

The Niceno-Constantinopolitan Creed in the Works and Life of Arvo Pärt

Tauri Tölpt

Abstract

Arvo Pärt has composed music for a variety of texts belonging to the Christian tradition. Yet there is one text that has received more emphasis in his oeuvre than any other: the Niceno-Constantinopolitan (NC) Creed, which found its way into *Missa syllabica* (1977), *Summa* (1977), *Berliner Messe* (1990/2002) and *Orient & Occident* (1999/2000).

The NC Creed, forged during alternating periods of ecclesiastical unity and conflict, fuses theological influences from both East and West and has remained for over 1600 years one of Christianity's central documents. Even so, it is far from obvious how this text found its way into the life and work of Arvo Pärt, considering the anti-religious context from which he emerged. However, a close examination of the composer's music diaries, as well as interviews conducted with Arvo and Nora Pärt, brings to light not only striking aspects of Pärt's personal relationship with the NC Creed and with creedal statements in general, but also the potential role of this document in Pärt's creative compositional process.

Introduction

Arvo Pärt has composed music for a variety of texts belonging to the Christian tradition. Yet there is one text that has received more emphasis in his oeuvre than any other: the Niceno-Constantinopolitan (NC) Creed, which in its Latin version has found its way into *Summa* (1977) and in Church Slavonic into *Orient & Occident* (1999/2000). As a part of the Latin Mass the Latin NC Creed is also found in *Missa syllabica* (1977) and *Berliner Messe* (1990/2002).

Before its reception by Pärt, this doctrinal declaration of the Christian Trinitarian faith underwent a long journey during which it incorporated theological influences from both East and West, giving witness to both unity and conflict, and over the centuries it has remained one of the most fundamental documents of the Christian world.

Even though our historical sources on this matter are scarce, it is now commonly agreed that the NC Creed was most probably formulated by the fathers of the First Council of Constantinople (381). Its first clear documented appearance on the other hand

takes place only several generations later, at the Fourth Ecumenical Council of Chalcedon (451), where the Council of Constantinople and its Creed were recognized as authoritative at an ecumenical, worldwide level. (Kelly 1972: 296–331; Hanson 2014: 1:632; Jaanson 2014: 30–32, 139) The NC Creed's initial entrance into the Christian Divine Liturgy, either sung or recited, most probably took place during the time of Peter the Fuller at the beginning of the 6th century (Kelly 1972: 348–351). During the same century, the NC Creed set in Latin started to gain dominance also in the baptismal services of Rome and of the whole Western Church, thus becoming truly the sole ecumenical creed of both the East and the West (Kelly 1972: 346–348).

Even in the 6th century, however, some Western local churches began to use in their Eucharist a delicately modified version of the NC Creed (the Latin NC Creed) with the added filioque clause.¹ With problems starting to arise between the Latin- and Greek-speaking churches, this interpolated Creed, which entered the Roman Mass for the first time in

¹ In order to better emphasize against the Arian heresy that the Son and the Holy Spirit are of equal value and honour, some of the Western Churches added the so-called filioque clause ("and from the Son") to the NC Creed, according to which the Holy Spirit proceeds not only from the Father but also from the Son. For the Eastern Christians this addition was seen as a unilateral and illegitimate interpolation of the Creed that undermines the monarchy of the Father and relativizes the reality of personal (hypostatic) existence in the Trinity (Meyendorff 1983: 92).

1014, became one of the major loci of the conflict that resulted in the mutual excommunication of Rome and Constantinople in 1054.² Since the break in communion, Western Christians under Rome, who used the Latin NC Creed,³ have held fast to it with the added filioque clause, while Eastern Christians in communion with Constantinople have held fast to the original NC Creed without the filioque clause.

Upon the reception of the Christian faith from the Byzantines, the latter (i.e. original) version of the NC Creed was also adopted by the Slavic peoples in Church Slavonic, and also by other nations in their respective languages.

The following analysis will discuss how these two versions of the NC Creed, which have historically followed largely separate and often conflictual paths, have found a friendly meeting place in the life and works of Arvo Pärt. In addition, a close examination of the composer's musical diaries, as well as interviews conducted with Arvo and Nora Pärt, will bring to light not only aspects of Pärt's personal relationship with the NC Creed and with creedal statements in general, but also the potential role of this document in Pärt's creative compositional process.

The first creedal statement

Before coming to the NC Creed, it should first of all be mentioned that the very first creedal statement of Arvo Pärt is not the NC Creed itself but his 1968 work *Credo*. The Latin text of this work comprises two short fragments. The first – “Credo in Jesum Christum” – is a profession of faith in the person of Jesus Christ, created by telescoping the opening

sentences of the Creed from the Ordinary of the Mass, whilst the second is taken from the Sermon on the Mount in the New Testament (Matt. 5:38–39).⁴ (Quinn 2000: 16)

It is interesting to note that *Credo*, in addition to being Pärt's first composition based on a religious text, is also a very personal creedal statement addressed to Jesus Christ. Pärt himself comments on it in the following way: “*Credo* was a final goodbye to twelve-tone music. *Credo* was the statement of what I believed – that I believed those words of Christ that He said, that I used in this work.”⁵ Even though Pärt was at that time not actively participating in any Church or religious community, in his heart a deep conversion towards Christ and Christianity had already taken place. This becomes evident not only in the creedal statement of *Credo*, but also in a 1968 interview with Ivalo Randalu in which Pärt confessed that his greatest model outside the music world is Jesus Christ, who “simplified his fraction perfectly and divinely”.⁶ The concept of simplifying a fraction is summarised by Pärt in the following way:

It is almost as though there has been given a number, let's say the number one. It is true that its value is one, but it has been given to people in the form of an extremely complicated multi-digit fraction, the solution to which we ourselves have to reach with our lives, and this is of course an endlessly long journey, and yet wisdom lies entirely in reducing and throwing away everything that is unnecessary.⁷

In a very philosophical way, Christ is here presented as a divine mathematician who simplified his fraction with his own life – an example which

² For the history of the filioque addition see Kelly 1972: 351–367; Meyendorff 1983: 91–94.

³ During the 9.–11. centuries the Apostles' Creed started to slowly replace the Latin NC Creed in the Western Church, especially in catechism and baptism (Jaanson 2014: 140). Nevertheless, the Latin NC Creed still kept a predominant position in the weekly services of the Roman Catholic Church and therefore also in the musical tradition of the Western Christianity (Westra 2002: 5).

⁴ “You have heard that it was said, ‘An eye for an eye and a tooth for a tooth.’ But I say to you, Do not resist the one who is evil.” (For Bible references this article uses the English Standard Version.)

⁵ “*Credo*’ oli lõpparve 12-toonilise muusikaga, ‘Credo’ oli selle väljaütlemine, mida ma uskusin. Et ma uskusin neid Kristuse sõnu, mida ta ütles, mida ma kasutasin selles teoses.” (Mihkelson 2005b, 00:52:50–00:54:41) In this article all translations from Estonian are those of the author unless otherwise indicated.

⁶ Randalu 1968, 00:54:00–00:54:16.

⁷ “See on umbes nii, nagu oleks antud mingi arv, näiteks üks. Tema väärtus on küll üks, aga inimestele on ta kätte antud äärmiselt keerulise paljutehtelise murdarvu kujul, mille õige lahenduse poole tuleb jõuda meil endil oma eluga. Ja see on muidugi lõputult pikk tee, aga ikkagi kogu tarkus seisneb ainult taandamises ja üleliigse äraviskamises.” (Ibid. 00:50:00–00:50:32)

by 1968 Pärt had already understood and sought to follow.

The story behind this spiritual conversion is of course a very personal one and for the most part remains a mystery, probably also for Arvo Pärt himself. But even though from the outside Pärt's *Credo* and his confession of faith in Christ seemed to come out of the blue, there is a prequel or pre-history to it. Even though baptized as a child in the Lutheran Church, Pärt's first profound encounter with Christianity most probably took place in the early 1960s when he and Eri Klas, together with a fellow student they were visiting, went skiing near Pühtitsa monastery while also attending services at the monastery every evening during their 2–3 day stay. According to the conductor Eri Klas, it was probably in the mystical atmosphere of the monastery that a seed of change was planted in the thought of Arvo Pärt.⁸ Also in the sixties, Pärt had visited various churches in Yugoslavia and Poland, and owing to his health problems he very often stayed at a sanatorium in Truskavets, Western Ukraine, where he also had the opportunity frequently to visit one particular Orthodox parish. The other component was that, as Pärt recalls, by the second half of the 1960's he had developed a newly conceived interest in early music.⁹ Most importantly, however, during the same decade Pärt had the possibility to meet and be influenced by certain individuals whom he calls "extraordinary people". Among these, Pärt mentions Maria Yudina, a Russian-Soviet pianist who was persecuted by the Soviet regime due to her Orthodox religious beliefs. Other strong influences were Heimar Ilves¹⁰ and Hugo Lepnurm,¹¹ both Estonian composers and musical lecturers, who were persecuted by the Soviet

regime due to their religiosity and worldviews. Pärt even mentions that it was Hugo Lepnurm who gave him the New Testament in Latin, from which he drew part of the textual basis for *Credo* (1968). According to Pärt, without these artistic circles, where Christianity was one of the main topics, "nothing would have happened".¹²

Another question that arises is whether *Credo* can be considered a sort of Christian creedal protest on the part of the composer against the evil in the world. Commenting on the background to *Credo*, Pärt relates that in his mind the year 1968 was a time of suffering and injustice throughout the whole world, shadowed by the events of the Prague Spring which took place during that same year.¹³ Interestingly, Pärt also comments that at this time the suffering of the world was also witnessed every time he opened and read the Gospel.¹⁴ Toomas Siitan has said that in Soviet Estonia, religion had an important function as a channel of spiritual resistance against the regime of Leonid Brezhnev.¹⁵

On one hand *Credo* may therefore be conceived as a spiritual uprising via music against the suffering and evil of the world. Pärt himself comments that *Credo* contains a sense of revolution, comparing it with the Estonian Singing Revolution, where instead of tanks, songs and music were used.¹⁶ In this way, *Credo* is Pärt's confession of faith, which, via its musical structure, states that even though in the world's catastrophic reality evil constantly rises and gains power, it will still fall and instantly lose power when crushed against the goodness of Christ.¹⁷

On the other hand, even though related to the historical events of the time, Nora Pärt reminds us that this spiritual uprising should still be perceived

⁸ Mihkelson 2005a, 00:24:36–00:27:20.

⁹ Unpublished Kristina Körver and Kai Kutman archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Credo*, 15 June 2021, Arvo Pärt Centre (APC).

¹⁰ Estonian Music Info Centre (EMIC). Art. Heimar Ilves, <https://www.emic.ee/?sisu=heliloojad&mid=58&lang=eng&action=view&method=biograafia&id=21> (15 October 2021); Annus 2015.

¹¹ EMIC. Art. Hugo Lepnurm, <https://www.emic.ee/?sisu=heliloojad&mid=58&lang=eng&action=view&method=biograafia&id=51> (15 October 2021).

¹² Unpublished Kristina Körver and Kai Kutman archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Credo*, 15 June 2021, APC.

¹³ Ibid.; Mihkelson 2005b, 00:51:55–00:52:40.

¹⁴ Unpublished Kristina Körver and Kai Kutman archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Credo*, 15 June 2021, APC.

¹⁵ Mihkelson 2005c, 00:26:20–00:26:62.

¹⁶ Ibid. 01:01:05–01:01:57.

¹⁷ Unpublished Tauri Tõlpt (TT) archive interview with Arvo and Nora Pärt (ANP), 21 August 2020, APC.

mainly on an inner and personal level and not so much at the level of a political statement or a provocation – even though it was interpreted in exactly that way by the Estonian Communist Party Central Committee and also by the West. For Pärt, this godfather of all his credos is therefore above all a personal spiritual uprising prompted by his musical and creative inner crisis.¹⁸ According to Pärt:

It was as though I had bought myself freedom, but at the cost of renouncing everything and being left completely naked. It was a turning point, like turning a new page in my life, or at least in music. It was a decision, a conviction of something very significant.¹⁹

In a way very similar to what happens in Christian baptism, with his *Credo* Pärt declared his old ways of composing music hopelessly dead, with the hope and belief that in time resurrection would occur and a new way of self-expression would come to him. This was no free-floating hope, but a hope based on Jesus Christ, in whose self-reduction lies the simplification of all fractions.

A phase of crisis and Pärt's first encounters with the NC Creed

In his new spiritual quest for self-expression, Pärt turned even more intensively towards early music.²⁰ During this time, Pärt also remembers his first musical encounters with the Latin NC Creed. Pärt himself says that he encountered the NC Creed in Latin while researching early music (Gregorian chant, etc.), but that he cannot recall having worked with that text on a daily basis, or even paying particularly close attention to it.²¹

But another stage that certainly demanded from Pärt more intense personal attention to the NC Creed was when he joined the Orthodox Church in the autumn of 1972. It was during his

chrismation in the Church of St Nicholas in Tallinn – he had already been baptized in the Lutheran Church as a child – that Pärt had to read the Orthodox NC Creed in Church Slavonic, claiming it as his personal confession. Pärt acknowledges that it was after his entry into the Orthodox Church and the beginning of his participation in the Church's liturgical life – where the Creed is read or sung in every Liturgy – that the Orthodox NC Creed started to play an increasingly important role in his mind and heart. As Pärt himself comments: "From then on, it slowly became your child and you remain living with it daily."²²

Through this everyday contact Pärt developed a very special relationship with this Creed, to the extent that at a certain time it even became a sort of prayer of the heart that Pärt recited from memory every day. Arvo and Nora Pärt recall a time at the beginning of the 1970s when they were staying at Arvo's mother's house in the suburbs of Rakvere and Arvo often had to go to pick up milk from a milk post nearby. During his short walk, surrounded by nature, Pärt very often felt an inexplicable need simply to recite the Creed by heart in Church Slavonic. His habit of saying the Creed every day, especially during his walks in nature, began in the 1970's and continues till the present.²³ It began already during his creative dark ages and was present also when *tintinnabuli* was born.

Tintinnabuli and the NC Creed

As is well-known, the end of Pärt's creative dark ages was marked by the discovery of the *tintinnabuli* – the solution to the equation that was hoped for – which finally arrived in 1976 with the piano piece *Für Alina*. That said, one of Pärt's earliest *tintinnabuli* compositions, in which the composer took a text as the starting point for creating his music, is *Missa syllabica* (1977) – a text based on the ordinary sections of the mass,

¹⁸ Unpublished Kristina Körver and Kai Kutman archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Credo*, 15 June 2021, APC.

¹⁹ "See oli enda vabaksostmine, aga selle hinnaga, et ma ütlesin kõigest ära, mis mul oli, ma jäin täiesti paljaks. ... See oli pöördepunkt ja ma nagu pöörasin uue lehekülje oma elus, vähemalt muusikas. See oli otsus või veendumus milleski väga olulises." (Mihkelson 2005b, 00:53:20–00:54:12)

²⁰ APC. Biography; <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/biography/> (15 October 2021).

²¹ Unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21 August 2020, APC.

²² "Sealt saati tasapisi sai sellest sinu laps ja sa jääd sellega igapäevaselt elama." (Ibid.)

²³ Ibid.

including that of the Latin NC Creed.²⁴ At almost the same time, Pärt also composed a *tintinnabuli* work that is based solely on the text of the Latin NC Creed: *Summa* (1977).²⁵ The Latin NC Creed was therefore very strongly present already in Pärt's first attempts to link *tintinnabuli* technique with a text.

As we can see, even though the Orthodox Creed in Church Slavonic came first, the Latin version of the NC Creed followed very soon after. The timeline of Pärt's contact with the two creeds has also been commented on by the composer, who says:

I think it happened practically at the same time in the two languages: Russian (Church Slavonic) and Latin. The Slavonic language was directly related to the Church and to the everyday life; at the time we personally didn't even have the Estonian-language creed ... And at the same time or a bit later the Latin came along, because I had already started to write *Summa* and *Missa syllabica*.²⁶

Elsewhere Pärt mentions that the Latin Creed came together with music, and that it was probably first with *Missa syllabica* that he started concentrating more closely on the Latin Creed.²⁷ We can therefore see that the NC Creed enters in Arvo Pärt's life from two directions: from the everyday life of the Church in Church Slavonic and from the world of music in Latin.

Later, in the year 1990, the Latin NC Creed again reveals itself as a part of *Berliner Messe* – a commissioned work composed for the 90th German Catholic Days in Berlin.²⁸ And finally, in the year 1999 the NC Creed in Church Slavonic also sees daylight in *Orient & Occident*.²⁹

But how did this Creed become Pärt's most frequently used text, and what was his personal relationship with this text? Or in other words, how is this text, or any other, selected by Pärt?

If we leave aside musical compositions where the text was designated by those who commissioned it, then as both Arvo and Nora Pärt have emphasized, the primary aspect that led to one or the other text was its capacity to inspire. The tactic of looking out for texts and activities which could inspire was used during the era of creative crisis, and it continued well after that. The NC Creed, first in Latin and later also in Church Slavonic, was therefore chosen according to the same logic: it inspired Pärt and he trusted the sacred tradition, value and importance that this credal text held.³⁰ This becomes evident also in the early phase of *Orient & Occident*, where in 1996, while working on the NC Creed in Church Slavonic, Pärt wrote in his musical diary that "the thought of the holy word bears/gives music".³¹ According to Pärt it is the sacred value of a holy text and its holy words that has the capacity to give music and also to sustain it.³² Here we see again the importance and value of the text's content, and in this case the holy and "bearing" – i.e. underpinning – value of the NC Creed in the musical creative process. When a text really inspired him, Pärt tried to focus on it as much as possible.³³

The Latin NC Creed as a musical confession of faith

Another very important aspect that gives us a glimpse of the author's personal connection to the NC Creed is the composer's deliberation over

²⁴ APC. Works: *Missa syllabica*; <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/work/569/> (15 October 2021).

²⁵ APC. Works: *Summa*; <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/work/555/> (15 October 2021).

²⁶ "Ma arvan, et praktiliselt läks see kahes keeles korraka – vene keel ja ladina keel. Slaavi keel oli praktiline, see oli seotud kirikuga otseselt, see tähendab igapäevaselt; muide, meil ei olnudki eestikeelset usutunnistust ... Ja siis umbes samal ajal, võibolla natukene hiljem, tuli ladina keel juurde, sest ma hakkasin kirjutama 'Summat' ja 'Missa syllabicat.'" (Unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21 August 2020, APC)

²⁷ Ibid.

²⁸ APC. Works: *Berliner Messe*; <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/work/507/> (15 October 2021).

²⁹ APC. Works: *Orient & Occident*; <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/work/486/> (15 October 2021).

³⁰ Unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 30 January 2020, APC.

³¹ "Püha sõna mõte (k)annab muusikat." (APK 2-1.192, p. 36)

³² Unpublished Ardo Västriku archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Orient & Occident* I, 18 December 2019: 6, APC.

³³ TT interviews with ANP, 30 January 2020 and 21 August 2020.

the potential titles for the compositional works. Pärt has himself commented that none of his compositional titles have been chosen casually and that the titles very often also dictate and inspire his compositional process (Smith 1999: 21).

What might not be very well known is the fact that while working on a piece Pärt often has multiple title versions on the table. For example, as witnessed by Pärt's musical diaries of *Summa*, the first and most preferred title for this Latin NC Creed was "Credo", which in Latin means "I believe".³⁴ According to Pärt, in the beginning the title was therefore "Credo", but the title "Credo" was eventually abandoned, since a work with the same title already existed in his oeuvre – but also in order to conceal its religious content from the anti-religious Soviet regime. Pärt mentions that he wanted to avoid the scandal that had occurred in 1968 with his *Credo* and its religiously confessional title and content.³⁵

Nevertheless, as Pärt himself emphasizes, in his heart he never actually retreated from this title. Interestingly, this aspect is still visible up to the present, as Pärt does not only use the Latin term "credo" to refer to the Latin creedal texts in *Credo* and *Summa*, but also when referring to the NC Creed (in Church Slavonic) in *Orient & Occident* and even to the NC Creed (in Estonian) in his Orthodox Prayer Book.³⁶

What this tells us is that Pärt seems to use the title "Credo" in cases where he wants to emphasize the confessional character of the composition. The fact that it is used in the early phases of *Summa* tells us that at the beginning Pärt wanted to use the Latin NC Creed as his musical confession and statement of faith in a similar way to the *Credo* of 1968.³⁷

In the search for alternative titles, after "Credo" Pärt arrived at another potential title that also existed before *Summa* – "Sümbol".³⁸ Pärt confirms

that "Sümbol" was indeed a possible title for the work, but he does not remember exactly where he had taken it from or why it was finally discarded.³⁹

To many churchgoers and theologians, the NC Creed is better known as the "Symbol of faith". The term "symbol", which in Greek means "putting together" (σύμβολον = σύν + βάλλω), was already from Antiquity used for documents that proved a common agreement on matters between different parties.⁴⁰ The same title was later given by Christians to their baptismal creedal statements that were also understood as unifying contracts between God and humanity (Kelly 1972: 55–58).

It is therefore reasonable to consider the potential title "Sümbol" for the *Summa* also as a reference to the well-known creedal title *Symbol of faith*. As in Estonian the NC Creed (*usutunnistus*) is never referred to with the term "sümbol", this term must come from another language. It does not seem to derive from a Latin background, as in the *Liber usualis* (a book of liturgical Chant of the Roman Catholic Church), from which Pärt most probably drew the text, the creedal part is exclusively referred to as "Credo".⁴¹ This leaves us no other possibility but to conclude that the potential title "Sümbol" for the *Summa* is Pärt's personal derivation from the well-known title *Символ веры* (*Simvol veri*) of the NC Creed set in the Church Slavonic of his ecclesiastical life. The term "sümbol" therefore refers to the NC Creed in Church Slavonic and consequently also to his personal religious experience of confessing a faith. In a remarkable way, even after abandoning the confessional title "Credo", Pärt was still trying to give this musical work a title that would tell the world that this is his personal confession of faith.

What is also interesting is the fact that with the title "Sümbol", Pärt is viewing the Latin NC Creed through the confessional lens of the Creed

³⁴ APK 2-1.18, p. 100, 1976; APK 2-1.19, p. 60–61, 1976.

³⁵ TT interview with ANP, 21 August 2020. For the scandal over *Credo* (1968) with the Soviet regime see: Hillier 1997: 58, 75; Karnes 2020: 74.

³⁶ Unpublished Ardo Västriik archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Orient & Occident* I, 18 December 2019: 5, APC; unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21 August 2020, APC.

³⁷ According to Jaanson, the frequent use of the Latin "Credo" (to refer to the NC Creeds) in Pärt's oeuvre might be perceived as a form of a public confession of faith via music (Jaanson 2014: 183).

³⁸ Musical diary, APK 2-1.19, p. 80, 1976.

³⁹ Unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21 August 2020, APC.

⁴⁰ LSJ The Greek-English Lexicon, <http://stephanus.tlg.uci.edu/ljsj/#context=lsj&eid=101177> (1 October 2021).

⁴¹ For Pärt's use of the *Liber usualis* see Hillier 1997: 81; Restagno 2012: 7; Vuorinen 2014: 60.

of his Orthodox religious life. This essentially means that Pärt is declaring the Latin NC Creed, which comes from the world of his music (and inevitably also from the Catholic Church), to be an inseparable part of his personal religious confession in the same manner as the NC Creed in Church Slavonic. As Pärt himself states, there is no border to separate the life of his music and faith (Lubow 2010). And as there is no border, music also naturally becomes a language that can express his personal faith. As is well emphasized by Pärt: “My music can be my inner secret, even my confession.” (Elste 1988: 338)

In this way, as is seen via the early potential titles, *Summa*, together with its Latin NC Creed, was meant to be Pärt’s confession of faith in the language of music. The fact that Pärt finally abandoned these titles does not mean that he would also have abandoned the work’s confessional character. It simply shows that its confessional character took a more subtle and non-public form. As Toomas Siitan rightly points out, with *Summa* Pärt did not want to play up his religiosity, but even so, he remained honest in his compositional work by expressing what he experienced in his life and in his soul.⁴²

The Latin NC Creed and the process of self-distancing

From the confessional titles Pärt nevertheless arrived at a much more enigmatic title – *Summa*. According to Pärt, the Latin NC Creed was finally named *Summa* because for him the NC Creed

has always been a “summa summarum” (Latin, “sum of sums”) and “the sum of all wisdom and truth”.⁴³ Pärt has retrospectively mentioned that the primary inspiration for such an understanding came from Psalm 119, which glorifies the word of God and states: “The sum of your word is truth, and every one of your righteous rules endures forever.” (Ps 119: 160)⁴⁴ According to Pärt, this Psalm inspired him to understand that the words of the NC Creed contain a divine and other-worldly truth that endures forever, which is why it is a sum of all truth.⁴⁵

In this concept there seems to lie a valuable function of the NC Creed that Nora Pärt has described in the following way:

There is a necessity to distance oneself from the ego and to stand on something that I know is impossible to understand – that this is an impossible formulation, that it is impossible to even get close to it. He puts himself not second in line, but third in line after the text. This means self-renunciation at a very deep level. This makes itself felt in everything he has written, but especially with *Credo* (NC Creed) he steps even further away.⁴⁶

Faced with a mysterious and unearthly creedal text that is “the sum of divine truth”, the composer naturally feels insignificant, which inclines him towards self-reduction and the renunciation of his ego. It is probably the same insignificance that makes Pärt claim that he has difficulties accessing the Creed when his soul is tangled up in itself;⁴⁷ that the Creed reveals to him his sinfulness;⁴⁸ and

⁴² Mihkelson 2005c, 00:26:00–00:26:13.

⁴³ Unpublished Immo Mihkelson archive interview with Arvo Pärt, 10 May 2016: 7, APC; unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21 August 2020, APC.

⁴⁴ This inspiration seems to be directly linked to Pärt’s 1976 exercise in monophony, where the composer wrote monodic melodies corresponding to all of the 150 Psalms (Lingas 2020: 223–224).

⁴⁵ During a phone call by the author with Arvo Pärt on 14 October 2021 the composer stated: “*Summa* tähendab, et see on tõe summa, nii nagu Jehoova tõe kestab igavesti psalmis 119 ja need Jehoova tões on usutunnistuse sees. Aga psalm 119 on nagu Jumala tõe ja taevalik tõe ja seda ma tahtsin niimoodi välja tuua. See on minu tunnetus ja vaatevinkel. Aga selle psalmi formuleering on ilus ja vägev ja puhas ja selge.” (“*Summa* means that it is the sum of truth, just as Jehovah’s truth endures forever in Psalm 119, and these Jehovah’s truths are within the Creed. But Psalm 119 is like God’s truth and heavenly truth, and that’s how I wanted to point it out. It’s my feeling and point of view. But this formulation of the Psalm is beautiful and powerful and pure and clear.”)

⁴⁶ “Vajadus oma minast distantseeruda ja toetuda millegi peale, mille kohta ma tean, et sellest on võimatu aru saada – et see on võimatu formuleering ja et sellele on võimatu ligi pääseda. Ta asetab ennast mitte isegi teise, vaid lausa kolmandasse ritta suhtes tekstiga. See on oma minast äraütlemine väga sügaval tasandil. Kogu loomingus annab see tunda, aga eriti *Credo*’ga astub ta veel kaugemale.” (Unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21 August 2020, APC)

⁴⁷ Unpublished Ardo Västriku archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Orient & Occident* I, 18 December 2019: 5, APC.

⁴⁸ Unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21 August 2020, APC.

that composing music on the sacred text of the Creed can in some cases even make him feel as if he is committing sacrilege (*святотатство*).⁴⁹

In this way the NC Creed contains a principle for which Pärt was already seeking in his 1968 interview with Randalu – an ascetic value that via self-reduction and self-distancing would help him simplify his personal fraction.

This is something that of course lies behind the creative and compositional process of tintinnabulation, where the composer must distance himself from his ego, interpretations and passions, so that the words and their structure in the text could themselves have the possibility to emanate objective information (Siitan 2014: 12). Without doubt, the divinely mystical content of the creedal text has helped and inspired Pärt to ascetically humble and distance himself so that the words of the NC Creed, or any other text, could themselves be turned into objective musical information.

The NC Creed in Church Slavonic as a musical confession of faith

More than 20 years later, similar patterns emerge also in *Orient & Occident*, a work based on the NC Creed set in Church Slavonic.

Initially, in 1996, when Pärt started composing *Orient & Occident*, it was simply titled “Берюю ...”, which is the first word of the Creed in Church Slavonic, meaning “I believe”.⁵⁰ It is hard to ignore the fact that in the first phase of composition both *Summa* and *Orient & Occident* were titled “I believe” (“Credo” – “Берюю”). What is even more striking is the fact that in the second phase of the composition process, both of these works again bear the same title – “Sümbol”. According to the musical diaries of *Orient & Occident*, in August/September 1999, while staying on Patmos, Pärt decided to give this musical composition the title

“Sümbol” – just as he did with the *Summa*.⁵¹ At the beginning of the year 2000, probably inspired by his stay in Greece, Pärt decided to give the title “Sümbol” a more archaic form by replacing it with the Ancient Greek “Symbolon”.⁵² Without doubt, the potential titles “Sümbol” and later “Symbolon” in *Orient & Occident* were also inspired by the Church Slavonic title of the Creed *Символ веры*, on which this work is based.⁵³

As with the composition of *Summa*, the early phases of the evolution of *Orient & Occident* show us that this work was also meant to be Pärt’s musical expression of faith, this time through the Creed of his ecclesiastical life. In addition to the confessional titles, other aspects also direct us towards the same understanding. First of all, the idea and initiative of composing music based on the NC Creed in Church Slavonic, which is to say based on the experience of his ecclesiastical life, came directly from Pärt and not from the organizers of the Berliner Festspiele.⁵⁴

But as the titles “Берюю”, “Sümbol” and “Symbolon” were finally discarded, here also, as in the case of *Summa*, in the end Pärt decided to present this musical confession of faith in a hidden, inner, silent form.⁵⁵ This is also supported by the observations of Toomas Siitan, according to whom silent texts in Pärt’s oeuvre (as is the case with *Orient & Occident*) refer to inner transformation and prayer, whereas musical compositions that are written in the language of his religious practice (Church Slavonic, Russian) are expressions of his personal faith (Siitan 2020: 31–32).

The NC Creed in Orient & Occident and the unity of the opposites

Despite his initial intention to entitle this inner musical confession of faith with a creedal title, Pärt nevertheless finally arrived at *Orient & Occident*. As

⁴⁹ Unpublished Immo Mikhelson archive interview with Arvo Pärt, 10 May 2016: 8, APC.

⁵⁰ Musical diary, APK 2-1.192, p. 9, 1996.

⁵¹ APK 2-1.224, p. 16.

⁵² Musical diary, APK 2-1.225, p. 1, 18, 31.

⁵³ Furthermore, in a 2016 interview with Immo Mikhelson, Pärt acknowledges that the title “Sümbol” in the *Orient & Occident* is a reference to the Creed. (Unpublished Immo Mikhelson archive interview with Arvo Pärt, 10 May 2016: 9, APC)

⁵⁴ Unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21 August 2020, APC.

⁵⁵ According to John Forrester, the NC Creed in *Orient & Occident* can be considered Pärt’s inner and silent confession of faith (Forrester 2014: 72).

is clearly indicated by the title (“East and West”), Pärt presents us with a musical composition where the melodic line sounds Eastern in style, although written in the harmonic minor, which belongs to Western musical tradition. The two musical worlds – Eastern monophony and Western polyphony – intertwine in the composition.⁵⁶ With this final title, the creedal text (which is anyhow silent) and its confessional aspect become even more hidden. One could therefore listen to its combined harmonic and monophonic peculiarity and even read the title without ever knowing that this work may be somehow linked to the NC Creed of Pärt’s religious life.

But when we dig deeper, then we see that the NC Creed in Church Slavonic plays a bigger role in this composition than might at first appear. In order to understand this, we must first of all try to understand whether behind the East and West there is something more than just two contrasting musical worlds of monophony and polyphony.

As regards the Western polyphonic and harmonic part, Pärt is quite clear: through this he wanted to represent a later musical tradition that became predominant in the Western Church (Catholic and Protestant Churches) and in Western Europe in general.⁵⁷

As far as the Eastern part is concerned, Pärt makes it clear that he wanted to emphasize the Eastern religious monophonic musical tradition which, as it existed before the polyphonic tradition, is the earlier of the two.⁵⁸ What exactly is meant by this remains at first unclear. Some authors have tried to find here links and similarities with the Arabic and Islamic Middle Eastern monodic musical tradition (Forrestal 2014: 75–84)

– an aspect that Pärt has himself never mentioned nor confirmed. Even though the composer seems to accept a wider interpretation behind it by even referring to the shamanic musical tradition, he still primarily links the monophonic tradition with Eastern Christianity and with the Orthodox Church.⁵⁹ Of course, Pärt does not associate the monophonic musical tradition specifically with the Russian Orthodox Church, in which, he explains, Western polyphony has been extensively grafted onto the earlier monodic musical tradition of the Eastern Church.⁶⁰ By making such a distinction the composer’s thoughts seem to guide us towards the Eastern Mediterranean and to the early Christian and Byzantine Orthodox monophonic musical tradition, which largely seems to be behind the oriental religious music that Pärt has been mentioning.⁶¹

We may therefore conclude that for Pärt *Orient & Occident* as a whole contains a contrasting coexistence of the musical traditions that are more or less linked to the Western and Eastern Churches, which, as the composer is well aware, have been in conflict for centuries.

For this reason, with *Orient & Occident* Pärt wanted to bring together not only the two different musical traditions but also the two conflictual Churches, which according to Pärt should in reality be one.⁶² This is why, when talking about the division between the Orthodox and Catholic Churches, Pärt, using musical language, emphasizes that ideally the two should “sound together”, without the one excluding the other.⁶³

In such a context, Forrestal’s hypothesis that with the NC Creed in *Orient & Occident* Pärt is tackling the Eastern-Western Christian dispute

⁵⁶ APC. Works: *Orient & Occident*; <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/work/486/> (15 October 2021).

⁵⁷ Unpublished Ardo Västriik archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Orient & Occident* I, 18 December 2019: 3, APC; unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21 August 2020, APC.

⁵⁸ Unpublished Immo Mihkelson archive interview with Arvo Pärt, 10 May 2016: 8, APC.

⁵⁹ Ibid.; unpublished Ardo Västriik archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Orient & Occident* I, 18 December 2019: 3, APC; unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21 August 2020, APC.

⁶⁰ Unpublished Ardo Västriik archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Orient & Occident* I, 18 December 2019: 3, APC.

⁶¹ Many important oriental musical elements of the *Orient & Occident* emerged only during or after Pärt’s two week stay (August–September 1999) at the Eastern Mediterranean Island of Patmos. During his stay on the Greek Island, we can see the emergence of sharps and flats that create a third minor which makes the musical tension between the East and the West even more felt in this composition. The title *Orient & Occident* on the other hand is inserted in the early 2000 and the glissandi only in September 2000. (Unpublished Ardo Västriik archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Orient & Occident* II, 18 December 2019: 7–8, APC)

⁶² Unpublished Immo Mihkelson archive interview with Arvo Pärt, 10 May 2016: 8–9, APC.

⁶³ Musical diary, APK 2-1.249, p. 65, 2013.

over the filioque clause (Forrestal 2014: 93) does not seem to be very probable. In general, Pärt does not seem to pay any attention to the historical Orthodox position, which rejects the Latin NC Creed with its filioque clause.⁶⁴ On the contrary, as we have previously seen, the Latin and Orthodox versions of the NC Creed are considered by the composer to have an equal and even indistinguishable confessional value.

Nevertheless, the task of unifying these two ecclesiastical and musical worlds in *Orient & Occident* was assigned by Pärt to the NC Creed of his ecclesiastical life, where each alternate Church Slavonic word gives voice to either Western polyphony or Eastern monophony.⁶⁵ This task was not assigned by chance, since for Pärt, in the spirit of the ancient Christian creedal title "Symbol", the NC Creed is also seen as a unifier of opposites.

This becomes evident first of all in Pärt's personal religious life, as in his Orthodox Prayer Book⁶⁶ the composer has entitled the NC Creed as "the best formulation of an impossible formulation".⁶⁷ What Pärt tries to say with this title is that the Creed holds an incomprehensible, divine and hidden meaning that somehow has become earthly and revealed in comprehensible words – a meeting point between the opposites of the possible and the impossible. While commenting on the NC Creed in *Orient & Occident*, Pärt also expresses his conviction that it is the sacred text itself that confesses the co-existence of opposites: with the NC Creed one confesses that God the Father has created the opposites of heaven and earth, and all things visible and invisible.⁶⁸

This unifying duality becomes evident also in another personal spiritual practice of the composer in which the NC Creed is paired with the Jesus Prayer.⁶⁹ According to Pärt, during the

composition of *Summa* he had already developed a rather particular way of reading the NC Creed, where after each verse of the Creed one Jesus Prayer was also added.⁷⁰

During our interviews, Pärt gave an example of how this works by reading one part from the NC Creed: "He was crucified for us under Pontius Pilate, and suffered, and was buried, and the third day he rose again, according to the Scriptures." After that Pärt read the Jesus Prayer, which guided him to the following conclusion:

We are accomplices – aren't we? – in this crucifixion, sinners all alike. Broadly speaking, we are the same kind of mob as those who called for crucifixion. So, when you say the Jesus Prayer, this understanding and this perception moves into your blood. And with the Jesus Prayer, you also get rid of this thought.⁷¹

With the help of the Jesus Prayer the NC Creed therefore allows the composer to experience the paradoxical co-existence of the two opposites – his sin, and divine redemption.

As Pärt himself states, all of this search for the unified duality will finally guide us towards the *tintinnabuli* technique, where between the opposites of the melody (M) voice and the *tintinnabuli* (T) triad there is also a continuous tension. In analogy to the previous examples, Pärt symbolically characterizes the M-voice as earthly, which is also related to his sin and ego, and the T-voice as heavenly, which is related to redemption. This binary opposition and tension in the *tintinnabuli*, however, does not lead to division, but instead, in a similar way to the NC Creed, arrives at unity, which is expressed by the mathematical equation $1+1=1$. As Pärt himself has put it: "One and one, it is one – it is not two.

⁶⁴ Unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21 August 2020, APC.

⁶⁵ Unpublished Ardo Västriik archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Orient & Occident* I, 18 December 2019: 3–4, APC.

⁶⁶ For the Prayer Book that Arvo Pärt here uses, see Palli et al. 2007.

⁶⁷ Unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21.08.2020, APC; unpublished Ardo Västriik archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Orient & Occident* I, 18 December 2019: 5.

⁶⁸ Unpublished Ardo Västriik archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Orient & Occident* I, 18 December 2019: 5, APC.

⁶⁹ "Lord Jesus Christ, Son of God, have mercy on me, a sinner."

⁷⁰ Unpublished TT archive interview with ANP, 21 August 2020, APC.

⁷¹ "Meie oleme ju kaassüüdlased sellele ristilöömisele, samasugused patused. Laias laastus oleme meie samasugune põobel nagu ristilööjad. Aga siis, kui loed Jeesuspalvet, läheb see arusaamine ja tunnetus sulle verre. Ja Jeesuspalvega saad sellest mõttest ka lahti." (Ibid.)

This is the secret of this technique.” (Yaraman 2020: 233; Hillier 1997: 96)⁷² Without doubt, for Pärt, this secret of the *tintinnabuli* technique is simultaneously the secret of the NC Creed and vice versa.

Conclusion

We may therefore conclude that not only are the creedal statements in Pärt’s musical compositions directly linked to the experiences and expressions of his personal religious life, but they are also linked to his compositional creative process.

In the case of the works discussed here, it is the sacred tradition, the meaning and depth of the NC Creed, that Pärt needed in order for the music to be sustainable. We have also seen not

only how the composer’s personal relation to the creedal content led him to elaborate on the title or potential titles of the musical compositions, but also how in turn the same titles reveal to us the true religious value that the NC Creed has for the composer and how it is indivisibly linked to the world of his music.

It can be therefore said that the NC Creed is for Pärt not just a confessional text of his religious life that has somehow also found a way into some of his musical compositions, but it is a musical confession of faith, which at the same time represents the whole compositional logic of the *tintinnabuli* technique by aiding his ascetic self-reduction and by unifying the binary forces of opposites.

⁷² This tension between the opposites has been thematized by Arvo Pärt in: Musical diaries, APK 2-1.192, p. 38, 1996, and APK 2-1.225, p. 67, 2000; unpublished Ardo Västrik archive interview with Arvo Pärt on *Orient & Occident* I, 18 December 2019: 5, APC. For the same topic see also: Lingas 2020: 225; Siitan 2020: 30.

Archive sources

Arvo Pärt Centre / Arvo Pärdi Keskus (APK)

APK 2-1.18: Musical diary. 16 (03.09.1976/27.11.1976).

APK 2-1.19: Musical diary. 17 (28.11.1976/10.02.1977).

APK 2-1.192: Musical diary. 1996, 4 (30.05.1996/02.08.1996).

APK 2-1.224: Musical diary. 1999, 3 (08.07.1999/06.02.2000).

APK 2-1.225: Musical diary. 2000, 1 (08.01.2000/26.05.2000).

APK 2-1.249: Musical diary. 07.2012-2013

(28.07.2012/06.2013).

Interviews

Unpublished Tauri Tõlpt archive interview with Arvo and Nora Pärt, 30 January 2020. Arvo Pärt Centre.

Unpublished Tauri Tõlpt archive interview with Arvo and Nora Pärt, 21 August 2020. Arvo Pärt Centre.

Unpublished Immo Mikhelson archive interview with Arvo Pärt: Commentaries on musical diaries (transcription), 10 May 2016. Arvo Pärt Centre.

Unpublished Ardo Västriik archive interview with Arvo Pärt on the context of *Orient & Occident* I-II (transcription), 18 December 2019. Arvo Pärt Centre.

Unpublished Kristina Körver and Kai Kutman archive interview with Arvo Pärt on the context of *Credo*, 15 June 2021. Arvo Pärt Centre.

References

- Annus**, Amar 2015. Religioon ja savantism – mida uskus Heimar Ilves? – *Kirik & Teoloogia*, 12 June 2015, <https://kjt.ee/2015/06/religioon-ja-savantism-mida-uskus-heimar-ilves/> (15 October 2021).
- APC** (Arvo Pärt Centre). Biography; <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/biography/> (15 October 2021).
- APC**. Works: *Berliner Messe*; <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/work/507/> (15 October 2021).
- APC**. Works: *Missa syllabica*; <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/work/569/> (15 October 2021).
- APC**. Works: *Orient & Occident*; <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/work/486/> (15 October 2021).
- APC**. Works: *Summa*; <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/work/555/> (15 October 2021).
- Elste**, Martin 1988. An Interview with Arvo Pärt. – *Fanfare* 11/4, March/April, pp. 337–341.
- EMIC** (Estonian Music Information Centre). Art. Heimar Ilves; <https://www.emic.ee/?sisu=heliloojad&mid=58&lang=eng&action=view&method=biograafia&id=21> (15 October 2021).
- EMIC**. Art. Hugo Lepnurm; <https://www.emic.ee/?sisu=heliloojad&mid=58&lang=eng&action=view&method=biograafia&id=51> (15 October 2021).
- Forrestal**, John 2014. “A Poet From the North”: Arvo Pärt, *Orient and Occident*, and the Aural Architecture of his Orthodox Faith. Master’s Thesis, Boston University.
- Hanson**, Richard P.C. 2014. Creeds and Confessions of Faith. – *Encyclopedia of Ancient Christianity*. Angelo Di Berardino (ed.), Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, pp. 1:630–633.
- Hillier**, Paul 1997. *Arvo Pärt*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Jaanson**, Mart 2014. *Nikaia-Konstantinoopoli usutunnistuse ladinakeelse normteksti grammatiline, teoloogiline ja muusikaline liigendamine*. Dissertationes theologiae Universitatis Tartuensis 30, [Tartu]: Tartu Ülikooli Kirjastus.
- Karnes**, Kevin C. 2020. Arvo Pärt’s Tintinnabuli and the 1970s Soviet Underground. – *Arvo Pärt: Sounding the Sacred*. Eds. Peter C. Bouteneff, Jeffers Engelhardt, Robert Saler, New York: Fordham University Press, pp. 68–85, <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv1199106.7>.
- Kelly**, John N.D. 1972. *Early Christian Creeds*. London: Longman.
- Lingas**, Alexander 2020. Christian Liturgical Chant and the Musical Reorientation of Arvo Pärt. – *Arvo Pärt: Sounding the Sacred*. Eds. Peter C. Bouteneff, Jeffers Engelhardt, Robert Saler, New York: Fordham University Press, pp. 220–231.
- LSJ**. The Online Liddell-Scott-Jones Greek-English Lexicon, <http://stephanus.tlg.uci.edu/ljsj/#context=lsj&eid=101177> (1 October 2021).
- Lubow**, Arthur 2010. Arvo Pärt: The Sound of Spirit. – *The New York Times Magazine*, 15 October, <https://archive.nytimes.com/www.nytimes.com/2010/10/17/magazine/17part-t.html> (2 March 2022).
- Meyendorff**, John 1983. *Byzantine Theology: Historical Trends and Doctrinal Themes*. sNew York: Fordham University Press.
- Mikhelson**, Immo 2005a. *Arvo Pärt. Heli ja vaikus 4*. [Radio broadcast series, rebroadcast 2020], <https://klassikaraadio.err.ee/1128433/arvo-part-heli-ja-vaikus-4> (1 October 2021).
- Mikhelson**, Immo 2005b. *Arvo Pärt. Heli ja vaikus 5*. [Radio broadcast series, rebroadcast 2020], <https://klassikaraadio.err.ee/1128922/arvo-part-heli-ja-vaikus-5> (1 October 2021).
- Mikhelson**, Immo 2005c. *Arvo Pärt. Heli ja vaikus 7*. [Radio broadcast series, rebroadcast 2020], <https://klassikaraadio.err.ee/1130017/arvo-part-heli-ja-vaikus-7> (1 October 2021).
- Palli**, Mattias, Kristi Sarapuu, Taimi Kopli (toim.) 2007. *Õigeusu palveraamat*. Tallinn: Eesti Apostliku Õigeusu Kiriku kirjastus.
- Quinn**, Peter 2000. Out with the Old and in with the New: Arvo Pärt’s ‘Credo’. – *Tempo, New Series* 211, pp. 16–20.
- Randalu**, Ivalo 1968. *Looming ja Aeg: 6 Arvo Pärt*. 10 September, <https://arhiiv.err.ee/vaata/looming-ja-aeg-looming-ja-aeg-06-arvo-part> (1 October 2021).
- Restagno**, Enzo 2012. Interview with Nora and Arvo Pärt: “I seek a common denominator”. – *UE Musikblätter* 2, pp. 5–9.
- Siitan**, Toomas 2014. Introduction. – *In principio: The Word in Arvo Pärt’s Music*. Ed. by Hedi Rosma, Kristina Körver, Kai Kutman, Laulasmaa: Arvo Pärt Centre, pp. 9–15.
- Siitan**, Toomas 2020. Sounding Structure, Structured Sound. – *Arvo Pärt: Sounding the Sacred*. Eds. Peter C. Bouteneff, Jeffers Engelhardt, Robert Saler, New York: Fordham University Press, pp. 25–35, <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv1199106.5>.
- Smith**, Geoff 1999. Sources of Invention: An interview with Arvo Pärt. – *The Musical Times* 140/1868, pp. 19–25, <https://doi.org/10.2307/1004490>.

Vuorinen, Mark Eric John 2014. *Arvo Pärt's Serial and Tintinnabuli Works: A Continuum of Process*. Doctoral thesis, University of Toronto.

Westra, Liuwe H. 2002. *The Apostle's Creed: Origin, History and Some Early Commentaries*. *Instrumenta patristica et mediaevalia* 43, Turnhout: Brepols.

Yaraman, Huriye Sevin 2020. In the Beginning There Was Sound: Hearing, Tintinnabuli, and Musical Meaning in Sufism. – *Sounding the Sacred*. Peter Bouteneff, Jeffers Engelhardt and Robert Saler (eds.), New York, USA: Fordham University Press, pp. 232–241, <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv1199106.16>.

Nikaia-Konstantinoopoli usutunnistus Arvo Pärdi elus ja teostes

Tauri Tölpt

Arvo Pärt on komponeerinud muusikat erinevatele kristlikku traditsiooni kuuluvatele tekstidele. Kõige rohkem on Pärt kasutanud Nikaia-Konstantinoopoli (NK) usutunnistust, mis on ladina versioonis leidnud tee teosesse „Summa” (1977) ning kirikuslaavi keeles „Orient & Occident’i” (1999/2000). Osana ladina muusikalisest missast on NK usutunnistuse ladina versioon leitav ka „Missa syllabica’s” (1977) ning „Berliner Messe’s” (1990/2002).

Enne kui kõnealune usutunnistus jõudis Arvo Pärdi ellu ja teostesse, läbis ta pika ja keerulise ajaloolise teekonna, mille käigus sai ta mõjutusi nii idast kui läänest, olles tunnistajaks nii ühtsusele kui ka konfliktidele.

Kuigi ajaloolised andmed selle kristliku maailma ühe olulisema usutunnistuse kohta ei ole lõpuni selged, ollakse tänapäeval ühel meelel, et NK usutunnistuse löid I Konstantinoopoli kirikukogu isad 381. aastal ning selle kinnitas üleilmseks usutunnistuseks IV oikumeeniline kirikukogu 451. aastal. Alates 6. sajandist saavutas NK ladinakeelne versioon olulise koha ka Lääne kiriku kateheesis ja ristimisteenistustel. Kuid samal sajandil hakkasid Läänes teatud kohalikud kirikud kasutama NK usutunnistuse muudetud versiooni lisandusega *filioque* (nn. Ladina NK usutunnistust). See muudatus, mille võttis 1014. aastal vastu ka Rooma kirik, panustas ühena paljudest osaduse katkemisse Rooma ja Konstantinoopoli vahel 1054. aastal. (Kelly 1972) Alates osaduse katkemisest on lääne kristlased eesotsas Roomaga jäänud truuks Ladina NK usutunnistusele koos *filioque*-lisandiga, samas kui ida kristlased eesotsas Konstantinoopoliga on jäänud algse versiooni juurde. Kuigi ajalooliselt on need kaks usutunnistuse versiooni liikunud eraldi ja kohati isegi konfliktsetel radadel, on nad leidnud sõbraliku kooseksistentsi Arvo Pärdi elus ja loomingus.

Arvo Pärdi esimeseks usutunnistuslikuks deklaratsiooniks pole aga siiski veel terviklik NK usutunnistus, vaid hoopis tema ladinakeelne „Credo” (1968), milles ta toob kokku kaks sakraaltekstilist fragmenti: katoliku missal kasutatava usutunnistuse avalause („Credo in Jesum Christum” – „Usun Jeesusesse Kristusesse”) ning perikoobi Uue Testamendi mäejutlusest (Mt 5:38–39). Kuigi „Credo” loomise ajal ei tegutsenud Pärt veel aktiivselt üheski kirikus ega usulises organisatsioonis, on „Credo” näol selgelt tegemist helilooja isikliku usu tunnistamisega Jeesusesse Kristusesse, kes, nagu toob Pärt välja 1968. aasta intervjuus Ivalo Randalule, suutis jumalikult „taandada oma murre” ehk lihtsustamise teel loobuda kõigest mittevajalikust (Randalu 1968). Toetudes Kristuse enese eeskujule, saab „Credost” Pärdi loomingus ühelt poolt vaimne protest maailma kurjuse vastu, kuid teisalt ka oma vanale loomingulisele reaalsusele surma kuulutamine, mis jääb Kristusese ootama oma uut ülestõusmist.¹

Järgnenud aastatepikkuse loomingulise kriisi ajal süüvis Pärt aina rohkem vanamuusikasse ning erinevatesse tegevustesse ja pühadesse tekstidesse, mis inspireeriksid. Selle käigus jõudis helilooja ellu esmakordselt ka NK usutunnistus, kuid huvitaval kombel üldse mitte muusika, vaid hoopis õigeusu kiriku kaudu, mille liikmeks Pärt 1972. aastal sai. Sellest ajast alates mängis kirikuslaavikeelne NK usutunnistus Arvo Pärdi isiklikus usulises elus aina olulisemat rolli, saades ajapikku lausa igapäevaselt loetavaks südamepalveks.²

Ladina NK usutunnistus jõudis aga aastaid hiljem Arvo Pärdi ellu just muusika kaudu. Ta oli olulisel ja auväärsel kohal helilooja loomingulisest kriisist väljumisel ning esimestes katsetes siduda *tintinnabuli* stiili tekstiga. Selle versiooni usutunnistusest võib puhtal kujul leida „Summas” (1977) ning osana ladina muusikalisest missast ka „Missa syllabicas” (1977) ning „Berliner Messes” (1990/2002). Huvitaval kombel jõudis Pärdi usulisse ellu kuuluv kirikuslaavikeelne NK usutunnistus tema muusikalisel loomingus aga kõige viimasena, nähes 1999. aastal päevavalgust teoses „Orient & Occident”.

Et mõista veelgi paremini NK usutunnistuse olulisust Arvo Pärdi elus ja loomingus, tuleb põhjalikumalt analüüsida helilooja katseid leida pealkirjad teostele, kus seda usutunnistust on puhtakujuliselt kasutatud.

¹ Mikhelson 2005b, 00:53:20–00:54:12; Tauri Tölpti avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo ja Nora Pärdiva, 21.08.2020, APK.

² Tauri Tölpti avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo ja Nora Pärdiva, 21.08.2020, APK.

Pole kuigi laialt teada fakt, et enne kui ladina NK usutunnistusele kirjutatud heliteose pealkirjaks sai „Summa”, kaalus Pärt veel teisigi võimalusi. Üks esimesi võimalikke pealkirju oli „Credo” (lad. „Mina usun”),³ mis sarnaselt 1968. aasta „Credoga” pidi samuti olema Pärdi viis öelda maailmale muusika kaudu, et ladina NK usutunnistus on ka tema isiklik usutunnistus (Jaanson 2014: 183). Kuid samanimelise teose olemasolu ning probleemide tõttu, mis olid tekkinud „Credo’ga” 1968. aastal, loobus Pärt siiski sellest pealkirjast.⁴

Katse leida järgmine pealkiri viis helilooja sootuks huvitava tulemini: „Sümbol”.⁵ Kuigi esmapilgul jääb selle pealkirjaversiooni tähendus ja päritolu selgusetuks, on suure tõenäosusega tegemist Pärdi katsega eestistada NK usutunnistuse slaavikeelne nimetus *Символ веры* („Simvol veri”), millega helilooja soovib alternatiivsel viisil kõnealuse heliteose usutunnistuslikku iseloomu rõhutada. Lisaks sellele näitab sellise pealkirjaversiooni kaalumine, et Pärt vaatab ladina NK usutunnistust läbi oma kirikliku usutunnistuse prisma, põimides nõnda lahutamatuks tervikuks nii oma muusikalise kui ka kirikliku usutunnistusliku maailma. Kuid lõpuks otsustas Pärt usutunnistuslikest rõhuasetustest teose pealkirjas siiski loobuda, määrates lõplikuks pealkirjaks „Summa”. Kuigi ka selle pealkirja tähendus ja päritolu jääb esialgu mõistatuseks, annab Arvo Pärt teada, et peamiselt inspireeris teda valiku tegemisel Vana Testamendi psalm 119, mis ülistab Jumala sõnas olevat terviklikku ja kokkuvõtvat tõde. Pärdi selgituste järgi andis see psalm talle mõista, et NK usutunnistuses olevad sõnad sisaldavad endas jumaliku tõe summat.⁶

Antud usutunnistuslikul väärtusel on oluline roll ka Arvo Pärdi loomingulises protsessis. Asetades ennast teksti ette, mis on müstiline ja ebamaine, tunneb helilooja loomupäraselt alandlikkust ja lausa vääritud,⁷ aga ka vajadust taandada end oma pahesid täis „minast”.⁸ Sellisel kombel kujutab NK usutunnistus endast askeetlikku väärtust, mida Pärt otsis juba 1968. aastal (vt. Randalu 1968) ning millel põhineb ka *tintinnabuli*-tehnikat loominguks protsess, kus helilooja peab suutma loobuda oma minast ja pahedest, et NK usutunnistuse või mis tahes muu teksti sõnad suudaks emaneerida tõest muusikat (Siitan 2014: 12).

Küll aga ei jää „Summaga” toimuvad mustrid hoopiski viimasteks, vaid korduvad ligi 20 aastat hiljem „Orient & Occident’is”. See teos, mille aluseks on kirikuslaavikeelne NK usutunnistus ehk teisisõnu, helilooja kiriklik kogemus usu tunnistamisest, pidi samuti oma alguses faasis olema helilooja muusikaline usutunnistus. Sellest annavad lisaks kõigele muule tunnistust ka Pärdi muusikapäevikud,⁹ mille järgi oli teose esialgseks pealkirjaks „Бегью”, mis hilisemas faasis asendati pealkirjaversioonidega „Sümbol” ja „Symbolon”. Nii „Summat” kui ka „Orient & Occident’i” tituleeris helilooja seega nende alguses faasis pealkirjaga „Mina usun” („Credo” – „Бегью”), samas kui järgmises faasis oli mõlemal teosel ühtmoodi kirikuslaavikeelsele NK usutunnistusele viitav nimeversioon „Sümbol”. Kuid nii nagu „Summagi” puhul, loobus Pärt ka siin lõpuks usutunnistuslikest pealkirjadest, jättes nii need kui ka kogu NK usutunnistuse teksti peidetud kujul heliloominguks varjule.

Määrates teose lõplikuks pealkirjaks „Orient & Occident” („Ida ja lääts”), soovis helilooja rõhutada antud kompositsiooni muusikalist eripära, kus põimuvad idapärane ühehäälsus ja läänelik mitmehäälsus.¹⁰ Lähemal uurimisel aga selgub, et mitte ainult idapärane ühehäälsus ja läänelik mitmehäälsus. Pärdi isiklike kommentaaride alusel¹¹ võib selgelt väita, et „lääne” all peab helilooja silmas lääne kristluse (katoliiklus ja protestantlus) hilisemat mitmehäälsust muusikalist traditsiooni, mis sai valitsevaks kogu Lääne-Euroopas. „Ida” all tundub aga helilooja peamiselt silmas pidavat varajast idakristlikku ning

³ Muusikapäevikud, APK 2-1.18, lk. 100, 1976; APK 2-1.19, lk. 60–61, 1976.

⁴ Tauri Tõlpti avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo ja Nora Pärdiva, 21.08.2020, APK.

⁵ APK 2-1.19, lk. 80, 1976.

⁶ Telefonivestlus autori ja Arvo Pärdi vahel 14.10.2021.

⁷ Ardo Västriku avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo Pärdiva teemal „Orient & Occident” I, 18.12.2019: 5, APK; Immo Mikhelsoni avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo Pärdiva, 10.05.2016: 8, APK.

⁸ Tauri Tõlpti avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo ja Nora Pärdiva, 21.08.2020, APK.

⁹ APK 2-1.192, lk. 9, 1996; APK 2-1.224, lk. 16, 1999.

¹⁰ Teosed: *Orient & Occident*; <https://www.arvopart.ee/arvo-part/teos/486/> (15.10.2021); Tauri Tõlpti avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo ja Nora Pärdiva, 21.08.2020, APK.

¹¹ Ardo Västriku avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo Pärdiva teemal „Orient & Occident” I, 18.12.2019: 3, APK; Tauri Tõlpti avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo ja Nora Pärdiva, 21.08.2020, APK.

Vahemere idakalda õigeusuga seotud ühehäälsel muusikalist traditsiooni.¹² Just selle tõttu ei põimi ta kõnealusel teoses vaid idapärast ja läänelikku muusikalist traditsiooni, vaid eripäraselt just muusikalisi traditsioone, mis on suuremal või vähemal määral seotud ida või lääne kirikutega, mis, nagu helilooja hästi teab, on olnud tüüls juba sajandeid.¹³ Üllatavalt on Pärt nende vastaspoolte kokkutoojana „Orient & Occident’is“ kasutanud just oma kiriklikku NK usutunnistust, kus iga järgnev kirikuslaavikeelne sõna annab hääle kas idakiriklikule monofooniale või läänekiriklikule polüfooniale.¹⁴

Seda ülesannet ei andnud ta NK usutunnistusele juhuslikult, sest nagu helilooja ka ise välja toob, on tema tajunud NK usutunnistust alati kui vastandite kokkutoojat. Seda kinnitab Arvo Pärdi kasutuses olev õigeusu palveraamat, kus helilooja on NK usutunnistuse juurde kirjutanud: „Võimatu formuleerimise parim formuleering.“¹⁵ Selle lausega väljendab helilooja oma veendumust, et NK usutunnistuses on suudetud kirjeldada ja selgitada midagi, mis on olemuslikult kirjeldamatu ja selgitamatu – kohtumispaik võimaliku ja võimatu vahel. Samuti annab Pärdi arvates niisugusest vastandite kooseksistentsist tunnistust ka usutunnistus ise, mis viitab Jumal-Isale kui taeva ja maa ning nähtava ja nähtamatu loojale. Kuid lisaks kõigele muule tekitab NK usutunnistuse lugemine kõrvuti Jeesuspalvega Arvo Pärdi samaaegselt nii patu kui ka lunastuse tunnet.¹⁶

Sedalaadi vastandite kooseksistentsi ei esinda mitte ainult NK usutunnistus, vaid ka *tintinnabuli*-tehnika, milles meloodiahääl esindab helilooja patustust ja maisust, samas kui *tintinnabuli*-kolmkõla on seotud taevaliku ning lunastavaga.¹⁷ Matemaatiliselt võtab helilooja selle ise kokku nii: „Üks ja üks on üks ja mitte kaks – see on selle tehnika saladus.“ (Yaraman 2020: 233; Hillier 1997: 96)

¹² Immo Mikhelsoni arhiiviintervjuu Arvo Pärdiga, 10.05.2016: 8, APK; Ardo Västriku avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo Pärdiga teemal „Orient & Occident“ I, 18.12.2019: 3, APK; Tauri Tõlpti avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo ja Nora Pärdiga, 21.08.2020, APK.

¹³ Muusikaline päevik, APK 2-1.249, lk. 65, 2013.

¹⁴ „Orient ja Occident“ muusikalises struktuuris on Pärt loonud mustri, kus kordamööda on iga järgnev sõna kirjutatud kas ühehäälselt või mitmehäälselt. (Ardo Västriku avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo Pärdiga teemal „Orient & Occident“ I, 18.12.2019: 3, APK.)

¹⁵ Ardo Västriku avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo Pärdiga teemal „Orient & Occident“ I, 18.12.2019: 5, APK; Tauri Tõlpti avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo ja Nora Pärdiga, 21.08.2020, APK.

¹⁶ Tauri Tõlpti avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo ja Nora Pärdiga, 21.08.2020, APK.

¹⁷ Muusikapäevikud APK 2-1.192, lk. 38, 1996, ja APK 2-1.225, lk. 67, 2000; Ardo Västriku avaldamata arhiiviintervjuu Arvo Pärdiga teemal „Orient & Occident“ I, 18.12.2019: 5, APK. Vaata ka: Lingas 2020: 225; Siitan 2020: 30.