian was the intermediary language. There were no novels or collections of poetry from Portugal or Brazil published during the first half of the 20th century, but short stories began to appear in journals.

Most of those stories appeared in the journal *Romaan* (Novel) that contained fiction from around the world – usually inconsequential short stories with elements of soap operas were published, solely for entertainment. H. V. Patera, a Brazilian author, gained

extraordinary popularity. 13 of his stories were published in *Romaan* and other journals at the end of the 1920s and in the early 1930s.

The first literary text ever translated from Portuguese into Estonian appeared in the journal *Laulu ja mängu leht* (The Song and Play Periodical), which was published by Karl August Hermann, a major Estonian literary scholar and composer. It was a sonnet by Luís Vaz de Camões, the 16th century poet and author of the Portuguese national epic.

Literary criticism from 1890 to 1939 contained only one item concerning Portuguese literature: an introductory note about Camões, accompanying the sonnet. However, it is significant for the reception that it occurred quite early – in 1890. The name of the author was not cited, but in all probability it was Karl August Hermann.

2. The Reception of Portuguese-language literature in Estonia, 1944–1990

The second phase of reception started after World War II, when Estonia became part of the Soviet Union. A new ideology was ushered in with the political change which featured a highly normative translation policy. The main aim of the policy was to limit "the decadent influence of the Imperialist West" on Soviet citizens. Strict quotas were introduced for translation.

The quota system stipulated that 45% of translations had to be from Russian, 15% from other Soviet countries, 13% from other socialist countries, and no more than 27% from the rest of the world. From 1940 to 1968, only one Portuguese and two Brazilian novels were translated into Estonian, as compared to eight novels from Spanish. Overall, the quotas were rigorously observed: during the above-mentioned period there were about one thousand books translated from Russian, 250 books from other Soviet republics and slightly more than 800 from the rest of the world (Talvet 1995: 15).

Today, the concept of a centrally planned economy directed by Moscow sounds very bizarre and utterly restrictive, but there was actually a positive aspect to this kind of publishing policy. Such a

selection process served to filter out trivial literature that in market economies tends to prevail at the expense of the more consequential. "Soviet cultural ideology continually restricted [the publication of products of] Western culture and gave priority to translations of older classics of world literature." (Talvet 2005: 433) A consistent program for translating the canon of classic literary works was developed and followed.

The first book translated from Portuguese into Estonian (with the Russian translation being used as the intermediary) was an exceptionally ideological text about Luis Carlos Prestes, the leader of the Brazilian Communists, written by the extremely popular novelist Jorge Amado in his youth. The year of the translation, 1955, was responsible for the choice of the novel – the 1950s were the first decade of Soviet rule, and there was strong pressure to establish the new ideology. The quality of the translation was very poor and the literary level of the book is lower than that of any of Amado's other works. Fortunately, some much better translations of his books into Estonian were eventually published. Starting in 1949, when an excerpt of a story by Amado was printed in a newspaper and an introductory article appeared in the literary journal *Looming*, Jorge Amado became one of the favorites of the Soviet Estonian media. This is logical in the light of his leftist views: Amado also became hugely popular in some left-leaning African countries.

In the 1960s, one of the most renowned Estonian translators, Aita Kurfeldt, made her first influential translations from Portuguese: in 1963. She translated one of Jorge Amado's best known books: *Gabriela, nelk ja kaneel* (Gabriela, Cravo e Canela / Gabriela, Clove and Cinnamon) and in 1968, the first important book of Portuguese fiction: *Reliikvia* (A Reliquia / The Relic), by the 19th century classicist, José Maria Eça de Queirós.

Jorge Amado, who was by that time very popular in Brazil, also became well read in Estonia. The first printing of 30 thousand copies in 1963 was followed by a second printing of 40 thousand copies in 1978. In the context of a language that is spoken by fewer than one million people, these numbers are quite remarkable.

Eça de Queirós, the author of *A Reliquia*, the second novel translated from Portuguese into Estonian, is undoubtedly the most

important author of 19th-century Portuguese literature. The choice of the author is therefore logical, but the selection of the novel is debatable. Portuguese critics consider *Os Maias* (The Maias, 1888) his best work. *A Reliquia* (1887, The Relic) is from Eça de Queirós's third period, which has been called decadent and postnaturalist. It is definitely *not* the book for which he is known in his homeland. Nevertheless, "The Relic" is widely read in English and some critics (see Sousa 2001) claim that this novel, with its radical departure from realism, will endure longer than his other works. That argument may have been a factor in Aita Kurfeldt's decision to translate the book; in the preface to *Reliikvia*, she compares Eça de Queirós to Flaubert, and the character, Cousin Basilio, to Madame Bovary. "Just as Flaubert, after writing 'Madame Bovary', escapes from banal everyday life and creates 'Salammbô', Eça writes *A Reliquia*, in which the present and the past, reality and fantasy intertwine." (Kurfeldt 1968: 8)

In addition to disseminating the classics, the Soviet translation policy had another positive aspect: writers from the so-called "revolutionary" and "progressive" cultures were permitted to be translated, and their publishers obtained financing more easily and were allowed to include them in their publishing plans. "Third World" countries were regarded even more favorably, as the Soviet Union wanted to cultivate its image as "the protector of repressed nations" (Talvet 1995: 16). Attempts by African colonial states to become independent were monitored with great enthusiasm. Translating the literature of those countries and other kinds of cultural liaisons were strongly encouraged: several Estonians had the opportunity to visit African countries or meet black poets in Moscow.

A small group of men of letters was formed in Estonia to translate African poetry. The two principal members were Ain Kaalep and Eerik Teder. Both published translations of poems in newspapers and magazines, and in 1964, they assembled an anthology of African poetry. A comprehensive collection *Vabaduskoidiku rütmid* (The Rhythms of the Dawn of Freedom) included poetry from sixteen countries and was accompanied by a long foreword by Eerik Teder that provided a brief introduction to the political background of the countries and to the poets whose work had been translated.

Translating Latin American literature was also encouraged during Soviet times, although not as strongly as African literature. The choice of texts to translate was usually made from among books that had already been translated into Russian.

Soviet domestic and foreign policies also had a direct effect on publishing. During the first decade of Soviet Estonia, the ideology was strongly emphasized: the new rules needed to be instated and the citizens needed to be compelled to follow them. In the 1940s–1950s, almost nothing was translated from Portuguese, including news and short journalistic excerpts. The few pieces that appeared in print had a strong ideological slant: the style was convoluted and the contents were very much in line with Marxist-Leninist thinking.

Conditions were relaxed at the beginning of the 1960s, during the administration of Nikita Khrushchev. African poetry began to be translated, and the literary magazine *Keel ja Kirjandus* (Language and Literature) published an article on "The Literary Situation in Brazil" in 1966. Literary news, poems, short stories and excerpts from novels by Portuguese authors were now translated. 1968 was an important year for the reception of Portuguese literature: besides the publication of the novel by Eça de Queirós, in Aita Kurfeld's translation, a selection of Fernado Pessoa's poems appeared in Ain Kaalep's translation in the literary magazine *Looming*.

Brezhnev's tenure as General Secretary of the Communist Party (1964–1982) was marked by attempts to curtail the relative liberalism of the first half of the 1960s. It was still not permitted to translate Kafka or Pasternak. But, little by little, the situation eased. In the 1970s, the process of translation became less tightly controlled and relied less on Russian editions. The larger libraries in Moscow stocked more books from abroad. People also received books by means of personal contacts. Thus books sent to the Estonian translator Ain Kaalep by Ivar Ivask (an Estonian poet and scholar living in the United States, long-time editor of the journal *Books Abroad / World Literature Today*) were important sources of Kaalep's knowledge about Spanish, Portuguese and Latin American literature, and influenced his future selections of works to be translated (Talvet 1995: 19–21; Kaalep 2006).

The publication of *Autopsühhograafia* (Autopsicografia, Auto-psychography), a 1973 collection of poems by Fernando Pessoa and his three heteronyms, was a milestone in the history of Estonian translation. Although the little booklet became famous, its publication was met by complete silence on the part of newspapers and journals. The silence persisted for many years. However, *Autopsühhograafia* was noticed, and widely read and discussed. Many Estonian poets, such as Tõnu Õnnepalu and Doris Kareva, have acknowledged that they were influenced by Pessoa. Mats Traat even wrote a poem called "Pessoast inspireeritud" (Inspired by Pessoa).

Ain Kaalep discovered Fernando Pessoa in a French literary magazine that named him as one of the major European poets of the 20th century. In 1968, Kaalep published the nucleus of his collection, translations of seven important poems, in the literary journal *Looming*. In so doing, he departed from the principle that he later used for compiling the larger collection: the best examples from each of the heteronyms used by Fernando Pessoa. Kaalep's choices provide a good overview of the nature of each heteronym.

Two Brazilian children's books were also translated into Estonian during the Soviet era: *Kollase rähni ordu* (Picapau Amarelo / The Yellow Woodpecker Ranch) by Monteiro Lobato in 1964, and *Võlurpoiss* (O Menino Magico / The Magic Boy) by Rachel de Queiroz in 1978. The former was translated by Hilja Välipõllu from a Russian version by Inna Tõnjanova, so it was twice distanced from the original Portuguese. The final product was nevertheless easy to read and well suited to children. However, the latter book, *Võlurpoiss*, is from the 1970s, when the translation process was becoming more independent. Aita Kurfeldt's translation was directly from the Portuguese and is of excellent quality.

These two authors, especially Lobato, were ideologically acceptable: both were leftist, and Lobato had even opposed the right-wing dictatorship and been imprisoned for his political views. Both of the books were of good literary quality and, in the case of *Võlurpoiss*, the publishing house has already managed to circumvent the obligatory, moralizing, accompanying text.

In 1974, another children's book was published that included a few translations from Portuguese. A collection of African short

stories called *Isa, mamba ja mina* (Father, Mamba and Me) was assembled by Andres Jaaksoo; it was intended for "older school-children" but it could also have appealed to adults who were interested in African ways of life. The stories from seventeen African countries, among them Angola and Mozambique, give an interesting insight into the life of ordinary people in those countries. Several are not universal children's stories that could have transpired anywhere in the world, but are quite specific to the locations where the events of the story took place.

Eerik Teder's collection of African poetry *Vabaduskoidiku rütmid* (The Rhythms of the Dawn of Freedom, 1964) is a comprehensive overview of African poetry in the 1960s. Teder and other translators used every collection of African poetry they could find to put the book together. There are poems from fifteen countries in all, among them Angola and Mozambique. The biggest selection of poems comes from Angola: when the book was published in 1964, the only remaining European colonies were Portuguese. The translations are of good quality, and the Portuguese poems were translated by Eerik Teder and Ain Kaalep. Kaalep recalled in a 2006 interview that because African poets were viewed favorably by Soviet authorities, control was not so stringent and it was possible to create an "ideological diversion": in some of the translations, Kaalep and Teder used free verse, which was not officially favored. "This helped considerably to subsequently improve and renew Estonian poetry," Ain Kaalep comments in retrospect.

A collection of poems titled *Püha lootus* (Sagrada Esperança / Holy Hope, 1980), also translated by Kaalep and Teder, paid homage to their Angolan author and freedom fighter, Agostinho Neto, who had passed away a year before. Neto and Fernando Pessoa are the only Portuguese-language poets whose works were translated as separate books in Estonian. The afterword of *Püha lootus* is an excursion into the closely intertwined political and literary history of Angola.

After the Portuguese revolution in 1974, the Soviet Union intensified its contacts with the leftist political forces of Portugal. It was even possible to buy Portuguese newspapers at Estonian news-stands. However, there was still no official opportunity to study

Portuguese language or literature in Estonia during the Soviet period. It was possible to take correspondence courses from the Center for Distance Learning in Moscow, or to study it at Moscow University or a few other major universities of the Soviet Union. At the beginning of the 1980s, Margit Moritz, a student at Tartu State University, was permitted to study Portuguese at the University of Vilnius (with a private docent there). She was probably the only Tartu University student ever to graduate with a thesis in Portuguese: *Fernando Pessoa e a sua obra poética* (Fernando Pessoa and his poetic works); her supervisor was Ain Kaalep.

In the same year that *Autopsühhograafia* was published, Aita Kurfeldt translated one of the most important novels of 19th century Brazilian literature: *Dom Casmurro* by Machado de Assis. The work, an outstanding analysis of jealousy, was an avant-garde novel far ahead of its time. Machado de Assis is considered to be the most important Brazilian novelist of the 19th century.

In the 1970s, Ain Kaalep and others began to publish translations of Brazilian poetry in newspapers. Their attention shifted away from the African war poets. In 1976 and 1980, a collection of two volumes of poetry translated by Ain Kaalep was published. The second volume, *Peegelmaastikud* (Mirror Landscapes II, 1980), contains his best translations of Pessoa and some Brazilian poets, accompanied by comments.

Two significant shorter novels were added to the list of translations in the 1980s. In 1984, the Loomingu Raamatukogu series published *Pühapäeva õhtupoolikul* (Domingo a Tarde / Sunday Afternoon) by Fernando Namora, a book that was very popular in Portugal in the 1960s. The other short novel, also translated by Meelike Palli, was published in the same series in 1986. *Quincas Vesikuradi kolm surma* (A Morte e a Morte de Quincas Berro d'Água / The Two Deaths of Quincas Wateryell) by Jorge Amado was another excellent choice for translation. This genial text is a paean to the relativity of truth. The "facts" and fiction are so intertwined that the reader cannot be sure about what "really" happened.

3. Reception of Portuguese-language literatures
in Estonia 1991–2010

The publishing situation changed radically after Estonia regained its independence. The ideological barriers suddenly vanished and the whole world opened up. There was immense curiosity and a desire to take part in everything that had previously not been permitted, but economic opportunities were scant, as was the knowledge of how to survive in the Western publishing market. The price of books began to rise rapidly at the beginning of the 1990s, and book sales and newspaper circulation started to shrink. Books were not quite luxury items, but neither were they common purchases. Publishing houses had to adjust their principles for making publishing decisions. They quickly grasped that in a market economy, a book is a commodity like any other, and the most important task is to find a book that will sell. Anglo-American culture seeped into all facets of life and the balance shifted strongly towards translations from English. Translating literature from less widespread languages became the private interest of a chosen few.

There was an extremely small number of translations from Portuguese in 1990s, the percentage of works of good literary quality is very low. The first 1990s translation, *Tuparize mõõk* (Tupariz / The Sword of Tupariz), a collection of short stories by Vitório Kali, translated by Margit Levoll, Siivi Sarap and Anneli Tuulik, appeared only in 1999 in the series *Loomingu Raamatukogu*. The stories are not of outstanding literary merit – critics in neither Estonia nor Portugal have spoken highly of them.

The 1990s brought to Estonia a second wave of interest in the work of Fernando Pessoa, although no books appeared in print as yet. The literary journals *Vikerkaar* and *Looming* published quite a few new translations of his poems by Ain Kaalep, Tõnu Õnnepalu, Anneli Tuulik and Jüri Talvet. The learned journal *Akadeemia* featured a story by Pessoa: *Anarhistist pankur* (O banqueiro anarchista / The Anarchist Banker) translated by Maarja Kaplinski; *Vikerkaar* published excerpts from *Rahutuste raamat* (Livro de desassossego / The Book of Disquiet) translated by Tõnu Õnnepalu.

Livro de desassossego is the most singular work of the non-conformist author.

Merimees (O marinheiro / The Seaman) is the only play that Pessoa completed (in 1913). The author referred to it as an "anti-" or "static" drama. It was translated into Estonian in 2001 by Anneli Tuulik, a member of a small group of people who had started learning Portuguese at the Estonian Humanitarian Institute (now part of Tallinn University) in the 1990s. A short introductory note accompanying the text states that *O marinheiro* is a drama that takes place in the soul, in complete isolation and denial of reality. It speaks of "a soul escaping to its dreams and its past as its only chance for happiness" (Pessoa 2001a: 874). Despite the fact that the topic does not appear suitable for a play, the work has been staged in many languages in many countries. Anneli Tuulik's translation was also produced in Estonia at Theatrum, a small theatre in Tallinn. The performances were well received and the production conformed to Pessoa's concept of static theatre.

The next most popular long poem by Fernando Pessoa after *Ode maritima* (Ode to the Sea) is "Tabacaria" (The Tobacco Shop), which is still frequently cited at literary gatherings in Portugal. It was first translated into Estonian in 2001, the same year as *O marinheiro*. The translator, Jüri Talvet, explained that he chose to translate this text because it occupied second place in a list Brazilian literary critics had compiled of the best poems of all time from all over the world (Talvet in: Pessoa 2001b: 983).

By the end of the second decade of independent Estonia the time was ripe for publishing the fruits of work completed over a long period. In 2009 and in 2010 two collections of poems by Fernando Pessoa appeared in print, the first translated by Tõnu Õnnepalu and the second by Ain Kaalep, Jüri Talvet, Maarja Kaplinski and Anneli Tuulik.

Tõnu Õnnepalu translated only poems by Álvaro de Campos, one of the four main heteronyms of Pessoa, and picked mostly poems written during the last years of Pessoas life. In an afterword of the book titled *Tubakapood* (Tabacaria / Tobacco Shop) Õnnepalu explains that this is not a "best of" but a very personal choice of poems that "talked to him". Õnnepalu also notes, that in his opinion

the texts signed by Álvaro de Campos form the best and most mature part of Pessoas works. One of the reviewers expresses an opinion that this is not an anthology of a big poet but "a personal relationship of an Estonian poet with one of his favourite writers" (Kaevats 2010). The poems appear both in Portuguese and Estonian, offering a possibility to compare the original version with the translation.

Sõnum. Valik loomingut (A Message. Selected Work) wa put together by Jüri Talvet and Ain Kaalep, translated by Ain Kaalep, Maarja Kaplinski, Jüri Talvet ja Anneli Tuulik. It includes all the poems translated by Kaalep in *Autopsühhograafia* (1973), with additions provided by Talvet's translations (of Álvaro de Campos's poems), parts from *Livro de desassossego* written under the hetero-nym of Bernardo Soares, the story *O banqueiro anarquista* and the short play *O marinheiro*. This wider choice of Pessoas work is the first one in Estonia serving the purpose of inviting a reader to have a thorough look into the rich and varied world of the Portuguese genius. One of the reviewers called the book a bit eclectic (Kangro 2010) but that seems to also be its strength: *Sõnum* builds a bridge between the historically important debut of Pessoa in Estonian culture and the newer reception. It also points to the different directions where a more thorough reader or future translator of Pessoa could continue the work.

The two books complement each other well in the receiving culture, providing a wider overview and a closer insight into a certain period of Pessoa's works. It also provides an excellent opportunity for comparative translation studies. Besides, both books contain significant and extensive introductory essays, respectively by Tõnu Õnnepalu and Jüri Talvet.

The two closer reviews of the collections were written by two young Estonian poets and translators of poetry: Maarja Kangro and Mariliin Vassenin. Kangro introduces *Sõnum* and brings the reader onto the doorstep of the multi-faceted and rich world of Pessoa. Vassenin compares the two collections on the level of translation choices. She concentrates on the work of Õnnepalu but also shows how his choices tend to differ from those made by Kaalep and Talvet and how this reveals their different styles of translation. Both books

include a translation of "Tabacaria". The reviewers detect different interpretations of some parts of the poem by the translators.

The reception of the two new collections revive the earlier translations. Thus Rein Veidemann mentions that the publishing of *Autopsühhograafia* in 1973 influenced very strongly his worldview (Veidemann 2010), Maarja Kangro puts the relatively early entrance of Pessoa into Estonian culture into the European context (Kangro 2010). Veidemann in his review calls Estonian poet Juhan Liiv "the Estonian Pessoa", using a comparison of the two poets made by Jüri Talvet.

In 2000, news of the bestselling author Paulo Coelho reached Estonia and his books started to be translated one after another. The third period of reception is dominated by Paulo Coelho – he is without a doubt the Portuguese-language writer who is most discussed in the Estonian media.

The works of Paulo Coelho arrived in Estonia a little later than the rest of Europe. "Coelho-mania" only really began when the publishing house Philos, which makes good use of marketing and media relations, started to publicize Coelho and conducted an advertising campaign in connection with the printing of a second edition of *Alkeemik* (Alquimista). In 2000–2010, eleven Coelho novels were translated and ten of his stories published in women's magazines. Between 1990 and 2005, Brazilian literature was the topic of 28 articles in the Estonian media. Only two of the 28 are not about Paulo Coelho or his books. Despite the large number of refe-rences to Coelho, a professional critical discourse is nearly absent, the literary magazines are silent about his work, and newspaper critics do not analyze them, but typically provide a brief negative opinion with little explanation.

It is interesting that the most thorough discussion of the Coelho phenomenon appeared years before the first translation of his works. In 1998, the Estonian orientalist translator, Haljand Udam, wrote an article entitled "Euroopa loeb muinasjuttu" (Europe is reading a fairy-tale) for the Estonian weekly newspaper, *Eesti Ekspress*, introducing a fashionable new writer who had already been a hit in Paris and Rome for some years. Udam expressed his doubts whether Coelho's books would be worth translating, because, in his opinion,

Estonians lacked the background necessary to understand pilgrimage or alchemy, central themes in Coelho's works (Udam 1998). The Coelho phenomenon in Estonia has occasioned debates about book sales tactics, the relationship between self-help books and "real" literature, and the author's presence in his works, etc.

A Portuguese author who did receive media attention was José Saramago, not because of his books but because he won the Nobel Prize in 1998. Daily newspapers tried to provide timely reports about the ceremony and allotted some space for Estonian writers to introduce his works. In his article, Jüri Talvet compared Saramago with the Estonian writer Jaan Kross (who had been presented as a candidate for the Nobel Prize many times but had never received it). The Estonian poet and essayist Jaan Kaplinski wrote about his meeting with the great Portuguese author at the World Literature Academy. Judging by the media reports, it is reasonable to say that the writer was not well known in Estonia at the end of the 20th century.

Beyond doubt enhanced by Nobel Prize Saramago got a chance to enter into Estonian culture: *Pimedus* (Ensaio Sobre a Cegueira / Blindness) by José Saramago, was translated by Mare Vega Salamanca in 2007 and appeared in the series of books by Nobel Prize winners. *Ensaio sobre a cegueira* first appeared in print in 1995 and has become one of the most important out of Saramagos 16 novels. It provides harsh social criticism, describing something that might be called "social blindness" through a metaphor of an epidemic that makes people blind. The author has said that the writing process was terrible and painful and he wishes the readers to re-live his pain.

Surprisingly enough a well-done translation of an influential book did not manage to get much attention in Estonian media. Judging by the silence in newspapers, literary journals and even blogs, the earlier phenomenon – everybody says Saramago is good, but very few have read him – seemed to continue. Only the weekly papers *Eesti Ekspress* and *Sirp* published very short introductory notes, the latter just mentioning that the book appeared in print and the publishing house did not send a free copy to the newspapers. Occasionally *Pimedus* was also shortly mentioned in film reviews of "Blindness", by the Brazilian director Fernando Meirelles, based on

the book. The death of José Saramago in June 2010 received more attention in Estonian media than the translation of *Ensaio sobre* a *cegueira*.

4. The key factor: Portuguese–Estonian translators

In a small culture such as Estonian, subjective reception factors – the translators' personal choices, tastes, experience and networks – become extremely important. It is often possible to pinpoint the exact reasons for the selection of a translation, because those decisions were based on a combination of subjective factors, rather than the less transparent decision-making processes of more institutionalized translation units (such as big editing departments in larger countries).

In the short history of translations from Portuguese to Estonian, there are two outstanding names: Ain Kaalep and Aita Kurfeldt. Portuguese was not the principal foreign language for either of them, but by virtue of their talent and hard work they managed to make a worthy introduction of Portuguese-language literature in Estonian culture. Ain Kaalep primarily translates poetry, while Aita Kurfeldt translated prose works during her lifetime. More Portuguese translators, such as Tõnu Õnnepalu, Jüri Talvet, Maarja Kaplinski and Meelike Palli, have emerged in the last two or three decades, but Ain Kaalep and Aita Kurfeldt have made the most significant contribution to this field until now.

Aita Kurfeldt (1901–1979) was a multi-faceted, talented and creative individual. She brought many influential works from various languages into the Estonian literary world. Aita Kurfeldt was one of the first translators in Estonia who started to write detailed afterwords to accompany her translations. She authored one of the few monographic books ever written by an Estonian about world literature, *Miguel de Cervantes Saavedra* in 1934 (Talvet 1995), as well as an article about the Portuguese national epic *Os Lusíadas* in the literary journal *Looming* (Kurfeldt 1973). She wrote informative afterwords for her most important translations from Portuguese, *Gabriela, nelk ja kaneel* by Jorge Amado (in Estonian, 1963), *Reliikvia* (The Relic) by Eça de Queiros (in Estonian, 1968) and *Dom Casmurro* by Machado de Assis (in Estonian, 1973).

Võlurpoiss (The Magic Boy), the children's book by Rachel de Queiroz, came to Kurfeldt by way of Ivar Ivask, an Estonian literary scholar living in United States, and her fellow Portuguese translator, Ain Kaalep. Ivask used to send huge boxes of books to Kaalep, who selected some and mailed others to Kurfeldt, accompanied by occasional notes suggesting that a particular book be translated into Estonian.

Ain Kaalep was born in Tartu in 1926; he graduated from Tartu University in 1956 with a major in Finno-Ugric languages. In addition to translating a huge body of work, he is also a poet, dramatist, critic, essayist, and professor. His translations from the literatures of many different countries reveal a fairly wide spectrum of interests. In addition to Portuguese, he has also translated from German, French, Spanish, Russian, Latvian, Tajik, Uzbek, Ukrainian, Greek, Latin, Finnish, Bulgarian, Polish and Turkish.

Jüri Talvet emphasizes Kaalep's importance in introducing the literature of the Iberian peninsula and South America. His most important translation from Portuguese is the above mentioned *Autopsühhograafia* (1973), a selection of poems by Fernando Pessoa and his three heteronyms – Alberto Caeiro, Álvaro de Campos and Ricardo Reis. His introduction of many Brazilian poets to Estonian readers was also an extremely important achievement.

Although Ain Kaalep considers himself to be an intellectual brand of poet, as do others, his selections of translations reveal another aspect. He has translated Spanish and Portuguese poets whose work emanates more from the heart than the intellect. Jüri Talvet commented that this ambivalence makes Ain Kaalep a soulmate of other humanists of wide scope, among whom one of the most original was the Portuguese poet Fernando Pessoa.

If a translation lacks an intelligent commentary and foreword explaining the cultural context there is a danger that the reception will be limited, retarding the progress of the receiving culture. Ain Kaalep was among the first, along with Aita Kurfeldt, who made it a rule rather than an exception to accompany the text with explanatory comments. The essays he published in addition to his translated texts reached their zenith from the end of the 1960s to the beginning of the 1970s (Talvet 2001).

His interest in translating from Portuguese started with African poets. "We had a small active group; Eerik Teder, for example, translated through Russian. We managed to meet some of the African poets personally in Moscow," recalled Ain Kaalep in a 2006 telephone interview. By the time Kaalep started translating the war poetry of the Angolan Agostinho Neto, he was already translating from Portuguese without assistance. In 1980, a book of Neto's poems became the first, and up to the present time (2011), the only book entirely dedicated to the work of an African poet ever translated from Portuguese to Estonian.

Paradoxically, Ain Kaalep did not value poetry written in Portuguese very highly at that time. "Portuguese is a language with international currency, and Portugal has always participated in global cultural movements, but compared to the other three Romance nations – France, Italy and Spain –Portuguese literature has always made a more modest contribution to world culture." (Kaalep 1968: 1240) He offers the explanation that Portugal's position on the edge of Europe made them more interested in exotic overseas countries, such as those of South America, Africa and the Far East, than in those of their own, more indistinctly perceived, continent (ib.).

In 1998, it was obvious that Ain Kaalep, commenting in the Estonian daily *Eesti Päevaleht* on the Portuguese writer, José Saramago, having received the Nobel Prize in literature, had radically changed his opinion of Portuguese literature in the intervening 30 years. "We welcome the fact that Portuguese literature has finally received well-deserved recognition that its role in world literature is no less important than British, French or Spanish; it simply escaped our attention." (Kaalep 1998)

During an interview conducted in 2006, Ain Kaalep said that he considered African Portuguese-language poetry insufficiently intriguing to require immediate translation, but in his opinion there was enough worthy material in Brazilian poetry. He was ready to publish a collection of poems by Carlos Drummond de Andrade, if he could find a willing publishing house.

Conclusions

The reception of Portuguese-language literature in Estonia has always been quite modest. At the beginning of the 20th century, this could be explained by the lack of cultural contacts; a century later, at a time when Estonia and Portugal are both members of the European Union and Brazil is a rising super-power, it is more difficult to explain that phenomenon.

Only two books by the 19th century masters have been translated and none of their contemporaries have been introduced to Estonia. A couple of books by two popular 20th century Brazilian authors (Jorge Amado and Paulo Coelho) have been translated. The extremely diverse, interesting and vibrant 20th century fiction from Brazil is still completely unknown to Estonian readers. One unfortunate reason is that many of the wonders of Brazilian literature have also not been translated into English, and thus remain unknown to the rest of Europe and the US. Likewise Portuguese modernist poetry, Pessoa excepted, remains unknown in Estonia.

Some Brazilian poetry was introduced in Estonia through the work of Ain Kaalep. No collection of works of a Brazilian poet has yet been published in a separate book.

African prose and poetry were important for political reasons in the 1960s–1970s in the Soviet Union. However, Estonian readers have had nearly no opportunity to read anything new from Angola or Mozambique in the last 30 years – the only piece that has been translated is the fairy tale *Kaval kass* (The Clever Cat) for the newsletter of the Estonian Farmers Union in 1995. During this period, the works of the Mozambican avant-garde author, Mia Couto, have been translated into more than ten languages. The Angolan language reformer, José Luandino Vieira, is better and more widely known; José Eduardo Agualusa is a best-selling author, and new young writers keep emerging, transforming the colorful history of their countries into a diversity of literature.

Translation policy has been very closely tied to historical circumstances. It is commonly believed in independent Estonia that everything was worse during Soviet times. But the numbers actually show that the strict translation quotas and the principle of avoiding

commercial mass literature were responsible for classical literature being published more easily. Since Estonia's independence, nearly everything except for mass literature in English escaped the attention of the new commercial publishing houses in the 1990s. Only the best-selling author, Paulo Coelho, has managed to fight his way into Estonian and garner much attention.

From 1890 to the present time, the global attitude towards Portuguese-language literatures has changed radically. After a long pause, the important Portuguese authors Pessoa and Saramago have emerged on the world stage, and this has helped to improve the general attitude towards Portuguese-language literature. There is some interest in translating the works of other authors writing in Portuguese into the major translation language of the world, English. I hope that this revival of interest will also give rise to more translations into Estonian.

References

Amado, J. 1955. *Luis Carlos Prestes*. Trans. from Russian by J. Nasalevitš. Foreword V. Jermolajev. Tallinn: Eesti Riiklik Kirjastus.

Amado, J. 1963. *Gabriela, nelk ja kaneel. Ühe provintsilinna kroonika.* Trans. by Aita Kurfeldt, verses translated by Ain Kaalep. Tallinn: Eesti Riiklik Kirjastus.

Amado, J. 1986. *Quincas Vesikuradi kolm surma*. Trans. by Meelike Palli. Loomingu Raamatukogu 19. Tallinn: Perioodika.

Assis, J. M. M. de 1973. *Dom Casmurro*. Trans. by Aita Kurfeldt. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Camoens, L. de 1890. Aja kaduvusest. (A Sonnett, after Camoens K. A. Hermann). – *Laulu ja mängu leht*, year VI nr 4.

Coelho, P. 2002a. *Alkeemik*. Trans. by Anneli Tuulik. Tallinn: Philos.

Coelho, P. 2002b. *Palverännak: maagi päevik*. Trans. by Kadre Vaik, Tiina Ristimets. Tallinn: Philos.

Coelho, P. 2002c. *Veronika otsustab surra*. Trans. by Anneli Tuulik. Tallinn: Philos.

Coelho, P. 2003. *Istusin Piedra jõe ääres ja nutsin*. Trans. by Kai Aareleid. Tallinn: Philos.

Coelho, P. 2004. *Üksteist minutit*. Trans. by Anneli Tuulik. Tallinn: Pilgrim.

Coelho, P. 2005. *Zahir*. Trans. by Anneli Tuulik. Tallinn: Pilgrim Group.

PESTI

EKL 2000 = *Eesti Kirjanike Leksikon*. Kruus, Oskar (comp.), Heino Puhvel (ed.). Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Hermann, K. A. 1890. Luis de Camoens. – *Laulu ja mängu leht*, year VI, No. 4.

Jaaksoo, A. (ed.) 1974. *Isa, mamba ja mina. Lugemispalu kaasaegsest Aafrika proosast*. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Jaaksoo, A. (translator) 1995. Kaval kass. Mosambiigi muinasjutt. – Eesti Maa, 30. jaanuar.

Kaalep, A. 1968. Selgitus Fernando Pessoa 7 luuletuse juurde. – *Looming*, 6, 1240–1241.

Kaalep, A. 1973. Järelsõna Brasiilia luulele. – *Looming*, 2, 806–807.

Kaalep, A. 1998. *Kolm Lydiat*. Tartu: Ilmamaa.

Kaalep, A. 1998. Kommentaar J. Saramagole Nobeli-preemia omistamise puhul. – *Eesti Päevaleht*, 9. oktoober.

Kaalep, A. 2006. Interview conducted and recorded by Mele Pesti.

Kaevats, M. 2010. Põhjus astuda Tubakapoodi, uks on avatud igal hetkel ja ükskõik kus. – *Postimees*, 05.01.

Kali, V. 1999. *Tuparize mõõk*. Trans. by Margit Levoll, Siivi Sarap ja Anneli Tuulik. Loomingu Raamatukogu 12. Tallinn: Perioodika.

Kangro, M. 2010. Kirjutaski endale elu pileti. – *Sirp*, 28.10

Kurfeldt, A. 1968. Saateks. – Queiros, José Maria Eça de. *Reliikvia*. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat, 7–8.

Kurfeldt, A. 1973. Neljasaja-aastane kunstiteos (eepos "Lusiaadid", 1572). – *Looming*, 2, 347–348.

Lobato, M. 1964. *Kollase rähni ordu. Jutustus*. Retold by Inna Tõnjanova from Portuguese, translated from Russian by H. Välipõllu. Tallinn: Eesti Riiklik Kirjastus.

Namora, F. 1984. *Pühapäeva õhtupoolikul*. Trans. by Meelike Palli. Loomingu Raamatukogu 17–19. Tallinn: Perioodika.

Neto, A. 1980. *Püha lootus*. Trans. by Ain Kaalep ja Eerik Teder. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

N.N. 1966. Kirjanduslikust situatsioonist Brasiilias. – *Keel ja Kirjandus*, 10, 646–647.

Pessoa, F. 1973. *Autopsühhograafia. Luulevalimik*. Trans. by Ain Kaalep. Loomingu Raamatukogu 1–2. Tallinn: Perioodika.

Pessoa, F. 1994. Anarhistist pankur. Jutustus. Translated by Maarja Kaplinski. – *Akadeemia*, 2, 320–348.

Pessoa, F. 1995. Rahutuste raamat (katkendid). Translation from French and afterword by Tõnu Õnnepalu. – *Vikerkaar*, 11, 15–54.

Pessoa, F. 2001a. Merimees. Trans. by Anneli Tuulik. – *Looming*, 6, 865–874.

Pessoa, F. 2001b. Tubakaäri. Translation and afterword by Jüri Talvet. – *Looming*, 7, 979- 984.

Pessoa, F, 2009. *Tubakapood.* Trans. by Tõnu Õnnepalu. Pilgrim Books.

Pessoa, F, 2010. *Sõnum. Valik loomingut.* Trans. by Ain Kaalep, Jüri Talvet, Maarja Kaplinski and Anneli Tuulik. Tartu Ülikooli kirjastus.

Queiroz, R. de, 1978. *Võlurpoiss*. Trans. by Aita Kurfeldt. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Queiros, J. M. E. de 1968. *Reliikvia.* Trans. by Aita Kurfeldt. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

RKA 1984 = *Renessansi kirjanduse antoloogia*. Edited and commented by Villem Alttoa. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Saramago, J. 2007. *Pimedus.* Trans. by Mare Vega Salamanca. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Semper, J. 1937. *Lõuna risti all.* Tartu: Eesti Kirjanikkude Liit.

Sousa, F. F. 2001. Nineteenth-Century Portuguese Novelist Eça de Queirós (1845–1900): From Realism/Naturalism to an "Aesthetics of Imperfection". In: Global Impact of the Portuguese Language. Ed. Asela Rodriguez de Laguna. New Brunswick and London: Transaction Publishers.

Talvet, J. 1981. Ain Kaalepi Poetica Iberica. – *Keel ja Kirjandus*, 6, 368–376.

Talvet, J. 1995. Hispanistika Eestis. – *Hispaania vaim*. Tartu: Ilmamaa, 11–23.

Talvet, J. 2001. Aita Kurfeldti meenutades. – *Sirp,* 1. detsember.

Talvet, J. 2005. Maailmakirjanduse kodustamise küsimusi. – *Keel ja Kirjandus*, 6, 433–441.

Teder, E. (Ed.) 1964. *Vabaduskoidiku rütmid. Aafrika poeesiat.* Tallinn: Eesti Riiklik Kirjastus.

Udam, H. 1998. Euroopa loeb muinasjuttu. – *Eesti Ekspress*, 10. aprill.

Veidemann, R. 2010. Fernando Pessoa mõtleva südame hääl. – Postimees, 13.06.

Vetemaa, E. 2002. "Lusiaadid": oktaave teisest laulust ja järelsõna. – *Looming*, 6, 879–882.

Forewords and Reviews: Some Notes
on the Translators' Presence in Estonian
Translational Space[1]

According to Gideon Toury, a seminal figure among descriptive translation researchers, translation is a norm governed activity. Translational norms are seen as repeated patterns of translational behaviour in a particular socio-cultural framework: norms are among the tools that can be used to define the translational situation at a particular time in a particular culture; norms denote the line between the accepted and the non-accepted translational behaviour as well as what is regarded as a translation 'proper' in a particular culture and what is not. Hence also the recognition that translational behaviour within one particular culture tends to manifest certain regularities (Toury 2004: 206–207). Although Toury regards normative prono-uncements, such as critical formulations around translations, to be the "by-products of the existence of norms" (ib. 214), researchers such as, for example, Şehnaz Tahir-Gürçağlar (2002) have shown that the critical description and study of paratextual elements, as well as texts constituting a discourse around the actual translations, can reveal the regularities of translational behaviour in a particular socio-cultural context.

Accordingly, the present paper will look at such norm-governed regularities, as well as the change in such regularities in translational behaviour, apparent in semi-theoretical and critical formulations. Among such formulations are the statements made by translators, editors, publishers and other persons involved in or connected with the translational activity, as well as the material inside book covers that introduces the main text. Such peritexts and epitexts (Genette 1997) are, on the one hand, positioned outside the main text and on the other

---

hand they can be regarded to function as adding an extra dimension to the main text. Due to the fact that the focus in the present paper lies on the issues concerning the visibility and self-representation of the translator, maintaining the difference between the terms epitext and peritext will not be necessary. I will borrow the terminological set devised by Gerard Genette and use the term *paratext* to refer to both – the texts constituting a more general discourse on translation outside book covers (the particular texts circulating independently such as reviews and critical appraisals), as well as the texts inside book covers other than the main text. Before addressing the issues of the visibility of the translator through a comparative case study concerning the translation of Baudelaire and García Lorca into Estonian, I would like to discuss one particular type of paratexts that has come to be widely practiced in Estonia – the afterword.

Literary translation in Estonia: *forewords* or *afterwords*?

Ernst-August Gutt, a well-known translation relevance theorist, points out in his article *Pragmatic Aspects of Translation: Some Relevance-Theory Observations* that the terms people have devised for certain kind of texts or utterances: "...can serve a significant purpose: they can help to coordinate the intentions of the communicator with the expectations of the audience" (Gutt: 1998: 46). Gutt's statement bears similarities to Phelippe Lejeune's (1989) concept of the tacit 'pact' between the reader and the writer concerning autobiographical writing; such 'pact' in Lejeune's case expresses the reader's agreement with the author on the non-fictionality of a text called autobiography. Gutt, on the other hand, proposes that each label attached to a certain text type triggers expectations in the readers and in this way plays an important part in the communicational process. Proceeding from Gutt, what are the reader's expectations concerning a *foreword*? Following the meaning of the word in English, the term *foreword* could broadly be said have three main implications. Firstly, the term certifies its positioning in front of a main text. Secondly, it indicates (in accordance with Gutt) the intermediary function of such a paratext, and thirdly, foreword (as opposed to a *preface*) is written by someone else than the author of the main text. However, in case of translated

literary texts, the translations of fiction as well as poems from another language to Estonian, forewords, in the sense of frontal positioning in regard to the main text have fallen out of practice during the so called Soviet time[2] and become substituted with a similar literary form positioned after the main text called an *afterword*. Nevertheless, we could argue that in case of literary texts the immediacy of the information provided by a text such as a foreword is considered to be of secondary importance, and thus, whether the information about the main text is positioned before or after the main text itself is not that relevant. Along these lines, if we, firstly, disregard the positioning of forewords in front of a text; secondly, take into consideration texts inside book covers that function as mediators between the main text and the target reader; and thirdly, consider texts that are written by somebody else than the author of the original/main text, we could talk about both *afterwords* as well as *forewords* in much the same idiom – as of texts functioning to mediate between the author of the main text

---

[2] Several phases in the change of the position of the translator's foreword to an afterword in a spatial sense can be observed in Estonia starting from the beginning of 20th century. With severe generalizations we could describe a cycle of three phases. Firstly, following an arbitrary phase at the beginning of 20th century, literary translations into Estonian during the 1920s and 1930s, prose and poetry, were generally accompanied with a translator's foreword positioned in front of the main text. Such foreword contained the introduction to the book, notes about the author of the original and very often also the translator's comments on the translation process, difficulties or peculiarities. Secondly, due to the severe censorship during late the 1940s and early 1950s, books published before Soviet occupation underwent severe control in public libraries. As a result many forewords by the translators, former literary elite, who had fallen out of favour were cut from the books, the names of the translators became erased from the publications, inked over or ripped out resulting in the loss of agency in translated literary works (See Monticelli (in print)). Closely connected with the previous, from the late 1940s we can observe a period in Estonian publishing that can be called a silent period with invisible authors and translators (See Gielen (in print)). When, in rare cases, notes on a particular translation appear, they are published after the main text (hence the term 'järelsõna' (afterword)) and are often nameless. From this period up to very recently Estonian counterpart for the English word *foreword* can be said to be *afterword*.

(source text in case of a translation) and the target reader. Generally speaking, the aim of such texts is to provide the readers with background information and negotiate the meaning of the work at hand. However, when talking about the presence of the translator in the context of Estonian publishing traditions there is an apparent need to balance between the terms *foreword*, *afterword* and *translator's afterword*.

When looking at the afterwords of Estonian literary translations (including poetry) from the Soviet period (1945–1991), we can draw up two broad categories. Firstly, afterwords that have been accompanying the main text in the source language and have been translated by the translator of the main text/source text, and secondly, those added by the target text producers. (There is a third negotiable type that can be called a zero foreword, a feature that can be quite telling; such a category is, however, quite dependent on the general arbitrariness of the publishing traditions in Estonia.) Afterwords that have been added to the translated text during the process of translation can in turn be broadly divided into three subcategories. Firstly, afterwords produced by a specialist in the field (a literary critic, a professor of literature etc.); secondly, afterwords by the editor of the translation; and lastly, afterwords written by the translator of the main text – the translation. In the second part of the present paper I am particularly interested in the latter. I will treat the translator's afterwords as a means of mediation between the source text, the original, and the target text, the translation, looking at how the translation is presented to the reader as well as scrutinizing the translator's presence in the afterwords. But first of all I will address some broader issues related to translational practices in Estonia and in a small culture in general.

Translators in a (small) culture

Throughout years statements saying that the vast impact of translations to a small culture is difficult to overestimate[3], have caught my

---

[3] See, for example Sepamaa 1960; Talvet 2005: 451; Kaldjärv 2007: 9; Tamm 2010;

eye. Anne Lange, an Estonian translator and translation scholar, says in her *The Translator's Primer*[4], that we are born into the world that has been translated for us (Lange 2008: 7). The same has been expressed by many other Estonian scholars dealing with translation. However, Anne Lange's further assumption that translation in a small culture is of equal importance to the texts created in that culture is not new but, nevertheless, intriguing. By equalling the significance of the translated work with that of our own, Estonian production, Lange indicates that certain texts, be it then The Bible or Astrid Lindgren's books for children, have been available for us, the Estonians, for a long period of time and have in the course of time become a part of our collective memory. These books have become domesticated by our culture, to use the term rendered popular by Lawrence Venuti (2008). Proceeding in accordance with Venuti, an important question here would be that of the visibility of the translator – the importance of the visibility of the translator to a small culture. And indeed, apart from the names of some of the translators do we know much of the translating process, the methods the translators use, the choices they make? Apart from manifesting themselves in the translated text through those translational choices, are the translators visible outside the translated texts? I believe these questions could point to a larger framework or patterns underlying translational practices within Estonian culture. Contextualization and critical description of material around the translations of the main text can show the processes of and concepts related to translation in the observed socio-cultural context. Therefore the analysis of translator's afterwords as well as other paratextual material related to translations could provide the researchers with valuable information on the translational situation as well as on the position of the translator in general.

Representations of the translator's *self*

The texts under observation in the present paper are the second edition of the translation of Frederico García Lorca's selection of

---

[4] Translation of the title into English by the author of the present paper

poems into Estonian by Ain Kaalep titled *Mu kätes on tuli,* published in 1997, with an afterword by the translator. I have chosen the second edition because the afterword has also been reviewed prior to the second publishing and the translator has became somewhat more visible, reflecting also on the foreword of the first edition. In addition to Lorca's collection, I will look at the translation of Charles Baudelaire's *Les Fleurs du Mal,* translated into Estonian by Tõnu Õnnepalu, published in 2000 and afterworded by the translator. However, the focus of the paper does not lie in the particular source text, the Baudelaire, the Lorca; nor does it lie in the translation of Baudelaire, the translation of Lorca, but rather in the texts around these translations, the paratexts. In case of a translated text the afterword can be said to have the possibility to influence the reader's perception of the text (in case the afterword is read, of course). It is interesting to see the relations between when (temporal sequence) and what kind of information is presented by the translator in the afterword of a translated work. What are the things the translator believes are important to keep in mind regarding the main text and who is perceived to be the target reader of the particular text. But more importantly, afterword contributes to whether the reader perceives the main text to be *the* Baudelaire, *the* Lorca, or the translation of Baudelaire, the translation of Lorca.

Translator's forewording choices can be influenced by the accepted patterns of the genre of forewording/afterwording although the genre itself may have slightly different requirements in different cultures. In Estonian translations of literary texts (novels, short stories and the like) the translator's afterword, as a rule, follows a certain pattern. Such pattern includes, as a compulsory element, the life and other works of the author, the school of writing, the style, and more importantly, the current work as presented in the original/source language, how it is perceived by the source culture. The language, style and problems of translation rarely merit any attention. Commonly, neither the translation, nor the translator is present in the afterword. The translator, however, tends to become more visible in the translator's afterword of more specific literary texts, in our case, poetry translations. And it is from the degree of visibility as well as the choices explicated by this visibility that we

can draw information about the translator's position in a particular culture at a particular time. In Estonia as well as in the rest of the world recent years have brought along a gradual change in the issues concerning the position of the translator. The invisible translator has become more visible. There is an emphasis on visibility which may, first and foremost, be due to the attitude originating from contemporary business and commerce world stating that when you are not visible you are not there, an attitude of a very Western origin, I believe. Secondly, the practice of making the author visible along with the politics of location as originating from feminist critical practice, has become an alternative (not to say new) way to create objectivity also in academic writing. Thus, the movement and gradual change in approach to the visibility of the translator can also be witnessed by studying the paratexts and comparing the relevant discourses of translation.

Translation methods and ideas as well as the concept of 'good' translation are different at different times in different cultures depending as much on traditions as on prominent translators. Anne Lange, among others, has pointed out in the introduction to her doctoral dissertation that the traditional pattern for poetry translation until the late 20th century in Estonia has been *homorythmic* i.e. metrical translation. A strong proponent of the so-called *homorythmic* translation is Ain Kaalep, a prolific translator and poet, who, no doubt, is one of the best experts on poetry translation in Estonia. Referring to a very visible change in the established poetry translation pattern, Lange points to Tõnu Õnnepalu's non-rhyme translation of Baudelaire's *Les Fleurs du Mal* in the year 2000 (Lange 2007). I do not want to suggest that deviations from the prevalent homorythmic translation did not exist prior to Õnnepalu's Baudelaire. Neither do I want to stress the temporal significance of before and after Kaalep or before and after Õnnepalu, but merely to observe the volatile movement of changes in thinking about the practice and the meaning of translation in the light of the translator's presence in the afterwords of poetry translations into Estonian.

Ain Kaalep's Lorca and Tõnu Õnnepalu's Baudelaire revisited

Let us first look at the translator's afterword of the second edition of the translation of Frederico García Lorca's poems called *Mu kätes on tuli* by Ain Kaalep, published in 1997 (first edition called *Kaneelist torn* was published in 1966). The text has a noteworthy format of reversed indentation where not the first line of the paragraph is indented but rather the paragraph itself. In such a manner the key points of the life and career of Frederico Garcia Lorca are brought out. The translator makes a mention of the verse forms used by Lorca and the verse forms used in Spanish context in general, bringing out the importance of eight syllable verse and assonance rhyme to Spanish poetry. Without a wish to go deeper into the issue of versificational norms, I hereby want to make the point of the places in afterwords, where it is possible to see the translators' presence. In the case of Lorca's translator's afterword we see the presence via translational choices hinted at by the translator in between a general mediating process. We can say that the formal elements of this particular afterword provide an interesting deviation from general norms of layout allowing thus the writer/translator to accentuate and link information. Starting with the mention of the date and place of birth of the poet, the text precedes with the early years, highlighting by indentation the key points in Lorca's life and career until its tragic end, at the same time contextualizing the events by more general historical and source-cultural facts. In regard to the content of the afterword, we can say that it is designed to fulfil the expectations of the reader at a particular moment in time, in a particular socio-cultural context, since by the time of the publication of the second edition of Lorca's poetry in 1997, Ain Kaalep had been a prominent, norm-setting poetry translator and reviewer for decades.

After the translator's final contemplation about the poet's ivory tower there is a small notice marked off by dots that is of particular interest to me. In this notice the translator explains the background of the figurative image used in the title of the collection's first edition (1966). Kaalep says that during the time that has passed since the publication of the first edition certain things have become clearer. He

subtly points to the end of the Soviet regime and mentions that some of the weaker translations have been left out from the current, second edition (Kaalep 1997: 156). The whole paragraph is in third person singular – Kaalep, the translator himself, talking about the translator and 'what the translator has done'.

In a review essay on Ain Kaalep's translation called "On Garcia Lorca's Poetry and Ain Kaalep's Translation"[5] (2005 [1997]), Jüri Talvet, Professor of Comparative Literature at the University of Tartu, another seminal figure Estonian translational space, stresses that the sale success of Lorca's collection is possibly due to the fact that people in Estonia love Lorca's poems (Talvet 2005: 443). The question for me here is not whether people love Lorca's poetry or not. The question is rather, whether we recognize that this is not Lorca's poetry, but Ain Kaalep's translation, his interpretation that we love. Similar issues can often be seen in the all too scarce reviews of translations into Estonian, where the source culture text is introduced not from the perspective of the translation, but as the text is perceived by the source language culture. Talvet points out that Lorca's poetry: "…could be regarded as the textbook for poets and Ain Kaalep's translation can be the textbook for translators of poetry, who seem to have started to imagine that poetry translation is a simple thing." (Ib. 447). And indeed, translating poetry is never simple. Talvet recognizes that translation, being inevitably a different text, cannot have the same qualities as the original, and that poetry translation is a poetic imitation of the original. Basing my arguments on the aforementioned article, for Talvet poetry translation has a dual authorship of complicated nature, in which ideally the philosophical gist of the original has been not retained (because this would be impossible because of the language differences), but captured or re-created in another language by the author of the translation. This, however, preconditions the existence of a translator, who recognizes the essence of a particular author or a particular poem, does not manifest his own personality or preferences in the translation, but the other way round – one who becomes

---

[5] Translations into English by the author of the present paper.

dissolved in the translations, one who is able to sacrifice his/her personality for the sake of the original (ib.451).

Hence, the allusion in both the review and the translator's afterword to Lorca's collection can be said to be source culture oriented, with the aim to enrich the target culture with the master-pieces of world literature, convey in more or less successful attempts of *umdichtung* the philosophy otherwise not available for the Estonian reader.

In this light, it is interesting to look at Tõnu Õnnepalu's afterword of Charles Baudelaire's rhyme dodging translation that was published some three years later and appears to be the first large scale deviation from the prevalent translational norms that has been noticed and that has merited a number of critical appraisals. No doubt, there are several reasons for the interest in Õnnepalu's translation, one of them being his status as one of the most renowned idiosyncratic Estonian authors. Õnnepalu's Baudelaire is the translation from Baudelaire's *Œuvres complete. Tome I,* published in 1975. It is a type of *en face* translation featuring parallel French and Estonian text, a practice that puts the translator in an especially vulnerable position. The translation has been thoroughly afterworded and endnoted by the translator. Õnnepalu starts the afterword to Baudelaire with a poetic, paragraph-long sentence, the first word of it being a significant *maybe* that is repeated once more during the sentence. The passage is difficult to grasp during first reading since the first pair of words: "Maybe psychology, ..." is set off from the rest of the main clause with a number of parenthetical expressions full of allusions and images. To contrast the dreamy beginning, the next paragraph is a matter of fact description of Baudelaire's tombstone and, further on, a colourful depiction of the controversies in the Baudelaire family follows. The translator is creating a scene for the story of Baudelaire in a very artistic, fanciful manner, presenting the facts of life playfully. Apart from manifesting himself in the untypical story-like presentation of information, the register and the idiom, the translator, Õnnepalu, is present in explications of the techniques and methods he has used throughout his translation. The methods of and thoughts on translation are made explicit in a long passage at the end of the afterword. Õnnepalu's immediate

presence is also felt by the use of the pronoun *I*. Keeping in mind that an afterword, similarly to a foreword, can help to coordinate the intentions of the translator with the expectations of the audience – the readers, Õnnepalu openly counters the *homorhymic* poetry translating traditions by saying that it is: "...not worth forcing the content into rhymes and meter since all this mathematics would result in rhymes jingling together in a slightly ridiculous manner." (Õnnepalu 2000: 484). This particular translator's afterword can be considered as a strong statement in favour of the self positioning of a translator, the aim being to counter and oppose the conventional invisibility of the translator. In a mock-apologetic mode the translator implies that he has taken action and the action taken might not be in coherence with the expectations of the reader (or critic). *Maybe* is a significant word to begin such an afterword with, especially when considering the reception/discourse that followed the publication. The use of the word *maybe* as the very first introductory element seems to try to create a space for a different view of translation, a different interpretation from the part of the translator.

Contrary to the almost nonexistent response a poetry edition normally receives, Õnnepalu's Baudelaire has accumulated a relatively large number of critical appraisals. For example, in a review to Õnnepalu's translation of Baudelaire, Paul-Eerik Rummo, who is a well-known Estonian poet himself, recognizes that this book of poetry, with its conscious renouncement of the traditional metre and rhyme might signify a beginning of something new (Rummo 2001:175–178). This 'something new' indicates to both a new attitude as compared to the prevalent norms as well as a new way to present Baudelaire to the Estonian readers. Rummo seconds to the justifications offered by Õnnepalu in his translator's afterword to opt for a non-rhyme translation because of the density of Baudelaire's poetry. Nevertheless, other critics are not that benevolent. Tanel Lepsoo, a representative of an academic establishment, University of Tartu, uses a more prescriptive set of expressions to refer to Õnnepalu's translation: *a translator must...*, *Bereman also demands...*, *one has to...* (Lepsoo 2005: 175–179). Such expressions are telling considering the translational situation and context. They suggest the existence of a set of behavioural norms imposed by our cultural

context to the translator; the expressive means used by Lepsoo are also suggestive of the expectations of the target reader. Among other issues such as referential deformations, Lepsoo brings out the problem of translator's excessive subjectivity: "...Õnnepalu, the writer, is never far from Õnnepalu, the translator..."; "...the translator does not look for the message sent by Baudelaire..." (ib.175). We can infer from the previous examples that the demand for translator's objectivity, fidelity to the source text and translator's disappearance inside the translation are the dominant criteria for a "good" poetry translation. It also appears that the translator's afterword is a powerful trigger for the discussion, since both Lepsoo and Rummo draw heavily from the explanations given in the translator's afterword by Tõnu Õnnepalu.

When comparing Ain Kaalep's translator's afterword of Lorca (1997) and the ensuing contemplation by Talvet to the paratexts of Õnnepalu's translation of Baudelaire in 2000, we can see that in the first case the scarse manifestation of the translator and the review indicating the necessity of the translator to suppress the 'self', be objective and become dissolved in the translation, can be considered as being in accordance with the expectations of the target audience and hence also with the norms of translational behaviour. As for Õnnepalu's translation – a breach of these conventions can be inferred when studying the paratextual material. Õnnepalu's approach to the source text can be compared to that of an original author. He sees the translated text as a mediated product that has acquired an extra quality during the process of mediation. The translator has become visible in the case of, spurring heated discussions, and in doing so Õnnepalu's Baudelaire has merited a fair amount of attention.

Maybe...

If we now move one step further to the translational situation from 2000 until the present, we could take a look at the translator's notes in the Internet based literary journal *Ninniku* (published from 2001), the first journal in Estonia that is solely concentrated on poetry translations (edited by Hasso Krull and Kalju Kruusa). On the

introductory page to the website *Ninniku's* aim is defined to be, among other things, to bring to the fore different ways of translating poetry and to intensify the discussion on poetry translation. The translations freely experiment with the different contexts and meanings added by the target culture in order to bring out different possibilities of the original. In his translator's note to Miroslav Holub's, Janos Pilinszky's, Vasko Popa's translations, Märt Väljataga admits that the translations are made without looking at the original, via English, and that most of the poems are probably incorrectly translated (Väljataga 2001). Such an attitude to poetry translation does particularly stand out considering the prevalent understanding and ongoing discussions on poetry translation in Estonia. This statement also brings out the importance of paratextual material, such as translator's afterword, as well as the importance of the translator to position him/herself in regard to the translated text. And as Jüri Talvet says: "…the translator should have a total freedom in his work with the original" (Talvet 2005: 453). I as a reader would just like to know what has been done and why.

To conclude with, apart form being a source of information on the main text by contextualizing it or trying to mediate the importance of the original in the original cultural context, paratextual material as a frame can be telling in many other senses. For example the foreword/afterword more often than not reveals the attitude of the translator towards the translation and in doing so often also mirrors the attitude of the target culture. What is more, it functions as a mediator between the translator and the target language audience negotiating the space for the translation. In the light of the discussions on the importance of translation for a small culture (see above) such negotiations are inevitable from time to time. The researchers of translation follow discourses such as pointed out in the present paper with keen interest. The particular case of Baudelaire's translation, where a strong presence of the translator can be felt, as opposed to the prevalent norm patterns advocating fluency and invisibility, gives an insight into the field of poetry translation and the possible shifts and changes in translational norms in Estonia. Although the texts under scrutiny point to one particular case related to norms of accepted translational behaviour, paratexts on a broader

scale can show the rises and falls of different approaches to translation and translators. The presented discourse can be observed as illustrative of the volatile movement of different socio-cultural norms that govern translations explicating thus translational behaviour at different points in time, in different cultures. Estonian culture, as well as any other, would only benefit from a wide variety of translational concepts and from the disputes spurred by opposing viewpoints on the matter.

References

Baudelaire, C. 2000. *Kurja õied.* Translated by Tõnu Õnnepalu. Tallinn: Eesti Keele Sihtasutus.

García Lorca F. 1997. *Mu kätes on tuli.* Translated by Ain Kaalep. Tallinn:Vagabund.

Genette, G. 1997. *Paratexts: Tresholds of Interpretations,* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Gielen, K. in print. Authors as Translators: Emerging Hierarchical Patterns of Literary Activity in Early Soviet Estonia. – Chalvin, Antoine; Lange, Anne; Monticelli Daniele (eds). *Between Cultures and Texts: Itineraries in Translation History. Entre les cultures et les textes: itinéraires en histoire de la traduction.* Hamburg: Peter Lang.

Gutt, E-A. 1998. Pragmatic Aspects of Translation: Some Relevance-Theory Observations. – *The Pragmatics of Translation. Topics in Translation 12.* L. Hickey (ed). Philadelphia: Multilingual Matters Ldt. 41–53.

Kaldjärv, K. 2007. *Autor, jutustaja, tõlkija. Borgese autofiktsioonid eesti keeles.* Tartu: Tartu Ülikooli Kirjastus.

Kaalep, A. 1997. Saateks. F. García Lorca. *Mu kätes on tuli.* Tallinn: Vagabund, 149–156.

Lange, A. 2008. *Tõlkimise aabits.* Tallinn: Valgus.

Lange, A. 2007. *Orase poeetika.* Tallinn: TLÜ Kirjastus.

Lejeune, P. 1989. The Autobiographical Pact. – *On Autobiography.* Paul John Eakin (ed). Translated by Katherine M. Leary. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 3–30.

Lepsoo, T. 2005. Kaotatud autor ja taasleitud autor. Pilguheit Tõnu Õnnepalu tõlkepoeetikale. – *Vikerkaar,* 4/5, 174–179.

Monticelli, D. in print."Totalitarian Translation" as a Means of Forced Cultural Change. The Case of Postwar Soviet Estonia. – Chalvin, Antoine; Lange, Anne; Monticelli, Daniele (eds). *Between Cultures and*

GIELEN

Texts: Itineraries in Translation History. Entre les cultures et les textes: itinéraires en histoire de la traduction. Hamburg: Peter Lang.

NINNIKU http://www.eki.ee/ninniku/, accessed 15.11.2008.

Rummo, P.-E. 2001. Kõva koputus Baudelaire'i uksele. – *Vikerkaar*, 2/3, 175–178.

Sepamaa, H. 1960. Mõtteid kirjanduslikust tõlkimisest. – *Looming*, 10 (1549–1558).

Tahir-Gürçağlar, Ş. 2002. What Texts Don't Tell: The Uses of Paratexts in Translation Research. – T. Hermans, *Crosscultural Transgressions*, Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing, 44–60.

Talvet, J. 2005 [1997]. Garcia Lorca luulest ja Ain Kaalepi tõlkest. – J. Talvet. *Tõrjumatu äär*, Tartu: Ilmamaa, 442–453.

Tamm, M. 2010. *Tõlkija nähtamatusest tõlkekriitikas. Toimetajast rääkimata.* – Sirp 19.03.2010.

Toury, G. 2004. The Nature and Role of Norms in Translation. – L. Venuti (ed). *The Translation Studies Reader*, New York and London: Routledge, 205–218.

Venuti, L. 2008. *The Translator's Invisibility: A History of Translation*, New York: Routledge.

Väljataga, M. 2001. *Ninniku*, http://www.eki.ee/ninniku/index2.php?n=4, accessed 15.11.2008.

Õnnepalu, T. 2000. Järelsõna. – Charles Baudelaire. *Kurja õied.* Tallinn: Eesti Keele Sihtasutus, 433–487.

Traducciones entre comunidades interliterarias específicas

1. Introducción

El propósito de este trabajo es ver de qué manera el volumen de traducciones entre diversas literaturas refleja el funcionamiento de grupos de literaturas de forma conjunta. La hipótesis es que ciertos grupos de literaturas muy cohesionados funcionan de manera análoga a los polisistemas, estructurándose en centro y periferias. Por lo tanto, las traducciones se establecen fundamentalmente entre literaturas centrales, aunque las traducciones entre literaturas periféricas son también relativamente importantes para el desarrollo de estas.

La base teórica para este estudio se basa en dos teorías combinadas. La más importante de ellas es la teoría de los polisistemas, propuesta por Even-Zohar (1990), ya que ha demostrado ser muy útil para el estudio de las relaciones entre diversas literaturas, especialmente en el ámbito de la traducción. Según esta teoría, pertenece a la literatura todo lo que se relaciona con ella: editores, lectores, bibliotecas, etc. Todos estos elementos se relacionan entre sí en el polisistema o literatura, estructurándose en centro (el que lidera las relaciones del polisistema) y periferias.

Esta teoría será complementada con ciertas ideas de la teoría del proceso interliterario de Ďurišin (1993). Este autor ha estudiado grupos de literaturas especialmente cohesionados, llamados comunidades interliterarias específicas (CIEs). Tomaremos de él el nombre de estos grupos, los ejemplos de CIEs por él mencionados y alguna idea tomada de sus investigaciones en el campo de las relaciones interliterarias.

Aunque ambas teorías son muy distintas entre sí, se verá que coinciden en muchos aspectos aquí propuestos. Por otra parte, hay que decir que se prestará especial atención a la CIE del ámbito

español, en la cual las tendencias que a continuación se presentan se muestran de manera más evidente.

2. La CIE y el macro-polisistema

En la teoría del proceso interliterario de Ďurišin (1993: 23) se considera el funcionamiento de las CIEs como análogo al de la literatura nacional, aunque en un nivel de cohesión más bajo:

> Le trait spécifique des communautés interlittéraires citées est le fait qu'elles s'inclinent, du point de vue typologique, vers l'unité historico-littéraire de la littérature nationale, ce qui ne signifie pas qu'elles s'identifient avec elle.

Ďurišin concibe las literaturas nacionales como unidades literarias orgánicas, aunque construidas por las sociedades y por lo tanto históricamente condicionadas. También reconoce que no todos los grupos sociales admiten la existencia de una identidad para la CIE, similar a la de las literaturas nacionales. Pero esto no quita que algunos grupos sí la admitan, ni que haya sido propuesta en algún momento de la historia de la comunidad. Así suele ocurrir dentro del marco político-administrativo del estado, en que los poderes políticos tienden a crear una identidad nacional que justifique la división administrativa.

Por tanto, el hecho de que las literaturas catalana, vasca y gallega tengan una historia literaria propia e independiente no impide que se puedan integrar en un estudio conjunto de la literatura en el ámbito español. Esto se explica porque la identidad de la CIE condiciona la propia evolución de cada literatura, según las relaciones que los agentes literarios quieran mantener con las literaturas de su entorno (aproximación, alejamiento o complementariedad). De esta forma, el marco de la CIE permite ofrecer explicaciones más globales que van más allá de las relaciones entre cada par de literaturas. Tal estudio integrador, pues, no implica necesariamente que las distintas litera-turas nacionales hayan de ser consideradas regionales, como partes inseparables de una entidad mayor. Se trata de admitir que esta entidad superior, con identidad propia, aglutine a varias naciones,

relativamente autónomas pero también integradas en una comunidad que las engloba. Negar esta posibilidad sería lo mismo que negar una identidad europea compatible con las naciones que la integran.

Desde una perspectiva polisistémica no habría tantos reparos a la hora de integrar el estudio de las distintas literaturas, ya que las cuestiones identitarias pasan a un segundo plano y lo que se ve son las complejas relaciones que se establecen entre literaturas. De hecho, Even-Zohar también propone la existencia de grupos de literaturas que funcionan de modo análogo a los polisistemas unitarios. Veámoslo con más detenimiento:

> within a group of relatable national literatures, such as the literatures of Europe, hierarchical relations have been established since the very beginnings of these literatures. Within this (macro-) polysystem some literatures have taken peripheral positions, which is only to say that they were often modelled to a large extent upon an exterior literature. (Even-Zohar 1990: 48; 1978: 8)

Sin embargo, en ninguna de las dos teorías mencionadas se desarrolla esta idea de los grupos de literaturas como análogos a las literaturas nacionales (según Ďurišin) o polisistemas (según Even-Zohar), considerando las similitudes y las particularidades de cada uno de los niveles. Por lo tanto, nos detendremos brevemente en este aspecto.

3. Estructura de la CIE

En primer lugar hay que tratar las cuestiones de la delimitación. Ďurišin menciona varias CIEs de Europa: el ámbito español, el suizo, el belga, el de las Islas Británicas, el germanófono, el de las antigua Yugoslavia, Checoslovaquia y URSS. Even-Zohar (1979: 301–2), en cambio, solo ofrece una referencia a este respecto: literatura europea, esquemáticamente comentada en su artículo "Polysystem Theory". Pero el concepto de macro-polisistema puede ser aplicado a conjuntos más grandes o más pequeños, con menor grado de cohesión a medida que ascendemos en la escala. Se puede decir, por lo tanto, que abarca todas las categorías interliterarias señaladas por Ďurišin:

CIE, comunidad interliteraria clásica, regiones, literatura mundial, etc. Esta es una de las diferencias entre ambos teóricos: Even-Zohar propone solo los conceptos más abstractos y esquemáticos, para que puedan ser aplicados al mayor número de casos posible, mientras que Ďurišin se esfuerza por conceptualizar de diferente manera realidades históricas distintas. Ambas perspectivas, pues, pueden ser complementadas para obtener una visión más completa. Aquí utilizaremos el término CIE para designar un macro-polisistema con características propias de una CIE en cuanto a la cohesión entre las literaturas que la conforman. Esto nos permite, al mismo tiempo, tomar como ejemplos de trabajo las CIEs propuestas por Ďurišin para Europa (entre ellas la española), sin tener que detenernos exhaustivamente en su justificación.

Por otra parte, la existencia de una identidad propia para la CIE favorece las relaciones intersistémicas y su apoyo institucional, especialmente en el marco de un estado común. Aunque también se puede dar el caso del alejamiento mutuo. Lo que se quiere decir con esto es que la imagen, la conciencia y la identidad de una CIE favorecen su funcionamiento unitario (como polisistema). Esto implica la interdependencia entre literaturas de una misma CIE, similar a la que se establece entre el centro y la periferia de un polisistema: ambos se necesitan mutuamente, aunque de distintas maneras. De ahí que las interrelaciones dentro de la CIE sean tan abundantes.

La organización interna de las CIEs (tal y como se propone aquí el concepto) es, pues, análoga a la del polisistema, y por lo tanto tiene una estructuración similar. Ha de haber una o varias literaturas centrales, canónicas, más institucionalizadas, más prestigiosas, más desarrolladas en su repertorio, que guían en cierto modo la evolución de la CIE. Se erigen, por tanto, en centro de referencia para el resto de los miembros. Todas estas características no tienen por qué darse siempre juntas necesariamente, pero frecuentemente es esto lo que ocurre.

Aunque la presencia de varias literaturas centrales es evidente en la CIE suiza, lo más habitual es que solo una de las literaturas predomine claramente sobre las otras, ya que estas CIEs fueron creadas por dominación (político-militar, cultural) o por naciona-

lismo centrípeto. Así, por ejemplo, en la comunidad de la antigua URSS domina la literatura rusa, en la ex-Yugoslavia la serbo-croata, en las Islas Británicas la inglesa, en España la castellana, y así sucesivamente. Puede resultar de interés el hecho de que, en muchos casos, el polisistema central ocupe también la posición geográfica central, seguramente motivada por razones estratégicas (militares y otras) que no es el momento de comentar.

En cuanto a las otras literaturas, suelen ser periféricas, menos institucionalizadas, menos prestigiosas y menos desarrolladas. Esta periferia de la CIE también está estructurada, debido al diferente grado de desarrollo de los polisistemas y a las relaciones particulares de las literaturas periféricas entre sí. Por ejemplo, en la CIE española la posición central es ocupada por la literatura castellana, ya que es la más legitimada institucionalmente (para muchos literatura española es equivalente a literatura castellana), tiene un repertorio más amplio y está presente en todo el territorio de la CIE, lo cual la hace más poderosa en términos de dominación cultural. Por el contrario, los polisistemas vasco y gallego adoptan posiciones periféricas, ya que aún se encuentran en vías de normalización y desarrollo, su estado de institucionalización es precario (ver González-Millán 1991 para el caso gallego) y su prestigio y visibilidad resultan escasos, especialmente fuera de las fronteras de la CIE. En cuanto al polisistema catalán, se puede decir que ocupa una posición intermedia entre el centro y la periferia. No tiene graves problemas de normalización y su grado de institucionalización y desarrollo son considerables, pero no puede equipararse al polisistema castellano en este sentido ni ha alcanzado su mismo reconocimiento, especialmente a escala internacional.

Esta diferenciación entre literaturas centrales y periféricas no implica que todos los productos (o productores, consumidores, instituciones y otros factores) procedentes de la literatura central sean más prestigiosos/canónicos/centrales que cualquier otro de las literaturas periféricas. Por el contrario, hemos de pensar en varios centros y periferias que se entrecruzan, de la misma manera que ocurre en el interior de un polisistema. Cada sistema y subsistema, aún siendo periférico, tiene su propio centro. La realidad es más compleja de lo que a veces se piensa. Si hablamos de polisistemas no podemos verlos como una línea continua en la que las posiciones de

DOMÍNGUEZ PÉREZ

cada factor sean fácilmente delimitables. Más bien hemos de con-
cebirlos como redes de relaciones en que los distintos sistemas se
cruzan, se solapan y cambian de posición constantemente.

De la misma manera, en el nivel de la CIE un modelo (o
productor, institución, producto...) de la literatura central puede
ocupar una posición más periférica que otro procedente de un
sistema central en una literatura periférica. Por ejemplo, el canónico
autor vasco Bernardo Atxaga (seudónimo de José Irazu) ocupa en el
nivel de la CIE una posición más central que David Bernardo, autor
periférico de literatura infantil y juvenil castellana que solo ha
publicado un libro en 2001[1]. Pero si observamos los sistemas canó-
nicos de cada polisistema hemos de reconocer que el de la literatura
castellana es más amplio, está más legitimado y tiene mayor
incidencia en la CIE (por ejemplo, sus obras son leídas en todo el
territorio). Así pues, la posición que cada literatura asume en la CIE
condiciona hasta cierto punto la posición de cada factor polisistémico
concreto, pero no la determina. Por ejemplo, un modelo innovador
procedente del exterior de la CIE tiene más posibilidades de ocupar
una posición más central si es introducido en el polisistema central
de la CIE (más prestigioso), y no en un polisistema periférico. Sin
embargo, no siempre ocurre así.

En cualquier caso, el centro de la CIE siempre rige en parte su
evolución, puesto que tiene mayor peso y energía, mayor capacidad
de desarrollo e innovación, un grado de institucionalización más
elevado, etc. Mientras, las literaturas periféricas tratan de
desarrollarse, en tensión constante con el centro que a veces supone
un obstáculo a su desarrollo.

4. Funcionamiento de las traducciones

En el campo de la traducción debemos recordar que las transferen-
cias intra-sistémicas poseen el mismo funcionamiento que las
transferencias intersistémicas (entre ellas las traducciones), como

---

[1] Si bien este libro se ha traducido al catalán y ha sido reeditado en 2005 en
castellano y catalán, la posición polisistémica de su escritor sigue siendo
muy periférica comparada con la de Atxaga.

señala Even-Zohar (1990: 73): "translational procedures between two systems (languages/literatures) are in principle analogous, even homologous, with transfers within the borders of the system".

Ďurišin (1989: 106) opina lo mismo, aunque usando otros conceptos:

> National literary relationships and affinities on the one hand and interliterary relationships and affinities on the other are basically governed by the same laws. At the same time, however, they are characterized by a whole series of differences.

Por lo tanto, aún admitiendo ciertas diferencias entre ambos tipos de relaciones (postuladas como diferencias de grado y no de distintas formas de relacionarse), podemos pensar que el mecanismo es aplicable también a las CIEs. Esto es, la forma en que se producen las transferencias intra-sistémicas entre diferentes sistemas de un polisistema (del centro a la periferia y viceversa, del sistema de adultos al infantil, etc.) será análoga a la que rige las transferencias intersistémicas dentro de un macro-polisistema (en este caso, de una CIE en el sentido propuesto).

Si esto es así, lo habitual será que, en períodos de crisis o cambio, las innovaciones lleguen al centro de la CIE (es decir, a la literatura central) de dos maneras: bien creando nuevas combinaciones con los modelos existentes en la periferia (lo que incluye las literaturas periféricas de la CIE), bien importando modelos foráneos a través de traducciones innovadoras, próximas al polo de adecuación. La elección de una u otra opción depende de las condiciones de los polisistemas:

> it depends on such parameters as the nature of stratification (whether it is "developed" or not), the age of the system (whether it is "young" or "old"/"established"), as well as the volume ("richness") of the repertoire available. (Even-Zohar 1990: 92).

La literatura central de una CIE suele estar desarrollada, consolidada y establecida, pues en caso contrario difícilmente ocuparía una posición central en la comunidad. Estas características le permiten recurrir a su propia periferia para llevar a cabo la renovación del

repertorio. Pero suponiendo que sus agentes optan por la importación de modelos aún dispone de la periferia de la CIE, cuyas literaturas deben estar, a su vez, mínimamente desarrolladas para poder tomar de ellas modelos innovadores. La tradición de la CIE (es decir, que sea una comunidad establecida y consolidada) también puede influir en la decisión, contribuyendo a legitimar el uso que se haga de las literaturas periféricas.

La adopción de modelos de las literaturas periféricas supone su conocimiento y su interferencia en el polisistema central, sea gracias a la traducción, sea de forma más directa: a través de autores biliterarios que introducen los modelos de un polisistema en otro, por la intercomprensión entre las lenguas, o incluso porque se han estudiado. Si se trata de la traducción, esta debe aproximarse al polo de adecuación (es decir, estar más próxima al texto de partida, según la terminología de Toury, 1995) para permitir la transferencia de modelos. Lo cual implica la posición central de las traducciones, o al menos su proximidad al centro, ya que importarán rasgos innovadores (Even-Zohar 1990). Por poner un ejemplo, esto es lo que sucede con *Dos letters*, traducción del euskera al castellano de *Bi letter jaso nituen oso denbora gutxian* (Atxaga 1985), que propone elementos innovadores en la literatura infantil y juvenil como la alternancia de códigos (*code switching*).

En la medida alternativa se importan modelos externos a la CIE, que llegan al polisistema central a través de traducciones innovadoras, adoptando normas primarias. También pueden introducirse por interferencia directa, pero este procedimiento hace menos aceptables los nuevos modelos. En cualquier caso, según el funcionamiento habitual de los polisistemas, estos modelos serán relegados a la periferia tan solo después de su agotamiento como productores de literatura central. Se podría pensar, por lo tanto, que no serán traducidos o transferidos a las literaturas periféricas hasta bastante después de haber actuado en el centro de la CIE, y esto supondrá ya su estandarización, su simplificación, que aumentará al ser traducidos a los sistemas periféricos (según la ley de estandarización creciente, Toury 1995: 267–74). Si este camino se recorre del centro a la periferia de la CIE, es muy probable que el polisistema central funcione como intermediario. Lo puede hacer ofreciendo sus propias

traducciones, como en el caso de las traducciones indirectas (realizadas a partir de otra traducción), o bien ofreciendo sus propios textos que han incorporado los nuevos modelos, y por lo tanto la simplificación de los modelos será mayor.

Los sistemas periféricos, por su parte, solo pueden innovar tomando las opciones que le ofrece el centro, a no ser que haya una planificación (Even-Zohar 2004: 194–5). Esto implica que, salvando estos casos de planificación, las literaturas periféricas de una CIE importarán los mismos modelos que el polisistema central, dando entrada a las mismas interferencias, aunque sean organizadas de diferente manera. Así, los modelos introducidos, ya secundarios para la cultura central, llegan a los polisistemas periféricos de la CIE como modelos primarios, innovadores (ocupan una posición central), puesto que no existían hasta entonces (Even-Zohar 1979: 302). Es necesaria la planificación de las traducciones para salir de esta "inercia" y buscar caminos propios.

Este mecanismo de funcionamiento habitual de los polisistemas se puede aplicar, por tanto, a las CIEs, pero de una forma mucho menos rígida. Las literaturas periféricas suelen ser más independientes de la central que los sistemas periféricos de un polisistema. Poseen algunos agentes, instituciones, mercados, repertorios... diferentes, asociados con una entidad socio-semiótica distinta, con distinta tradición, etc. Es cierto que los límites no están bien definidos, y esto se ve especialmente en situaciones de convivencia de polisistemas en una misma sociedad, como ocurre con las literaturas vasca, gallega y catalana en relación con la castellana. La diferencia, pues, entre un polisistema convencional y un macropolisistema es más una cuestión de grado de cohesión que de distinto mecanismo. Pero esta mayor autonomía (al menos teórica) de cada polisistema permite tomar decisiones más libremente.

5. Traducciones entre distintas CIEs

Este modelo de funcionamiento de los polisistemas, propuesto por Even-Zohar, también se puede aplicar a categorías interliterarias mayores. Así, las CIEs de ámbitos como el español, belga o británico se integrarían en la zona (o macro-polisistema) de Europa Occidental, y esta a su vez en la región de toda Europa, hasta llegar al nivel de la literatura mundial.

En estas comunidades interliterarias, zonas y regiones (entendidas como mega-polisistemas y no únicamente como grupos de literaturas nacionales), las CIEs funcionan, en general, como polisistemas unitarios, en mayor o menor medida según el grado de cohesión y la visibilidad (prestigio) de las literaturas nacionales que la componen. La denominación "español", más extendida que "castellano" para referirse a la lengua mayoritaria de España (al menos fuera de las fronteras del Estado) es indicativa de la identificación que se suele hacer entre el país y el territorio europeo que habla esta lengua. Esto implica que las relaciones interliterarias predominantes se producen de centro a centro, entre distintas comunidades interliterarias: del polisistema inglés al castellano (y viceversa), del alemán al castellano, y así sucesivamente. Esto es lo que indica el cuadro 1, que recoge las lenguas más traducidas al castellano en España, al inglés en el Reino Unido, al ruso, al francés en Bélgica y al serbo-croata. Es cierto que el margen de error de este cuadro es considerable, puesto que no distingue entre dos polisistemas de origen que utilicen una misma lengua (caso del inglés de Inglaterra, Irlanda, Estados Unidos...). Valga como mera aproximación que refleje el argumento aducido.

En este cuadro se refleja que hay unas lenguas centrales que suelen ser las más traducidas en toda Europa, tanto en los polisistemas centrales (como se ve en este cuadro) como en los periféricos (según se verá en cuadros posteriores).

Cuadro[2] 1. Lenguas más traducidas a algunas de las lenguas centrales de las CIEs europeas (solo traducciones literarias). Al lado de cada lengua se especifica el número de valores que le asigna el *Index Translationum*.

CASTELLANO (ESPAÑA)[3]		INGLÉS (REINO UNIDO)		RUSO		FRANCÉS (BÉLGICA)		SERBO-CROATA	
Inglés	49917	Francés	1168	Inglés	15647	Inglés	1789	Inglés	1476
Francés	13090	Alemán	1003	Francés	5216	Holandés	520	Francés	583
Alemán	6247	Ruso	345	Alemán	1813	Alemán	320	Ruso	575
Italiano	3459	Italiano	281	Varias lenguas	888	Japonés	166	Alemán	499

Por el contrario, las literaturas periféricas apenas se traducen en los polisistemas fuertes fuera de su CIE, si comparamos el número de estas traducciones con los del cuadro 1. Por ejemplo, el *Index Translationum* registra solo 11 traducciones literarias del gallego al francés realizadas en Francia (de las 111.868 realizadas en este país a esta lengua) y 10 del euskera al alemán, de un total de 125.453 traducciones realizadas en Alemania [Consulta: 14 dic. 2010]. Si se conocen internacionalmente las literaturas periféricas suele ser a través de la literatura central de la CIE a la que pertenecen: gracias a las traducciones y a los estudios de la lengua central, entre otros. Por ejemplo, el Instituto Cervantes, institución dedicada a la promoción y difusión de la lengua castellana en el mundo, ofrece en varios de sus centros "Cursos en otras lenguas de España". Por lo tanto, mucha gente conocerá la existencia del catalán, gallego y euskera gracias a esta institución de la cultura central.

---

[2] Todos los cuadros están realizados sobre el período 1979–2005. Fuente: *Index Translationum* [Consulta: 14 dic. 2005].

[3] Limitar el país en que se producen las traducciones tiene la ventaja de diferenciar, en ocasiones y *grosso modo*, dos o más literaturas que utilizan una misma lengua. Sin embargo, hay que tener en cuenta que esta opción excluye las exportaciones; es decir, traducciones que desde otros estados se hagan para exportar a la literatura sobre la que se investiga.

DOMÍNGUEZ PÉREZ

Ahora bien, estas conclusiones se extraen al examinar las listas de las literaturas más traducidas en los polisistemas centrales. Cambia la perspectiva cuando observamos las listas de las lenguas a que más se traducen las literaturas periféricas. Es decir, las pocas traducciones que se hacen de un polisistema periférico fuera de su CIE se dirigen en primer lugar a literaturas centrales (o al menos a lenguas centrales). Por lo tanto, esas pocas traducciones, que para el polisistema central suponen una mínima parte de su producción, para la literatura periférica pueden ser muy importantes: le permiten expandirse, alcanzar un mayor prestigio y consecuentemente mejorar la autoestima de sus agentes. A continuación se presenta un cuadro correspondiente a las lenguas (externas a la comunidad) a que más se traduce cada una de las lenguas periféricas de la CIE española, a fin de demostrar que suelen ser lenguas centrales. Se añaden también dos lenguas periféricas de otras CIEs, para permitir la comparación.

Cuadro 2. Lenguas (externas a la CIE) a que más se traducen algunas lenguas periféricas (solo traducciones literarias).

CATALÁN		EUSKERA		GALLEGO		MOLDAVO		ESLOVACO	
Francés	307	Inglés	51	Inglés	25	Inglés	40	Húngaro	240
Alemán	129	Francés	27	Francés	11	Francés	38	Alemán	121
Inglés	124	Alemán	11	Portugués	6	Castellano	19	Ruso	117
Holandés	55	Finlandés	6	Alemán	4	Eslovaco	9	Polaco	110

Se observa en este cuadro que las lenguas a que más son traducidas las literaturas periféricas (fuera de su CIE) suelen ser lenguas centrales en Europa, aunque no siempre muy centrales: la presencia del eslovaco demuestra que las traducciones entre literaturas más o menos periféricas tampoco es desestimable, como se verá más adelante.

Por otra parte, los polisistemas periféricos sí traducen de los centrales de otras comunidades interliterarias, pero habitualmente seleccionan las mismas literaturas que el polisistema central que los domina, especialmente si utilizan sus traducciones como intermediarias. Esto es, adoptan las opciones que le ofrece el centro para sus innovaciones. Por lo tanto suelen llegar tardíamente, mediatizadas o no. Para demostrar esta tendencia de los polisistemas peri-

Traducciones entre comunidades interliterarias específicas

féricos de seleccionar las mismas literaturas que el polisistema central, se presentan los cuadros de las lenguas externas más traducidas (traducciones literarias) a cada una de las lenguas oficiales de la CIE española (cuadro 3). Se excluyen de los cuadros, por tanto, las lenguas que se encuentran en la comunidad.

Cuadro 3. Lenguas externas a la CIE española más traducidas a cada lengua de la comunidad (solo traducciones literarias).

CASTELLANO		CATALÁN		EUSKERA		GALLEGO	
Inglés	49917	Inglés	4653	Inglés	605	Inglés	271
Francés	13090	Francés	2132	Francés	312	Francés	225
Alemán	6247	Alemán	1220	Alemán	231	Alemán	128
Italiano	3459	Italiano	613	Italiano	91	Italiano	54
Ruso	1155	Portugués	152	Sueco	26	Portugués	36
Griego (clásico)	899	Ruso	135	Ruso	23	Latín	21
Danés	869	Griego (clásico)	102	Danés	16	Holandés	17
Portugués	834	Sueco	99	Holandés	13	Griego (clásico)	16
Latín	723	Danés	98	Portugués	11	Sueco	16
Árabe	612	Holandés	74	Griego (clásico)	8	Danés	15
Japonés	590	Latín	70	Latín	8	Ruso	12
Sueco	494	Árabe	59	Árabe	8	Árabe	4
Holandés	390	Noruego	44	Checo	5	Noruego	3
Polaco	260	Checo	41	Noruego	4	Francés (antiguo)	3

Aún admitiendo un pequeño desfase entre los datos referentes a las lenguas y los que se indicarían para los polisistemas, las distancias numéricas entre el número de traducciones de unas lenguas y otras (al menos entre las lenguas más traducidas) son lo suficientemente amplias como para sostener el argumento. Se observa en el cuadro que las cuatro lenguas (externas) más traducidas a las lenguas de España son las mismas en todos los casos, conservando un mismo orden. Las 10 restantes se mantienen con algunas variaciones, mayores cuanto más descendemos en la lista.

DOMÍNGUEZ PÉREZ

Podría pensarse que estas preferencias son las mismas que predominan en toda Europa, y en parte es así, en relación con las lenguas más traducidas. Pero a medida que descendemos en los puestos de las listas van apareciendo lenguas que no coinciden de unas CIEs a otras. Así, en la CIE de la antigua Yugoslavia se priorizan otras lenguas, como se puede ver en el cuadro 4. Se han incluido aquí algunas lenguas que podrían considerarse internas a la CIE, puesto que tienen una presencia minoritaria en su interior, pero son utilizadas sobre todo en el exterior (caso del albanés).

Cuadro 4. Lenguas externas a la CIE de la antigua Yugoslavia más traducidas a las lenguas de la comunidad (solo traducciones literarias).

SERBO-CROATA		SERBIO		CROATA		ESLOVENO		MACEDONIO	
Inglés	1476	Inglés	1049	Inglés	1553	Inglés	2112	Inglés	249
Francés	583	Francés	451	Alemán	360	Alemán	831	Ruso	145
Ruso	575	Ruso	273	Francés	288	Francés	482	Francés	126
Alemán	499	Alemán	232	Italiano	149	Italiano	121	Alemán	81
Italiano	161	Castellano	177	Castellano	106	Ruso	116	Italiano	47
Castellano	121	Italiano	154	Ruso	64	Castellano	101	Castellano	35
Húngaro	100	Varias lenguas	66	Griego (clásico)	35	Checo	70	Albanés	28
Polaco	89	Griego (clásico)	51	Polaco	34	Sueco	64	Rumano	28
Varias lenguas	58	Húngaro	44	Portugués	33	Holandés	57	Turco	26
Checo	54	Polaco	41	Checo	32	Polaco	44	Polaco	20
Griego (clásico)	45	Rumano	40	Sueco	29	Danés	29	Griego (moderno)	19
Danés	44	Griego (moderno)	40	Holandés	24	Griego (clásico)	26	Varias lenguas	18

SERBO-CROATA		SERBIO		CROATA		ESLOVENO		MACEDONIO	
Albanés	37	Portugués	31	Danés	22	Húngaro	24	Búlgaro	14
Árabe	28	Árabe	25	Latín	18	Portugués	21	Portugués	14

Hay que entender que las listas del serbio y el croata son cronológicamente posteriores a las del serbo-croata[4], y por lo tanto lo que más nos interesa en este momento es compararlas con las del esloveno y el macedonio, y no tanto entre sí.

Se observa que las seis primeras lenguas se mantienen en un orden similar al de las literaturas del ámbito español, con la inclusión del castellano y el ruso. Pero en este caso el orden varía de unas lenguas a otras, lo cual indica ya que la homogeneidad no es tan patente como en el ámbito español. Lo mismo se puede decir al observar las otras lenguas, que no son las mismas ni mantienen el mismo orden en todas las listas. De hecho, se ve que el macedonio selecciona unas lenguas muy diferentes a las de las otras lenguas, lo que indica el afán de alejamiento de su CIE. El esloveno, en cambio, sí traduce las mismas lenguas que el croata, aunque con distinto orden de preferencias. No es sorprendente que siga más las tendencias de su vecino geográfico que las del serbio.

En cualquier caso, hay que tener en cuenta que las literaturas de esta CIE están alejándose progresivamente, desde la fragmentación del antiguo Estado Yugoslavo e incluso antes (Andrew B. Wachtel 1998: 184–9)[5]. Esto explica que seleccionen lenguas distintas para traducir, en un intento de establecer unas relaciones intersistémicas

---

[4] En la época del antiguo Estado Yugoslavo se aceptaba la síntesis serbo-croata como lengua nacional, pero desde la fragmentación de Yugoslavia en 1991 el serbio y el croata sirvieron de expresión a diferentes literaturas.

[5] Las estadísticas de las traducciones entre las lenguas de la CIE también reflejan el progresivo alejamiento, ya que el porcentaje de traducciones literarias para cada par de lenguas (sobre el total de las traducciones literarias de la lengua meta) es descendente, aunque con altibajos. Por el contrario, los porcentajes de la CIE del ámbito español tienden a subir en todas las direcciones, excepto del catalán al gallego y del catalán al euskera.

que les permita seguir evoluciones literarias independientes. De hecho, los 39 registros del Index Translationum para el bosnio como lengua meta (casi todos ellos de 2005) reflejan unas lenguas de partida muy diferentes. Se podría discutir si hoy en día el territorio de la antigua Yugoslavia todavía forma una CIE; pero en el pasado era así, y eso lo demuestran las estadísticas de traducción.

Cabe resaltar también que hay algunas lenguas, presentes en tres o más listas de las lenguas de la antigua Yugoslavia (el húngaro, el polaco y el checo) que apenas aparecen en el cuadro correspondiente a la CIE española (en cero, una y dos listas respectivamente), ocupando siempre la última o penúltima posición. De esta manera, se comprueba que hay cierta tendencia, mayor en unas CIEs y menor en otras, a seleccionar las mismas lenguas para traducir. Las lenguas centrales de Europa se tienden a mantener en las primeras posiciones de todas las CIEs. A partir de ahí cada comunidad selecciona unas diferentes, más prestigiosas en su cultura (caso del latín en las literaturas de España), más próximas culturalmente (caso del húngaro en las literaturas eslavas) o lingüísticamente (el polaco y el checo en las mismas).

En cuanto a las traducciones entre dos polisistemas periféricos de diferentes comunidades interliterarias, suelen darse en muy menor medida. Por una parte, se observa en los cuadros anteriores que las literaturas periféricas externas a la CIE no se sitúan entre las más traducidas. Esto depende, por supuesto, de lo que consideremos periférico. Podría discutirse, por ejemplo, si el albanés (que aparece en las listas del serbo-croata y del macedonio) es una lengua periférica que canaliza una literatura periférica. Pero en cualquier caso se trata de una lengua oficial de un estado, y no (únicamente) de una lengua periférica en una CIE. Además, la posición de estas lenguas en las listas es muy baja, salvo en el caso del albanés en la lista del macedonio. Esto se explica por la proximidad geográfica de los Estados Albanés y Macedonio, así como por la convivencia de albaneses y macedonios en un mismo territorio.

El hecho de que las literaturas periféricas no cuenten entre las más traducidas (por su escaso desarrollo, prestigio, visibilidad, accesibilidad...) justifica que no aparezcan en los cuadros de las lenguas más traducidas, ni a lenguas centrales ni a las periféricas.

Pero cuando consideramos a qué lenguas se realizan las pocas traducciones existentes de las lenguas periféricas, observamos que la relación entre literaturas periféricas sí tiene una entidad considerable. Así, el cuadro 5 muestra las lenguas (externas a la CIE) a que más se traduce cada lengua periférica de la CIE española.

Cuadro 5. Lenguas externas a la CIE española que más traducen de las lenguas periféricas de la comunidad (solo traducciones literarias). Las lenguas meta periféricas aparecen coloreadas.

CATALÁN		EUSKERA		GALLEGO	
Francés	307	Inglés	51	Inglés	25
Alemán	129	Francés	27	Francés	11
Inglés	124	Alemán	11	Portugués	6
Holandés	55	Finlandés	6	Alemán	4
Italiano	27	Holandés	5	Bretón	3
Rumano	17	Griego moderno	3	Húngaro	2
Ruso	14	Danés	3	Italiano	2
Portugués	13	Italiano	3	Croata	1
Bretón	11	Bretón	2	Ucraniano	1
Esloveno	11	Japonés	2	Japonés	1

No es casualidad que varias de las lenguas a que más se traducen las literaturas periféricas de la CIE española sean también lenguas periféricas de otras CIEs: el esloveno, el croata (ambas de la CIE yugoslava), el ucraniano (de la antigua URSS) y el bretón, que aunque no pertenece a una CIE reconocida como tal es una lengua muy periférica (sobre todo en comparación con el francés, con la que se halla más vinculada).

Así pues, las traducciones entre literaturas periféricas de diferentes CIEs no son muy numerosas cuando lo que tenemos en cuenta son las traducciones realizadas a cada lengua meta. Pero sí se revelan importantes para la expansión externa de la literatura de origen, ya que suponen una de sus mayores posibilidades de ser traducida a otras lenguas y aumentar, por consiguiente, su estabilidad.

DOMÍNGUEZ PÉREZ

En resumen, las distintas CIEs de Europa se integran a su vez en la región europea, que funciona como otro mega-polisistema según la teoría polisistémica. La estructuración de este conjunto se debe en gran medida a la labor de los reescritores (traductores, antólogos, investigadores de la literatura...), que a su vez reflejan las jerarquías políticas y económicas internacionales. Unos factores y otros se hallan interrelacionados de forma que, por ejemplo, las literaturas más traducidas serán más estudiadas a nivel internacional; y viceversa, las más estudiadas serán también más traducidas. Así, Wlad Godzich (1997: 5; la cursiva en el original) describe el centro del mega-polisistema europeo tal y como fue propuesto por la tradición comparatista: "desde el principio hemos privilegiado ciertas literaturas, sobre todo la alemana, la francesa y la inglesa. Hemos concedido un *status* secundario a otras, como la italiana, la rusa, o la española". Aunque esta jerarquía puede resultar un tanto simplificadora, se corresponde con la que reflejan, *grosso modo*, las estadísticas de traducción. Se puede comprobar así en los cuadros 1 y 2, aunque con reservas debido al desfase entre lenguas y polisistemas, que aquí sí resulta importante: el inglés, el francés y el alemán son las tres lenguas que más se traducen (sin contar las que pertenecen a una misma CIE), y que más traducen. Esto es así tanto en el extremo occidental de Europa (en las lenguas de España) como en algunas lenguas del extremo oriental, o en otros lugares como los Balcanes. Pero tampoco podemos pensar que se refleje en todas las lenguas ni en orden estricto. Sobre todo al analizar las lenguas de llegada para cada lengua de origen se observa que muchas literaturas (en especial las de Europa del Este) son más traducidas a polisistemas próximos que a los lejanos, aunque sean estos los centrales.

A continuación sitúa Godzich el castellano, el italiano y el ruso, que aparecen en muchos de los cuadros presentados pero no en todos. Por supuesto, el castellano aparecería en todos los cuadros de su CIE, ocupando una de las primeras posiciones. En cualquier caso, el hecho de que el ruso sea la quinta lengua más traducida al castellano y que el castellano aparezca en los cuadros de las lenguas balcánicas (geográficamente localizadas a gran distancia del territorio castellano) justifican el estatus que Godzich ha indicado para estas lenguas.

Situada la literatura castellana en una posición intermedia entre el centro y la periferia del mega-polisistema europeo, podemos hacer corresponder, *grosso modo*, esta posición con las posibilidades que tienen los polisistemas gallego, vasco y catalán de darse a conocer (a través de la literatura castellana) en el resto de Europa. Es decir, como polisistemas periféricos apenas tienen posibilidades de ser conocidos por sí mismos (por ejemplo a través de traducciones), ya que ni todos saben de su existencia ni es fácil que una literatura más central (o menos periférica) recurra a ellos para la importación de modelos. Pero gracias a la CIE cierto conocimiento de estas literaturas puede llegar, a través de la literatura central castellana, a otros polisistemas europeos: por las traducciones de las lenguas periféricas al castellano, por el Instituto Cervantes, etc. Así pues, la visibilidad y el conocimiento de las literaturas periféricas fuera de la CIE depende en gran medida de la posición que el polisistema central asume en los mega-polisistemas mayores.

Por otra parte, hay que tener en cuenta también que no en todas las épocas se traduce por igual. Al contrario, los factores económicos, políticos y culturales condicionan que en ciertos períodos históricos aumente o disminuya el volumen de traducciones literarias. Por ejemplo, ciertos movimientos culturales, como el multiculturalismo de las últimas décadas, promueven el conocimiento de las culturas periféricas, y por lo tanto en las épocas de mayor auge pueden favorecer la producción de traducciones de estas culturas[6].

6. Conclusiones

Hemos visto que tanto la teoría del proceso interliterario como la de los polisistemas proponen el funcionamiento de grupos de literaturas como análogo al de las literaturas unitarias. Así, se pueden complementar ambas teorías para estudiar grupos de literaturas especialmente cohesionados (las CIEs, concebidas aquí como macropolisistemas) y otros más amplios, como por ejemplo la literatura europea. En todos ellos encontramos una o más literaturas centrales y

---

[6] El hecho de que el *Index Translationum* no aporte datos anteriores a 1979 no nos permite aportar datos contrastables para esta hipótesis.

una o más literaturas periféricas, que se estructuran de la misma manera que lo hace un polisistema.

Las traducciones entre las literaturas de una misma CIE, así como las traducciones entre diferentes CIEs, siguen el modelo de las traducciones entre sistemas de un mismo polisistema, pero de manera menos rígida. Por lo tanto, las tendencias generales no pueden ser tomadas de manera estricta, excluyendo otras posibilidades, sino como meras tendencias a las que hay que sumar las circunstancias de cada caso concreto.

De cualquier forma, vemos que las traducciones, en tanto que constituyen una forma de relacionarse las literaturas, también reflejan las relaciones asimétricas que se establecen entre literaturas o CIEs, por ejemplo en el volumen de las traducciones entre cada par de literaturas. La posición de cada literatura en la CIE, pues, condiciona la práctica de las traducciones.

Así, las relaciones fundamentales entre distintos macro-polisistemas se establecen de centro a centro, y cuando llegan a la periferia suelen hacerlo tras haber pasado por el centro correspondiente. Se explica así que las literaturas periféricas suelen traducir de las mismas lenguas que las literaturas centrales de su CIE. Por otra parte, las traducciones entre periferias, mucho menos numerosas, solo resultan significativas cuando miramos las traducciones que se han hecho de cada lengua, teniendo en cuenta que suelen ser muy escasas para las literaturas periféricas. La mayoría de las traducciones (hacia unas u otras literaturas) se realizan de culturas centrales.

Se ha demostrado, por tanto, que las literaturas no establecen únicamente relaciones bilaterales entre sí, sino que configuraciones como las CIEs pueden condicionar ciertas relaciones grupales que se reflejan, por ejemplo, en las traducciones literarias.

Bibliografía

Atxaga, B. 1985. *Bi letter jaso nituen oso denbora gutxian.* Bilbao: Erein.

Ďurišin, D. 1989. *Theory of Interliterary Process.* Traducción de J. Kocmanová y Z. Pistek. Bratislava: Slovak Academy of Sciences.

Ďurišin, D. 1993. *Communautés interlittéraires spécifiques 6: notions et principes.* Bratislava: Academie Slovaque des Sciences.

Even-Zohar, I. 1978. *Papers in Historical Poetics* [en línea]. *Itamar EVEN-ZOHAR's Site.*
<http://www.tau.ac.il/~itamarez/works/books/php1978.pdf> [Consulta: 27 jul. 2004].

Even-Zohar, I. 1979. Polysystem Theory. – *Poetics Today*, 1, 2, 287–310.

Even-Zohar, I. 1990. *Polysystem Studies.* – *Poetics Today*, 11, 1.

Even-Zohar, I. 2004. *Papers in Culture Research* [en línea]. *Itamar EVEN-ZOHAR's Site.*
<http://www.tau.ac.il/~itamarez/works/books/ez-cr2004.pdf> [Consulta: 27 jul. 2004].

Godzich, W. 1997. *Literaturas emergentes y literatura comparada.* Traducción de Josep-Vicent Gavaldà. Valencia: Episteme.

González-Millán, X. 1991. A institucionalización do discurso literario galego (1975–1990). – *Tropelías*, 2, 49–69.

Toury, G. 1995. *Descriptive Translation Studies and Beyond.* Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company.

Wachtel, A.B. 1998. *Making a Nation, Breaking a Nation: Literature and Cultural Politics in Yugoslavia.* Standford (California): Standford University Press.

La función del ritmo en la versología y la traducción literaria

Al inicio no es inútil recordar que la noción de ritmo representa desde los comienzos de la creación literaria uno de los aspectos de mayor importancia. En el conjunto de los procedimientos que constituyen una obra de arte le pertenece con razón el papel ordenador y unificador de su estructura fónica. Por consiguiente, no es nada sorprendente el interés cada vez mayor por captar o describir, por definir lo más exhaustivamente su naturaleza variable y única. Ese estudio se dedica a las variaciones históricas del ritmo en cada literatura nacional y a las innovaciones métricas llevadas a cabo ante todo en el campo de la poesía. Está claro que desde esa perspectiva el ritmo no encarna habitualmente un fenómeno aislado. Sin duda alguna, por su capacidad de síntesis funciona en relación íntima con otros componentes poéticos o bien coexiste con ellos. Considerado así, el verso se distingue por múltiples manifestaciones históricas demostrando el esfuerzo siempre renovador de utilizar las inagotables posibilidades de la lengua en las palabras rítmicamente organizadas.

Es obvio que el problema esencial consiste, en primer lugar, en la necesidad de examinar las relaciones mutuas en el verso. Bajo esa óptica hay, por una parte, su aspecto normativo mientras que, por otra parte, se produce una tendencia opuesta destinada a abolir cualquier norma fija, prosódica o métrica. El resultado de esa tensión interior son naturales cambios históricos de la forma o estructura versal. Esos cambios se refieren, en general, al número de sílabas, al carácter fónico de la rima o de la estrofa, a la distribución de las pausas o cesuras. Otro elemento que influye decididamente en el ritmo es el acento, su utilización mediante cláusulas o pies métricos. Hay que destacar la importancia del acento para el estudio comparativo que se realiza entre dos o varios idiomas o literaturas. A mi modo de ver el acento constituye el mayor rasgo distintivo en

la confrontación de diferentes sistemas prosódicos correspondientes a idiomas distintos.

El propósito que nos anima en esta contribución es considerar el verso desde varios puntos de vista formales y conceptuales. Sin embargo, la extensión de dada problemática obliga a reducir su visión a los horizontes más estrechos y no centrarse asimismo en la construcción estrófica de todo un poema o de toda una composición poética. Ésa se desarrolla, se comprende, a base de la necesaria repetición periódica de los elementos durante el acto mismo de creación (la definición corriente del verso se funda etimológicamente en la palabra "vuelta"). Es de suponer que cualquier percepción del verso concebido como unidad total ofrece la posibilidad de estudiar los sistemas versológicos cuya diferencia reside en primer plano en las particularidades prosódicas de los idiomas. Es esa diferencia que nos impulsa a tener en cuenta las leyes y condiciones fonológicas relativas a tres lenguas: la española, la eslovaca y la checa.

Para realizar ese proyecto es importante señalar que el estudio de tales condiciones ha desembocado hace más de treinta años en la publicación de un libro teórico y analítico *En busca del verso español* (1975). Su autor era Oldřich Bělič, el eminente historiador y teórico de literaturas de habla española. El primero de los tres estudios intitulado *Tomás Navarro y la versología española*[1] contiene una serie de análisis y observaciones metodológicas que son sumamente interesantes desde una perspectiva actual. Es indudable que el núcleo de su teoría del verso español reflejada con distancia de algunos decenios permite valorar con más claridad el aporte y la legitimidad de sus opiniones desde nuevos enfoques históricos. Están determinados por esfuerzos de globalización cultural en la Europa actual. En ese contexto no es nada extraño hacer constar que cada generación aprovecha en su teoría impulsos típicos de su época y está apropiándolos de acuerdo con su orientación filológica y

---

[1] El libro fue publicado por Acta Universitatis Carolinae en Praga. Además del estudio dedicado a T. Navarro Tomás comprende una revisión crítica, aunque más atenuada, de Rafael de Balbín, otro versólogo español. Bělič analiza su "planteamiento estrófico" que constituye la esencia de su enfoque rítmico. El tercer estudio se llama *El español como material de verso.*

filosófica. Digamos previamente que lo que aleja la concepción metodológica del verso español en los trabajos de O. Bělič de la versología de Navarro Tomás, el prestigioso teórico, lingüista e historiador español, aparece como el fruto de la historia diferente de ambas sociedades, comunidades o culturas. Y que no tiene nada que ver con un acto gratuito, puramente voluntario de esas figuras sobresalientes.

En resumidas cuentas es lo que tiene presente también el versólogo checo al decir que "no quiere en ninguna manera quitarle sus méritos al maestro y erudito".² Hay que decir que la revisión crítica de Bělič se apoya en los fecundos impulsos de la lingüística, de la teoría literaria y de la teoría de la comunicación. Ahora bien, en confrontación con la voluminosa *Métrica española* de Navarro Tomás (1975), cuya primera edición apareció en 1946, se ha servido Bělič de los principios de la versología moderna que tenía ambición de aplicar también al estudio científico del verso español.

Un examen atento de las diferencias que existen entre ambos versólogos requiere, primero, caracterizar el modelo de interpretación de Navarro Tomás. En su opinión la base esencial del ritmo de un verso español son "los apoyos del acento respiratorio". En la estructura concreta hay que contar con conceptos como los de anacrusis, período rítmico interior, periodo de enlace y cláusula rítmica – dactílica y trocaica. En su concepto figuran los componentes que testimonian correspondencia entre el ritmo y la música. El mismo Navarro Tomás dice que la sucesión regular de los acentos se produce a la manera "de los compases de una composición musical" (Navarro Tomás 1968: 10).

Al criticar ese concepto que "destruye" según él las palabras y la unidad oracional del verso Bělič cita algunos versos analizados por Navarro Tomás en su libro:

---

² NAVARRO TOMÁS, T.: *Métrica española*. Reseña histórica y descriptiva, p. 9. Navarro Tomás (1884-1979) se ha distinguido también como fonetista. Enseñó como Profesor en España y EE.UU. Miembro de la Real Academia Española. Otras obras: *Manual de pronunciación española* y *Manual de entonación española*.

La función del ritmo en la versología y la traducción literaria

	anacrusis	p. r. interior/	p. de enlace
Romerica, romerica	oó	/ó oo oo/	óo
calledes, no digas tal	o	/óo ooo/	ó
que eres el diablo sin duda	/óoo ooo/	óo	
que nos vienes a tentar	oo	/óo oo/ ó	

J. Espronceda, *El conde Sol* (ib. 48; Bělič 1975: 23)

Según Bělič tal esquema rítmico compuesto por anacrusis, período rítmico interior y período de enlace exige que desaparezca el acento de la palabra "diablo" que considera palabra clave de todo el pasaje citado. El concepto musical de Navarro no respeta así la función primordial del contenido. Al final hace Bělič una pregunta: "¿Es posible, es admisible que quede sin acento?" (ib. 23)

La métrica española de Navarro Tomás analiza según la percepción del versólogo checo sólo "los factores fónicos" y abandona el factor fonológico. Se sabe, ese enfoque basado en una dialéctica sonido-sentido, en una conjunción de factores fónicos y semánticos permite ampliar la visión del verso y analizarlo en su totalidad constructiva. No obstante, no es la única objeción que pronuncia el versólogo checo. En cuanto a la distribución de los acentos que están estudiados por Navarro ante todo según "apoyos rítmicos" y no "acentos prosódicos", como es habitual, se observa una diferencia fundamental. Repitamos que su concepto borra los límites entre palabras y pone de relieve las leyes internas de una composición musical. No se somete así primordialmente a las normas gramaticales de pronunciación normativa que determinan el uso de los pies métricos o de las cláusulas en el idioma español.

Hay que recordar que esa regla no deja de tener una validez general desde la época de Andrés Bello quien es considerado el fundador de la métrica española. En sus *Principios de la Ortología y Métrica* (1835) subraya la naturaleza acústica del verso a partir de su división en partecillas de duración fija. Las denomina "cláusulas rítmicas" y son cinco: dos disílabas y tres trisílabas. El apoyo de dos sílabas con acento en la primera se llama "cláusula trocaica" (óo). Si el acento cae en la segunda, hablamos de la "cláusula yámbica (oó). El grupo de tres sílabas se distingue a su vez por siguientes cláusulas: "dactílica" (óoo), anfibráquica (oóo) y anapéstica (ooó).

FRANEK

No es arbitrario que lo particular del sistema acentual del verso español fundado en las reglas gramaticales de pronunciación nos lleva a compararlo con el sistema, al parecer semejante, que funciona en el verso eslovaco. Sólo que esa semejanza se nota solamente en lo referente a la denominación o el número de las cláusulas. Es de notoriedad que la acentuación del verso eslovaco está determinada por la regla sobre existencia de un acento dinámico colocado en la primera sílaba de las palabras. No es inútil agregar que por el carácter morfológico y fonológico de las palabras eslovacas, la actuación de dadas cláusulas es distinta. En nuestro verso prevalecen absolutamente las trocaicas, yámbicas y dactílicas (en vez de las anapésticas y anfibráquicas como es en el idioma español). Desde ese punto de vista, este hecho parece acercar paradójicamente el sistema acentual de la versificación eslovaca a la del modelo de Navarro Tomás, a su división del verso en pies dactílicos o trocaicos según leyes musicales. En un ejemplo citado por J. Domínguez Caparrós el verso con cláusula anapéstica (según Bello) se analiza como dactílico en el modelo de Navarro Tomás:

> De sus / ó-jos-los /hué-cos-fi-/já-ron   (J. Espronceda, *El estudiante*
> *de Salamanca*)
> Y sus / dé-dos en / jú-tos en / él.

En ese verso hay anacrusis (De-sus), dos cláusulas dactílicas (ó-jos-los / hué-cos -fi) y un "período de enlace" que comprende las dos sílabas del verso (já-ron) , la pausa y las dos sílabas átonas con que empieza el verso siguiente (Y-sus) (Domínguez Caparrós 1993: 91).

De todo eso podemos deducir el motivo del argumento lógico y no musical de O. Bělič quien al observar la destrucción de la unidad oracional y acentual llega a reprocharle a Navarro Tomás una pobreza de las unidades métricas en el verso español. Dice: "Lo que a primera vista extraña en esta definición es que Tomás Navarro no especifica los tipos de sílabas que forman los pies" (Bělič 1975: 29). Otra objeción de Bělič se refiere al hecho de que en el modelo del versólogo español figura, además del acento principal, también el acento o tiempo débil o secundario. Lo que respondería al ritmo interiormente diferenciado o matizado: "En algunas ocasiones el

espacio correspondiente a las cláusulas lo ocupa una sola sílaba y, a veces, con menos frecuencia, cuatro sílabas. La mayor parte de los versos son de período binario, formado por dos cláusulas, una en el tiempo marcado o principal y otra en el tiempo débil y secundario" (ib. 29).

Es necesario destacar que el problema de los acentos secundarios ha sido objeto de discusión en varias métricas nacionales, incluso en la eslovaca o la checa. Para solucionar ese problema, insistiendo en el sistema binario, muchos tratadistas llegaron hasta a excluir ese factor importante de la estructura versal. Regularidad o irregularidad de los "tiempos fuertes" y "los tiempos débiles", una distribución libre u obligatoria de los acentos, según leyes propias de cada idioma, llegó a ser en los ojos de los partidarios del análisis estructural el fenómeno de primera importancia. La omisión de los acentos secundarios constituyendo un factor demasiado subjetivo coincidía, por cierto, con la necesidad objetivista de ver en el verso a todo precio un esquema métrico. Y de ponerlo en relación con el ritmo de un poema determinado.

Refiriéndose a los principios de la métrica checa (Josef Hrabák) Bělič opera con la noción de norma. Se da cuenta de que su realización no es nunca completa y absoluta: entre el metro que significa según Navarro Tomás "propiamente solo la extensión y la medida silábica del verso" y el ritmo concreto del poema puede haber discrepancias y tensiones. "Ésas no son –generalmente hablado –„defectos", sino que, al contrario, constituyen la esencia misma del ritmo poético" (ib. 15). Esa afirmación nos conduce a una pregunta: ¿cómo podría elucidarse la esencia misma del ritmo poético sin admitir función valiosa de acentos secundarios? Es cierto que para hacerlo debería incluirse a dado estudio la percepción subjetiva del ritmo poético que deriva, según Navarro Tomás, de los principios musicales del lenguaje. A mi modo de ver, se trata del problema cuya solución el método estructural de Bělič, desprovisto de esa exigencia, no puede ofrecer. Sin duda, ese problema se relaciona con otro fenómeno subjetivo, con el llamado "desplazamiento del acento", es decir con el fenómeno que es asimismo uno de los problemas candentes de la métrica eslovaca.

FRANEK

Mikuláš Bakoš, el gran versólogo eslovaco, al apoyarse, igual que Bělič, en los formalistas rusos y en la poética de J. Mukařovský, el historiador literario checo, ha propuesto la misma oposición binaria entre la norma y el ritmo concreto. Para alcanzar el rigor de sistema que consideraba indispensable, Bakoš ha rechazado para su estudio todo momento subjetivo, resultando de la actuación de los acentos secundarios o del "posible" desplazamiento del acento. Sin embargo, frente a los impulsos musicales de Navarro Tomás que vienen a perturbar el estudio preponderantemente formal o estructural, así como frente a la métrica checa de Bělič, Bakoš ha propuesto otro principio: lo vio en la oposición verso/frase, entre la realización métrica de un verso y su aspecto oracional.

Al estudiar las realizaciones métricas del verso eslovaco se ha atenido a la norma más o menos obligatoria. Consiste en la distribución del acento según la regla sobre su colocación en la primera sílaba de la palabra eslovaca. No es sin interés notar que esa dualidad *verso/frase* difiere claramente de la dualidad *sonido/sentido* destacada por Bělič en cuanto al modelo de interpretación, incompleto según él, de Navarro Tomás. Una gran ventaja de M. Bakoš en comparación con la métrica checa de Bělič consiste en el hecho de que el versólogo eslovaco ha podido incorporar en su estudio también el factor sintáctico. Depende de la segmentación oracional del verso, de la distribución de las pausas o cesuras en su estructura. Hay que añadir que los resultados de su método estadístico o formal son dentro de ese tipo de estudios realmente excepcionales bien que hasta hoy día siguen siendo fuera del interés más serio de la versología eslovaca.

M. Bakoš aplicó ese método al análisis evolutivo del verso eslovaco desde la primera mitad del siglo XIX hasta la poesía moderna (véase *Vývin slovenského verša od školy Štúrovej*; La evolución del verso eslovaco desde la Escuela de Štúr, 1939, 1949, 1966). Ha logrado, por ejemplo, definir diferencias básicas entre la generación "popular" agrupada en torno a la Escuela de Štúr y la versificación "aristocrática"de los poetas de la generación posterior de Hviezdoslav. Si la primera estaba caracterizada por el uso del verso silábico, con distribución irregular del acento, la segunda, silabotónica, utilizó el yambo regular cuya automatización se veía,

por otro lado, debilitada por sintaxis libre, sin límites, opuesta a la regular segmentación sintáctica de los poetas de Štúr.

Sin embargo, el sistema binario de Bakoš no prescindía completamente de factores subjetivos. Junto con incorporación del elemento oracional, subrayaba asimismo el papel equivalente del tono, de la entonación oracional. Es en relación con ese componente que Bělič llegó a pronunciar otra crítica al modelo rítmico de Navarro Tomás quien, por su definición, no vio en el tono un procedimiento primordial. El versólogo español ha sostenido que además de la primacía del acento respiratorio "otros factores fonéticos como el tono o la cantidad silábica no desempeñan papel constitutivo en la estructura del verso español" (Navarro Tomás 1968: 9). Un mismo valor se atribuye, al mismo tiempo, a los efectos logrados por "la armonía de las vocales, por la aliteración de las consonantes o por las correlaciones, alternancias, paralelismos, antítesis y demás recursos de la colocación de los vocablos" que "sólo se emplean con función ocasional y complementaria" (Navarro Tomás 1968: 9).

Hay que destacar que todos esos procedimiento no tienen en la teoría de Bakoš función secundaria, sino que se analizan como constitutivos del ritmo acentual y oracional del verso eslovaco. Recordemos que en el marco de la métrica española Dámaso Alonso se ha valido de una semejante visión global en el estudio de los versos de Góngora, de los efectos estéticos de creación culteranista.

No obstante, el afán de sistema que caracteriza los accesos estructurales de Bakoš y Bělič puede suscitar desde nuestros enfoques claras objeciones. La primera coincide con el papel del acento prosódico que por su definición estática y normativa no permite captar todos los rasgos de su actuación "real" en el verso checo o eslovaco. ¿Es posible que se abandone en el estudio el aspecto acústico de los versos? ¿No es necesario tomar en consideración en cada momento también las verdaderas intenciones de un creador poético, ante todo su propia manera de sentir el ritmo poético? ¿Qué tensión existe entre la norma prosódica y la configuración verdadera del verso?

Dado que mis observaciones en esta contribución se apoyan en los resultados de mi propia investigación (la unión de lo objetivo y lo

subjetivo, de lo inmanente y lo transcendente), quisiera destacar
validez legítima de varios puntos de vista en ese estudio.[3] Aparecen
como el fruto de un análisis que sobrepasa el cuadro estático de los
exámenes que se llevan a cabo dentro de la tradición poética de una
literatura nacional o de una lengua. Es natural que el método
contrastivo aplicado al campo de la traducción literaria es capaz de
abrir nuevas posibilidades en el ámbito interdisciplinario o
pluridimensional. Como hemos visto, el trabajo de Bělič carecía casi
absolutamente de referencias detalladas a lo específico de la
versificación checa que en su época determinó, por lo visto, su
revisión crítica del concepto de Navarro Tomás. Uno y otro concepto
representaban así un estado diferente de evolución teórica y, por
consiguiente, se alejaban de sí en los puntos de salida primordiales.
Si Navarro Tomás estaba arraigado todavía en la tradición
propiamente literaria, Oldřich Belič, impulsado por ambiciones
puramente científicas, miraba un acto poético desde el ángulo de su
validez general o generalizada.

La contradicción que se desprende de ambas posiciones es algo
que señala otro factor decisivo. Su ausencia es tanto más sensible
que prueba un divorcio entre literatura y ciencia, entre dos esferas
que son portadoras del instrumentario particular funcionando de
modo sui generis. Es un mérito indudable de Navarro Tomás que el
problema del verso español no haya querido sacarlo del ámbito de la
literatura. Por eso ponía siempre de relieve la esencia primordial de
la música en la configuración rítmica del verso. Mientras que Bělič
no veía en su actitud sino una parcialidad metódica privada de
factores latentes o inmanentes, lingüísticos y formales. El ritmo (y el
ritmo en general) es en su concepto un fenómeno objetivo-subjetivo.
En cuanto a su afirmación surge una pregunta: ¿es realmente esa
dualidad que condiciona la función poética? O bien: ¿qué limitación

---

[3] Véase Franek, L. *Štýl prekladu. Vývinovo-teoretická a kritická analýza
slovenských prekladov Paula Claudela* (El estilo de la traducción. Análisis
evolutivo-teórico y crítico de las traducciones eslovacas de Paul Claudel).
Al considerar una percepción subjetiva, oral o acústica, esta obra analiza
también varios casos del "desplazamiento de los acentos" motivados por un
impulso métrico interior de nuestros traductores-poetas.

se oculta detrás de la palabra "sentido" que el versólogo checo considera indispensable para una visión total del verso?

Dentro de los estudios estructurales de la poesía nacional encontraríamos un libro interesante que ensancha obviamente dada metodología y nos permite elucidar mejor ese problema. Su autor es Jean Cohen, el eminente teórico del verso francés quien se ha propuesto estudiar su evolución desde un punto de vista funcional. El método que ha elegido suponía la única necesidad de considerar sus manifestaciones históricas objetivamente, al dedicarse exclusivamente a su aspecto lingüístico y formal. En el libro *Structure du langage poétique* (1970), fundado en los principios de la lingüística moderna (F. de Saussure), Cohen estudia los textos poéticos a partir de la oposición *prosa/poesía* o de la dicotomía *lengua/habla*. Sin embargo, frente a los conceptos que acabamos de presentar hay en su concepto una diferencia radical. Al postular que el verso como tal comprende a la vez una estructura fónica y semántica, el aspecto semántico está observado por el teórico francés en virtud de su función particular de la poesía. Eso significa que lo que Bělič llama sentido, tiene en su opinión una acepción más amplia. Refleja el desvío natural que un sentido poético produce siempre en relación con leyes naturales del habla corriente. Acaso no es necesario destacar que el concepto dualista de Cohen, bien que reducido al plano meramente estructural y funcional, enriquece considerablemente las posibilidades de la versología moderna porque el aspecto semántico se identifica en esa visión con el aspecto figurativo o metafórico de un texto poético. Diciendo en otras palabras, la estructura del verso está constituida por elementos fónicos, rítmicos y semántico-figurativos. De tal manera, su funcionamiento simultáneo hace posible que no se pierda de vista la esencia misma de la poesía. Una lección adquirida de esa conjunción orgánica es sumamente importante para que el análisis del verso considere no solamente su cara constructiva sino también todo lo que tiene que ver con el problema del *estilo* poético. Como hemos indicado, ese factor organizador hace falta en los anteriores estudios estructurales. Desde la perspectiva nueva todos los elementos del verso constituyen una estructura común donde cada uno de los componentes funciona en interdependencia con los demás.

FRANEK

Claro está, ese concepto es un paso importante en el camino hacia la comparación estilística que se traza justamente en el campo de la traducción literaria. La verdad es que el análisis estructural que hemos presentado en sus diferentes conceptos checos y eslovacos plantea una cuestión esencial. Se refiere a la necesidad de salir más o menos radicalmente del hermetismo lingüístico que se niega a reconocer el valor estético de la literatura concebida no sólo como el fenómeno de arte sino también como la representación diversificada cultural. Es innegable que una orientación primordial al hecho literario, a la descripción estadística de sus componentes constructivos impide pasar a órbitas individuales de la creación literaria. Y si las estudia, tiene en cuenta su incorporación evolutiva a los conjuntos amplios, supraindividuales o nacionales (escuelas, movimientos literarios, formaciones estilísticas, etc.). De tal modo se pierde naturalmente la esencia misma, el valor único de una obra literaria.

En ese sentido lo general, vinculado con lo particular, no es lo mismo que lo específico o lo original. Cualquier estudio estático del verso basado en los esquemas establecidos a priori abandona lógicamente, sin duda alguna, toda referencia a las intenciones reales del escritor relegándolas a veces ni siquiera a una posición secundaria.

No es el propósito de mis observaciones o reflexiones menospreciar un aporte admirable y meritorio de los conceptos estructurales. Forman parte de toda una evolución europea, occidental y centroeuropea que veía y sigue viendo con legitimidad el lugar predominante de la lengua, de su manifestaciones concretas, verificables y objetivamente demostrables. No obstante, a pesar de todas las limitaciones de ese método lógico y racional hay que admitir su descubrimiento importante. Es que muestra con relevancia el papel imprescindible de la lingüística moderna, de sus conquistas generales que ayudan a ver más nítidamente también otra cara del problema, creativa e individual.

No es casual que, por ejemplo, la poética y las reflexiones de los grandes representantes de la modernidad aprovechan de modo fructífero varios estímulos de esa disciplina aunque, por cierto, al ver su validez restringida la someten a veces a severas críticas. Paul

Claudel, el prestigioso neosimbolista francés, en oposición con toda la tradición del pensamiento positivista francés subraya el papel de la metáfora nueva que nos lleva, por un movimiento dinámico interior, a sobrepasar la naturaleza antitética de las cosas y los fenómenos. Su libro *Art poétique* (1907) nos presenta un mundo natural pero visto en relación con principios metafísicos de la existencia humana. Es así una clave que sirve para el conocimiento y el autoconocimiento del hombre en el mundo. El papel de la poesía es elucidar la esencia oculta de nuestra existencia y con la unión intrínseca *animus/anima* reemplazar la noción tradicional de silogismo por la de metáfora. A saber, el silogismo es idéntico según Claudel con "la lógica de la primera parte de la gramática que determina la naturaleza y la función de diferentes palabras. La segunda lógica como si fuera su síntesis orientada hacia el arte de unirlas. Todo eso sucede en la naturaleza misma. Hay sólo ciencia de lo general y arte de lo individual" (Claudel 1926: 44). Siguiendo el sentido profundo de esa afirmación se destaca una diferencia esencial entre los conceptos generales del estructuralismo y una visión todavía bastante tradicional de la poesía y poética neosimbolista. Estriba en una función poética, en su acepción ampliada por íntima relación del poeta con el mundo. Es natural que esa dialéctica universal de las cosas ofrece por leyes multiformes de un acto poético variadas posibilidades.

En las reflexiones de Claudel sobre los mecanismos vivos de la forma de escribir poesía nos interesarían, por cierto, las que afectan al ritmo poético, a las manifestaciones fónicas y tónicas del verso francés. En uno de sus ensayos le cautivó a Claudel el problema específico del verso francés. Atañe a la cantidad, a la forma silábica, al funcionamiento de la rima o de las cesuras y pausas. Es obvio que todas sus opiniones se desarrollan por afán de liberación de los rígidos conceptos clásicos que Navarro Tomás llama en su *Métrica española* "refinado tecnicismo de la versología francesa". Revelan por ejemplo uno de los rasgos típicos: "La sílabas no son en el francés por sí mismas ni breves ni largas, y el fonema comprende una larga que es siempre la última y, sin considerar su número, de una variedad de sílabas neutras cualquiera que sea su valor ortográfico" (Claudel 1954: 66). Es con esa definición que el escritor simbolista critica tanto el carácter mnemotécnico del alejandrino

FRANEK

francés que en su opinión "falsea el principio esencial de la fonética francesa atribuyendo a cada sílaba el valor igual" (ib. 68). No considera por tanto que las ondas breves están terminadas "por una acentuación e insistencia más o menos larga de la voz sobre la última sílaba" (ib. 66). Es obvio que la nueva visión de Claudel coincide con las formas más libres de la métrica moderna.

No es sin interés notar que algunos de los tratadistas del verso español tienen al respecto de las reglas diferentes de acentuación española una visión semejante, apartándose así de los preceptos musicales de Navarro Tomás. En cuanto al ritmo de cláusulas Domínguez Caparrós insiste no solamente en el período de ritmo "mixto" (binario o ternario) como lo ha pretendido su predecesor sino también en la imposibilidad de acumular acentos "en todas las sílabas pares del ritmo yámbico" lo que "sería inarmonioso en español"(Domínguez Caparrós 1993: 88).

El concepto de ritmo que aparece en las reflexiones de Claudel tiene, por lo demás, otro sentido. Refleja esfuerzo por definir y criticar con ironía los rasgos típicos de la mentalidad francesa, sus bases racionales y lógicas. Es decir todo lo que expresan brevemente esas palabras: "la necesidad de lo absoluto". Y es mediante la palabra poética, su valor psicológico y estético que su visión abarca también las zonas poco exploradas, sociales y culturales de su propia nación. Se trata pues de una síntesis vital que además de factores fónicos y semánticos cuenta también con una distribución libre de pausas métricas. Esas pausas encarnan para Claudel *el blanco*, una vacuidad que es necesaria para una percepción más amplia del sentido disipándose siempre en el ritmo discontinuo del verso libre. De eso renace un distanciamiento que resulta tanto de la capacidad de comprender como de la de sentir y resentir esa simbiosis de las cosas que rodean ante todo - al *hombre*.

Dejemos previamente aparte otro gran ejemplo de las literaturas romances que es la figura de Octavio Paz, el gran poeta y pensador mexicano. En su concepto cultural y social arraigado en la tradición latinoamericana y europea encontraríamos, naturalmente, semejantes impulsos. Lo más valioso es que sobrepasen el concepto occidental y eurocéntrico de la lengua para desembocar en un reconocimiento de

la diversidad cultural con todo los valores simbólicos particulares de cada nación, sociedad o comunidad.

Como hemos visto, el papel del ritmo poético examinado por vía de comparación de diferentes conceptos o modos de análisis nos lleva al final a la reflexión sobre las posibilidades de salir del hermetismo objetivista, de abandonar los imperativos metodológicos de índole puramente racional. Pues se trata de un proceso de liberación que revela en la historia de cada literatura nacional el carácter multifacético de una obra literaria.

Una de las salidas posibles y realmente productivas reside a mi modo de ver justamente en el ámbito de la traducción literaria. Y no es sorprendente que ese *giro* metódico afecte asimismo a los modos de enseñanza de nivel universitario. Siendo ésta una actividad tanto empírica como histórica, su verdadero valor contribuye a descubrir a cada momento una aventura individual, subjetivamente motivada. El análisis contrastivo que tiene ambición de penetrar en las esferas válidas de imaginación, de sueños o ficciones tiene toda la potencia de adquirir hasta una forma de juego, de búsqueda libre y atenta de soluciones rítmicas y estilísticas apropiadas.

De todos modos, mediante una visión dinámica y procesal esa actividad creativa no debería olvidar la preparación teórica, una fase propedéutica de la que se nutren variadas formas del quehacer literario. Es lo que hace resaltar con razón más de una vez en el libro *Entre lo uno y lo diverso* (2005) Jorge Guillén, el gran comparatista español. En cuanto a la poesía eso requiere prestar atención a múltiples manifestaciones que representan los diferentes aspectos genéricos, silábicos, fónicos o estróficos. Todos esos aspectos determinan, por cierto, en cada idioma leyes particulares de construcción. Son los que, apropiados, nos llevan a otro campo de creatividad que es según José Martí regido por la necesidad de pensar y *transpensar*.

Como ha demostrado la admirable y riquísima reseña histórica y descriptiva de Navarro Tomás y una empresa muy semejante y valiosa de Mikuláš Bakoš, toda esa herencia vuelve a adquirir en la actualidad el valor de primer interés abriendo así los horizontes poco explorados que siguen trazándose en el porvenir. Los principios teóricos, junto con lo empírico de la eslovaca *Escuela de traducción*

FRANEK

(Anton Popovič) y toda la riqueza de nuestra praxis traductora, también en el ámbito de literaturas romances, ofrecen la garantía de que esos esfuerzos serían exitosos.

La traducción llega a ser desde esos ángulos una actividad interdisciplinaria a pluridimensional que no deja de enriquecer nuestro conocimiento de un individuo creador situado en su propio entorno histórico y cultural. Esa labor tiene, por lo demás, otro valor importante. Permite penetrar en la alteridad cultural de otros pueblos en un proceso nunca cerrado de innovación y recreación. Y recoger nuevos impulsos imprevisibles al adoptar no solamente las actitudes poéticas sino también las posiciones críticas.

Al considerar esa definición general regresemos a la noción esencial de ritmo. Octavio Paz, dándose cuenta de su función primaria en el acto de escribir, llegó a una conclusión, acaso no tanto extraña que "el ritmo es hijo del sonido" y que "las lenguas son puntos de vista". Y en otro lugar añade: "Sin lenguaje, no hay sociedad; sin sociedad no hay lenguaje. Éste es para mí uno de los grandes enigmas de la historia humana. Mejor dicho: el enigma" (Paz 1983: 37). No es sin importancia añadir que una de las tareas esenciales de la traducción literaria es precisamente descifrar ese enigma. En el prólogo a la edición de su obra *El peregrino en su patria* Octavio Paz dice: " No es arbitrario ver nuestra historia como un proceso regido por el ritmo – o la dialéctica – de lo cerrado y lo abierto, de la soledad y la comunión. No es difícil advertir, por otra parte, que el mismo rige las historias de otros pueblos. Pienso que se trata de un fenómeno universal. Nuestra historia no es sino una de las versiones de ese perpetuo separarse y unirse con ellos mismos que ha sido, y es, la vida de todos los hombres y los pueblos" (Paz 1993: 578).

Referencias

Bakoš, M. 1968. *Vývin slovenského verša od školy Štúrovej* (La evolución del verso eslovaco desde la Escuela de Štúr). Bratislava: VSAV.

Bělič, O. 1975. *En busca del verso español.* Praha: Universitatis Carolinae, Philologica monographia.

Domínguez Caparrós, J. 1993. *Métrica española.* Madrid: Ed. Síntesis.

Claudel, P. 1926. *Art poétique*. Paris: Mercure de France.

Claudel, P. 1954. *Réflexions sur la poésie.* Paris: Gallimard.

Guillén, C. 2005. *Entre lo uno y lo diverso. La Literatura Comparada (Ayer y hoy).* Barcelona: Ed. Marginales Tusquets.

Franek, L. 1997. *Štýl prekladu. Vývinovo-teoretická a kritická analýza slovenských prekladov Paula Claudela* (El estilo de la traducción. Análisis evolutivo-teórico y crítico de las traducciones eslovacas de Paul Claudel). Bratislava: VEDA.

Franek, L. 2005. *Modernita románskych literatúr* (La Modernidad de las literaturas romances). Bratislava: VEDA.

Navarro Tomás, T. 1968. *Métrica española*. Reseña histórica y descriptiva. La Habana: Instituto del Libro.

Paz, O. 1983. *Sombras de obras.* Barcelona: Biblioteca del bolsillo.

Paz, O. 1993. *El Laberinto de la soledad.* Madrid: Ed. Cátedra.

Popovič, A. 1968. *Preklad a výraz* (Traducción y expresión). Bratislava: SAV.

Quilis, A. 1994. *Métrica española*. Barcelona: Ed. Ariel.

The Syllabic Structure of Estonian Hexameter at the End of the 19th Century – the First Half of the 20th Century*

1. Introduction: sources and starting points.

The aim of this paper is to study the syllabic structure of the dactylic hexameter in Estonian poetry before the Soviet occupation. The method of this work is the comparative-statistical analysis, as it was developed within Russian formalism and structuralism. It is grounded in the method generated by Andrey Bely, which, in turn, was based on Nikolay Novosadsky's study of the rhythmical structure of Homeric hymns (Novosadsky 1900, see also Bely 1910). While Novosadsky studied quantitative verse, Bely had to create a method to analyze syllabic-accentual meters. Novosadsky treated hexameter in its ideal form as a dactylic meter, the deviation of which are spondaic feet; for Bely the syllabic-accentual verse is in its ideal model a configuration of stressed and unstressed syllables which can be replaced by a sequence of unstressed syllables; for instance in iambic tetrameter, instead of an iambic foot, a pyrrhicius can occur. Thus, his main focus was on deviations from the ideal model (for instance, the incidence of unstressed syllables on strong positions, but also to the contrary, the incidence of stressed syllables on weak positions). In the case of syllabic-accentual verse, this method has been mostly used to study the distribution of stresses in a verse line. In the case of accentual-syllabic and quantitative-syllabic forms, the disposition of the problem has been different – for the most part, variations of syllabic structure have been analyzed, but in these forms the fluctuation of syllables is to a certain extent allowed with metrical rules and therefore not deviations, but the scope of

variations and the rules of deep structures are studied. Accordingly, for instance, in dactylic hexameter every foot consists of at least two syllables, but in the first five feet the metrical rules also allow three syllables. In describing the syllabic variety the number and placement of spondaic or contracted feet is taken into account. Attention is payed, first of all, to verse line as a whole and thus to the formation of rhythm in a line as a result of disposition of syllables of different syllabic structure; which rhythmical patterns are the most common; which rhythmical patterns are avoided, etc. The focus is not as much on the primary rhythm or the alternation of stressed and unstressed or heavy and light syllables, but on the secondary rhythm or the incidence of alternation of different feet (for instance, the incidence of contracted or resolved feet in quantitative-syllabic verse). Mikhail Gasparov distinguishes between alternating secondary rhythm, when, for instance, feet which tend to have a stress in the strong positions and feet which tend to avoid any stresses are placed by turns, and the framing rhythm, when the first and the last foot are marked (see also Gasparov 1993: 87). In addition, the distinction should be made between progressive and regressive types of secondary rhythm; furthermore, there are different combined types, for instance, progressive or regressive alternation, etc.

This paper comprises both analysis of the secondary rhythm of the earlier Estonian hexameter, and a more detailed treatment of syllabic variations based on analysis of verse lines as integers. In the case of the latter the analysis derives from the methods used by David Chisholm to study German hexameter (e.g., Chisholm 1995), where 16 regular, that is, with the dactylic fifth foot, rhythmical variations have been delineated. Exceptions and violations of metrical rules, which, as it happens, are quite frequent in the initial period of Estonian hexameter, will be discussed separately.

Let us start with a short overview of the incidence of dactylic hexameter in the earlier period of Estonian literature. Hexameter occurs both in stichic composition and together with its derivate – pentameter in the original poetry as well as the translated poetry. Due to the fact that five authors – Jaan Bergmann, Villem Ridala, Jaan Lõo, Jaan Jõgever and Anna Öpik have at least partially

translated Homer's epics, the total count of Estonian hexameters is quite high, as it is evident from the following table:

Table 1. The incidence of hexameters in the pre-war Estonian poetry

Author	No. of verses
Betti Alver	6
Jaan Bergmann	2,708
Matthias Johann Eisen	1,053
Erni Hiir	146
Iseõppinud Ladinlane	121
Jaan Jõgever	10,562
Jaan Lõo	15694
Lydia Koidula	9
Friedrich Kuhlbars	175
Andreas Kurrikoff	2,034
Ants Oras	36
Hans Pöögelmann	46
Villem Ridala	837
Gustav Suits	109
Karl Eduard Sööt	60
Juhan Sütiste	139
Henrik Visnapuu	147
Anna Öpik	6,212
Total	40,048

Hence, the database of the Estonian hexameter includes more than 40,000 verses, but is not complete or final. Random hexameters which occurred, for instance, in heterometrical poems or in free verse as single verse lines have been excluded, and, in all probability, there are still hexametrical poems in Estonian to be found, for

instance, from manuscripts and from the texts of less recognized authors.

Regretfully, there is not any whole-data analysis of the metrical repertoire of the period under observation. Researchers who have executed statistical analysis, have confined themselves to either the selective statistics (Peep 1969: 433–434) or intentionally studied only canonical texts (like, for instance, Jaak Põldmäe; see 1971). Therefore, we can only assess that the dactylic hexameter is probably the most common ternary meter during the period studied, as for the entire metrical repertoire, when we take into account the total number of verse lines, it could have been in third place after the trochaic tetrameter and iambic pentameter. However, this hypothesis needs to be verified.

This statistical analysis encompasses 500 verse lines from every author whose extant texts provide such an amount of hexameter: Bergmann, Kurrikoff, Eisen, Ridala, Lõo, Jõgever and Öpik. Samples from the rest of the authors include all existing lines (see Tab. 1).

2. Dactylic hexameter in Estonian poetry: origin and types

The earliest known dactylic hexameter in Estonian was published in 1813, when Peter Heinrich von Frey brought examples of different verse meters in his paper on Estonian poetry (1813). For the elegiac distich he presented the following couplet:

> Palju kül, mis innime jõuab: oh! et nüüd keik joud ka
> Wallitseks ennese peäl', ikka veel parremaks saaks!

Already in this short example we can see several difficulties proceeding from the nature of the Estonian prosody, precursing those which future hexametrists would have to face. First of all, in Estonian the accent is fixed on the first syllable; as a result, for Frey every trisyllabic word is a dactyl, while a disyllabic word is mainly a spondee and monosyllables function as ancipitia. Another, more significant difficulty, which is also demonstrated in this distich, relates to the problem of spondees: just like, for instance, in Russian or German, in Estonian it is hard to constitute accentual spondees, as

well. There are two main options to overcome this difficulty in accentual-syllabic hexameter: the avoidance of spondees, resulting in prevailingly dactylic rhythm; or the use of disyllabic words, the consequence of which is that most spondees are substantially trochees. At the same time, more form-conscious authors have used two monosyllables instead, to give the second syllable more weight in order to function as a spondee. In quantitative hexameter, the second option is excluded, unless the second syllable of the disyllabic word is at least of the second duration, thus carrying a secondary stress.

Hexameter was introduced into Estonian fiction by Friedrich Robert Faehlmann (first examples presented to the public were examples created for the speech "Estonian prosody" held in 1840 in The Learned Estonian Society, see Põldmäe 1978: 10). The basic principles of versification are the same as in Frey's verse: a trochaic word can fill the spondaic foot. Ancient caesurae within the third or the fourth foot are not followed, instead the diaeresis after the third foot prevails. In pentameter, the second half verse is correctly dactylic, in the first half verse often trochees instead of spondees occur.

A greater number of hexameters was created by Jaan Bergmann who first translated *Batrachomyomachia* and after that five cantos of the *Odyssey*. Bergmann's hexameter is also accentual-syllabic. He has attempted to convey the ancient caesura, solving the problem with the help of monosyllabic words. Yet the general rhythmical pattern is rather different from that of the Homeric hexameter, since the proportion of dactylic feet is much higher and word boundaries mostly coincide with the metrical boundaries inside verse. Another more important hexametrist from the end of the 19th century is Matthias Johann Eisen, who has written an epical poem in stichic hexa-meters"Kõu ja pikker" [Thunder and lightning] (1885). Again, the rhythmical structure of it does not have much in common with that of Homer's verse: most of the feet are dactylic, word boundaries tend to coincide with feet boundaries. However, the prevailing caesura is feminine caesura in the third foot, that is, he has tried to follow the ancient caesura. Similar principles have been followed also by Andreas Kurrikoff, Friedrich Kuhlbars and Georg Eduard Luiga.

At the beginning of the 20th century there are ever more experiments with hexameter, whereby the translations of Homer's *Iliad* prevail. In the 1920s Jaan Jõgever translated 16 cantos, still in the manuscript in the Estonian Literary Museum and never published. It is written in accentual-syllabic hexameters which continue, basically, the execution of principles offered by Frey. A spondaic feet can be filled with a trochaic word. Quantity is irrelevant. Instead of the caesura, mostly diaereses occur (after the third foot or the so-called bucolic diaeresis after the fourth foot). Prosody is somewhat stricter than in Bergmann, probably because it is metrically more free (such a connection is rather common, since in order to overcome metrical constraints often solutions are sought from prosody). For instance, in Bergmann's verse the disyllabification of diphthongs is common, while in the first canto of Jõgever's translation the sixth foot (the only position in hexameter where the proper analysis of it is possible) did not have any of such cases.

Another translation of *Iliad* was attempted by Villem Grünthal-Ridala, who confined himself to the first canto. This translation is also accentual-syllabic and its versification is less polished than that of the distichs in his original poetry (which in his later works were also realized as quantitative). The first canto of *Iliad* translated by Ridala was published in 1917. In comparison with the earlier hexameters by Jaan Bergmann and Friedrich Kuhlbars, in Ridala's verse the metrical structure is more constrained: strong positions are usually filled with syllables carrying the primary stress, sometimes also with the first syllable of the second component of a compound word and occasionally with a syllable carrying the secondary stress. He admits trochees instead of spondees. Enjambement, which is usual in Homer's verse (see, for instance, Parry 1971: 251–265), is also common in Ridala's hexameter, at the same time, caesura is not regular. Word boundaries usually coincide foot boundaries, contrarily to the rhythm of the ancient hexameter, where such effect is avoided.

In the second half of the 19th century Estonian linguistics started to analyze the phonological structure of the Estonian language and first treatments of Estonian quantity appeared. The first to systematize length was Ferdinand Johann Wiedemann (1875), whose

approach was, however, formulated in the terms of accent with the distinction between light stresses (syllables of the first and the second duration) and heavy stresses (syllables of the third duration). As degrees of duration, quantity was first treated by Mihkel Veske (1879; see also Ehala 2003: 28), yet the understanding that quantity has no role in Estonian versification persisted for decades. We do not know who was the first to regard the Estonian *regi*song as quantitative, but such approach evolved probably in the 1910s and possibly in works by Johannes Aavik (see Põldmäe 1978: 16). It is all the more remarkable that we can find quantitative verse already in Villem Ridala's first poetry collection "Villem Grünthal's songs" published in 1908. These are, however, not hexameters, but Aeolic verses: Sapphic, Alcaic and Asclepiadean stanzas. It is difficult to establish when the first quantitative hexameter was created in Estonian, due to the existence of unpublished translations. One of the most curious examples of the latter is the full translation of *Iliad* by a lawyer and a poet Jaan Lõo which, until now, has not been published in print[1]. Differently from the above-mentioned authors, Lõo pursues quantitative verse, he also tries to achieve a Homeric contrast between word and foot boundaries. To a certain extant, his principles of versification remind of the rules of the *regi*song: light syllables carrying primary stress are avoided in principitia, at the same time, light final syllables are allowed there. Yet unlike in *regi*song, where this opportunity is mainly used in verse-end, we can see strong positions filled with light non-initial syllables elsewhere in verse line; the phonetic constitution of a word is thereby irrelevant. Trochaic spondees are completely avoided. Word stress is rather irrelevant, except in verse-ends, where a disyllabic word is usually placed, resulting in accentual cadence.

It may well be that the author of the first published quantitative hexameter in Estonian is Gustav Suits, whose principles have much in common with Lõo's rules. Nevertheless, Suits is not as free both prosodically and metrically and therefore his hexameter appears to

---

[1] The online publication, however, can be found at the website *Estonian verse* (http://www.ut.ee/verse/index.php?m=authors&aid=9&obj=works& awid=118).

be much more elaborated. Just like in Lõo's verse, Suits has certain insconsistencies in determining the weight of syllables. Non-initial syllables, which are closed with consonant clusters, are always treated as heavy, as are the non-initial syllables, containing a diphthong. Sometimes, but not as a rule, a syllable is also closed with an initial consonant of the following word; obviously, in this case we are dealing with the direct influence of ancient prosody. Also, a light syllable is sometimes admitted in a strong position.

The third more significant author of quantitative hexameter in the period under observation is Villem Ridala whose poetry book "Tuules ja tormis" [In wind and storm] (1927) contains rhymed elegiac distichs. His verse is somewhat different from that of the above-mentioned authors. First of all, his main attention is on filling the strong positions with an initial syllable of the second or the third duration, while quantity of non-initial syllables is disregarded. At the same time, similarly to Suits, he occasionally allows light syllables in strong positions.

In the 20th century accentual-syllabic hexameter continued to be written in parallel with quantitative hexameter, but it started to apply conscious quantitative effects, compare, for instance, hexameters by Henrik Visnapuu or the licences provided by the rules of quantitative hexameter, seen, for instance, in hexameters by Erni Hiir.

3. Number of syllables in verse line

In the first stage of the analysis the incidence of lines with different syllable count was calculated. The results are presented in Table 2.

Table 2. The incidence of hexameters with different syllable count (%%)

Author	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20
Alver	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	16.7%	83.3%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Bergmann	0.0%	1.0%	7.0%	34.2%	57.8%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Eisen	0.0%	0.6%	4.4%	34.8%	59.8%	0.4%	0.0%	0.0%
Hiir	0.0%	1.4%	8.9%	43.8%	45.9%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Iseõppinud Ladinlane	0.0%	1.7%	3.3%	17.4%	77.7%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%

Author	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20
Jõgever	0.6%	4.4%	24.2%	44.6%	26.2%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Lõo	0.6%	3.2%	14.6%	45.0%	35.4%	0.8%	0.2%	0.2%
Koidula	0.0%	0.0%	44.4%	33.3%	22.2%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Kuhlbars	0.0%	0.6%	1.1%	14.2%	84.1%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Kurrikoff	0.0%	0.2%	3.2%	19.0%	77.2%	0.4%	0.0%	0.0%
Oras	0.0%	8.3%	16.7%	44.4%	30.6%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Pöögelmann	0.0%	0.0%	2.2%	47.8%	50.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Ridala (Iliad)	0.4%	1.0%	1.4%	21.6%	75.2%	0.2%	0.0%	0.2%
Ridala (original poetry)	0.0%	0.0%	1.8%	24.8%	73.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.4%
Suits	1.8%	2.7%	18.2%	38.2%	39.1%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Sööt	0.0%	0.0%	15.0%	23.3%	60.0%	1.7%	0.0%	0.0%
Sütiste	0.0%	0.7%	0.0%	9.4%	88.4%	1.4%	0.0%	0.0%
Visnapuu	0.0%	3.4%	12.2%	29.7%	53.4%	0.7%	0.0%	0.7%
Öpik	0.6%	10.0%	32.8%	40.6%	16.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Total	0.3%	2.8%	11.9%	33.6%	51.0%	0.3%	0.0%	0.1%

The results of the analysis reveal that the syllable count of most hexameters ranges from 15–17 syllables, which was quite expected, considering the dactylicity of Estonian hexameter. There are some authors who consciously attempt to decrease the syllable count in verse: as to quantitative hexameter, such authors are Lõo and Suits, and in accentual-syllabic hexameter this is done with the help of trochaic feet by Jõgever and especially Öpik. The 17-syllabic lines prevail, making up 51% of the entire material. The shortest lines consist of 13 syllables; such verses are extremely rare, appearing only in 0.3% of the cases. The analyzed material does not contain any 12-syllabic verses, where all the feet are contracted.

There are also clear violations of the metrical structure of hexameter. Let us note that, as a rule they are rather towards the bigger, not smaller syllable count. There are four instances where the verse line contains 20 syllables (according to the metrical scheme, the maximum count is 17 syllables).

As to the average syllable count in hexameters of different authors, the lowest count per line is in these authors who have

translated ancient epics (Lõo, Jõgever, Oras and Öpik). To the contrary, the highest syllable count is in the hexameters of original poets Alver, Kuhlbars and Sütiste. However, there are exceptions in both cases: Iseõppinud Ladinlane and Villem Ridala overcome the median, while Suits, being an original poet, does not quite reach it.

4. Secondary rhythmics

The following table demonstrates, how much and in which feet the analyzed authors allow contracted or disyllabic feet.

Table 3. Contractions in hexameter

Author	1. foot	2. foot	3. foot	4. foot	5. foot
Bergmann	11.2%	4.6%	14.2%	21.0%	0.2%
Kurrikoff	6.4%	5.4%	7.8%	5.2%	1.2%
Kuhlbars	5.7%	0.6%	5.1%	5.7%	0.0%
Eisen	13.6%	6.0%	18.8%	7.0%	0.2%
Hiir	16.4%	2.1%	36.3%	8.9%	0.7%
Iseõppinud Ladinlane	6.6%	3.3%	5.8%	9.1%	1.7%
Ridala (*Iliad*)	9.8%	5.2%	4.4%	5.0%	2.6%
Ridala (original poetry)	10.6%	3.5%	8.0%	4.9%	1.3%
Lõo	35.4%	15.6%	14.6%	17.8%	2.2%
Jõgever	33.4%	17.4%	25.2%	30.4%	0.8%
Suits	25.5%	23.6%	18.2%	16.4%	3.6%
Visnapuu	16.2%	4.7%	33.8%	6.8%	0.7%
Sütiste	1.4%	0.7%	8.0%	1.4%	0.7%
Öpik	29.4%	18.8%	55.0%	35.0%	0.4%
Total	19.4%	9.6%	20.2%	16.2%	1.1%

The main difference from the ancient hexameter is the low count of contractions – in the Greek hexameter the number of contractions in some positions exceeds 40%, and in Latin hexameter in the fourth position of some authors is as much as 90%. In Estonian authors this figure rarely goes above 20%. Only the number of contractions in Anna Öpik's verse comes close to the data of the ancient hexameter. The biggest number of contractions is, as a rule, in the first or in the third foot, sometimes also in the fourth foot, but in the studied authors never in the second foot.

The other difference is that secondary rhythmics is only starting to evolve: unlike Greek and Latin hexameter, there are no clear tendencies yet. In Greek hexameter authors show similar dissimilative rhythm, where the number of contractions is the highest in the first two feet (see, for instance, Gasparov 1997: 236–237). The typical secondary rhythm of Latin hexameter, has a progressive, rising character (ib. 240), which has no counterpart in earlier Estonian hexameter. Nevertheless, some more preferred rhythmical models can still be detected. First, there is a rhythmical model where the low number of contractions in the second foot contrasts the higher number of contractions in the first foot, while the number of contractions is even higher in the third and the fourth foot. Such dissimilative rhythm is typical, for instance, to Matthias Johann Eisen, Anna Öpik, Erni Hiir and Henrik Visnapuu, in whose hexameter the contractions peak in the third foot. The so-called falling rhythm, where the biggest number of contractions is in the beginning of verse, but onward drops with every foot, is typical to Gustav Suits. But the data characterizing the incidence of contractions are different in every author. For instance, Jaan Jõgever's rhythmical pattern approaches the tendencies of the so-called framing rhythm. However, there are several authors (for instance, Kurrikoff, Kuhlbars and Lõo) in whose case the secondary rhythmics has not shaped out yet.

In the next stage of analysis verse lines are studied as integers. The notation presented by David Chisholm (1996) is utilized, where 1 marks contracted or disyllabic foot, while 2 marks dactylic, that is, trisyllabic foot. He distinguishes 16 rhythmical variations, which have been presented in Table 8 (in the case of these variations the penultimate foot is always dactylic.

Table 4. 16 regular syllabic variations of hexameter

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
111121	111221	112121	112221	121121	121221	122121	122221

9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16
211121	211221	212121	212221	221121	221221	222121	222221

Table 5. The incidence of syllabic variations in hexameter (%%)

Author	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16
Alver	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	17	83
Bergmann	0	0	0	1	1	1	1	7	0	0	1	2	3	10	15	58
Eisen	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	11	0	0	1	4	1	15	4	60
Hiir	0	0	0	0	1	6	0	10	0	1	0	1	1	27	7	46
Iseõppinud Ladinlane	0	0	0	1	0	0	1	5	0	1	0	2	1	4	7	77
Jõgever	0	1	1	2	2	5	7	14	0	2	3	7	4	10	12	26
Koidula	0	0	0	0	0	33	11	22	0	0	0	0	0	11	0	22
Kuhlbars	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5	0	0	0	1	1	4	5	84
Kurrikoff	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	4	0	0	0	5	0	6	3	77
Lõo	0	1	1	3	1	2	5	22	0	1	1	8	1	7	8	35
Öpik	1	0	1	1	5	10	4	7	4	6	2	5	10	20	8	16
Oras	0	0	0	0	0	3	0	0	8	3	8	6	3	17	19	31
Pöögelmann	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	4	0	2	0	0	0	26	17	48
Ridala (*Iliad*)	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	8	0	0	0	5	0	4	4	75
Ridala (original poetry)	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	9	0	0	0	3	0	8	4	73
Sööt	0	0	0	0	0	3	3	2	0	0	2	5	5	7	8	60
Suits	1	0	0	2	1	4	5	11	1	3	2	14	1	7	5	39
Sütiste	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	7	1	88
Visnapuu	0	1	0	0	0	7	1	6	1	1	0	2	3	20	1	53

The most frequent variations are 122221, 121221, 122121, 212221, 221121, 221221, 222121 and predominantly 222221, that is, combinations where the trisyllabic feet prevail. These results are consistent with the previous stages of analysis which confirm the dactylicity of the Estonian hexameter in the earlier period. All 16 regular variations are represented, as to the forms where the fifth foot is disyllabic, there are only eight different variants.

Different authors have different preferences. There are authors whose verse does not show much variety (see, for instance, Kuhlbars, who has only six different variations, whereas 84% of the verses are of the same rhythmical pattern, or Sütiste, in whose verse the number of different variations is only four, while 88% are of the same pattern). There are also authors whose rhythmical picture is rather varying. Such authors are, for instance, Lõo, who has 14 variants and only 35% of his verses are with the pattern 222221, that is, the most common pattern in other authors; Gustav Suits, who has 17 variations; or Anna Öpik, who has 15 different variations, the most common not 222221 (16%), but the symmetrical 221221 (20%).

In addition to the 16 regular forms, in Kurrikoff's, Oras's, Ridala's, Sööt's, Suits's and Visnapuu's verse several variations with the contracted fifth foot occurred (111211, 122211, 222111, 222211, 221211, 212211). Variations shaped 111111, 112111, 121111, 121211, 211111, 211211 and 212111 did not occur, that is, such variations where the contracted feet prevail and the fifth foot is disyllabic.

At the same time the analyzed material included a number of irregular variations, where both violations against the number of feet in line occurred (22221, 12221, 21221, 1221221, 2222221, 2112221), as well as where violations against the syllabics of a verse foot occurred (122231, 122321, 123221, 132321, 222131, 222321, 223121, 223221, 232221, 322121, 322221, 321221).

5. Metrical deviations

Although, generally speaking, the syllabics of the Estonian hexameter is regulated with the same rules as the ancient hexameter,

more freedom is evident in earlier Estonian hexameter: we come across both tetrasyllabic and monosyllabic feet, analogically with the Estonian *regi*song. The syllabic structure is violated primarily with the following errors:

1. The wrong number of syllables in a foot, for instance, tetrasyllabic feet in hexameter, see, for instance:

x   o o   x o o o   x   o o x   o o x   o o x o

kostsivad penikoorma maad läbi määratu männiku nõnda
(M. J. Eisen, *Kõu ja pikker* [Thunder and lightning] 2.68)
or

x   o o o   x o o x o o x   o   x o o x o

Pisukesteks tükkideks raius ja sõrme suuruseks tegi,
(M. J. Eisen, *Kõu ja pikker* 2.132);

unstressed additional syllable in the beginning or the end of a line (that is, a verse with anacrusis or a dactylic ending), see an example of a verse with anacrusis:

o   x   o o x   o o x   o o x   o o   x   o o   x   o

aminthlane, kui kuna sul ehitand olen templi ma meelsa
(*Ilias* 1.39, tlk Jaan Lõo)

and examples of hexameter with dactylic ending:

  x o o   x o o x o   x   o o   x o o   x o o

küngaste haudunud vahed, tolmunud teeharud-rästikud
(Henrik Visnapuu *Äike* [Thunderstorm])

  x   o x o o   x   o x o o x o o x o o

Sangar nii sõnas, meelt veendis oma venna ta tõisiti
(*Ilias* 7.120, tlk Jaan Lõo).

2. The wrong number of feet. There can be less than six feet, see, for instance, a five-footed hexameter in Jaan Lõo's sample:

  x o o   x o x o o x   o o x o

Atreusipoeg sest sai vihaseks, kohe tõusis,
(*Ilias* 1.387, tlk Jaan Lõo)

or more than six, see a seven-footed hexameter:

x o o x o o x   o o x o o x   o o x o o   x o

Tal inimpõlve ju kaks olivad kadunud sureliste ju meeste,
(*Ilias* 1.250, tlk Jaan Lõo)

The percentage of mistakes depends on an author. There are writers
who break the metrical rules more freely (for instance Jaan Lõo, in
whose sample about 2% of the lines contain some kind of error), but
there are also rather strict authors (for instance, there were no
deviations from the metrical pattern in Anna Öpik's sample).
However, it has to be said that the number of flawed verses was not
big enough in any author to affect the general rhythmical tendencies.

6. Summary

While there were also poets who are more spondaic (trochaic) than
the others, the statistical analysis revealed the overall tendency to
dactylicity. What is more varying is the secondary rhythmics:
preferences of the authors of the studied period were rather different.

The analysis showed that differences in syllable count in this era
do not depend on date of creation nor esthetic orientation of a writer:
there are no clear-cut distinctions between traditionalist and
modernist poets. The versification system has no particular role as
well: quantitative verse can have a rather high average syllable count
(for instance, in Ridala's hexameter), but also a rather low count
(Lõo), see also the different rhythm of accentual-syllabic hexameters
by Sütiste and Öpik. The comparison of original and translated
poetry did not reveal any firm regularities: for instance, the translated
hexameters by Ridala and Iseõppinud Ladinlane have a higher
syllable count, but by Lõo and Öpik a lower count, while Berg-
mann's data are quite average. Also, the number of syllables does not
depend on composition: lower syllable count characterized both
Öpik's stichic hexameter and Oras's elegiac distichs; higher syllable
count is typical to the stichic verse by Iseõppinud Ladinlane and
Juhan Sütiste. Thus, the number of syllables tends to depend rather
on an author's individual preferences, not structural constraint (for

instance, versification system), time of composition, author's esthetic orientation or erudition, etc.

At the same time, verse technique appears to be a factor in preferences for the type of secondary rhythm. The authors of accentual-syllabic hexameter (Eisen, Öpik, Visnapuu) tended to prefer dissimilative rhythm, while Ridala, Suits and Lõo, who wrote quantitative verse, accumulated the contractions in the beginning of verse line.

The analysis of verse lines as integers showed that all studied authors have similar preferences for the variation with the maximum allowed syllable count, in which the first five feet are dactylic. This rhythmical type is especially prevailing in Ridala's, Sütiste's and Kuhlbars's hexameter. Only Öpik prefers the symmetrical variation, where the third foot is disyllabic. Of the studied authors is, however, quite different is the variability: there are authors who prefer 4–6 stereotypical patterns (for instance, Sütiste and Kuhlbars), but there are also authors with a diversified rhythmical repertoire (Lõo, Suits and Öpik).

Both on the level of verse line, and also verse foot occur violations of the metrical rules of hexameter: there are feet or verses with too little or too high a syllable count, there are also additional syllables in the beginning or end of the line. The metrical errors are typical to the period of formation of a meter; in the canonical hexametrical texts created in the second half of the 20th century (for instance, the new translations of *Iliad* and *Odyssey*) such violations are rare.

References

Alver, B. 1979. *Lendav linn*. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Bely, A. 1910. *Simvolizm*. Moskva: Musaget.

Bergmann, J. 1923. *Laulud*. Tartu: Eesti Kirjanduse Seltsi Koolikirjanduse toimkond.

Catullus *70, 76, 83, 84, 86, 93, 101, 109*. http://www.fl.ut.ee/522019.

Chisholm, D. 1995. Prosodic Aspects of German Hexameter Verse. – *Poetics Today* No. 16, 523–545.

Frey, P. H. 1813. Über die Ehstnische Poesie. – *Beiträge zur genauern Kenntniss der ehstnischen Sprache. Heft 2*. Pernau: J. H. Rosenplänter; Reval: Bornwassersche Buchh, 15–43.

LOTMAN

Ehala, M. 2003. Tänapäeva eesti kirjakeele uurimine. Fonoloogia. *The Estonian Mother Tongue Society Year Book* 48, 27–35.

Eisen, M. J. 1885. *Kõu ja Pikker*. Tartu: Schnakenburg.

Gasparov, M. 1993. *Russkie stikhi 1890-kh–1925-go godov v kommentariiakh*. Moskva: Vysshaia shkola.

Gasparov, M. 1997. *Izbrannye trudy. Tom 3. O stikhe*. Moscow: Jazyki russkoi kultury.

Goethe, J. W. von 1880. *Härmann ja Doora. Eesti keelde ümberpannud A. Kurrikoff*. Tartu: K. Mattiesen.

Hiir, E. 1946. *Elu nimel*. Tallinn: Ilukirjandus ja Kunst.

Hiir, E. 1979. *Luuletused*. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Homer 1938. *Homerose Odüsseia. Esimene osa (laulud 1–12) kreeka keelest tõlkinud Anna Öpik*. Tartu: Varrak.

Homer *Iliad translated by Jaan Lõo*. Manuscript in the Estonian Literary Museum.

Homer *Iliad translated by Jaan Jõgever*. Manuscript in the Estonian Literary Museum.

Horace *Satires 1.1 translated by Iseõppinud Ladinlane*. http://www.fl.ut.ee/527442

Koidula, L. 1969. *Luuletused*. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Kuhlbars, F. 1923. *Villi Andi luuletused: esimene osa ehk Perekonnaraamat*. Tallinn: Rahvaülikool.

Kuhlbars, F. 1923. *Villi Andi luuletused: teine osa ehk Isamaa-raamat*. Tallinn: Rahvaülikool.

Kuhlbars, F. 1924. *Villi Andi luuletused III: kolmas osa ehk Sõja- ning Rahu-raamat*. Tallinn: Rahvaülikool.

Novosadskii, N. 1900. *Orficheskie gimny*. Varshava: Tip. Varshavskago ucheb. okruga.

Parry, M. 1971. *The Making of Homeric Verse. The Collected Papers of Milman Parry*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Peep, H. 1969. *Eesti lüürika kujunemislugu aastail 1917–1929. I köide*. Tartu: Tartu Riiklik Ülikool [Dissertation].

Põldmäe, J. 1971. *Eesti värsisüsteemid ja silbilis-rõhulise värsisüsteemi arengujooni XX sajandil: väitekiri filoloogiakandidaadi teadusliku kraadi taotlemiseks*. Tartu: Tartu Riiklik Ülikool [Dissertation].

Põldmäe, J. 1978. *Eesti värsiõpetus*. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Pöögelmann, H. 1957. *Luuletused*. Tallinn: Eesti Riiklik Kirjastus.

Ridala, V. 1927. *Tuules ja tormis*. Tartu: Noor-Eesti.

Suits, G. 1992. *Luule*. Tallinn: Eesti Raamat.

Sööt, K. E. 1942. *Kogutud luuletused*. Tartu: Noor-Eesti.

Sütiste, J. 1955. *Teosed I*. Tallinn: Eesti Riiklik Kirjastus.

Veske, M. 1879. *Eesti keele healte õpetus ja kirjutuse viis.* Tartu: Schnaken-
    burg.
Visnapuu, H. 1964. *Kogutud luuletused.* Stockholm: Tryckeri AB Esto.
Wiedemann, F. J. 1875. *Grammatik der ehstnischen Sprache, zunächst wie
    sie in Mittelehstland gesprochen wird, mit Berücksichtigung der
    anderen Dialekte.* St.-Pétersbourg [etc.]: Imprimerie de l'Académie
    Impériale des sciences.

Medieval cursus in Italian prose by example of Dante Alighieri

The role of *cursus* in Latin prose

In the most simple and general sense, every prose text has a certain rhythm. Narrowly defined, the term "prose rhythm" is used in antique rhetoric to denote rhythmical units at the end of sentences and clauses which in classic prose were called *clausulae*. In these cases, mostly the ends of sentences and clauses were patterned, and the rhythmical unit had to comprise at least two words.

Cursus in prose means harmonic setting of words at the end of the sentences or clauses, according to the given structure, – *artificiosa dictionum structura,* as it was defined by a 13th century author Buoncompagno di Firenze[1]. According to Pier Vincenzo Mengaldo, cursus is a rhythmic scheme which comprises at least two words and was used for ending sentences in medieval high prose (Mengaldo 1970: 290). The rhythm of classic prose was based on the quantity of syllables, i.e., conforming fluctuation of short and long syllables. In time, the system of *clausulae* was simplified and amongst quantity, word stress became significant (Norberg 1968: 87).

Prose rhythm where the quantity as well as word stress were significant was also called *cursus mixtus*. This, in turn, developed into Medieval Latin prose rhythm which was purely based on word stress and which was called cursus (Norberg 1968: 87, Clark 1910: 10–11, Tunberg 1996: 114). Therefore, medieval cursus could be considered the descendents of classic ways of patterning the ends of sentences where quantity was replaced by stress.

---

[1] Quoted Thurot 1868: 480: *'Appositio que dicitur esse artificiosa dictionum structura, ideo a quibusdam cursus vocatur, quia, cum artificialiter dictiones locantur, currere sonitu delectabili per aures videntur cum beneplacito auditorum.'*

In 11th century, cursus were accepted by the Roman Curia. Alberto di Morra systematized the rules of *ars dictandi*[2] in a book *Forma dicandi*. In 1187, he became Pope Gregory VIII and use of cursus became commonplace in pope's writings (Tempest 1930: 77–78). While in the earlier Middle Ages there were several ways of using cursus, during 12th century a process of further simplification and standardization took place in Italy and France. The method of cursus that prevailed had been used by French writers in books from the middle of 12th century. It was called the Roman System, and in 13th century this model was accepted also in Bologna (e.g. by Guido Faba). By the middle of 13th century the Roman cursus was standard almost everywhere in Europe (Tunberg 1996: 115).

Following Johannes de Garlandia's[3] teaching there are four medieval prose styles: *stilus romanus, tullianus, ilarianus* and *isidorianus*. He named the style of Roman Curia also Gregorian style (after Pope Gregory VIII) which typically illustrated prose with rhythmical clauses called cursus and that, above all, at the end of periods and their parts (Schiaffini 1943: 11). Cursus, belonging to the stylistic devices of Roman Curia was mainly a decoration element when it came to letters. Using cursus, however, soon became popular outside the Pope's correspondence and became generally accepted not only in letters but in the entirety of Latin prose. In these Medieval cases, prose rhythm depends completely on stress not quantity (Toynbee 1966: 227).

Therefore, there were four different rhythmic patterns in the late Middle Ages: *cursus planus, cursus velox, cursus tardus, cursus trispondaicus*[4]. Here, rhythmical units comprise at least two words and the last word must have at least 3 syllables. The number of syllables in the word preceding it is not important, only the stress is relevant. *Cursus planus* comprises a trisyllable word with a stress on the penult syllable preceded by a word with similar stress (Xx xXx).

---

[2] *Ars dictandi* is a medieval teaching about writing in prose.

[3] See about Johannes de Garlandia and his book in Faral 1924: 40 and the following, 378 and the following

[4] *Cursus trispondaicus* has been treated as the second form of *cursus planus* (Toynbee 1966: 227).

MIKKEL

Cursus velox comprises a tetrasyllabic word with a stress on the penult syllable preceded by a word with stress on a third syllable from the end of the word (Xxx xxXx). *Cursus tardus* comprises a tetrasyllabic word with stress on the third syllable from the end of the word preceded by a word with the stress on the penult syllable (Xx xXxx). It is thought that the fourth form of *cursus* – a *trispondaicus* that comprises a tetrasyllabic word with a stress on a penult syllable preceded by a word with similar stress (Xx xxXx) – is named so by the modern researchers (Janson 1975: 11). Roman rules also allowed *consillabicatio*, i.e., replacing the last word with two or three short words that include the same number of syllables (Tunberg 1996: 115; Janson 1975: 28–29; Lausberg 1960: 504–505).

In some researches, a different way of describing cursus is used, where the length of the last word is not considered important, but only the number of syllables between the last two stresses and after the stress of the last word is considered (i.e., the last word may be a two-syllable word) (Tunberg 1996: 115). Therefore, next to the usual *cursus planus*, *planus* may also exist where the last word is a tetra- or disyllabic one (with schemes X xxXx and Xxx Xx). Furthermore, next to the usual *cursus velox* a form Xx xxxXx (where the last word contains not four but five syllables), *cursus tardus* may occur in a form of X xxXxx or Xxx Xxx and *cursus trispondaicus* in a form of Xxx xXx or X xxxXx (Lindholm 1963: 40–51). In Latin prose, *cursus velox* was the most popular rhythmic pattern and it was used often at the end of the sentences (and also books)[5] (Toynbee 1966: 229). According to Toynbee, *velox* is the most frequent cursus in Dante's Latin book *Letters* (*Epistolae*) (ib. 242).

---

[5] Dante, for example has at the end of *Monarchia* a *cursus velox* '*temporalium gubernatur*',at the end of IV (III) *Epistolae* a '*praesentium requiratis*', at the end of X *Epist.* a '*in saecula saeculorum*',at the end of VII *Epist.* a '*in gaudio recolemus,* at the end of VIII *Epist.* a '*posteris in exemplum*'; even his *Vita Nuova* ends with a Latin *velox* '*saecula benedictus*'.

From Medieval Latin prose to Italian prose

Although the use of cursus was more popular in Latin prose, they could also be found elsewhere, including in Italian prose. The occurrence of cursus in English prose has also been studied[6]. Subsequently, the occurrence of cursus in medieval Italian prose by the example of Dante Alighieri is treated.

Dante Alighieri (1265–1321), considered the father of Italian language and its first theoretician (see *De vulgari eloquentia*), gave directions for the development of literal Italian language. The writers of this era actually lived in a bilingual society, pending between literal Latin and popular language (*lingua volgare*). In order to write in popular language, it was necessary to be able to do so in Latin as well (D'Agostino 1995: 527). The prose of 13th century was, above all, educational, consisting rather of the translations of important Latin books into popular language (e.g., on the topics of rhetoric and philosophy) more than the penning of original texts (Bonfantini, Gervasoni 1940: 31). In comparison to poetry, prose was at the beginning of its independence at the end of 13th century. But it was apparent that popular language was ready for it, waiting for writers (Brand, Pertile 1996: 36).

Two Guido Faba's books could be considered the birth of Italian prose – *Gemma purpurea* and *Parlamenta et epistulae* (Dotti 1993: 34). Guido Faba lived and worked in Bologna during the first half of the 13th century. He also authored several Latin books concentrating on rhetoric. In *Gemma purpurea* (which concentrates on the technique of literature), the directions are in Latin but he illustrates his visions in popular language in addition to Latin. This way he placed popular language at the same level as Latin and provided writers with models how to write in that new language. In the popular language passages of *Parlamenta et epistulae*, the figures of speech and Latin cursus could be seen (Brand, Pertile 1996: 29). Guido Faba brought the cursus over from Medieval Latin (Serianni, Trifone 1993: 458, Segre 1963: 21).

---

[6] See Tempest 1930, Kuhn 1972.

MIKKEL

Dante used new popular language instead of Latin also in his significant books. Without doubt, his most well-known book is *The Divine Comedy* (*La Divina commedia*), but Dante's prose books in Italian are *The New Life* (*Vita Nuova*), written in his youth (during the period from 1290–1293), and a philosophical tractate entitled *The Banquet* (*Convivio*). In the first, the poetry alternates with prose, there are 31 poems on the book around which the frame of prose is settled. The assignment of prose is to bind the poems by describing Dante's life, while also explaining the meaning of the poems.

Medieval awareness of linguistics and stylistic structures relies on classical rhetoric tradition. *Ars dictaminis*[7] gave exact directions about requirements given for all Latin books and adapted also the form of classical *clausula* to cursus. Dante adjusted carefully with the dictations of *ars dictaminis* (Malato 1995: 1034–35); therefore, it is clear Dante used cursus in his Latin prose[8] although there is also opinion that there is no point in searching for them in his Latin books. Still, admittedly at least *Vita Nuova* seems to have accepted most types of the regular cursus, and that Dante uses cursus also in *Convivio* (Schiaffini 1943: 118).

There are many opinions about whether and how much Dante used cursus in his Italian books, since for that purpose Dante's Latin books have been studied more systematically. For example, Giulio Bertoni claims that Dante rejects almost all rules of rhetoric in his prose in popular language, being intolerant by nature of established categories, and being the creator of other, personal categories[9]. According to Benvenuto Terracini, Dante was very sensitive towards rhythm, and therefore had to be very observant about the ends of sentences, in composing which he was probably influenced by the rules of ends of sentences of Latin prose (Terracini 1957: 256).

---

[7] Medieval teaching about writing letters.

[8] Regular usage of *cursus*es is obvious in Dante Alighieri's books *On the Eloquence of Vernacular* (*De vulgari eloquentia*), *Monarchia, A Question of the Water and of the Land* (*Questio de Aqua et Terra*) and especially in *Epistolae*. In the book *De vulgari eloquentia*, *cursus planus* is dominant, also *cursus tardus* is frequent, at the end of the period *cursus velox* is preferred (Malato 1995: 1035).

[9] Bertoni 1914.

Dante was certainly familiar with the rules of cursus, and seemed to follow them where he found appropriate (Rajna 1932: 86).

In Toynbee's opinion, Dante did not use cursus forms regularly throughout the book, but more in rhetoric and personal places, mostly at the beginning and end of the book (Toynbee 1966: 231). Dante's Latin letters (*Epistolae*) were an exception, as in the case of the letters constant usage of cursus was a rule.

About the occurrence of cursus in Dante's *Vita Nuova*

In my research I have analyzed the occurrence of cursus in Dante's Italian book *Vita Nuova* with the purpose of finding the incidence and patterns of prose rhythm. The sample was formed from all the ends of the sentences and clauses in the book (i.e., the ends before punctuation marks). All together,1703 ends' rhythms were analyzed using statistical scientific method.

In determining the rhythm schemes of sentence ends the problems of Italian prosody, more specifically syllabication, became apparent. The syllabication of Italian words is not problematic when the syllable line is between a vowel and a consonant or between two consonants. The situation is more complicated when there are several vowels alongside, the language then often allows two ways of syllabication (Menichetti 1993: 176–177)[10]. The situation is especially complicated when one of the juxtaposed vowels is an unstressed *i* or *u*, as in Italian those phonemes could be half-consonants (accordingly *j* or *w*). In case of doubt, Aldo Menichetti suggests to consult the dictionary *Dizionario d'ortografia e di pronunzia* compiled by Bruno Migliorini, Carlo Tagliavini and Piero Fiorelli. This recommendation has also been followed for this analysis.

The results of the analysis are summarized in the following table:

---

[10] Menichetti has given the word *beatitudine* as an example, the word could be a pentasyllabic or a hexasyllabic word, the choice depends often on the context, speed of speech, also there may occur differences in regions.

MIKKEL

Table 1. The occurrence of *cursus*es and other rhythmical ends of sentences in the book *Vita Nuova*

	Frequency	%
Cursus planus	554	32.5%
Cursus velox	127	7.5%
Cursus tardus	49	2.9%
Cursus trispondaicus	274	16.1%
Other	699	41.0%
Total	1703	100.0%

The results of the analysis show that the percentage of the cursus in the given book is 59%, there, in turn *cursus planus* (32.5%) has prepotency, for example: *alcuna parola, altra persona, certe parole, donna gentile*; *cursus trispondaicus* (16.1%) follows, for example: *certe tavolette, cosa da udire, essere gentile; cursus velox* (7.5%), for example: *debole condizione, dolcissimo salutare, spirito naturale* and *cursus tardus* (2.9%), for example: *ancora dividere, colore rettorico, posso intendere. Cursus planus* and *trispondaicus* are the most natural in popular language as many of the words of this language have stress on the penult syllable and these two types of cursus include such words.

The research also observed the occurrence of cursus in the given book by chapters, summary of that analysis could be seen in the following tables:

Table 2. The occurrence of cursus and other rhythmical ends of sentences in different chapters

	Cursus planus	Cursus velox	Cursus tardus	Cursus trispondaicus	Other	Total
I	2				4	6
II	12	10	2	5	19	48
III	28	4	2	10	31	75
IV	4	3	1	3	4	15

Medieval cursus in Italian prose by example of Dante Alighieri

	Cursus planus	Cursus velox	Cursus tardus	Cursus trispondaicus	Other	Total
V	6		1	3	14	24
VI	4	1		2	5	12
VII	6	1	3	2	10	22
VIII	8	1		6	16	31
IX	15	1		9	14	39
X	2	4		3	5	14
XI	4	7		5	8	24
XII	29	8	3	15	35	90
XIII	17	1		13	16	47
XIV	33	5		12	27	77
XV	11	2	2	9	23	47
XVI	7	2		4	10	23
XVII	1	2		1	4	8
XVIII	23	3	2	6	26	60
XIX	28	3	2	7	29	69
XX	13		1	2	7	23
XXI	7	2		4	20	33
XXII	17	5	1	14	32	69
XXIII	38	13	3	28	64	146
XXIV	23	3		9	24	59
XXV	39	13	5	13	26	96
XXVI	21	2	4	20	21	68
XXVII	5	1		2	3	11
XXVIII	9	1	3	1	12	26
XXIX	13	3	4	8	14	42
XXX	6	2		4	6	18
XXXI	8	1		7	22	38
XXXII	9	3		3	11	26
XXXIII	8			2	14	24
XXXIV	15	4		7	12	38
XXXV	7			6	13	26
XXXVI	7		1	2	3	13

MIKKEL

	Cursus planus	Cursus velox	Cursus tardus	Cursus trispondaicus	Other	Total
XXXVII	7	2		6	14	29
XXXVIII	19	3	1	9	25	57
XXXIX	11	3	1	3	14	32
XL	19	2	3	5	14	43
XLI	11	5	4	2	22	44
XLII	2	1		2	6	11
Total	554	127	49	274	699	1703

Table 3. The occurrence of cursus and other rhythmical ends of sentences in different chapters %%

	Cursus planus	Cursus velox	Cursus tardus	Cursus trispondaicus	Other	Total
I	33.3%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	66.7%	100.0%
II	25.0%	20.8%	4.2%	10.4%	39.6%	100.0%
III	37.3%	5.3%	2.7%	13.3%	41.3%	100.0%
IV	26.7%	20.0%	6.7%	20.0%	26.7%	100.0%
V	25.0%	0.0%	4.2%	12.5%	58.3%	100.0%
VI	33.3%	8.3%	0.0%	16.7%	41.7%	100.0%
VII	27.3%	4.5%	13.6%	9.1%	45.5%	100.0%
VIII	25.8%	3.2%	0.0%	19.4%	51.6%	100.0%
IX	38.5%	2.6%	0.0%	23.1%	35.9%	100.0%
X	14.3%	28.6%	0.0%	21.4%	35.7%	100.0%
XI	16.7%	29.2%	0.0%	20.8%	33.3%	100.0%
XII	32.2%	8.9%	3.3%	16.7%	38.9%	100.0%
XIII	36.2%	2.1%	0.0%	27.7%	34.0%	100.0%
XIV	42.9%	6.5%	0.0%	15.6%	35.1%	100.0%
XV	23.4%	4.3%	4.3%	19.1%	48.9%	100.0%
XVI	30.4%	8.7%	0.0%	17.4%	43.5%	100.0%
XVII	12.5%	25.0%	0.0%	12.5%	50.0%	100.0%
XVIII	38.3%	5.0%	3.3%	10.0%	43.3%	100.0%
XIX	40.6%	4.3%	2.9%	10.1%	42.0%	100.0%

Medieval cursus in Italian prose by example of Dante Alighieri

	Cursus planus	Cursus velox	Cursus tardus	Cursus trispondaicus	Other	Total
XX	56.5%	0.0%	4.3%	8.7%	30.4%	100.0%
XXI	21.2%	6.1%	0.0%	12.1%	60.6%	100.0%
XXII	24.6%	7.2%	1.4%	20.3%	46.4%	100.0%
XXIII	26.0%	8.9%	2.1%	19.2%	43.8%	100.0%
XXIV	39.0%	5.1%	0.0%	15.3%	40.7%	100.0%
XXV	39.6%	13.5%	5.2%	13.5%	28.1%	100.0%
XXVI	30.9%	2.9%	5.9%	29.4%	30.9%	100.0%
XXVII	45.5%	9.1%	0.0%	18.2%	27.3%	100.0%
XXVIII	34.6%	3.8%	11.5%	3.8%	46.2%	100.0%
XXIX	31.0%	7.1%	9.5%	19.0%	33.3%	100.0%
XXX	33.3%	11.1%	0.0%	22.2%	33.3%	100.0%
XXXI	21.1%	2.6%	0.0%	18.4%	57.9%	100.0%
XXXII	34.6%	11.5%	0.0%	11.5%	42.3%	100.0%
XXXIII	33.3%	0.0%	0.0%	8.3%	58.3%	100.0%
XXXIV	39.5%	10.5%	0.0%	18.4%	31.6%	100.0%
XXXV	26.9%	0.0%	0.0%	23.1%	50.0%	100.0%
XXXVI	53.8%	0.0%	7.7%	15.4%	23.1%	100.0%
XXXVII	24.1%	6.9%	0.0%	20.7%	48.3%	100.0%
XXXVIII	33.3%	5.3%	1.8%	15.8%	43.9%	100.0%
XXXIX	34.4%	9.4%	3.1%	9.4%	43.8%	100.0%
XL	44.2%	4.7%	7.0%	11.6%	32.6%	100.0%
XLI	25.0%	11.4%	9.1%	4.5%	50.0%	100.0%
XLII	18.2%	9.1%	0.0%	18,. %	54.5%	100.0%
Total	32,5%	7.5%	2.9%	16.1%	41.1%	100.0%

Since *cursus planus* and *cursus trispondaicus* are the most natural in popular language, their occurrence in every chapter is not surprising, except the first chapter that is a short introduction to the book. If we take a closer look at the occurrence of *cursus velox* and *tardus* we recognize their abundance in two chapters – XXVIII and XLI. In chapter XXVIII Beatrice dies, therefore making this one of the more epochal chapters in the whole book. In Latin prose, *cursus velox* was

thought as one of the most elegant and was used above all at the end of the sentences, and often at the end of the book. A Latin *cursus velox* is also at the end of this book: *secula benedictus*. The accrual of *velox* in certain chapters is also noticeable, as chapter II (where Dante first meets Beatrice), chapter IV (Dante describes what influence love has on him), chapter X (Beatrice does not respond to Dante's greetings), chapter XI (the influence of Beatrice's greetings on Dante), chapter XVII (Dante decides to work with different materials in the future), where approximately one-quarter of the ends are *cursus velox* (in chapter X 28.6%, in chapter XI 29.2%); furthermore, in chapters X, XI and XVII *cursus velox* exceeds *cursus planus* as well as *trispondaicus*.

Taking a closer look at the cursus-forms occurring in book *Vita Nuova*, it can be seen that Dante, in cases of *planus* and *trispondaicus*, preferred to use regular forms (i.e., with the scheme Xx xXx and Xx xxXx). Also over half of the incidences of *cursus tardus* follow the regular scheme of Xx xXxx, while in the case of *cursus velox*, the preferred scheme is Xx xxxXx and the regular form Xxx xxXx is occurring less.

In *Vita Nuova*, 41% of the cases consist of other rhythm schemes that do not fit under *cursus*es. Amongst them, trochaic rhythm XxXx that is used in 57.1% of cases, is dominant. Usually, it is a disyllable word, for example, *altre donne, certe cose, fosse corpo, molte volte*. It could also be a disyllable word preceded by a trisyllable word, for example, *secondo altro, sonetto sono, persona detta*. XxxX (13.2%) follow, for example, *apparve a me, desse di sé*, XxXxx (7.3%), for example, *alquante lagrime, questa camera, pure femmine*, XxxxXxx (5.6%), for example, *questa gentilissima, anima bellissima, essere risibile.*

Table 4. Other rhythmical ends of sentences in *Vita Nuova*

Scheme	Frequency	%%
XXxX	25	3.6%
XXXx	5	0.7%
XxxX	92	13.2%
XxXx	399	57.1%
XXxx	2	0.3%
XXxX	1	0.1%
xxXXx	2	0.3%
XxxxX	28	4.0%
XxXxx	51	7.3%
XxXxX	5	0.7%
XxxxxX	4	0.6%
XxxxxxX	1	0.1%
XxxxXxx	39	5.6%
XxxxxxxX	1	0.1%
XxxxxxXx	29	4.1%
XxxxxXxx	9	1.3%
XxxxxxxXx	2	0.3%
XxxxxxXxx	1	0.1%
XxxxxxxxXx	2	0.3%
XxxxxxxXxx	1	0.1%
Total	699	100.0%

Based on the results of the analysis, it can be said that Dante is not indifferent towards rhythm and uses cursus in his prose works in popular language but he adjusts them according to the requirements of natural language. In Latin, the word stress may be on the penult or the third syllable from the end, and in Latin prose, *cursus velox* that comprises words with such stress, was mostly used. Many words of popular language have the stress on penult syllable, and the results of the analysis showed that Dante used mostly *cursus planus* and *trispondicus* which comprises words with stress on the penult

MIKKEL

syllable. Also in cases of *cursus velox* Dante preferred to use the form Xx xxxXx rather than Xxx xxXx which is more characteristic to Latin. The importance of rhythmical endings of sentences in Dante's prose in popular language is also shown by accrual of *cursus velox* in certain chapters and the fact that *Vita Nuova* ends with *cursus velox* as is characteristic to many of the Latin books.

References

Alighieri, Dante 1984. *Opere minori. Tomo I. Parte I.* A cura di Domenico de Robertis e di Gianfranco Contini. Milano, Napoli: Riccardo Ricciardi Editore.

Bertoni, G. 1914. *La prosa della 'Vita Nuova'.* Genova: A.F. Formiggini.

Bonfantini, M., Gervasoni, G. 1940. *Antologia della letteratura italiana. Ad uso dei licei, degli istituti magistrali e delle scuole medie superiori. Vol. I Dalle origini a tutto il '400.* Milano: Corticelli.

Brand, P., Pertile, L. 1996 (ed.) *The Cambridge History of Italian Literature.* Cambridge: University Press.

Clark, A. C. 1910, *The Cursus in Mediaeval and Vulgar Latin.* Oxford: Clarendon press.

D'Agostino, A. 1995. Itinerari e forme della prosa. – *Storia della letteratura italiana. Volume I. Dalle origini alle Dante.* (ed. Enrico Malato) Roma: Salerno, 527–630.

Dotti, U. 1993. *La letteratura italiana. Dalle origini a oggi.* Roma-Bari: Laterza.

Faral, E. 1924. *Les arts poétiques du XII et du XIII siècle,* Paris: È. Champion.

Janson, T. 1975. *Prose Rhythm in Medieval Latin from the 9th to the 13th Century.* Stockholm: Almquist & Wiksell international.

Kuhn, S. M. 1972. Cursus in Old English: Rhetorical Ornament or Linguistic Phenomenon? *Speculum* 47 (2), 188–206.

Lausberg, H. 1960. *Handbuch der literarischen Rhetorik: eine Grundlegung der Literaturwissenschaft.* München: Hueber.

Lindholm. G. 1963. *Studien zum Mittellateinischen Prosarhythmus. Seine Entwicklung und sein Abklingen in der Briefliteratur Italiens.* Stockholm: Almquist & Wiksell.

Malato, E. 1995. 'Dante' in *Storia della letteratura italiana. Volume I. Dalle origini alle Dante.* (ed. Enrico Malato) Roma: Salerno, 773–1052.

Mengaldo, P. V. 1970. 'Cursus' in *Encyclopedia dantesca.* Roma: Istituto della Enciclopedia Italia, 290–295.

Menichetti, A. 1993. *Metrica italiana. Fondamenti metrici, prosodia, rima.* Padova: Editrice Antenore.

Migliorini, B., Tagliavini, C., Fiorelli, P. *Dizionario d'ortografia e di pronunzia.* http://www.dizionario.rai.it/index.aspx?treeID=1

Norberg, D. L. 1968. *Manuel pratique de latin médiéval.* Paris: Picard.

Rajna, P. 1932. 'Per il 'cursus' medievale e per Dante' in *Studi di filologia italiana. Bulletino della R. Accademia della Crusca. Volume III.* Firenze: G. C. Sansoni Editore.

Schiaffini, A. 1943. *Tradizione e poesia nella prosa d'arte italiana dalla latinità medievale a G. Boccaccio.* Roma: Edizioni di Storia e letteratura.

Segre, C. 1963. *Lingua, stile e società. Studi sulla storia della prosa italiana.* Milano: Feltrinelli Editore.

Serianni, L., Trifone, P. 1993. (ed.) *Storia della lingua italiana. Vol. I, I luoghi della codificazione.* Torino: Giulio Einaudi.

Tempest, N. R. 1930. *The Rhythm of English Prose.* Cambridge: University Press.

Terracini, B. 1957. *Pagine e appunti di linguistica storica.* Firenze: Felice le Monnier.

Thurot, C. 1868. *Notices et extraits de divers Manuscrits latins pour servir à l'histoire des doctrines grammaticale au moyen age.* Paris: Bibliothèque Impériale.

Toynbee, P. J. 1966. *Dantis Aligherii Epistolae. The Letters of Dante. Emended Text with Introduction, Translation, Notes, and Indices and Appendix on the Cursus.* Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Tunberg, T. O. 1996. 'Prose styles and *cursus'* in *Medieval Latin.* (ed. by Mantello, Frank Anthony Carl, Rigg, Arthur Georg). Washington: The Catholic University of American Press, 111–121.

Books and Reviews Received

Debats. 3, 2010. Valencia: Institució Alfons el Magnànim, 97 pp. ISSN 0212–0595. (Dir. Rosa María Rodríguez Magda). Under the subtitle "George Santayana: La lucidez de la razón", the richly illustrated journal contains articles in Spanish by about the heritage of the Spanish-born American philosopher.

Debats. 1, 2011. Valencia: Institució Alfons el Magnànim, 101 pp. ISSN 0212–0595. (Dir. Rosa María Rodríguez Magda). Under the subtitle "Foucault: fundador de discursividades", the richly illustrated journal contains articles in Spanish about the heritage of the French philosopher.

Exemplaria classica. Journal of Classical Philology. Eds. Antonio Ramírez de Verger Guillermo Galán, Miyam Librán. Universidad de Huelva. 14 /2010. ISSN 1699–3225. The journal contains a great number of articles on classical literature and reviews on editions and monographs in this field, in Spanish, English, German, French, Italian.

Forum for World Literature Studies. Eds. Huang Tiechi, Nie Zhenzhao, Charles Ross. Shanghai Normal University, Central China Normal University, Purdue University. 3 /2010, 522 pp. ISSN 1949–8519. The present issue of a new Chinese-American academic journal of world literature contains four thematic special sections, with articles in English and Chinese: Coetzee Studies (authors: E. Boehmer, D. Attridge, S. Kossew, Cai Shengquin), Tagore Studies (authors: P. Surie, Wei Liming, R. Basu), Bjørnson Studies (authors: T. Bakke, Li Minghous, Sun Jian, Ng Hog Chiok), Estonian Literature Studies (authors: J. Talvet, L. Pilter, K. Talviste).

Moreno, Fernando Ángel. *Teoría de la Literatura de Ciencia Ficción. Poética y retórica de lo prospectivo*. Vitoria: PortalEditions, 2010, 504 pp. ISBN 978–84–937075–7–6.

Pormeister, Eve. *Grenzgängerinnen*. Berlin: SAXA Verlag, 2010, 222 pp. ISBN 978–3–93960–26–0.

Pozuelo Yvancos. *Figuraciones del yo en la narrativa: Javier Marías y E. Vila-Matas*. Valladolid: Cátedra de Miguel Delibes, 2010, 231 pp. ISBN 978–84–8448–542–1.

Rampike. 2 / 2010. *Cultural Mischief.* (Toronto) Dir. Karl E. Jirgens. ISSN 0711–7647. It is a journal for fiction, poetry, texts, photos, graphics, interviews, essays and reviews featuring.

Recherche Littéraire / Literary Research. Vol. 26, 2010. ISSN 0849–0570. (Ed. John Burt Foster, Jr.) The journal in its new phase of publication includes a great variety of reviews about recent collective and individual works in the field of comparative literature.

Rilce. 26.2. Pamplona: Universidad de Navarra, 2010. ISSN 0213–2370. (Dir. Víctor García Ruiz). From the area of literary research, it contains the following articles: D. Blaustein, Ilusión de mimesis y amenidad en *La reina Isabel cantaba rancheras* de Hernán Rivera Letelier; G. Insausti, El teatro de Manule Altolaguirre: *El espacio interior*; J. M. Martínez, ¿Subversión u oxímoron?: la literatura fantástica y la metafísica del objeto; F. Quinziano, Las *Noches lúgubres* cadalsianas: humanitarismo, sensismo y nueva sensibilidad en la literatura dieciochesca; J. M. Rodríguez García, La dualidad historia / leyenda en Bécquer, Valle-Inclán y Antonio Machado.

Rilce. Monográfico. 27.1 /2011. Pamplona: Universidad de Navarra, 2009. ISSN 0213–2370. (Dir. Víctor García Ruiz). It a monographic issue of the journal: "El 'arte nuevo' de Lope y la perspectiva dramática del Siglo de Oro: teoría y práctica. (Eds. J. Enrique Duarte and Calros Mata Induráin, with articles in Spanish by I. Arellano, J.; Díez Borque, C. C. García Valdés, M. A. Garrido Gallardo, C. Mata Induráin, J. Oleza, C. Oliva, F. B. Pedraza Jiménez, J. Rubiera, E. Rull, G. Serés, F. Serralta, K. Spang, A. Suárez Miramón.

Siglo XXI. Literatura y cultura españolas. Revista Anual de la Cátedra Miguel Delibes. 6 / 2008. Dir. María Pilar Celma. Valladolid: Cátedra de Miguel Delibes, 2010, 296 pp., ISSN 1697–0659. It contains a great number of articles on Spanish literature and culture, mostly, in Spanish.

The Atlantic Literary Review. (Ed. Rama Kundu). Volume 10, Number 3, 2009. ISBN 978–81.269–0836–3. It contains articles (mainly on English and Indian English) literature by R. Nandi, H. D. Raviya, F. P. Desai, U. Nwagbara, K. Singh, V. Sunitha, D. Chakraborty and I. Ghosh, A. Singh, S. Tiwari.

The Atlantic Literary Review. (Ed. Rama Kundu). Volume 10, Number 4, 2009. ISBN 978–81.269–0836–3. It contains the following articles: M. Yasae, Do We Get All-in-One or Non-in-One Product? Margaret Drabble's Vision of Pluralism in *The Radiant Way*; S. B.

Hasan, O'Neille's Dramatic Synthesis of Myths; M. Gupta, Infanticide and Mother-Daughter Relationship in Toni Morrison's *Beloved*; R. Saraswathi, The Mask and the Role, the Model and the Replica, the Play and the Non-Play: A Study of Edward Albee's *Tiny Alice*; P. K. Kalyani, The Diasporic Predicament of Alienation: A Study of Select Poems of Nissim Ezequiel and Irving Layton; C. J. George, Ezequiel's "Miss Mushpa T.S." and Her Friends; A. Patel, Padma, Parvati and Durga: Real Bodies and Imagined Nations in Salman Rusdies's *Midnight's Children*, S. Gurwara, Manju Kapur's *A Married Woman* – An Interrogation of Marital Relationships; B. K. Sharma, Construction and Deconstruction: A Feminist Interpretation of the Text of *Paro: Dreams of Passion*; P. C. Pradhan, Challenging Patriarchal Ideology: Interpretation of Feminist Vision in the Novels of Anita Desai, Shashi Deshpande, Arundhati Roy and Manju Kapur; S. Haldar, Feminist Literary Theories in the Context of Indian Literature in English: An Overview.

The Atlantic Literary Review. (Ed. Rama Kundu). Volume 11, Number 1, 2010. ISBN 978–81.269–0836–3. It contains the following articles: P. Sengupta, Robert Frost's "Mending Wall: A Bakhtinian Reading; L. Barathan, Beyond Personal History – Autobiography as Cultural Signifier: Maya Angelou's *I Know Why the Caged Birds Sing*; E. Ngongkum, The Mass Media in African Literature: Peter Abrahams' *A Wreath for Udomo* and Alowbed'Epie's *The Death Certificate*; B. Naikar, Crime and Punishment in J. M. Coetzee's *Disgrace*; A. Choubey, Braving the Dark: First Impressions of *The White Tiger*; S. Haldar, Controversy Over Holding a Mirror to Realities: A Study of *The God of Small Things, The White Tiger* and *The Inheritance of Loss*; P. Lata, Streak of Alienated Idetnification in Jhumpta Lahiri's Works; R. Tibile, Homi K. Bhabha: The Theory of Hybridity; V. Shanker, A Cultural Approach to Science, Magic and Technology in the *Harry Potter* Series; P. Roy, *Non seulement un correspondant à visage poupin*: Detecting Hergé's Ideologies in the Tintin Albums.

The Atlantic Literary Review. (Ed. Rama Kundu). Volume 11, Number 2, 2010. ISBN 978–81.269–0836–3. It contains the following articles: S. Rahim Moosavinia, Ambivalance in Kipling's *Kim*; P. Sengupta, Confronting the Gaze: The Rhetoric of Visualization in *The Scarlet Letter*; U. Abdurrahman, Richard Wright's *The Outsider*: An Existentialist Approach; A. Chattaraj (Mukhopadhyay),

Childhood in Toni Morrison's *Beloved*; R. Vemula, Female Subjectivity and Resistence: Subversive Politics in Adrienne Rich's Poetry; J. Tar Tsaaior, The Private, the Public and the Prophetic: Politics of Achebe's Art and Fifty Years of *Things Fall Apart*; M. Rashmi Kindo, Judith Wright's Poetry: A Case for Redefining Sensibility; P. Ghosh, Themes and Thematic Symbols in Ibsen's *A Doll House*: A Critique; B. Nayak, Vijay Tendulkar's *Ghasiram Kotwal*: A Study of Power Dynamics in the Aesthetics of History; S. J. P. Joseph, The Novelist as a Social Chronicler: A Critical Analysis of Kiran Desai's *The Inheritance of Loss*; M. Kumar, Repetition and Verbal Structuring in McCullers *Clock Without Hands.*

The Atlantic Literary Review. (Ed. Rama Kundu). Volume 11, Number 3, 2010. ISBN 978–81.269–0836–3. It contains the following articles: B. Pourgharib, Meaning and Meaning-Making in the Structuralist-Poststructuralist Contexts; S. Lahiri, Shakespeare's Cleopatra: A Feminist Reading; S. Brar, Thematic Core of the Writing of G.B. Shaw; E. Sheen Divakar, The Cultural Legacy of the Jazz Age in Toni Morrison's *Jazz*; A. Kehinde: J.M. Coetzee's *Life and Times of Michael K* and the Empowerment of the Disabled; S. Ray, The Enigma of Authoethnography: Saga of an Émigré; S. Haldar, Some Hidden Facets of the Colonial Rule in India: A Study of *Sea of Poppies*; S. Putatunda, Violence and Veneration: *Panchya Kanya*; A. Myles, Japanese Noh Drama and the Theatre of the Absurd; R. Joseph, Spatializing Literary and Cultural Studies; S. Jha, Vedantic Philosophy in Raja Rao's First Three Novels; K. Kavita, Manju Kapur's *A Married Woman*: A Woman's Quest for a New Identity.

Tópicos del Seminario. 23. Benemérita Universidad Autónoma de Puebla. 2010. ISSN 165–1200. (Dir. María Isabel Filinich). Under the title "Semántica e interpretación" it contains articles in Spanish by B. Pincemin, T. Mézaille, C. Chollier, E. Ballón Aguirre, B. Hall, S. Martín Méndez, V. Cárdenas, M. Costilla.

Tópicos del Seminario. 24. Benemérita Universidad Autónoma de Puebla. 2010. ISSN 165–1200. (Dir. María Isabel Filinich). Under the title "La significación del espacio" it contains articles in Spanish by L. E. Raso, R. Guzmán, I. Darrault-Harris, C. Gonzálex-Ochoa, E. Landowski, J. Alonso Aldama, B. Lamizet.

About Authors

EPP ANNUS (PhD 2002, Tartu University) is senior researcher at the Estonian Literary Museum Cultural Theory research group. Her publications include a monograph on time and narrative "How to Tell Time" (in Estonian, 2002), a novel *Matilda* (in Estonian, 2007) and an edited collection *Twentieth Century Movements of Thought* (in Estonian, 2009). She has written numerous articles on post-colonialism and Estonian 20th century prose literature, and on the relations between philosophy and culture.

FERNANDO BERMEJO-RUBIO, PhD, historian of religions, is currently a Research Fellow at the Department of Greek Philology and Indo-European Linguistics (Universidad Complutense, Madrid) and Lecturer of Early Christianity in the Master of Religions and Societies at Pablo de Olavide University (Sevilla). His main areas of research are historiography on Jesus of Nazareth, Gnostic trends, the history of Manichaeism and Kafka's works. He is the author of *La escisión imposible. Lectura del gnosticismo valentiniano* (1998) and *El maniqueísmo. Estudio introductorio* (2008), and coeditor of *El maniqueísmo. Textos y Fuentes* (2008). He is also one of the translators to Spanish of the Coptic library of Nag Hammadi. He has published numerous articles in Spanish, French, English and German on journals as *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik*, *Revista de Filología Alemana*, *Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa*, *Journal for the Study of the Historical Jesus* or *Deutsche Vierteljahrsschrift für Literaturwissenschaft und Geistesgeschichte* and on several collective volumes – The *Gospel of Judas in Context* (2008) and *The Judas Codex* (2009).

TINA BILBAN is post-doctoral fellow at the Institute for Quantum Optics and Quantum Information (Vienna), working as a philosopher on the "Philosophers-Physicists Cooperation Project on the Nature of Quantum Reality". She took her PhD on contemporary physical and philosophical theories of time and their application to contemporary

literature at the University of Ljubljana, Slovenia, in 2009. Her interests and publications encompass the crossroads between continental philosophy, contemporary literature and contemporary physics. In addition she has published a book of short stories *Interferenca* (2010). She is also a member of a professional Slovenian national board for children's literature (2007).

MÓNICA DOMÍNGUEZ PÉREZ is a graduate of Spanish philology from the University of Santiago de Compostela. She took her PhD with a thesis about translations of youth and children literature in Spain. It is the main topic of her research. She has worked at high school and is currently (since 2008) Lecturer of Spanish at the University of Abuja (Nigeria).

VINCENT FERRÉ is Lecturer (maître de conférences) in Comparative Literature at the Université de Paris 13, and a member of *Equipe Fabula à l'ENS*, www.fabula.org. He works on the European and American novel of the 20th century: on genres (essay and novel, novel and theory), especially on Proust, Broch and Dos Passos; and on medievalism. His PhD (*L'essai fictionnel chez Proust, Broch et Dos Passos*, 2003) is to be published in 2011 (Paris, Honoré Champion). He has published and edited books on Tolkien & medievalism (*Sur les Rivages de la Terre du Milieu*, 2001; *Tolkien, Trente ans après*, 2004; *Médiévalisme. Modernité du Moyen Âge*, 2010), co-edited volumes on *Cycle et collection* (2008), *Littérature, politique et Histoire au XXe siècle* (2010) and on *Proust dans la recherche comparatiste. Bilan et nouvelles perspectives* (2010). Forthcoming: *Proust. Dialogues critiques* (proceedings of the 2009 conference on Proust in Paris). Currently working on medievalism, for his Habilitation.

DOROTHY FIGUEIRA is Professor in Comparative Literature at the University of Georgia, USA. Trained in both comparative literature and the history of religions, she is interested in the intersection of religion and literature. Her research includes: *Translating the Orient* (1991), *The Exotic; A Decadent Quest* (1994), *Aryans, Jews and Brahmins: Theorizing Authority through Myths of*

Identity (2001) and *Otherwise Occupied: Theories and Pedagogies of Alterity (2008)*. She has recently completed a volume on early European travel narratives to India. She has held positions at Cornell University, SUNY, University of Illinois; has been a visiting professor at Indiana University and the University of Lille. She has been the recipient of several Fulbrights to India. She holds degrees from the Ecole Pratique en Sciences Sociales, Harvard University, the University of Chicago. She has served as president of the ICLA. Professor Figueira has served also as editor of *The Comparatist* and is currently editor of *Recherche litteraire/Literary research,* the review journal of the ICLA. She has edited several books including most recently with Marc Maufort, *Theaters in the Round* (2011).

LADISLAV FRANEK is Professor at the Department of Romance Languages and Literatures, Faculty of Philosophy, Constantine the Philosopher University in Nitra, and a researcher at the Institute of World Literature, Slovak Academy of Sciences in Bratislava, Slovakia. His teaching and research spans several disciplines: literary history and theory, comparative literature, stylistics and literary translation. His main research interest is in the function of the rhythm of languages. Main publications: *The Style of Translation. A Developmental-Theoretical Analysis of Slovak Translations of Paul Claudel* (1997); *The Modernity of Romance Literatures* (2005). He is the author of many theoretical-critical studies on Slovak literary translations from Romance languages. He has translated over 20 works from French, Portuguese, and Spanish (Premium in Literary Fund's Ján Hollý Award for the translations of *M. Yourcenar: Memoirs of Hadrian,* 1990; *P. Claudel: Annunciation.* In: Plays 2007). He works with all literary genres. He is the recipient of the Honorary Plaque for his achievement in the Social Sciences (2008) by the Slovak Academy of Sciences.

KATILIINA GIELEN is assistant lecturer at the Department of English Language and Literature at the University of Tartu where she teaches text analysis, practical translation and translation theory. She is a PhD candidate in literary studies at the same department. Her research interests include reception analysis, literary and gender

studies as combined with translation studies, especially descriptive translation research and translation theory.

IVO HEINLOO has a Master's degree in Literary Studies. He is currently a doctoral student at the Estonian Institute of Humanities, Tallinn University. Fields of research: urban studies, culture theory, Soviet Estonian literature. He also works as a freelance culture journalist. E-mail: ivoheinloo@gmail.com

MIRJAM HINRIKUS is PhD student at Tartu University and works as a researcher at Under-Tuglas Literature Center. She is also an editor of *Ariadne Lõng* (Ariadne's Thread), the only Estonian academic feminist journal. She has studied as an exchange student at the University of Tampere (1996–1997) and at the University of Toronto (2001–2002). Her research interests are related to Estonian literature of the period between 1908 and 1922, in the context of the early modernism.

KERLI ILVES graduated from the Estonian Academy of Arts, Institute of Art History, and enrolled in the Estonian Institute of Humanities, department of Romance Studies from which she graduated in 2008. She has studied also at the University of Lille3, in France, and at the University of Verona, in Italy. The theme of her Master's thesis is symbolist aesthetics and the symbol Androgyne in the work of French painter and aquarellist Gustave Moreau. She has worked as an administrator at KUMU art museum and is actually working as a cultural coordinator at the French Cultural Centre, Cooperation and Cultural Activities Department of the French Embassy. She is in charge of cultural projects that have Estonian operators and French artists but her job consists of cultural mediation between these two countries.

BAIBA KALNA is researcher of theatre and drama working at the Institute of Literature, Folklore and Art of the University of Latvia, the Department of Theatre, Music and Cinema. In 2008 she was awarded the degree of Doctor of Art (Dr. Art.) in theatre and cinema theory and history at the University of Latvia. Her research interests

mainly concern the theatre and drama of the 1930s and 1940s as well as the creative innovations of the contemporary Latvian directors representing the younger and the middle generation. She is the co-author of the books: *20. gadsimta teātra režija pasaulē un Latvijā* (20ᵗʰ Century Theatre Directing in Latvia and in the World, 2002), *Latvijas teātris. 20. gadsimta 90. gadi un gadsimtu mija* (Latvian Theatre in the 1990s and at the Turn of the Century, 2007), *Teātra režija pasaulē. 1. daļa* (Theatre Directing in the World. Part I, 2009), *Latviešu teātris no pirmsākumiem līdz mūsdienām* (Latvian Theatre from its Beginnings to Nowadays, 2010). Her articles on contemporary Latvian theatre are regularly published in the Latvian periodicals.

MARISA KËRBIZI is Professor of Albanian Language History at Aleksander Moisiu State University, Albania. Her main research subject has been Modern Literature in which she has accomplished her MA. She collaborates with a number of literary magazines. She also holds the CEO position at Mankind Tracks "MA3X" CTR. – an organization dedicated to advancing understanding, culture and education directly among people throughout the country and abroad.

ZHANNA KONOVALOVA is Lecturer at Kazan Federal University (Department of World Literature), where her courses include English and American poetry of the 19ᵗʰ and 20th centuries and world literature of the 19ᵗʰ and 20th centuries, philological analysis of the text and new journalism. She received her PhD in journalism; her thesis was dedicated to the American Dream in American literary nonfiction of the second half of 20th century. Her research interests include American literary nonfiction of the 20th century, documentary tradition in American literature, new journalism. She has published articles on her research topics in Russia and abroad.

RAMA KUNDU is a full Professor of English. She has been teaching in the Postgraduate Department of English, Burdwan University, West Bengal, India, since 1976. She is the author of eleven books: (1) *Vision and Design in Hardy's Fiction* (1984); (2) *Wrestling With God: Studies in English Devotional Poetry* (1996);

(3) *Anita Desai's Fire on the Mountain* (2005); (4) *New Perspectives on British Authors: From William Shakespeare to Graham Greene.* (2006); (5) *E. M. Forster's A Passage to India* (2007); (6) *Intertext: A Study of the Dialogue Between Texts* (2008); (7) *Emerging Territories: A Study in New Literatures in English* (2009); (8) *The Unfamiliar Hardy: A New Look* (2010). (9) Translated [Jointly with Mohit K. Ray] Rabindranath Tagore's (*Gora.*) 2008; (10) Translated [Jointly with Mohit K.Ray] translation of Rabindranath Tagore's *Jīvansmṛti*) as *Jīvansmṛti:The Birth of a Poet's Soul*. New Delhi: Atlantic Publishers & Distributors, 2010. (11) *Ānandamath O Sāmpradāiktā* (in Bengali on Bankimchandra Chattopadhyay) (1987). She edits *The Atlantic Literary Review*
Website: <http://www.ramakundu.net>

LEENA KURVET-KÄOSAAR is Assoc. Professor of Comparative Literature at the Estonian Institute of Humanities, Tallinn University, Estonia and Senior Researcher of the Estonian Literary Museum. She has published on women's autobiographical writings, and in particular on women writers' diaries from the first half of the twentieth century and the body, as well as on personal narratives and autobiographical novels by Baltic women concerning World War II and its aftermath in the Baltic States. She is the holder of four-year Estonian Science Foundation research grant "Positioning Life Writing on Estonian Literary Landscapes and the editor of the special issue of Estonian life writing of *Methis. Studia humaniora Estonica* (2010).

SVEND ERIK LARSEN, Professor of Comparative Literature, Aarhus University. He has belonged to the Board of directors of the ICLA, 1991–2004 and has acted as secretary of Comparative History of Literatures in the European Languages from 2007. Member of Academia Europaea since 2004, chair of Section for Literary and Theatrical Studies, 2010–2012. Member of the Danish Research Council for Culture and Communication since 2005–2011, its vice-president from 2009. Co-editor of the journal *Orbis Litterarum* from 2008. He has been author/co-author of 10 books, some translated into English, French and Croatian, of ca. 350 articles and editor of several Danish and international anthologies and special issues.

Visiting lecturer in many countries and organizer of Danish and international conferences. Current research themes: literary history, literature, emotions and forgiveness.

LI XIA (PhD) is the founder of Chinese programs and Convenor of Chinese at the University of Newcastle, Australia where she has been teaching Chinese language, literature and practical translation for eighteen years. She has published extensively on the Chinese poets Gu Cheng and Yang Lian as well as on aspects of comparative Chinese-Western literature. Her articles have appeared in *Modern Chinese Literature*, *Canadian Review of Comparative Literature*, *Interlitteraria*, *Neohelicon*, *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, *Zhongguo Fanyi* – 'Chinese Translators' Journal and so on. She is also a qualified teacher of English (Cambridge RSA) as a second/ foreign language as well as a highly qualified translator/interpreter with five years of practical experience in the corporate sector.

MARIA-KRISTIINA LOTMAN is Senior Lecturer at the University of Tartu. She obtained her MA degree in 1999 and PhD in 2003. Her research interests are ancient verse, its metre, rhythm, versification systems; typological analysis of quantitative verse; Estonian verse from the typological point of view; semantics of verse. She is one of the editors of the on-line journal *Studia Humaniora Tartuensia* and editor of the online versification portal Estonian Verse.

LIVIA MAČAITYTĖ-KASELIENĖ is PhD Candidate and works at the Department of Lithuanian Literature at Vytautas Magnus University in Vilnius. Her research interests include pastoral in contemporary fiction, narrative strategies, rural landscapes and nature writing (eco-criticism), relationship between the fields of culture, history, politics and nature (socio-critical, post-colonial approaches to literature), space, place and identity, regional imagination in Lithuanian literature, globalization and national identity, comparative literature. Actually she is working on her doctoral dissertation *Pastoral Strategies in Lithuanian Literature: 1940–2010 (Theory and Practice)*. Contact information: tel. +370 682 49083, e-mail: lmacaityte@gmail.com

LUIS MARTÍNEZ-FALERO works at the Universidad Complutense de Madrid, were he teaches Literary Theory. He is author of *Gramática, Retórica y Dialéctica en el siglo XVI* (Logroño, IER, 2009). He has published several articles concerning Medieval and Renaissance literary imagery on the theme of death, and concerning literary imagery of the European contemporary poetry. As a poet, his book *Plenitud de la materia* has won the Price Adonáis of Poetry in 1997 (Madrid: Rialp, 1998).

DOROTA MICHUŁKA, PhD, graduated from both the Department of Polish Philology and the Department of History at the University of Wroclaw. She is Assistant Professor at the Department of Polish Philology at the Wroclaw University. Since 1986 she has been working at the Institute of Methodology of Teaching Language and Literature, since 1995 also as a lecturer in the School of the Polish Language and Culture for Foreigners. As a researcher she deals with problems related to the theory of reception of literature, Polish Romantic literature, children's literature and education. She has written around 40 articles, published one monograph – book *Od ojcowizny do ojczyzny. O recepcji romantyzmu w polskich szkolach w Galicji okresu autonomii (1867–1914)(From Homeland to Fatherland. On Reception of Polish Romantic Literature in Education of Autonomos Galicia (1867–1914)* – 2003, edited 4 books – two with Marja Leiononen – *Poland. On Politics, Culture, Literature and Education* (Tampere 2003) and *Borderlands. What does it mean for Poland and Finland?*, Tampere 2004, *Przeboje edukacji polonistycznej (Reading in Polish Education)*, Wroclaw 2001 and one with K. Bakula: *Metodyka a nauka o literaturze i nauka o jezyku (Methodology and Literary Studies and Linguistic Studies*, Wroclaw 2005. During 2000–2005 she was working as lecturer at the Department of Slavonic Philology at University in Tampere (Finland).

ANNELI MIHKELEV took her PhD degree in Semiotics and Cultural Studies at the University of Tartu with the monograph *The Poetics of Allusion* in 2005. She works as a Senior Researcher in

Under and Tuglas Literature Centre of the Estonian Academy of Sciences and as Associate Professor of Comparative Literature in Tallinn University. Her fields of research include Estonian literature, allusions in literature and culture, and comparative literature (mainly Baltic literatures). She has published articles on these themes in several international and Estonian publications.

ANNIKA MIKKEL took her Master's degree in Romance Studies at the University of Tallinn in 2009. Her field of research is prosody and prose rhythm of Italian language. At present she is teaching Italian language in the Language Centre at the University of Tartu. Since 2009 she works also as Assistant in the Department of Romance Languages and Literatures, University of Tartu.

FERNANDO ÁNGEL MORENO is PhD in Literary Theory and Comparative Literature by the Universidad Complutense de Madrid, with an Extraordinary Degree Award and National Award. He is the author of *Teoría de la Literatura de Ciencia Ficción: Poética y Retórica de lo Prospectivo* and co-director of the journal *Hélice. Reflexiones críticas sobre ficción especulativa.* He has also promoted numerous conferences, meetings and literary projects. He has taught at the University of Madrid Alfonso X and made a research visit to the University of Tartu. For years, he taught a workshop on film criticism of the Autonomous Community of Madrid. He is currently Professor of theories and structures of literary language at Madrid Complutense University.

ESZTER MUSKOVITS is a PhD candidate at Eötvös Loránd University (Doctoral Programme in Modern English and American Literature) in Budapest, Hungary. The title of her dissertation is *The Morality-Transgression Axis in the Field of Sexuality in the Dracula Tradition.* She has taught several specialized courses in her research topic (Representations of Love in the Dracula Tradition, The Gothic Tradition). Her main field of interest: the Dracula tradition. Viewpoints of analysis: sex and gender, psychoanalysis, forms of appearance in popular culture (in different mediums), cultural history concerning vampirology. Related areas: Gothic literature, the Victorian age.

AUDINGA PELURITYTĖ-TIKUIŠIENĖ (PhD), Docent at the Department of Lithuanian Literature, Vilnius University. Her scholarly work falls into the following areas: classical and modern poetry (from Maironis, to Martinaitis and Marčėnas), contemporary Lithuanian literature (modern and postmodern prose, poetry, essay), feminist researches in Lithuanian literature, theoretical researches. She has studied Lithuanian and East and Middle Literature of Europe at Vilnius University (BA in 1995, MA in 1996). She wrote her doctoral thesis, entitled 'Lietuvių lyrikos tradicija: struktūrinės dominantės Maironio, Vinco Mykolaičio-Putino, Salomėjos Nėries, Jono Aiščio ir Henriko Radausko kūryboje' [Tradition of Lithuanian Lyrical Poetry of the 20th Century: Structural dominance in the lyric of Maironis, Vincas Mykolaitis-Putinas, Salomėja Nėris, Jonas Aistis and Henrikas Radauskas] at Vilnius University (PhD awarded in 1999). She is currently associate professor at Vilnius University. In 2006 she published a book about modern Lithuanian literature: *Senieji mitai, naujieji pasakojimai: apie naujausią lietuvių literatūrą* [Old Myths, New Tales: About Contemporary Lithuanian Literature]. She has organized two International Contemporary Literature Conferences at Vilnius University, in 2005 and 2008.

MELE PESTI is lecturer of Brazilian literature in Tallinn University. She is currently pursuing doctoral studies in the field of Brazilian modernism, focusing on the cultural metaphor of anthropophagy. Her research interests lie in the lusophone world, translation studies, post-colonial theory, Latin American and Portuguese literature. She has worked as a cultural journalist and has co-translated *Cidade de Deus* by Paulo Lins from Portuguese to Estonian. She has also written a travel book, *Mate ja miljon mahla* (2009).

LAURI PILTER (1971) earned his PhD degree in English language and literature at the University of Tartu with the monograph *The Comic and the Tragicomic in the Works of William Faulkner* in 2009. Since 2007, he has been lecturing about comparative literature at BA and MA levels at Tartu University. A Researcher of Comparative Literature since 2010, his fields of interest include the literatures of European ethnic minorities/minor ethnicities, twentieth

century Western novel, mediaeval and Renaissance verse traditions, and the history and characteristics of the translations of Estonian poetry into English. His translations into Estonian include British, Italian and Provençal poetry, three novels by Cormac McCarthy, two novels by Philip Roth, short fiction by William Faulkner, a novella by Thomas Wolfe and an autobiographical novel by Mark Twain. Author of the novel *Lohejas pilv* (*A Dragon Cloud*, 2004) and the collection of fiction *Retk Rahemäkke* (*A Journey to the Hail Mountain*, 2010), winner of the Fr. Tuglas and B. Alver awards for fiction in 2004.

ÜLAR PLOOM (PhD in comparative literature at the University of Helsinki 2001) is Professor of Romance studies at the Estonian Institute of Humanities, Tallinn University. He is also a docent of the MA programme of Italian studies and didactics at the G. D'Annunzio University of Chieti-Pescara. He has mainly studied the poetry of late medieval and renaissance Italian authors from the Sicilians to Dante and Petrarch, but also 20th century Italian poetry (Campana) and prose (Calvino, Magris, Eco). His recent research deals with poetics of translation. Besides research, he has translated Italian literature into Estonian. He has also published essays and two collections of poetry.

PILVI RAJAMÄE, PhD, is Lecturer at the Department of Germanic and Romance Languages and Literatures at the University of Tartu and the Executive Director of the Estonian Centre for British Studies. Her research interests include Victorian and Edwardian literature and the English country house. She has published articles on Evelyn Waugh. Tom Sharpe and John Buchan, the latter being the subject of her PhD thesis. She is also an assistant editor of *Interlitteraria*.

MOHIT K. RAY A full Professor since 1982, and now retired, D. Litt (*honoris causa*) is one of the seniormost Professors in the country. He has six books and a large number of research papers published in scholarly journals in India and abroad, which reflect his wide range of scholarship including Criticism, Comparative Literature, New Literatures, Canonical Literature, Comparative

Poetics and Translation Studies. He has edited several anthologies of critical studies, and edits *The Atlantic Critical Review*, an international quarterly of global circulation. He is also at present working as the Chief Editor of M/S Atlantic Publishers & Distributors (P) Ltd.

He is associated with many international bodies including *Association Internationale de Littérature Comparée, Paris*, (International Association of Comparative Literature) and *Association Internationale des Critiques Litteraires, Paris,*(International Association of Literary Critics) and SANART Association of Aesthetics and Visual Culture. Website: http://www.mohitkray.com His books include: *T. S. Eliot: Search for a Critical Credo.* Calcutta, 1978; *Bhāṣā Bijnāner Godār Kathā* (in Bengali). Calcutta, 1988 (Fundamentals of Lingusitics); *Studies in Literary Criticism* (Vol. I). New Delhi, 2001. *Joseph Conrad's Heart of Darkness: A Critical Study.* New Delhi, 2005; *A Comparative Study of the Indian Poetics and the Western Poetics*. New Delhi, 2008. *Studies in Literary Criticism* (Vol. II), New Delhi, 2010. He has translated (jointly with Rama Kundu) Rabindranath Tagore's *Gora.* New Delhi, 2008; *Jivansmrti: The Birth of a Poet's Soul* (jointly with Rama Kundu; translation of Rabindranath Tagore's *Jīvansmṛti*). New Delhi, 2010.

VIRVE SARAPIK is Senior Researcher in culture studies at Estonian Literary Museum and Estonian Academy of Arts, Estonia. Her principal research interests include the relations between pictorial and verbal representation, visual culture; the problems of mimesis. Her major publications include *Keel ja kunst* (Language and Art, 1999), "Artist and Myth" (2000), "Landscape: The Problem of Representation" (2002). She is editor-in-chief of the academic journal *Kunstiteaduslikke Uurimusi* (*Studies on Art and Architecture*).

ENRIQUE SERRANO ASENJO is Associate Professor of the University of Zaragoza. His main research area is the 19th- and 20th-century Spanish literature. Among his publications the following stand out: *Ramón y el arte de matar (El crimen en las novelas de Gómez de la Serna)* (1992) y *Vidas oblicuas: Aspectos teóricos de la*

«nueva biografía" en España (1928–1936) (2002); also, he has edited the correspondence of Juan Valera (2002–09) (with L. Romero Tobar, dir., and A. Ezama Gil).

KATRI SIRKEL is a PhD student and an assistant lecturer at the Department of English language and literature at the University of Tartu, where she also obtained her MA degree in 2005. Her research interests lie in nineteenth century English literature, cultural history, and British studies. She is a member of the Estonian Association of Comparative Literature, the Estonian Centre for British Studies and the International Society for Cultural History.

MONICA SPIRIDON. Professor of Comparative Literature, Semiotics and XXth Century European Culture, Faculty of Letters, University of Bucharest. Director of the Center for Communication Studies of the University of Bucharest. Member of the International Comparative Literature Association, elected member of the ICLA Executive Committee since 1997 and member of the ICLA Nominating Committee. Founder and Secretary General of the Romanian Association of Comparative Literature. Acting president of the ICLA Research Committee on Eastern and South-Eastern Europe. Member of the Romanian Writers Union and of the International PEN Club. Author of 10 books, of approximately 100 studies and more than 200 articles published in scholarly periodicals and of several chapters in books published in Germany, Italy, Canada, Greece, The Netherlands, Portugal and the U.S. Member, the editorial board of the *Review of National Literatures and World Report* (Published by the Council on National Literatures, New York, Ed. Anne Paolucci, New Series, 1998 -) and of *Synthesis (*The Publishing House of the Romanian Academy). Liaison officer to *Literary Research/Recherche litteraire,* ICLA and the University of Western Ontario, London, Canada. Since 2010 she serves as one of the ICLA Vice-presidents.

ELLE-MARI TALIVEE has a Master's degree in Literary Studies. She is currently a doctoral student of Cultural Studies at the Estonian Institute of Humanities, Tallinn University. Her main research

interests are the means city is depicted in literature, the literary space, and the language of literary works.

JÜRI TALVET is since 1992 Chair of Comparative Literature at the University of Tartu. He took his PhD on the Spanish picaresque novel at Leningrad University in 1981. He has published in Estonian collections of essays *Hispaania vaim* (The Spanish Spirit, 1995), *Tõrjumatu äär* (The Irrefutable Edge, 2005), cultural-philosophic reflections *Sümbiootiline kultuur* (Symbiotic Culture, 2005), books of (travel) essays *Teekond Hispaaniasse* (1985, Estonia's annual literary prize in essay genre), *Hispaaniast Ameerikasse* (1992), *Ameerika märkmed ehk Kaemusi Eestist* (2000) and eight books of poetry. His books of poetry and essays have been translated into English, Spanish, French and Catalan. In 1997 he was awarded the Juhan Liiv Prize of Poetry and in 2002 the Ivar Ivask Memorial Prize for poetry and essays. He has translated into Estonian both classical and modern works (Quevedo, Gracián, Calderón, Tirso de Molina, Espriu, Aleixandre, García Márquez, etc.). He is the editor and principal author of a manual of world literature for Estonian high schools and universities (*Maailmakirjandus*, I-II, Tallinn 1995–1999). He has chaired the Estonian Association of Comparative Literature (1994–2010) and has also served as member of the ICLA Executive Committee (2000–2007).

JAAK TOMBERG is a literary researcher and critic. He studied Estonian Literature at Tartu University and completed his MA (2004) and PhD (2009) in world literature. His current fields of research are philosophy of literature, theory of criticism, and the contemporary relations between realism and science fiction. Besides various scientific articles, he has written a lot of literary criticism, two plays, and translated fiction and literary theory. Since 2006, he works as a researcher in the Estonian Literary Museum.

MAARJA VAINO, head of the A. H. Tammsaare Museum; doctoral student in Cultural Studies, Tallinn University. Her research and articles are focusing on A. H. Tammsaare and Estonian literature in the beginning of the 20th century. She has published articles in

collections and is a compiler of several books: A. H. Tammsaare *Kirjad tütrele* (2008); A. H. Tammsaare *Õnnelikest ja õnnetuist aegadest. Valitud artiklid* (2010); August Gailit *Saatana karussell. Siuru-aegsed novellid* (2010) etc. Her interests include literary heritage and writer museums.

REIN VEIDEMANN is a graduate of Tartu University in Estonian philology. After working as Academic Secretary at the Estonian Museum of Literature and finishing doctoral studies at the Institute of Language and Literature he took his PhD in 1984 with a thesis on Estonian post-war literary criticism. He has been active as Editor-in-Chief of literary monthlies *Looming* (1983–1986) and *Vikerkaar* (1986–1990), Member of Estonian Parliament (1990–1995) and councillor of the Ministry of Culture. In 1998–2000 he was the Chair-holder of Literary Theory at Tartu University, and at the same time, has worked as the head of, respectively, of the literary supplement and the literary section of two main Estonian daily newspapers, *Eesti Päevaleht* and *Postimees*. From 2000 up to the present he has been working as Professor and Chair of Estonian literature at Tartu University. He has published numerous articles and essays about Estonian literature, a selection of which has appeared in his books *Olla kriitik* (To Be a Critic, 1986), *Mälestus Golfi hoovusest* (Memory of the Gulf Stream, 1993) and *Ajavahe* (Time Break, 1996). His monograph *Kriitika kunst* (Art of Criticism, 2000) was the first theoretical treatment of Estonian literary criticism. His confessional essay book *Elu keskpäev* (The Life Mid-day) appeared in 1986. *Kusagil Euroopas* (Somewere in Europe, 2001) is a subjective and expressive commentary on Estonia's latest history. As a novelist, he made his debut with *Lastekodu* (Orphanage, 2003). His latest books are *Isiku tunnistus* (A Person's Identification, 2006), *Tuikav tekst* (The Pulsing Text, 2006) and *Eksistentsiaalne Eesti* (Existential Estonia, 2010).

PIRET VIIRES is Professor of Estonian Literature at Tallinn University and senior research fellow at Estonian Literary Museum. She received her PhD in Estonian literature in 2006 and her thesis was on the relations of Estonian literary culture and postmodernism.

She has written several articles, taken part in international conferences and in 2008 she published a book *Eesti kirjandus ja postmodernism* (Estonian Literature and Postmodernism). Her current research interests are contemporary Estonian literature, postmodern and post-postmodern cultural situation, relations between literature and technology, digital literature. Contact: viires@eki.ee

interlitteraria

INTERLITTERARIA avaldab algupäraseid kirjandusuurimuslikke artikleid eeskätt võrdleva kirjandusteaduse valdkonnast inglise, prantsuse, saksa ja hispaania keeles. Eelistatud on käsitlused, mis hõlmavad kirjandusnähtuste interkultuuraalseid kontekste. INTERLITTERARIA avaldab tõlkeid ülalmainitud nelja keelde ka artiklitest, mis varem on ilmunud teistes (väiksema levikuga) keeltes. Artikli ülemmaht on 15 lehekülge. Kaastööd palutakse esitada nii trükitult kui ka arvutidisketil.

INTERLITTERARIA publishes original articles in English, French, German and Spanish, above all in the field of comparative literature. Preference is given to researches which focus on intercultural contexts of literary phenomena. INTERLITTERARIA publishes also translations into the above-mentioned four languages of articles which have earlier appeared in other (minor) languages. The maximum size of an article is 15 folios. Articles should be presented both in printed form and on a diskette.

INTERLITTERARIA publie des articles originaux en anglais, en allemand, en français et en espagnol, touchant surtout le domaine de la littérature comparée. On attend de préférence des recherches sur les contextes interculturels des phénomènes littéraires. INTERLITTERARIA publie aussi des traductions des articles en quatre langues mentionnées ci-dessus, parus avant en d'autres langues moins parlées dans le monde. L'extension d'un article ne doit pas excéder 15 pages. Les travaux sont priés de présenter en deux exemplaires, l'un imprimé, l'autre en disquette.

INTERLITTERARIA veröffentlicht literaturwissenschaftliche Artikel im Englischen, Französischen, Deutschen und Spanischen im Original, vornehmlich aus dem Bereich der vergleichenden Literaturwissenschaft. Bevorzugt werden Abhandlungen, die sich auf interkulturelle Kontexte literarischer Erscheinungen beziehen. Außerdem publiziert INTERLITTERARIA in die vier obgenannten Sprachen übersetzte Artikel, die früher in weniger verbreiteten Sprachen erschienen sind. Das Manuskript sollte 15 Seiten nicht überschreiten. Es sollte sowohl in gedruckter Form als auch auf einer Diskette vorgelegt werden.

INTERLITTERARIA publica artículos originales en inglés, francés, alemán y español sobre todo en el campo de la literatura comparada. Se dará preferencia a los estudios enfocados desde contextos interculturales de fenómenos literarios. INTERLITTERARIA publica también traducciones en las cuatro lenguas antes mencionadas de artículos que han aparecido con anterioridad en otros idiomas (de menor divulgación). La extensión máxima de un artículo será de 15 folios. Se ruega presentar los trabajos tanto impresos como en disquete.

interlitteraria

9 771406 070065